Genomic profiling of 553 uncharacterized neurodevelopment patients reveals a

high proportion of recessive pathogenic variant carriers in an outbred population

Youngha Lee[1]†, Soojin Park[2]†, Jin Sook Lee[2,3,4]†, Soo Yeon Kim[2]†, Jaeso Cho[1],

Yongjin Yoo[1], Sangmoon Lee[1], Taekyeong Yoo[1], Moses Lee[1], Jieun Seo[1], Jeongeun

Lee[1,5], Jana Kneissl[1], Jean Lee[1], Hyoungseok Jeon[1], Eun Young Jeon[1], Sung Eun

Hong[1], Eunha Kim[1], Hyuna Kim[2], Woo Joong Kim[2], Jon Soo Kim[6], Jung Min Ko[2], Anna

Cho[7], Byeong Chan Lim[2], Won Seop Kim[6], Murim Choi[1,2]*, Jong-Hee Chae[2]*

[1]Department of Biomedical Sciences, Seoul National University College of Medicine,

Seoul, Republic of Korea. [2]Department of Pediatrics, Seoul National University College

of Medicine, Seoul, Republic of Korea. [3]Department of Pediatrics, Gil Medical Center,

Gachon University College of Medicine, Incheon, Republic of Korea. [4]Department of

Genome Medicine and Science, Gil Medical Center, Gachon University College of

Medicine, Incheon, Republic of Korea. [5]Interdisciplinary Program for Bioengineering,

Graduate School, Seoul National Universty, Seoul, Republic of Korea. [6]Department of

Pediatrics, College of Medicine, Chungbuk National University, Cheongju, Republic of

Korea. [7]Department of Pediatrics, Ewha Womans University School of Medicine, Seoul,

Republic of Korea.

* Correspondence: murimchoi@snu.ac.kr and chaeped1@snu.ac.kr

†Youngha Lee, Soojin Park, Jin Sook Lee, Soo Yeon Kim contributed equally to this

work.

Abstract

Background: A substantial portion of Mendelian disease patients suffers from genetic variants that are inherited in a recessive manner. A precise understanding of pathogenic recessive variants in a population would assist in pre-screening births of such patients. However, a systematic understanding of the contribution of recessive variants to Mendelian diseases is still lacking.

Methods: Genetic diagnosis and variant discovery of 553 undiagnosed Korean patients with complex neurodevelopmental problems (KND for Korean NeuroDevelopmental cohort) were performed using whole exome sequencing of patients and their parents. Pathogenic variants were selected and evaluated based on a comparison to patient symptoms and genetic properties of the variants were analyzed.

Results: Disease-causing variants, including newly discovered variants, were identified in in 57.5% of the probands of the KND cohort. Of the 553 patients, 47.4% harbored variants that were previously reported as being pathogenic, and 35.1% of the previous reported pathogenic variants were inherited in a recessive manner. Genes that cause recessive disorders tend to be less constrained by loss-of-function variants and enriched in metabolic and mitochondrial pathways. This observation was applied to an estimation that approximately 1 in 17 healthy Korean individuals carry at least one of these pathogenic variants that develop severe neurodevelopmental problems in a recessive manner. Furthermore, the feasibility of these genes for carrier screening was evaluated.

Conclusions: We suggest that the odds are high for healthy individuals carrying a potentially pathogenic variant, and its genetic properties. Our results will serve as a foundation for recessive variant screening to reduce occurrences of rare Mendelian

53   disease patients. Additionally, our results highlight the utility and necessity of whole

54   exome sequencing-based diagnostics for improving patient care in a country with a

55   centralized medical system.

57   **Keywords:** Whole exome sequencing, Recessive variants, Clinical Neurology,

58   Developmental disorders, Pediatric disease

Background

A large fraction of Mendelian disorders follow a recessive inheritance pattern [1, 2]. The Online Mendelian Inheritance in Men (OMIM) lists 5,317 disorders and 3,077 of these are categorized as recessive (as of April 2019). For more common complex disorders, the contribution of recessive variants to the disease pathogenesis is less than expected [3–6]. For ultra-rare diseases, the contribution of recessive variants in inbred populations, such as Middle-Eastern countries, has been well proven [7–9]. However, the precise contribution of recessive variants to ultra-rare Mendelian disorders in an outbred population is still not well understood.

The inherent complexity of brain developmental processes inevitably leads to patients with diverse neurological problems that frequently challenge conventional diagnostic criteria. Therefore, diagnosis of neurological disorders that affect children is frequently hampered by rare and overlapping clinical features, which makes it difficult for clinicians to readily recognize and properly treat the disease entity. This makes pediatric neurologic patients an impending target for genome-wide genetic studies [10–12]. To facilitate diagnosis and discovery of novel disease pathophysiology, large-scale systematic efforts have been conducted at regional or national scales [13–16]. As many rare neurologic disorders in children follow Mendelian inheritance, disease-causing variant discovery by trio-based whole-exome sequencing (WES) has proved to be the most robust methodology, yielding instant diagnosis rates of 25-41% [10–12, 14, 16].

Notably, the medical system in Korea provides a unique opportunity to conduct a systematic survey of rare disorders and study the contribution of recessive variants at a large scale. With a nation-wide referral system focused on a handful of major tertiary clinical institutions, Seoul National University Children's Hospital (SNUCH) covers a large portion of the 51-million population, allowing for consistent evaluation and

treatment of the patient cohort. For example, we recently reported on genetic analyses

of large patient cohorts of Duchenne muscular dystrophy ($n = 507$) and Rett-like

syndrome lacking *MECP2* mutations ($n = 34$) [17, 18]. Genetically, ethnic Koreans are

a good example of an outbred population in which marriages between relatives and

even between individuals possessing the same surnames were prohibited since the

17th century, although the same surname marriage ban was lifted in 2005 [19]. Our

study represents the largest of its kind that was conducted at a single clinic, and

emphasizes the careful integration of clinical and genetic analyses.

We used WES to analyze a cohort of 553 patients (KND cohort) with severe

neurodevelopmental disorders. We characterized the genotype-phenotype

relationships of patients whose molecular defects had been identified, and explored the

potential association of genes that had not been previously associated with disease.

We demonstrate that a high proportion of recessively-inherited variants are associated

with patients that have rare neurodevelopmental diseases. Variants that were inherited

in a recessive manner were analyzed and their genetic properties were evaluated.

Overall, we describe the establishment of a system that efficiently integrates advanced

genetic techniques with clinical diagnostic processes to maximize benefits for pediatric

patients and their families.

Materials and Methods

Subjects

Blood samples were obtained from enrolled patients and their parents, who provided informed consent. WES was performed on 553 patients who visited the SNUCH pediatric neurology clinic from July 2014 to January 2019 and displayed various neurodevelopmental problems of unknown origins, such as demyelinating or hypomyelinating leukodystrophy, hereditary spastic paraplegia, mitochondrial disorders, epileptic encephalopathy, Rett syndrome-like encephalopathy, ataxia, neuropathy, myopathies, and multiple congenital anomalies/dysmorphic syndromes with developmental problems (Table 1). The patients can be categorized into two groups: (i) clinically diagnosable but with substantial genetic heterogeneity (270/553, 48.8%) or (ii) heterogeneous and nonspecific clinical presentations without definite diagnosis (283/553, 51.2%; Additional file: Figure S1). Prior to the WES analysis, thorough clinical and laboratory evaluations and extensive patient examinations have been conducted to identify possible genetic causes. These included genetic tests with candidate gene sequencing, targeted gene sequencing panel, trinucleotide repeat analysis, microarray, metabolic work-up, brain/spine MRI, or muscle biopsy if applicable. All subjects were evaluated by three pediatric neurologists, two pediatric neuroradiologists, and a pathologist.

Whole Exome Sequencing

WES was performed at Theragen Etex Bio Institute (Suwon, Korea) following the standard protocol and the data were analyzed as described previously [18]. Depending on the genetic analysis result, each patient was categorized as one of the following: category 1: known disease-causing genes were found; category 2: causative gene for

other diseases were found; category 3: potentially pathogenic gene, but without prior

disease association, was found; category 4: no disease-causing candidates were found;

and category 5: known pathogenic copy number variation (CNV) was found.

Our variant assessment procedures were as follows: firstly, patient-specific

CNVs were checked and samples with CNVs were classified as category 5. Then,

patient-specific nucleotide variants such as *de novo*, compound heterozygous (CH),

and rare homozygous (RHo) and hemizygous (RHe) variants were selected by

comparing against parents and prioritized based on the inheritance pattern (Fig. 1a). In

correlating the patient's clinical features with genetic variants, if patients carried a

known pathogenic variant in OMIM or ClinVar, they were categorized as category 1 or 2,

depending on similarity with reported and observed clinical manifestation. For

previously unreported variants, if they were never seen in normal individuals (gnomAD

[20], Korean Variant Archive (KOVA) [21] and in-house variants), harbored LoF, or were

evolutionarily well-conserved at the amino acid level, they were categorized as

potentially pathogenic. For CNV calling, the normalized coverage depths of each

captured intervals were compared to the depths from related individuals.

Human Brain Transcriptome Data

The BrainSpan transcriptome database (http://www.brainspan.org) was used to build

developing human brain networks [22]. Data from eight post-conceptual weeks to 40

years of age were analyzed. A total of 385 samples were used for the analysis after

combining the multiplicates by taking mean values. Probes with TPM (transcripts per

million) > 5 in at least one sample were used, yielding 23,943 probes as "brain-

expressed transcripts".

Brain Transcriptome Network Analysis

Using the above brain-expressed transcripts, we created eight known gene co-
expression networks by selecting genes that are highly correlated to our set of genes
(n = 164; Pearson's correlation r > 0.7), in which their disease associations were
previously reported, from each developmental period (Fig. 1f). Then, we asked whether
our novel genes can be successfully integrated into the known gene co-expression
network. We randomly selected 53 genes (equal to the number of our novel genes) in
brain-expressed transcripts and counted how many edges they formed with the known
genes. The 10^5 random gene selections were performed and the number of edges with
a known gene was used to construct a distribution. The number of edges from our
observed novel genes was evaluated against the random distributions. *P*-values were
calculated using z-score, assuming normal distrubutions.

Recessive variant analysis

Variants were first filtered by gnomAD allele frequency of 0.001 in a heterozygous
status and ability to alter protein sequences. Then CH variants were called on a trio
setting. If a gene contains more than one filtered variant and each variant was inherited
from mother and father separately (for proband), or at least one but not all of the
filtered variants of a gene were found from the progeny (for parent), the variants were
called as CH. RHo variants were called if filtered variants are inherited in a
homozygous manner in autosomes and never seen in gnomAD as homozygous. RHe
variants were called if filtered variants are in the X chromosome and never seen in
gnomAD as hemizygous or homozygous. Functionality scores were extracted from
dbNSFP [23].

180   **Results**

181

182   *Diagnostic success rate of WES analyses*

183   The symptoms experienced by KND patients were mostly of pediatric onset (mean 1.4

184   years of age). Pediatric patients harbored neurodevelopmental problems and were

185   soon referred to tertiary hospitals (mean 1.8 years of age). The majority of the patients

186   visited multiple tertiary hospitals for diagnosis (88.8% visited more than one hospital,

187   mean of 2.3 hospitals), required a mean of 2.3 specialists (31.6% required more than

188   two) and spent a mean of 5.6 years elapsed before WES analysis at SNUCH (Table 1,

189   Additional file: Figure S2). The distribution of straight-line distances from home to the

190   clinic strongly correlates with the original population distribution of Korea,

191   demonstrating that our cohort covers the entire population (Table 1, Additional file:

192   Figure S3).

193   The majority of the patients is sporadic origin (504/553 = 91.1%; Fig. 1a),

194   making them suitable for trio-based WES analysis. Major clinical feature of the KND

195   cohort was neurodevelopmental disease (84.1%; Fig. 1b). Integrative assessments of

196   genetic variants, their clinical impacts, and patient symptoms allowed us to diagnose

197   40.3% (223/553) of the cohort with high confidence. The patients included carriers of

198   CNVs (23/553 = 4.2%; 16 heterozygous deletions and 7 duplications; Additional file:

199   Table S1), in which 20 CNVs originated *de novo* (3.6% of the entire cohort), which is

200   slightly lower but comparable to a previous observation [24]. Three inherited

201   pathogenic CNVs were identified: a 165.5 kb deletion in a large family containing

202   multiple affected individuals (Additional file: Figure S4), and 7.2 Mb and 203.2 kb

203   hemizygous duplications that were transmitted from healthy moms to their affected

204   sons (Additional file: Table S1). An additional 7.1% of the cohort (39 patients) harbored

205   previously reported variants that were assumed to be pathogenic but displayed distinct

phenotypes, potentially expanding the phenotypic spectrum associated with these

genes. For example, two patients that carried a pathogenic heterozygous nonsense or

missense variant in *COL1A1*, known to cause osteogenesis imperfecta [25], were

initially diagnosed with muscle hypotonia. These two patients did not display skeletal

problems, but showed blue sclera [26]. Adding this group to the high confidence group

yielded an instant diagnostic rate of 47.4% ("known genes"; Additional file: Table S2).

Finally, an additional 10.1% of the cohort (56 patients, 53 genes) harbored variants that

are highly likely to be pathogenic but their disease associations are elusive ("novel

genes"), yielding a "suggestive" diagnostic yield of 57.5% (Fig. 1c). Among the patients

with definite diagnosis, 35.1% are recessive, and 29.9% harbored loss-of-function (LoF)

variants (Fig. 1d and Additional file: Figure S5). As expected, the known genes showed

strong enrichment in disease categories and gene ontologies such as intellectual

disability and central nervous system (CNS) development (Fig. 1e).

Novel genes display potential enrichment in neuronal differentiation

We assessed whether the 53 novel genes possess a neurologic disease-causing

function. The novel gene set was simulated against the BrainSpan data (Materials and

Methods) to evaluate if the expression of these novel genes as a group was strongly

correlated with known disease-associated genes during brain development. After 10^5

permutations, we found that the observed involvement of the novel genes was

significantly stronger than a randomly selected gene sets across eight developmental

windows (Fig. 1f, g; $P_{adj} < 0.05$ for all periods). Furthermore, this test was expanded to

the four anatomical domains in each period, yielding 32 spatio-temporal windows (Fig.

1g). It is notable that the most highly enriched windows are concentrated in the frontal

cortex area (Fig. 1g; R1 x P1-4). These results suggest that expression of the novel

genes is concordant with known disease-causing genes in developing brains and this

phenomenon is most prominent in the frontal cortex.

Profile of recessive variants that predispose neurodevelopmental disorders

Using our set of defined pathogenic variants, we explored the genetic properties of

these variants that caused disorders in a recessive manner. First, to test if recessive

variants (CH, RHo and RHe) are more frequently found in patients as compared to

healthy individuals, we counted the number of recessive variants in our cohort and

compared these values between patients and healthy parents as controls. Counting all

recessive variants from patients and controls, we observed that there is no substantial

difference in the number of variants for CH, RHo and RHe (Fig. 2a). Extracting LoF

variants, variants in OMIM-listed genes or variants in neurodevelopment-related genes

did not reveal any difference in burden (Fig. 2a and Additional file: Figure S6), implying

the presence of overwhelming non-pathogenic or non-functional recessive calls in the

patients. The majority of genes that were found in our patients with definite diagnosis

has been previously documented in OMIM, and has good concordance with previously

known recessive or dominant inheritance patterns (Fig. 2b). There were two

exceptional cases in which the genes are listed as recessive in OMIM but were

dominantly inherited in our patients. First, only the recessive *ACOX1* phenotype has

been recognized to date [27], but we are currently working on a report that describes

this dominant *ACOX1* variant. Second, a previous report suggested that the *C19orf12*

variant has dominant effect, similar to our observations. But this report is not yet listed

in OMIM [28]. Next, to test if the genetic properties of recessive variants are different

from those of dominant variants, several parameters were compared. Dominant

variants (mean allele frequency = 6.2×10^{-7}) were found less frequently in gnomAD

than recessive variants (mean allele frequency = 1.6×10^{-5}; Mann-Whitney U test *P* =

1.7×10^{-13}), since most of the dominant variants originated *de novo* whereas recessive

variants were inherited from healthy parents (Fig. 2c). Recessive variants were slightly

less conserved as compared to the dominant variants, based on PhyloP or amino acid

conservation among vertebrate species (Mann-Whitney U test $P = 0.034$ and 0.048,

respectively; Fig. 2d). Other functionality test values did not differ significantly between

the two groups (CADD $P = 0.50$, GERP $P = 0.15$ and SIFT $P = 0.17$, Mann-Whitney U

tests). On the contrary, the genes that contain the recessive variants displayed more

lenient constraint as compared to the dominant genes or known haploinsufficiency

genes, as documented by observed/expected ratio (o/e) and pLI score in gnomAD [20].

But the recessive genes still display a similar or a slightly more constrained pattern

compared to the genes in OMIM (Fig. 2e and Additional file: Figure S7). Functional

characterization of recessive neurodevelopmental disease genes revealed an

enrichment for genes involved in lipid metabolism and mitochondrial processes (Fig. 2f),

in addition to the expected enrichment in CNS development. The relative position of

LoF variants in recessive genes demonstrated a similar lenient pattern, more enriched

in the C-terminal portion, as compared to the dominant genes (Fig. 2g). There was no

significant difference in basic clinical parameters (displayed in Table 1) between the

recessive and dominant patient groups (data not shown).

Profile of pathogenic recessive variants carried in healthy individuals

Unlike *de novo* variants that originate largely at random, assembly of recessive

variants can be pre-screened and avoided if such variants can be identified in parents.

Taking advantage of the extensive coverage of the patient pool maintained by Korea's

centralized medical system and our analysis results of patients with severe

neurodevelopmental disorders, it is feasible to infer the probability of recessive variant

assembly in Koreans. Several numbers and assumptions are required for this

estimation: (i) approximately 400,000 babies are born every year in Korea as of 2016

284 [29], (ii) approximately 1,000 patients with severe neurodevelopmental disorders newly

285 enroll in our neurodevelopmental disorder clinic every year, (iii) these patients

286 encompass the majority of the Korean population, as exemplified by the sizes of our

287 DMD and Rett cohorts [17, 18] and reflected in the geographical distribution of the KND

288 patients (Table 1 and Additional file: Figure S3), (iv) our result from 553 patients

289 revealed a recessive genetic origin in approximately one-third of the patients (Fig. 1d)

290 and (v) Koreans typically marry an individual with minimal genetic similarity. These

291 observations lead a 1/1,200 incidence rate for developing a severe

292 neurodevelopmental disease in a recessive manner, which can be explained by the

293 existence of one carrier for every 17 healthy individuals (1/1,156; Fig. 3a). One can

294 point out limited evidence for one of our assumptions that we cover the majority of the

295 Korean population. But applying a partial coverage in the estimation will result in

296 increased incidence of neurodevelopment disorder patients and unintentionally inflate

297 the carrier frequency. Therefore, the assumption ensures conservative estimation. Next,

298 we sought to understand the properties of pathogenic recessive variants as compared

299 to the variants found from gnomAD on the same set of 69 genes that contain these

300 variants. As expected, KND recessive variants were found less frequently (Fig. 3b),

301 were strongly conserved during evolution (Fig. 3c), and displayed stronger functionality

302 scores (Fig. 3d) compared to all gnomAD variants found in the same set of genes.

303 Among many variants of obscure functional significances, heterozygous LoF and

304 ClinVar variants in gnomAD can be considered as a first-tier culprit for pathogenic

305 recessive variants. And we observed that the portion that is attributable to LoF and

306 ClinVar variants by healthy carriers was variable among the genes, and this portion is

307 correlated with the o/e LoF value (Pearson's correlation r = 0.33; Fig. 3e).

Discussion

This study demonstrates the clinical utility of applying WES to children with various and

complex neurodevelopmental disorders. We identified genetic causes in 47.4% of the

patients and evaluated the characteristics of the variants that caused the disorders in a

recessive manner.

Consistent with previous studies, we were able to diagnose approximately half

of the KND patients (Fig. 1c) [10–12, 14, 16]. The novel genes formed significantly

robust co-expression networks during neurodevelopment processes, which was most

prominent in frontal cortex regions (Fig. 1f, g). There was no significant difference in

the number of recessive calls between patients and controls, even after stratifying the

calls into disease-related gene sets (Fig. 2a and Additional file: Figure S6). This result

suggests following: (i) although categorized as "neurodevelopmental", our patient set is

heterogeneous in nature, diluting contribution of single functional entity, (ii) patients

carry more non-pathogenic or non-functional recessive calls than expected and we

need more power to extract biologically relevant signals. The pathogenic recessive

variants that cause rare neurodevelopmental disorders displayed moderately increased

allele frequency values and marginally increased evolutionary conservation as

compared to dominant variants, suggesting that the qualitative differences between

these two groups of variants were not dramatically different (Fig. 2c, d). Compared to

the relatively mild differences in variant characteristics, the genes that caused such

disorders displayed more discernible differences based on several parameters. First,

the recessive genes harbor increased o/e LoF values, implying that there is no

constraint applied to the recessive genes, whereas dominant genes in displayed a

highly biased pattern toward known haploinsufficiency genes (Fig. 2e). Similarly, the

distribution of the relative locations of LoF variants in genes suggested that recessive

genes were less constrained compared to dominant genes (Fig. 2g). GO analysis

further support that – while the two groups are predominantly composed of

neurodevelopment-related genes – recessive genes contain an enriched number of

genes that are involved in lipid metabolism and mitochondria function (Fig. 2f). This is a

plausible result considering that these pathways are essential for normal brain

development [30, 31]. To summarize, these observations suggest that gene properties

are stronger determinants of whether the disease adopts a recessive or dominant

inheritance pattern than variant properties.

344   Predicting and avoiding the occurrence of recessive disorders is critical.

Carrier estimation has been traditionally performed mostly for single-gene diseases

such as β-thalassaemia, Tay-Sachs disease and cystic fibrosis, and efficiently reduced

the incidence of these patients [32–34]. However, even after introducing aggressive

analysis of genetic disorders using whole exome or whole genome sequencing, precise

estimation of the incidence and contribution of rare Mendelian disorders in a recessive

manner remains variable for study populations and disorders [2]. For example, analysis

of the Deciphering Developmental Disorders (DDD) data suggested only 3.6% of

recessive disorders were attributable to patients of European ancestry whereas this

value was 30.9% for patients of Pakistani ancestry [4]. Systematic analysis of

schizophrenia data did not detect a substantial contribution of recessive variants [5, 6].

These observations differ from ours, where 35.1% of the definitely diagnosed patients

emerged in a recessive mode (Fig. 1d), which is in good agreement with previous

diagnostic WES studies [10, 35, 36].

358   Due to a diminishing birth rate and presumably with a burden of having a

severely sick child, the majority of our patients lack affected sibling. Therefore, only

11.1% of the patients of recessive origins were from the class 2 pedigree (two siblings

being affected, Fig. 1a). Remaining 88.9% of the patients were from the class 3

pedigree and not readily discernable whether their disorders follow dominant or

recessive inheritance until WES analysis revealed genetic etiology.

Since the majority of these pathogenic recessive variants were inherited from

healthy parents, and ethnic Koreans comprise a relatively isolated population with a

centralized medical system, it was feasible to derive an estimate that one out of 17

individuals are healthy carriers of pathogenic recessive variants for severe

neurodevelopmental disorders (Fig. 3a). Accumulating this estimated carrier portion

across different rare severe disease entities will certainly increase this ratio. The

contribution of known LoF and ClinVar variants varies by genes and is positively

correlated with o/e LoF values (Fig. 3e), and pathogenic recessive variants display

systematic differences that differentiate them from gnomAD variants (Fig. 3b-d). Thus,

it would be feasible to predict potential rare recessive variants from genomic data of

healthy parents with the help of large patient and control genomic data in the near

future.

Our approach expanded the phenotypic spectrum of known genes (39 cases,

7.1%), and suggested novel genes that may allow us to better understand

neurodevelopmental disease mechanisms (56 patients, 10.1%). Nevertheless, 42.5%

of the cases (235/533) remained undiagnosed even after our WES effort, suggesting a

substantial opportunity for further improvement (Fig. 1c). Related to this, a systematic

re-analysis effort with additional bioinformatics pipelines increased the diagnostic rate

by 4.2% [37]. Also, searching for functional non-coding variants through whole genome

sequencing (WGS) and evaluating multiple rare functional variants that may increase

disease predisposition may be beneficial [38], although a recent meta-analysis study

claimed only a minimal improvement in the WGS diagnostic rate, presumably due to

our limited understanding of the function of noncoding variant [39]. An alternative

approach would be to integrate genome data with transcriptome data in order to

identify functionally cryptic variants that directly influence expression of critical genes

[40, 41], although preparing patient-derived tissue still remains as a practical challenge.

Our study also addresses the clinical challenges of an evolving phenotype over

time in growing children and how this can be overcome, which facilitates identification

of treatable or actionable cases (Table 2; Additional file: Notable vignettes and Figure

S8). Our patient cohort included a successful drug repositioning case for a rare

neurogenetic disease [42] (Table 2). All of these cases are expected to increase as

more genotype-phenotype relationships are discovered and more drugs become

available. This study demonstrates that applying WES and subsequent in-depth

analysis provides clinical and practical benefits to existing patients and their families

and reducing emergence of such patients.

Conclusions

We analyzed a comprehensive cohort of rare severe neurodevelopmental disorders in

Korea. We genetically diagnosed approximately half of the cohort and discovered novel

genetic associations in ~10% of the cohort. Precise etiology for ~40% of the cohort still

remains to be elucidated. Extensive analysis of the genetic characteristics of variants

and genes that predispose patients to recessive disorders as compared to those of

dominant disorders was performed. For this specific set of rare diseases, the properties

of genes were a stronger determinant of inheritance pattern as compared to those of

variants. Based on these observations, we deduced a ratio of 1/17 for finding a

pathogenic recessive variant carrier and suggest several features that predispose

variants to reach a pathogenic level. More extensive genome-wide analysis of rare

disease patients and healthy controls in a systematic way would provide further

insights into the behavior of rare inherited variants that may function as pathogenic

recessive variants.

Our study presented a genetic analysis of 553 Korean pediatric patients with

unexplained neurodevelopmental problems that revealed various known and novel

genetic etiologies. We provided rationales for aggressively extending our system to a

wider range of undiagnosed rare disease patients in countries with centralized

healthcare like Korea. Through a careful integration of detailed phenotyping, genetic

analysis and data sharing, we demonstrate how this approach can facilitate more

precise diagnoses and personalized patient care, including pre-screening of rare

recessive diseases. Finally, we demonstrated the successful establishment of this

approach in Korea, and the necessity of this approach for patients with various

undiagnosed neurodevelopmental disorders in countries of similar status.

Abbreviations

CADD: Combined Annotation Dependent Depletion; CH: Compound heterozygous;

CNV: Copy number variation; DDD: Deciphering Developmental Disorders; GERP:

Genomic Evolutionary Rate Profiling; gnomAD: Genome Aggregation Database; GO:

Gene Ontology; KND: Korean neurodevelopmental disorder; LoF: Loss-of-function;

OMIM: Online Mendelian Inheritance in Man; phyloP: phylogenetic P-values; RHe:

Rare hemizygous; RHo: Rare homozygous; SIFT: Sorting Intolerant From Tolerant;

WES: Whole exome sequencing; WGS: Whole genome sequencing

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge patients and parents participated in this study.

Funding

This study was funded by grants from the Ministry of Health and Welfare (HI16C1986),

the Korea Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (20170607DBF-00) and the

Korean National Research Foundation (2018M3C9A5064708).

Availability of data and materials

Anonymized data not published within this article will be made available by request

from any qualified investigator for purposes of replicating procedures and results.

Authors' contributions

MC and JHC are responsible for study concept and design, supervised the study and

obtained funding. YL, SP, JC, YY, SL, TY, ML, JS, Jeongeun Lee, JK, EYJ, EK, and MC

analyzed genome data. JSL, SYK, JC, HK, WJK, JSK, JMK, AC, BCL, WSK, and JHC

provided clinical data. YL, SP, JSL, SYK, JC, MC, and JHC combined genetic and

clinical data. YL, SP, JC, Jeongeun Lee, JK, Jean Lee, HJ, EYJ, SEH, and MC

performed genetic and statistical evaluation of the cohort. YL, SP, JSL, SYK, MC, and

JHC drafted the manuscript. All authors reviewed the manuscript for important

intellectual content.

Ethics approval and consent to participate

This study was approved by the Seoul National University Hospital Institutional Review

Board (No. 1406-081-588).

Consent for publication

Not applicable

Competing interests

The authors declare no conflict of Interest.

Reference

1. Boycott KM, Vanstone MR, Bulman DE, MacKenzie AE. Rare-disease genetics in

the era of next-generation sequencing: Discovery to translation. Nature Reviews

Genetics. 2013;14:681–91. doi:10.1038/nrg3555.

2. Antonarakis SE. Carrier screening for recessive disorders. Nat Rev Genet. 2019.

doi:10.1038/s41576-019-0134-2.

3. Jin SC, Homsy J, Zaidi S, Lu Q, Morton S, Depalma SR, et al. Contribution of rare

inherited and de novo variants in 2,871 congenital heart disease probands. Nat Genet.

2017;49:1593–601. doi:10.1038/ng.3970.

4. Martin HC, Jones WD, McIntyre R, Sanchez-Andrade G, Sanderson M, Stephenson

JD, et al. Quantifying the contribution of recessive coding variation to developmental

disorders. Science (80-). 2018;362:1161–4.

5. Rees E, Kirov G, Walters JT, Richards AL, Howrigan D, Kavanagh DH, et al.

Analysis of exome sequence in 604 trios for recessive genotypes in schizophrenia.

Transl Psychiatry. 2015;5 June:e607.

6. Ruderfer DM, Lim ET, Genovese G, Moran JL, Hultman CM, Sullivan PF, et al. No

evidence for rare recessive and compound heterozygous disruptive variants in

schizophrenia. Eur J Hum Genet. 2015;23:555–7. doi:10.1038/ejhg.2014.228.

7. Monies D, Abouelhoda M, Assoum M, Moghrabi N, Rafiullah R, Almontashiri N, et al.

Lessons Learned from Large-Scale, First-Tier Clinical Exome Sequencing in a Highly

Consanguineous Population. Am J Hum Genet. 2019;:1–20.

doi:10.1016/j.ajhg.2019.04.011.

8. Alkuraya FS. Discovery of mutations for Mendelian disorders. Hum Genet.

2016;135:615–23.

9. Lifton RP, Gharavi AG, Geller DS, Hughes H. Molecular Mechanisms Review of

Human Hypertension. 2001;104:545–56.

10. Srivastava S, Cohen JS, Vernon H, Barañano K, McClellan R, Jamal L, et al.

Clinical whole exome sequencing in child neurology practice. Ann Neurol.

2014;76:473–83.

11. Trujillano D, Bertoli-Avella AM, Kumar Kandaswamy K, Weiss ME, Köster J, Marais

A, et al. Clinical exome sequencing: results from 2819 samples reflecting 1000 families.

Eur J Hum Genet. 2016;25 September:176–82. doi:10.1038/ejhg.2016.146.

12. Yang Y, Muzny DM, Xia F, Niu Z, Person R, Ding Y, et al. Molecular Findings

Among Patients Referred for Clinical Whole-Exome Sequencing. Jama. 2014;312:1870.

doi:10.1001/jama.2014.14601.

13. Baynam G, Pachter N, McKenzie F, Townshend S, Slee J, Kiraly-Borri C, et al. The

rare and undiagnosed diseases diagnostic service - application of massively parallel

sequencing in a state-wide clinical service. Orphanet J Rare Dis. 2016;11:77.

doi:10.1186/s13023-016-0462-7.

14. Beaulieu CL, Majewski J, Schwartzentruber J, Samuels ME, Fernandez BA,

Bernier FP, et al. FORGE Canada consortium: Outcomes of a 2-year national rare-

disease gene-discovery project. Am J Hum Genet. 2014;94:809–17.

15. Gahl WA, Mulvihill JJ, Toro C, Markello TC, Wise AL, Ramoni RB, et al. The NIH

Undiagnosed Diseases Program and Network: Applications to modern medicine. Mol

Genet Metab. 2016;117:393–400. doi:10.1016/j.ymgme.2016.01.007.

16. McRae JF, Clayton S, Fitzgerald TW, Kaplanis J, Prigmore E, Rajan D, et al.

Prevalence and architecture of de novo mutations in developmental disorders. Nature.

2017;542:433–8. doi:10.1038/nature21062.

17. Cho A, Seong MW, Lim BC, Lee HJ, Byeon JH, Kim SS, et al. Consecutive

analysis of mutation spectrum in the dystrophin gene of 507 Korean boys with

Duchenne/Becker muscular dystrophy in a single center. Muscle and Nerve.

2017;55:727–34.

18. Yoo Y, Jung J, Lee Y-N, Lee Y, Cho H, Na E, et al. GABBR2 mutations determine

phenotype in rett syndrome and epileptic encephalopathy. Ann Neurol. 2017;82:466–

78. doi:10.1002/ana.25032.

19. Deuchler M. The Confucian Transformation of Korea: A Study of Society and

Ideology. 1st edition. Harvard University Asia Center, Harvard University; 1992.

doi:DOI: 10.2307/j.ctt1dnn8zj.

20. Karczewski KJ, Francioli LC, Tiao G, Cummings BB, Alföldi J, Wang Q, et al.

Variation across 141,456 human exomes and genomes reveals the spectrum of loss-

of-function intolerance across human protein-coding genes. bioRxiv. 2019;:531210.

doi:10.1101/531210.

21. Lee S, Seo J, Park J, Nam JY, Choi A, Ignatius JS, et al. Korean Variant Archive

(KOVA): A reference database of genetic variations in the Korean population. Sci Rep.

2017;7:1–9.

22. Kang HJ, Kawasawa YI, Cheng F, Zhu Y, Xu X, Li M, et al. Spatio-temporal

transcriptome of the human brain. Nature. 2011;478:483–9. doi:10.1038/nature10523.

23. Liu X, Jian X, Boerwinkle E. dbNSFP: A lightweight database of human

nonsynonymous SNPs and their functional predictions. Hum Mutat. 2011;32:894–9.

24. Sanders SJ, Ercan-Sencicek AG, Hus V, Luo R, Murtha MT, Moreno-De-Luca D, et

al. Multiple Recurrent De Novo CNVs, Including Duplications of the 7q11.23 Williams

Syndrome Region, Are Strongly Associated with Autism. Neuron. 2011;70:863–85.

25. Cohn DH, Byers PH, Steinmann B, Gelinas11 RE. Lethal osteogenesis imperfecta

resulting from a single nucleotide change in one human proal(I) collagen allele

(mutation/gene cloning/DNA sequence analysis/extracellular matrix). Genetics.

1986;83 August:6045–7.

26. Lee JS, Seo J, Cho A, Lim BC, Choi M, Kim JW, et al. Severe hypotonia and

postnatal growth impairment in a girl with a missense mutation in COL1A1: Implication

of expanded phenotypic spectrum of type I collagenopathy. Brain Dev. 2017;39:799–

803. doi:10.1016/j.braindev.2017.04.020.

27. Ferdinandusse S, Denis S, Hogenhout EM, Koster J, Van Roermund CWT, Ijlst L,

et al. Clinical, biochemical, and mutational spectrum of peroxisomal acyl-coenzynie A

oxidase deficiency. Hum Mutat. 2007;28:904–12.

28. Gregory A, Lotia M, Jeong SY, Fox R, Zhen D, Sanford L, et al. Autosomal

dominant mitochondrial membrane protein☐associated neurodegeneration (MPAN).

Mol Genet Genomic Med. 2019; March:e736. doi:10.1002/mgg3.736.

29. Statistics Korea. Final Results of Birth Statistics in 2016. 2016.

http://kostat.go.kr/portal/eng/pressReleases/8/1/index.board?bmode=read&bSeq=&aS

eq=363582&pageNo=1&rowNum=10&navCount=10&currPg=&searchInfo=srch&sTarg

et=title&sTxt=birth.

30. McKenna MC, Schuck PF, Ferreira GC. Fundamentals of CNS energy metabolism

and alterations in lysosomal storage diseases. J Neurochem. 2019;148:590–9.

31. Tracey TJ, Steyn FJ, Wolvetang EJ, Ngo ST. Neuronal Lipid Metabolism: Multiple

Pathways Driving Functional Outcomes in Health and Disease. Front Mol Neurosci.

2018;11 January:1–25.

32. Cao A, Kan YW. The prevention of thalassemia. Cold Spring Harb Perspect Med.

2013;3:1–15.

33. Kaback M, Lim-Steele J, Dabholkar D, Brown D, Levy N, Zeiger K. Tay-sachs

disease—carrier screening, prenatal diagnosis and the molecular era: An international

perspective, 1970 to 1993. Obstet Gynecol Surv. 1994;49:321–2.

34. Watson MS, Cutting GR, Desnick RJ, Driscoll DA, Klinger K, Mennuti M, et al.

Cystic fibrosis population carrier screening: 2004 revision of American College of

Medical Genetics mutation panel. Genet Med. 2004;6:387–91.

doi:10.109701.GIM.0000139506.11694.7C.

35. Evers C, Staufner C, Granzow M, Paramasivam N, Hinderhofer K, Kaufmann L, et

al. Impact of clinical exomes in neurodevelopmental and neurometabolic disorders. Mol

Genet Metab. 2017;121:297–307.

36. Kuperberg M, Lev D, Blumkin L, Zerem A, Ginsberg M, Linder I, et al. Utility of

Whole Exome Sequencing for Genetic Diagnosis of Previously Undiagnosed Pediatric

Neurology Patients. J Child Neurol. 2016;31:1534–9.

37. Bergant G, Maver A, Lovrecic L, Čuturilo G, Hodzic A, Peterlin B. Comprehensive

use of extended exome analysis improves diagnostic yield in rare disease: A

retrospective survey in 1,059 cases. Genet Med. 2018;20:303–12.

38. Werling DM, Brand H, An J-Y, Stone MR, Zhu L, Glessner JT, et al. An analytical

framework for whole-genome sequence association studies and its implications for

autism spectrum disorder. Nat Genet. 2018;50:727–36. doi:10.1038/s41588-018-0107-

y.

39. Clark MM, Stark Z, Farnaes L, Tan TY, White SM, Dimmock D, et al. Meta-analysis

of the diagnostic and clinical utility of genome and exome sequencing and

chromosomal microarray in children with suspected genetic diseases. npj Genomic

Med. 2018;3:1–10. doi:10.1038/s41525-018-0053-8.

40. Cummings BB, Marshall JL, Tukiainen T, Lek M, Donkervoort S, Foley AR, et al.

Improving genetic diagnosis in Mendelian disease with transcriptome sequencing. Sci

Transl Med. 2017.

41. Gonorazky HD, Naumenko S, Ramani AK, Nelakuditi V, Mashouri P, Wang P, et al.

Expanding the Boundaries of RNA Sequencing as a Diagnostic Tool for Rare

Mendelian Disease. Am J Hum Genet. 2019;104:466–83.

doi:10.1016/j.ajhg.2019.01.012.

42. Seo J, Kang JA, Suh DI, Park EB, Lee CR, Choi SA, et al. Tofacitinib relieves

symptoms of stimulator of interferon genes (STING)???associated vasculopathy with

onset in infancy caused by 2 de novo variants in TMEM173. J Allergy Clin Immunol.

2017;139:1396-1399.e12.

43. Rehm HL, Ph D, Berg JS, Ph D, Brooks LD, Ph D, et al. Spe ci a l R e p or t

ClinGen — The Clinical Genome Resource. 2015;:1–8.

44. Boccuto L, Aoki K, Flanagan-Steet H, Chen CF, Fan X, Bartel F, et al. A mutation

in a ganglioside biosynthetic enzyme, ST3GAL5, results in salt & pepper syndrome, a

neurocutaneous disorder with altered glycolipid and glycoprotein glycosylation. Hum

Mol Genet. 2014;23:418–33.

45. Lee JS, Yoo Y, Lim BC, Kim KJ, Song J, Choi M, et al. GM3 synthase deficiency

due to ST3GAL5 variants in two Korean female siblings: Masquerading as Rett

syndrome-like phenotype. Am J Med Genet Part A. 2016;170:2200–5.

46. Strickland A V., Schabhüttl M, Offenbacher H, Synofzik M, Hauser NS, Brunner-

Krainz M, et al. Mutation screen reveals novel variants and expands the phenotypes

associated with DYNC1H1. J Neurol. 2015;262:2124–34.

47. Kim SY, Choi SA, Lee S, Lee JS, Hong CR, Lim BC, et al. Atypical presentation of

infantile-onset farber disease with novel ASAH1 mutations. Am J Med Genet Part A.

2016;170:3023–7.

48. Yoo D, Kim HJ, Lee JS, Lee S, Kim SY, Choi M, et al. Early-onset generalized

dystonia starting in the lower extremities in a patient with a novel ANO3 variant.

Parkinsonism and Related Disorders. 2018.

49. Hully M, Vuillaumier-Barrot S, Le Bizec C, Boddaert N, Kaminska A, Lascelles K, et

al. From splitting GLUT1 deficiency syndromes to overlapping phenotypes. Eur J Med

Genet. 2015;58:443–54.

50. Alfadhel M, Tabarki B. SLC19A3 Gene Defects Sorting the Phenotype and

Acronyms: Review. Neuropediatrics. 2018.

51. Lamers IJC, Reijnders MRF, Venselaar H, Kraus A, Jansen S, de Vries BBA, et al.

Recurrent De Novo Mutations Disturbing the GTP/GDP Binding Pocket of RAB11B

Cause Intellectual Disability and a Distinctive Brain Phenotype. Am J Hum Genet.

2017;101:824–32.

Fig. 1. Classification of the KND cohort and results of clinical WES analysis. (a)

Subjects by disease inheritance patterns. Class 1: autosomal dominant families; Class

2: families with affected siblings; Class 3: affected individuals with no family history. (b)

Major clinical features of the KND cohort. (c) Diagnostic yields of 553 patients with

undiagnosed symptoms using WES. (d) Pathogenic variants divided by inheritance

patterns. (e) GO and disease enrichment analysis of 164 known genes. (f) Brain

anatomical and developmental categorization used for our analysis. Components of

each brain region is shown in Additional file: Figure S9. (g) Strength of the co-

expression network composed of our known/novel genes compared to random

networks as measured by 10^5 permutations.

Fig. 2. Genetic properties of pathogenic recessive variants. (a) Burden of recessive variants in KND patients (Pt) and their parents

as controls (Ct). Recessive variants are divided into compound heterozygous (CH), rare homozygous (RHo) and rare hemizygous

(RHe) groups. Numbers found from all variants from all genes ("All"), LoF variants from all genes ("LoF"), all variants from OMIM-listed

genes ("OMIM") and all variants from intellectual disability gene set ("ID", from DisGeNET) are plotted. Numbers of samples used for

each category are as following: patients for CH = 145; controls for CH = 290; patients for RHo = 247; controls for RHo = 341; patients

for RHe = 134; controls for RHe = 168. Data are mean ± standard deviation. (b) Venn diagrams displaying high correlations of

recessive or dominant inheritance patterns with their known inheritance patterns. The asterisks denote two exceptional cases, *ACOX1*

and *C19orf12* (see text). (c) Allele frequency distribution of dominant and recessive variants. (d) PhyloP and amino acid conservation

differences between dominant and recessive missense variants. Amino acid conservation is determined by the number of vertebrate

species that contain an amino acid that is different from its human orthologous residue. The solid lines denote medians and the dotted

lines denote means. (e) Distributions of o/e LoF values for dominant and recessive genes found from KND patients (left) and dominant

and recessive genes from OMIM (right) plotted against all genes and known haploinsufficiency genes (n = 291) [43]. (f) Functional

differences between dominant and recessive genes by GO analysis. Ontologies in dark blue suggest non-neuronal signals specific to

the recessive gene group. (g) Relative position of LoF variants in genes. Positions of pathogenic LoF variants in genes from KND

patients are plotted against those LoF variant positions from all genes in gnomAD.

Fig. 3. Screen for rare severe neurodevelopmental disorder carriers. (a) A schematic diagram describing processes used to

estimate neurodevelopmental disorder carrier frequency in the Korean population. The dotted lines in the map denote the Korea Train

Express network, the high-speed railway system of Korea. (b-d) Distribution differences of various parameters between pathogenic

recessive variants from KND patients and gnomAD variants from the same genes that were found in KND patients. (b) Allele frequency.

The rare frequency portion of the left panel is seperately plotted in the right panel. (c) PhyloP and amino acid conservation. The solid

lines denote medians and the dotted lines denote means. (d) CADD, GERP and SIFT. (e) Recessive variants found from KND patients,

o/e LoF values, and accumulated frequencies of LoF and ClinVar variants from gnomAD East Asians (EAS) for genes that harbor

known pathogenic recessive variants in KND patients. Finally, portion that were attributable to ClinVar or LoF variants for pre-screening

parents for each recessive gene are shown.

 Table 1. Clinical information of 553 patients

Sex (*n* (%))	
Male	265 (47.9)
Female	288 (52.1)
Age at symptom onset (years)	1.4 (0-21)
Age at first access to a tertiary hospital (years)	1.8 (0-22)
Interval between symptom onset and first medical access (months)	3.9 (0-238)
Number of visited tertiary hospitals for diagnosis (*n* (%))	
1	62 (11.2)
2	277 (50.1)
3	178 (32.2)
4	32 (5.8)
5	4 (0.7)
Age at WES (years)	7.4 (0-37)
Interval between the first access and WES (months)	
Patients aged 0-10 years	34.0 (0-100)
Patients aged >10 years	114.5 (7-434)
Primary clinical diagnosis (*n* (%))	
Rett syndrome-like encephalopathy	72 (13.0)
Mitochondrial encephalopathy	49 (8.9)
Epileptic encephalopathy	51 (9.2)
Neuromuscular disorder	37 (6.7)
Leukodystrophy	27 (4.9)
Hereditary spastic paraplegia	34 (6.1)
Others	283 (51.2)
Number of involved specialists for diagnosis (*n* (%))	
1-2	378 (68.4)
3-5	152 (27.5)
> 5	23 (4.2)
Straight-line distance from home to the clinic, km (*n* (%))	
< 20	186 (33.6)
20-100	180 (32.5)

> 100	187 (33.8)

Table 2. Notable cases where WES-based analysis conferred correct diagnoses or changed medical treatment strategies

Initial clinical problem	Causal gene	Modified clinical interpretation (MIM number)	Significance of WES-based patient evaluation (treatment)	References
Developmental regression with Rett syndrome-like phenotype	*ST3GAL5*	Salt and pepper developmental regression syndrome (#609056)	Identified the molecular defect and established an accurate diagnosis	[44, 45]
Hypotonia and motor delay followed by lower extremity weakness	*DYNC1H1*	Spinal muscular atrophy, lower extremity-predominant 1, AD (#158600)	Diagnosed a case with pleiotropic and evolving symptoms	[46]
Early onset hypotonia, sacral mass, congenital heart disease, and facial dysmorphism	*ASAH1*	Farber lipogranulomatosis (#228000)	Corrected a misdiagnosis	[47]
Ataxia followed by generalized dystonia	*ANO3*	Expanded spectrum of dystonia 24 (#615034)	Suggested a treatment strategy that resulted in gradual improvement within one year (deep brain stimulation)	[48]
Focal lower leg dystonia, dystonic gait	*SLC2A1*	GLUT1 deficiency syndrome 2 (#612126)	Identified disease-specific treatment that resulted in near-elimination of dystonia (ketogenic diet)	[49]
Leigh syndrome	*SLC19A3*	Thiamine metabolism dysfunction syndrome 2 (#606152)	Identified disease-specific treatment that resulted in clinical improvements in dystonia, spasticity, and cognitive function (supplements of thiamine and biotin)	[50]
Recurrent infections,	*TMEM173*	STING-associated vasculopathy,	Provided a rationale for a new	[42]

telangiectatic skin mottling, and brain infarctions		infantile-onset (#615934)	treatment strategy that improved the skin lesions (tofacitinib treatment)	
Severe global developmental delay, seizures, and acanthotic skin lesions	*RAB11B*	Neurodevelopmental disorder with ataxic gait, absent speech, and decreased cortical white matter (#617807)	Identified a new disease gene leading to a neurodevelopmental syndrome	[51]