Immune genes, *IL1β* and *Casp9,* show sexual dimorphic methylation patterns in

the zebrafish gonads

Caballero-Huertas M., Moraleda-Prados J., Joly S., Ribas L.*

Institute of Marine Sciences, Spanish National Research Council (ICM-CSIC)

Passeig Marítim de la Barceloneta, 37–49. 08003. Barcelona

*Correspondence:

Dr. Laia Ribas. Tel. +34–932309547; e-mail lribas@icm.csic.es

Keywords: sexual dimorphism, epimarkers, methylation, gene expression, immune,

gonads

Abstract

There is a crosstalk between the immune and the reproductive systems in which sexual dimorphism is a common pattern in vertebrates. In the last years, epigenetics has emerged as a way to study the molecular mechanisms involved during gonadal development, which are responsible to integrate environmental information that contributes to assign a specific sexual phenotype (either an ovary or a testis). In the fish gonads, it is known of the existence of the reproduction-immune system interactions although the epigenetic mechanisms involved are far to be elucidated. Here, we used the zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) as a model to study the DNA methylation patterns of two well-known innate immune genes: *IL1β* and *Casp9*. DNA methylation levels were studied by a candidate gene approach at single nucleotide resolution and further, gene expression analysis were carried out. Results showed that there was clear sexual dimorphism in the DNA methylation levels of the two immune studied genes, being significantly higher in the testes when compared to the ovaries. In summary, and although much research is needed, here we present two potential candidates as epimarkers with forthcoming applications in the livestock and fish farming production, for example, in immune fish diseases or sexual control programs.

1. Introduction

Epigenetic definition has been subjected to controversy (Deans and Maggert, 2015) but, in general terms, it could be defined as the set of reactions conditioned by the cellular environment that are responsible to change DNA activity and gene expression without altering the nucleotide sequence (Moore et al., 2013). These mechanisms enclose changes in histone conformation (e.g., chromatin packaging), DNA methylation and regulation by non-coding RNAs (Qiu, 2006). DNA methylation is the best characterized epigenetic modification functioning on the pre-transcriptional control in several biological processes, such as cell differentiation or genomic imprinting (Jones and Takai, 2001). Epigenetic changes (or epimutations) can be inherited cell to cell through mitotic divisions or throughout subsequent generations by meiotic divisions (Dupont et al., 2009; Hanson and Skinner, 2016). Inheritable epimutations need to occur in the primordial germ cells (PGCs) during embryo formation, which in humans appeared during 6-18 weeks of gestation (Jirtle and Skinner, 2007) and in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) approximately around 1,000 cells (Koprunner et al., 2001). In addition, gametogenesis in the gonads, i.e., sperm and oocyte formation, is a sensitive window to promote transgenerational epimutation changes that will be transferred to the following phenotypes (Daxinger and Whitelaw, 2012). Thus, understanding the underlied molecular mechanisms of these epimutations in the gonads needs to be at the forefront of the research.

In the fish gonads, the first study showing the interaction between epigenetics and sexual development was published eight years ago in the European sea bass, *Dicentrarchus labrax*, showing that methylation of the gonadal aromatase (*cyp19a1a*) promoter was altered in the ovaries of adult females previously exposed

to high temperature during early stages of development (Navarro-Martin et al.,

2011). Since then, other studies, including in this fish species (Anastasiadi et al.,

2017; Anastasiadi et al., 2018b) have been have evidenced the important role of the

epigenetic mechanisms in the gonads. This is the case, for example, in half-smooth

tongue sole, *Cynoglossus semilaevis* (Shao et al., 2014), Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis*

niloticus, (Wang et al., 2017) or barramundi, *Lates calcarifer* (Domingos et al., 2018),

among others (reviewed in Piferrer et al. (2019), all of them revealing the importance

of the methylation processes in reproduction-related genes in the ovaries or in the

testes and so pointing out the sexual dimorphic epigenetic patterns.

Sexual dimorphism refers to phenotypic differences between the two sexes within a

species. In fish, sexual dimorphism is present in a large number of species being

females much larger than males, for example in turbot, *Scophtalmus maximus*

(Imsland et al., 1997) or E. sea bass (Saillant et al., 2001) or conversely, males much

larger than females, for example in Nile tilapia (Toguyeni et al., 1997) or rainbow

trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss* (Bonnet et al., 1999). Sexual dimorphism not only

manifests by morphological traits such as growth, but also by behavior (Magurran

and Garcia, 2000) or by molecular mechanisms (e.g., gene expression). Sex-biased

gene expression has implications beyond evolutionary biology due to the existence of

a predominant expression in one sex (Ellegren and Parsch, 2007). Thus, in human,

for example, transcriptomic sex-related differences are more remarkable in the

gonads, although other tissues such as brain, muscle or liver also exist (Mele et al.,

2015). In fish, transcriptomic studies identifying both the number of expressed genes

between ovaries and testes and the interactions of sex-specific pathways have been

carried out in several fish species such as zebrafish (Small et al., 2009), turbot (Ribas

et al., 2016), guppy, *Poecilia reticulata* (Sharma et al., 2014) or E. sea bass (Ribas et

al., 2019).

With clinical purposes, in human, many epigenetic studies address sexual

dimorphism, for example, in brain, showing differences in the methylation levels

(Matsuda et al., 2012) but the vast majority are focusing on the sex-related

differences in diseases responses. It is well documented that woman are more

resilient against infectious and some non-infectious diseases such as cancer but at the

same time, they are more susceptible to autoimmune diseases (Kirsch-Volders et al.,

2010; Ghosh and Klein, 2017). Such research is an emerging field in which the

underlying mechanisms of these sexual dimorphic responses are far to be elucidated,

though it is known, that the epigenetics mechanisms play important roles (reviewed

in Klein and Flanagan (2016).

Gonads are immune-privileged sites as they need to prevent immune responses

against meiotic germ cells (Maddocks and Setchell, 1990). Immune cells present

sexual steroid receptors not only in mammals (Kovats et al., 2010) but also in fish

(Chaves-Pozo et al., 2018). Thus, sexual steroids regulate the immune system in

addition to classical reproduction-related functions in vertebrates. In fish,

immunotoxicology field has developed more of the research concerning the

interactions between the reproduction and the immune systems because large number

of endocrine disruptors can mimic sex steroids and in turn, activate the immune

system (Milla et al., 2011). Further, expression of immune-related genes during

gonadal development have been described in some fish species like gilthead

seabream, *Sparus aurata* L. (Chaves-Pozo et al., 2008; Chaves-Pozo et al., 2009) or

turbot (Ribas et al., 2016). In sea bream, a protandrous hermaphroditic teleost, a

massive infiltration of an immune cell type (acidophilic granulocyte) is required to

degenerate the testis for phenotype sex-change (Liarte et al., 2007). In zebrafish,

gonads are first developed as an ovarian-like organ to latter half of the population

activates apoptotic and tp53 signaling pathways that drive to the testis phenotype

(Rodríguez-Marí et al., 2010; Liew and Orban, 2014).

Taken together, there is evidence of immune-reproduction interactions in the fish

gonads that are able to maintain physiological and molecular changes. Nevertheless,

the role of epigenetic mechanisms in regulating these changes by a sex-dependent

manner is unknown. We address this gap by studying the methylation levels in the

zebrafish ovaries and testes of two well-known innate immune genes: interleukin 1

beta, *IL1β*, a proinflammatory multifunctional cytokine involved in a variety of

cellular activities (Secombes et al., 2011) and caspase 9, *Casp9*, a cysteine proteases

that plays an essential role in the mitochondria-mediated cell death pathway

(Sakamaki and Satou, 2009). We performed a candidate gene approach method

(Methylation Bisulfite Sequencing, MBS) which allowed to analyze at single

nucleotide resolution, high coverage and single CpG sites in the desired regions

(Anastasiadi et al., 2018b). In parallel, gene expression of these two immune genes were

studied together with methylation levels by correlation analysis.

2. Material and methods

2.1. Fish husbandry

AB zebrafish were housed in the fish facilities at the Institute of Marine Sciences

(ICM- CSIC, Barcelona) following standard conditions (Ribas and Piferrer, 2014)

with an appropriate density levels (8 fish/L) to avoid induced masculinization (Ribas

et al., 2017). Fish were reared in a close-circuit system (Aquaneering, San Diego,

CA, USA) in a monitored chamber: photoperiod of 12:12 hours, environmental

temperature of $26 \pm 1°C$ and humidity of $50 \pm 3\%$. Physicochemical parameters of

the water were monitored daily: temperature $(28 \pm 0.2°C)$, pH (7.2 ± 0.5),

conductivity (750-900 μS) and dissolved oxygen (6.5-7.0 mg l $^{-1}$). Ammonia, nitrate

and nitrite water levels were checked weekly by a commercial colorimetric test (Test

kit Individual Aquarium Water Test Kit, API, United Kingdom).

2.2 Ethics statement

The animal procedure for the present study was licensed by Bioethical Committee of

the Generalitat de Catalunya with the reference code 9977 and approved by the

Spanish National Research Council (CSIC) Ethics Committee within the project

AGL2013–41047–R. European regulations of animal welfare (ETS N8 123, 01/01/91

and 2010/63/EU) were respected regarding fish rearing and maintenance. Fish

facilities in the ICM were validated for animal experimentation by the Ministry of

Agriculture and Fisheries (certificate number 08039–46–A) in accordance with the

Spanish law (R.D. 223 of March 1988).

2.3 Fish sampling

A total of ten females and ten males from adult zebrafish at 90 dpf were euthanized

on iced water followed by decapitation, and total weight (precision ± 0.05 g),

standard length (SL, precision ± 0.01 cm) were recorded. Under magnifying glass,

gonads were sexed, dissected and flash frozen in liquid nitrogen and kept at -80ºC for

further analysis.

2.4 Methylation analysis

Methylation levels of the ovaries and testes were analyzed following the protocol

described in (Anastasiadi et al., 2018b). Briefly, genomic DNA was isolated from 20

gonads and a unique library was prepared by pooling the *IL1β* and *Casp9* amplicons

for all the samples. For each fish, DNA was extracted from half of the gonad which

was lysed by by one microgram (1 μg) of proteinase K (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis,

Missouri) overnight at 65ºC and the following day, a standard phenol-chloroform-

isoamyl alcohol protocol with ribonuclease A (PureLink RNase A, Life

Technologies) was performed. Five hundred nanograms of DNA per sample were

bisulfite-converted using the EZ DNA Methylation-Direct™ Kit (ZymoResearch;

D5023).

2.5 Primer design

Primers were designed for bisulfite converted DNA using MethPrimer tool (Li and

Dahiya, 2002) with an amplicon size of 459 and 441 for *IL1β* and *Casp9*,

respectively. Amplicon regions included the promoter, the first intron and the first

exon as much as possible (Figure 1, Table S1). The adaptor sequences for 16S

metagenomic library preparation (Illumina) were added to the 5 ends of the primers

designed: Forward-TCGTCGGCAGCGTCAGATGTGTATAAGAGACAG and

Reverse-GTCTCGTGGGCTCGGAGATGTGTATAAGAGACAG. The target

regions included a total of nine for *IL1β* and 19 for *Casp9* CpGs, respectively. Primer

specificities were previously validated by Sanger sequencing of amplicons from a pool

of samples.

2.6 Amplification of target regions and library preparation

Targeted-regions were obtained from bisulfited DNA (25 ng per sample) by 30

cycles of PCR using specific primers: 7 min at 95ºC, followed by 40 cycles of 95ºC

for 1 min, annealing temperature (55ºC and 54ºC for *IL1β* and *Casp9*, respectively)

for 2 min and 65ºC for 2 min, with a final step at 65ºC for 10 min. Obtained targeted

amplicons were size-selected and normalized by magnetic beads was (Fisher

09981123) following the protocol described in (Anastasiadi et al., 2018b). PCR

products were indexed by Nextera XT index Kit Set A and Set D (Illumina; FC-131–

2001 and FC-131–2004) according to Illumina's protocol for 16S metagenomic

library preparation. PCR products were pooled in an equimolar manner to obtain a

single multiplexed library which was sequenced on a MiSeq (Illumina, San Diego,

California) using the paired-end 250 bp protocol at the National Center of Genomic

Analysis (CNAG, Barcelona).

2.7 Biocomputational analysis

Raw data from the sequencer were demultiplexed and Nextera adapters were

removed using Trim Galore! software (v. 0.4.5) (Babraham Bioinformatics) and low

quality bases were filtered (Phred score < 20). Pre- and post-trim quality control was

carried out with MultiQC to ensure that the adapters were cut off correctly (Ewels et

al., 2016). Bismark (v.20.0) was used to generate an *in silico* bisulfite converted

zebrafish genome (danRer11) as a reference template for alignments (Krueger and

Andrews, 2011). Bisulfite conversion efficiency was calculated for each sample with

a minimum threshold of 99.0%. One ovarian sample did not passed the minimum

thresholds and therefore was deleted. The coordinate positions of all CpG sites were

obtained by using "BSgenome.Drerio.UCSC.danRer10" package from BSgenome

226   (Pagès, 2018). The coordinates of the CpG sites of the targeted genes was assessed

227   by BED tools methodology (Quinlan and Hall, 2010) through bedr package (v. 1.0.4)

228   (Haider et al., 2017). From the targeted CpG sites, only those that showed coverage

229   >10 times were retained for statistical analysis. Raw sequencing data was submitted

230   in the NCBI with the accession number: GSE134291.

232   2.8 Gene expression analysis

Gene expression analyses were carried out with half of the gonadal tissue from the

same individuals that were used for methylation analysis except for two fish per sex

in which no more samples were available. RNA was extracted with chloroform by

TRIzol (T9424, Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, Missouri) according to manufacturer's

procedures. Quality of the RNA was measured by ND-1000 spectrophotometer

(NanoDrop Technologies) and quality was checked on a 1% agarose gel. By

following supplier indications, 150 ng of RNA were treated with DNAse I,

Amplification Grade (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., USA) and retrotranscribed to

cDNA with SuperScript III RNase Transcriptase (Invitrogen, Spain) and Random

hexamer (Invitrogen, Spain). Quantitative PCR (qPCR) was carried out in triplicate

for each sample and two housekeeping genes were used. cDNA samples were mixed

with Eva Green chemistry (87H24-001; Cultek), being the cycling parameters: 50°C

for 2 min, 95°C for 10 min, followed by 40 cycles of 95°C for 15 s and 60°C for 1

min. qPCRs were run in triplicate in optically clear 384-well plates (CFX-386, Touch

BioRad). Dissociation step, primers efficiency curves and PCR product sequencing

by Sanger, confirmed the specificity for each primer pair. Primer sequences used for

gene expression study are shown in Table S2.

2.9 Statistical analysis

All statistical analyses were carried out using R software (v. 3.4.4). Data were
expressed as mean ± SEM and the differences were considered significant
when $P < 0.05$. Graphs were generated either by using the ggplot2 package (v. 3.1.0)
(Wickham, 2016) or Sigma Plot (v. S13.0).

Methylation levels were calculated by averaging the values of each CpG per gene
and per sample, whereas for the CpG-specific approach the means per individual
CpGs per sample were considered. DNA methylation were evaluated by one-way
ANOVA followed by a Tukey's HSD test. Normality was tested by the Shapiro-Wilk
test and, when normality was not followed, methylation proportions logit
transformed and a robust non parametric two-way ANOVA was applied by using the
WRS2 package (v. 0.9.2) (Mair and Wilcox, 2016).

Statistics on gene expression data was calculated by the 2ΔΔCt method (Livak and
Schmittgen, 2001; Schmittgen and Livak, 2008). Data from qPCR were analyzed for
normality and homogeneity of variances by using the Kolmogorov–Smirnov and
Levene's test, respectively and significance between two groups was analyzed by t-
Student test. For DNA methylation and gene expression correlation analyses, a
Spearman's rank correlation (ρ) test was applied using the corrplot package (v. 0.84)
(Wei et al., 2017).

3. Results

3.1 Sequencing results

The total number of read-pairs that passed the Illumina filter for all 20 samples

ranged between 30,000–243,000 read-pairs with an average of 97894.7 ± 47209.8

(mean ±SD) and the bisulfite conversion rate was >99.5% for all samples producing

0.936 Gb of data. MultiQC summary confirmed that sequence quality post trimming

passed the quality controls and were within the accepted thresholds.

3.2 Methylation patterns show sexual dimorphism

Global methylation were significantly higher in testes than ovaries of adult zebrafish

for *IL1β* ($P < 0.001$) and *Casp9* ($P < 0.05$) genes (Fig. 2A and Fig.3A). The percent

levels for *IL1β* were 89.7 ± 3.8 and 61.4 ± 5.5 in testes and ovaries, respectively and

for *Casp9* were 0.62 ± 0.04 and 0.56 ± 0.12 in testes and ovaries, respectively.

In *IL1β*, eight out of nine analyzed CpGs showed significant differences of the

methylation levels between ovaries and testes ($P < 0.001$) (Fig.2B). Only CpG9 was

not significant. In *Casp9*, four out of nineteen CpGs showed significant difference in

the methylation levels between ovaries and testes which significant levels varied

among CpG positions: CpG2 and CpG18 $P < 0.001$; CpG3 $P < 0.01$ and CpG 6 $P <$

0.05 (Fig.3B).

3.3 Gene expression

The fold change of *IL1β* expression in the testis was seven times higher than that of

ovary ($P < 0.01$) in adult zebrafish (Fig.4A). However, no significant differences in

gene expression were found for *Casp9* gene when testes and ovaries were compared

(Fig.4B).

3.4 Correlations methylation vs. gene expression

Negative correlation patterns between methylation and gene expression levels were observed for both *IL1β* and *Casp9* genes in testes and ovaries of adult zebrafish, though no significance differences were obtained (Fig. 5). The strongest correlation was found in the testes for *IL1β* gene ($\rho = -0.5$).

4. Discussion

The main immune signaling pathways are conserved in fish (Stein et al., 2007) in which the innate response is the essential immunity to cope immune challenges (Press and Evensen, 1999) although evidence of the required role of the adaptive immunity have been emerged in the last years (Secombes and Belmonte, 2016). The innate response is the earliest immune mechanism characterized by being nonspecific and therefore not depending upon previous recognition of the surface structures of the invader (Tort et al., 2003). It has also the advantage of being inducible by external molecules but at the same time is constitutive and reacts within a very short time scale thorough inflammatory pathways (Bayne and Gerwick, 2001). Interleukins constitute a large group of cytokines involved in the specific immune defense by recruiting leukocytes to a site of infection to initiate inflammation (Brocker et al., 2010). *IL1β*, together with IL6 and tumor necrosis factor alpha (TNFα), are one of the main actors involved in the first inflammatory response (Smith et al., 2000). *IL1β*, once it is cleaved by caspase 1 into a mature form, it is able to bind to its receptor leading the activation of the nuclear factor (NF)-kβ pathway (Martin and Falk, 1997). Caspases, including *Casp9*, are a family of protease enzymes that play essential roles in the apoptotic pathways and in the inflammasome of the cells (McIlwain et al., 2013; Shalini et al., 2015).

In vertebrates, and in some invertebrates such as parasites, reproductive and immune

systems are interconnected playing sexual-dependent molecular functions (Folstad

and Karter, 1992; Nunn et al., 2009). In human, testes contain immune cells such

leukocytes and macrophages in the interstitial compartment that are involved in

gametogenesis and Leyding cell development (Li et al., 2012). $IL1\alpha$ is mostly

produced by spermatocytes but also by Sertoli cells and its production is stage-

specific (Haugen et al., 1994; Lie et al., 2012). In human ovaries, $IL1\alpha$ mediates

inflammatory processes during ovulation, fertilization and oocyte implantation

(Polan et al., 1991; Garcia-Velasco and Arici, 1999) and it is highly expressed in

ovarian cancers (Aggarwal and Gehlot, 2009). In sea bream gonads, $IL1\beta$ was found

in the cytoplasm of spermatogonia, spermatocytes and oogonia and its expression

was higher during reproductive cycles suggesting a role in promoting proliferation in

gametogenesis and spermatocyte differentiation (Chaves-Pozo et al., 2008). The two

cytokines, $IL1\beta$ and $TNF\alpha$ modulated the *in vitro* testosterone production in goldfish

testis indicating their role in regulating sex steroids (Lister and van der Kraak, 2002).

In the present work, we report a higher expression of $IL1\beta$ in testes when compared

to ovaries in adult zebrafish according to what previously found by Lee et al. (2017),

thus indicating that $IL1\beta$ is expressed in a sex-dependent manner in fish. We did not

find significant difference in *Casp9* expression between testes and ovaries although

higher expression in testes was also observed. In contrast, in protogynous black sea

bass (*Centropristis striata*) ovaries expressed *Casp9* twice as much as testes,

although gene expression patterns related to atresia differs among gonochoristic and

hermaphroditic species (Breton et al., 2019). It is described that in zebrafish, during

gonad development, activation of apoptotic pathways are required for testes

development (Liew and Orban, 2014), including specifically the expression of *Casp9*

(Pradhan and Olsson, 2014), thus we might have observed the remaining activation

of the pro-male machinery during testicular development.

Epigenetic modifications occurred in the host genome by pathogens after infections

altering the transcription and the corresponding signaling pathways of the host (Marr

et al., 2014). The understanding of epigenetic host-pathogen interactions is a

flourishing research field to untangle the sophisticated cellular strategies (Gomez-

Diaz et al., 2012). In humans, plenty of studies give evidence of rapid change in

DNA methylation of the innate immune cells to face infections (Sinclair et al., 2015;

Wiencke et al., 2016; Pacis et al., 2019) and the importance of the epigenetic

mechanisms in reprograming the immunity (Netea et al., 2016). In contrast, less data

is found in fish. Recent findings in guppy (*Poecilia reticulate*) showed changes in

DNA methylation dynamics after host–parasite interactions (Hu et al., 2018) and in

Atlantic salmon (*Salmon salar*) showed that stress response together with immune

challenges, altered transcriptome and methylome of the gills through immune

responses (Uren Webster et al., 2018). In zebrafish, viral infections showed that

histone modification was able to increase methylation levels of the gene promoters

associated with innate immune response in head kidney, liver, spleen and heart

(Medina-Gali et al., 2018). Surprisingly, to our knowledge, no data on epigenetic

mediating infections in the immune system in the fish gonads are currently found.

It is estimated that in zebrafish, global methylation in sperm is nearly 95% of CG

dinucleotides are methylated while in oocytes are ~75% methylated (Jiang et al.,

2013; Potok et al., 2013). Therefore, it may be said that the product of mature germ

cells already possess methylation sexual dimorphism. Here, by a candidate gene

approach method, we found higher methylation levels in the two studied immune

genes (*IL1β* and *Casp9*) in the testes when compared to ovaries thus evidencing sex-

specificity of the methylation programs in the fish gonads. Likewise, significant

differences were found in specific CpG sites for each of the targeted regions, in

which eight out of nine and four out of nineteen of the studied CpGs for *IL1β* and

Casp9, respectively, showed significant differences in the methylation levels

between the two sexes. Global DNA methylation levels between these two immune

cells differ in magnitude being ~73% and ~0.62% (percent methylation mean in

ovaries and testes) in *IL1β* and *Casp9*, respectively. Although low levels were found

in *Casp9* gene, percent difference between ovaries and testes of the four CpG

significantly methylated was ~2%. In a similar manner, differences in the

methylation levels (5.2%) were enough to observed epigenetic transgenerational

effects in the insulin growth factor (IGF) 2 promoter in the siblings of those mothers

famished in the Second World War (methylation levels for IGF2 ranged from 0.517-

0.488 in all studied groups) (Heijmans et al., 2008). Thus, low but significant

changes in DNA methylation levels might induce epigenetic changes.

Analysis of gene expression and methylation levels showed negative, although not

significant, correlations among the four studied comparisons. Conventionally, higher

methylation levels in the gene promoters have been associated with transcriptional

silencing (Illingworth and Bird, 2009; Straussman et al., 2009). However, gene

expression inhibition have been related to other genomic features like the first exon

and the first intron of the gene body not only in human (Blattler et al., 2014) but also

in fish (Anastasiadi et al., 2018a). Further, the approach here performed for studying

the methylation levels is limited to amplicons about ~500 bp, that even with the

intention of include promotor, first intron and first exon in the targeted regions, the

entire gene body and possible enhancers involved in the gene regulation were not

fully studied. Thus, to tackle this physical barrier, wide genomic approaches need to

be performed.

In tilapia, genome-wide methylation analysis identified sexually dimorphic

methylated regions along specific genomic regions (Wan et al., 2016) as well as in

zebrafish brain, global methylation differences were found between males and

females (Chatterjee et al., 2016). Thus, both studies, pointed out the importance of

the sexual dimorphic methylation patterns in fish. Our results supports that sexual

dimorphism defined the methylation patterns in two immune genes in the gonads and

so the sex-biased differences need to take into account when analyzing the immune

responses in fish. In fact, human research on sex-based differences in immune

responses are bringing to light the importance of considering sex when analyzing the

data in such a way that funding agencies and journals have launched policies to

analyze and publish research based on sex and gender in biomedical sciences (Klein

and Flanagan, 2016). Thus, sexual dimorphic differences need to be included for

good data interpretation.

Over the last few years, epigenetic marks have been implemented to predict, among

others, phenotypic features. This is the case, for example, in the identification of

clinical biomarkers to predict cancer predisposition or other diseases (Jubb and

Harris, 2010; Tabernero et al., 2015). In animal production, epigenetic biomarkers to

predict the sex of the offspring in E. sea bass has been stated as an important step

towards improving sex control programs in aquaculture farms (Anastasiadi et al.,

2018b). The present study shows, for the first time, the presence of sexual

dimorphism in the DNA methylation profiles of two immune genes in the fish

gonads that might be useful, for example, to develop sexual epimarkers but also to

other applications such as fish diseases research. Further studies need to cover the

methylation patterns of these two immune genes when fish are subjected to immune

challenges and to see whether dimorphic sex-specific patterns are present when

facing immunological diseases.

6. Declaration of interest

The authors declare non-financial competing interests.

7. Funding

This study was supported by the Spanish Ministry of Science grant AGL2015-73864-

JIN "Ambisex" to LR. LR and JM were supported by Ambisex contracts.

Figure legends

Figure 1. Schematic view of the amplicon region studied by Methylation

Bisulfite Sequencing (MBS) method for *IL1β* (A) and *Casp9* (B) genes. The

amplicon length for the *IL1β* was 459 bp and for Casp9 441 bp. A total of 9 CpG

were studied for *IL1β* and 19 CpG for Casp9. Accession numbers were NM212844.2

and NM001007404.2 for *IL1β* and Casp9, respectively.

Figure 2. Methylation levels of *IL1β* gene in adult zebrafish gonads. (a) Global

DNA methylation percent found in ovaries and testes. (b) DNA methylation percent

for each of the nine CpG analyzed. Number of individuals studied; N = 9 ovaries and

N = 10 testes. Data shown as mean ± sem. Significant differences *** (P < 0.001).

Figure 3. Methylation levels of *Casp9* gene in adult zebrafish gonads. (a) Global

DNA methylation percent found in ovaries and testes. (b) DNA methylation percent

for each of the 19 CpG analyzed. Number of individuals studied; N = 9 ovaries and

N = 10 testes. Data shown as mean ± SEM. Significant differences * P<0.05, ** P <

0.01, ***P < 0.001.

Figure 4. *IL1β* and *Casp9* expression profiles in adult zebrafish gonads. Data shown

as mean ± SEM of fold change using control values set at 1. Sample size *n* = 10

gonad per sex. Significant differences between sexes were analysed by Student's *t*

test, *** *P* < 0.001.

Figure 5. Correlations DNA methylation and gene expression of *IL1β* and *Casp9*

genes. Correlations are shown by Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (ρ). The

direction of the long axis of the ellipses and the color indicate the type of correlation:

negative is shown in red and positive is in blue shade. The short axis of the ellipse

and the intensity of the color are proportional to the correlation coefficients.

Significant differences are considered when $*= P < 0.05$; $**= P < 0.01$; $*** = P <$

0.001.

Supplementary table legends

Table S1. Information related to the amplicons studied by Methylation Bisulfite

Sequencing (MBS)

Table S2. Primer information for gene expression analysis of *IL1β* and *Casp9* genes

References

Aggarwal, B.B., Gehlot, P., 2009. Inflammation and cancer: how friendly is
the relationship for cancer patients? Curr. Opin. Pharm. 9, 351-369.

Anastasiadi, D., Diaz, N., Piferrer, F., 2017. Small ocean temperature
increases elicit stage-dependent changes in DNA methylation and gene expression in
a fish, the European sea bass. Sci. Rep. 7.

Anastasiadi, D., Esteve-Codina, A., Piferrer, F., 2018a. Consistent inverse
correlation between DNA methylation of the first intron and gene expression across
tissues and species. Epigenet. Chromatin 11, 37.

Anastasiadi, D., Vandeputte, M., Sanchez-Baizan, N., Allal, F., Piferrer, F.,
2018b. Dynamic epimarks in sex-related genes predict gonad phenotype in the
European sea bass, a fish with mixed genetic and environmental sex determination.
Epigenetics 13, 988-1011.

Bayne, C.J., Gerwick, L., 2001. The acute phase response and innate
immunity of fish. Dev. Comp. Immunol. 25, 725-743.

Blattler, A., Yao, L.J., Witt, H., Guo, Y., Nicolet, C.M., Berman, B.P.,
Farnham, P.J., 2014. Global loss of DNA methylation uncovers intronic enhancers in
genes showing expression changes. Genome Biol. 15.

Bonnet, S., Haffray, P., Blanc, J.M., Vallee, F., Vauchez, C., Faure, A.,
Fauconneau, B., 1999. Genetic variation in growth parameters until commercial size
in diploid and triploid freshwater rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) and seawater
brown trout (*Salmo trutta*). Aquaculture 173, 359-375.

Breton, T.S., Kenter, L.W., Greenlaw, K., Montgomery, J., Goetz, G.W.,
Berlinsky, D.L., Luckenbach, J.A., 2019. Initiation of sex change and gonadal gene

expression in black sea bass (*Centropristis striata*) exposed to exemestane, an aromatase inhibitor. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. A Mol. Integr. Physiol. 228, 51-61.

Brocker, C., Thompson, D., Matsumoto, A., Nebert, D.W., Vasiliou, V., 2010. Evolutionary divergence and functions of the human interleukin (IL) gene family. Hum. Genomics 5, 30.

Chatterjee, A., Lagisz, M., Rodger, E.J., Zhen, L., Stockwell, P.A., Duncan, E.J., Horsfield, J.A., Jeyakani, J., Mathavan, S., Ozaki, Y., Nakagawa, S., 2016. Sex differences in DNA methylation and expression in zebrafish brain: a test of an extended 'male sex drive' hypothesis. Gene 590, 307-316.

Chaves-Pozo, E., Garcia-Ayala, A., Cabas, I., 2018. Effects of sex steroids on fish leukocytes. Biology - Basel 7, 9-9.

Chaves-Pozo, E., Liarte, S., Fernandez-Alacid, L., Abellan, E., Meseguer, J., Mulero, V., Garcia-Ayala, A., 2008. Pattern of expression of immune-relevant genes in the gonad of a teleost, the gilthead seabream (*Sparus aurata* L.). Mol. Immunol. 45, 2998-3011.

Chaves-Pozo, E., Liarte, S., Mulero, I., Abellan, E., Meseguer, J., Garcia-Ayala, A., 2009. Early presence of immune cells in the developing gonad of the gilthead seabream (*Sparus aurata* Linnaeus, 1758). J. Reprod. Dev. 55, 440-445.

Daxinger, L., Whitelaw, E., 2012. Understanding transgenerational epigenetic inheritance via the gametes in mammals. Nat. Rev. Genet. 13, 153-162.

Deans, C., Maggert, K.A., 2015. What do you mean, "Epigenetic"? Genetics 199, 887-896.

Domingos, J.A., Budd, A.M., Banh, Q.Q., Goldsbury, J.A., Zenger, K.R., Jerry, D.R., 2018. Sex-specific dmrt1 and cyp19a1 methylation and alternative splicing in gonads of the protandrous hermaphrodite barramundi. Plos One 13.

Dupont, C., Armant, D.R., Brenner, C.A., 2009. Epigenetics: definition,

mechanisms and clinical perspective. Semin. Reprod. Med. 27, 351-357.

Ellegren, H., Parsch, J., 2007. The evolution of sex-biased genes and sex-

biased gene expression. Nat. Rev. Genet. 8, 689-698.

Ewels, P., Magnusson, M., Lundin, S., Kaller, M., 2016. MultiQC:

summarize analysis results for multiple tools and samples in a single report.

Bioinformatics 32, 3047-3048.

Folstad, I., Karter, A.J., 1992. Parasites, bright males, and the

immunocompetence handicap. Am. Nat. 139, 603-622.

Garcia-Velasco, J.A., Arici, A., 1999. Chemokines and human reproduction.

Fertil. Steril. 71, 983-993.

Ghosh, S., Klein, R.S., 2017. Sex drives dimorphic immune responses to viral

infections. J. Immunol. 198, 1782-1790.

Gomez-Diaz, E., Jorda, M., Peinado, M.A., Rivero, A., 2012. Epigenetics of

host-pathogen interactions: the road ahead and the road behind. PLoS Pathog. 8,

e1003007.

Haider, S., Waggott, D., Lalonde, E., Fung, C., Liu, F.-F., Boutros, P.C.,

2017. A bedr way of genomic interval processing. Source Cod. Biol. Med. 12.

Hanson, M.A., Skinner, M.K., 2016. Developmental origins of epigenetic

transgenerational inheritance. Environ. Epigenet. 2.

Haugen, T.B., Landmark, B.F., Josefsen, G.M., Hansson, V., Hogset, A.,

1994. The mature form of interleukin-1-alpha is constitutively expressed in immature

male germ-cells from rat. Mol. Cell. Endocrinol. 105, R19-R23.

Heijmans, B.T., Tobi, E.W., Stein, A.D., Putter, H., Blauw, G.J., Susser, E.S.,

Slagboom, P.E., Lumey, L.H., 2008. Persistent epigenetic differences associated with

prenatal exposure to famine in humans. PNAS 105, 17046-17049.

Hu, J.T., Perez-Jvostov, F., Blondel, L., Barrett, R.D.H., 2018. Genome-wide

DNA methylation signatures of infection status in Trinidadian guppies (*Poecilia*

reticulata). Mol. Ecol. 27, 3087-3102.

Illingworth, R.S., Bird, A.P., 2009. CpG islands - 'A rough guide'. FEBS Lett.

583, 1713-1720.

Imsland, A.K., Folkvord, A., Grung, G.L., Stefansson, S.O., Taranger, G.L.,

1997. Sexual dimorphism in growth and maturation of turbot, *Scophthalmus*

maximus (Rafinesque, 1810). Aquacult. Res. 28, 101-114.

Jiang, L., Zhang, J., Wang, J.-J., Wang, L., Zhang, L., Li, G., Yang, X., Ma,

X., Sun, X., Cai, J., Zhang, J., Huang, X., Yu, M., Wang, X., Liu, F., Wu, C.-I., He,

C., Zhang, B., Ci, W., Liu, J., 2013. Sperm, but not oocyte, DNA methylome is

inherited by zebrafish early embryos. Cell 153, 773-784.

Jirtle, R.L., Skinner, M.K., 2007. Environmental epigenomics and disease

susceptibility. Nat. Rev. Genet. 8, 253-262.

Jones, P.A., Takai, D., 2001. The role of DNA methylation in mammalian

epigenetics. Science 293, 1068-1070.

Jubb, A.M., Harris, A.L., 2010. Biomarkers to predict the clinical efficacy of

bevacizumab in cancer. Lancet Oncol. 11, 1172-1183.

Kirsch-Volders, M., Bonassi, S., Herceg, Z., Hirvonen, A., Moller, L.,

Phillips, D.H., 2010. Gender-related differences in response to mutagens and

carcinogens. Mutagenesis 25, 213-221.

Klein, S.L., Flanagan, K.L., 2016. Sex differences in immune responses. Nature reviews. Immunology 16, 626-638.

Koprunner, M., Thisse, C., Thisse, B., Raz, E., 2001. A zebrafish nanos-related gene is essential for the development of primordial germ cells. Genes Dev. 15, 2877-2885.

Kovats, S., Carreras, E., Agrawal, H., 2010. Sex Steroid Receptors in Immune Cells.

Krueger, F., Andrews, S.R., 2011. Bismark: a flexible aligner and methylation caller for Bisulfite-Seq applications. Bioinformatics 27, 1571-1572.

Lee, S.L.J., Horsfield, J.A., Black, M.A., Rutherford, K., Fisher, A., Gemmell, N.J., 2017. Histological and transcriptomic effects of 17 alpha-methyltestosterone on zebrafish gonad development. BMC Genom. 18.

Li, L.C., Dahiya, R., 2002. MethPrimer: designing primers for methylation PCRs. Bioinformatics 18, 1427-1431.

Li, N., Wang, T., Han, D., 2012. Structural, cellular and molecular aspects of immune privilege in the testis. Front. Immunol. 3, 152-152.

Liarte, S., Chaves-Pozo, E., Garcia-Alcazar, A., Mulero, V., Meseguer, J., Garcia-Ayala, A., 2007. Testicular involution prior to sex change in gilthead seabream is characterized by a decrease in DMRT1 gene expression and by massive leukocyte infiltration. Reprod. Biol. Endocrinol. 5.

Lie, P.P.Y., Cheng, C.Y., Mruk, D.D., 2012. The biology of interleukin-1: emerging concepts in the regulation of the actin cytoskeleton and cell junction dynamics. Cell. Mol. Life Sci. 69, 487-500.

Liew, W.C., Orban, L., 2014. Zebrafish sex: a complicated affair. Brief. Funct. Genomics 13, 172-187.

Lister, A., van der Kraak, G., 2002. Modulation of goldfish testicular

testosterone production in vitro by tumor necrosis factor alpha, interleukin-1 beta,

and macrophage conditioned media. J. Exp. Zool. 292, 477-486.

Livak, K.J., Schmittgen, T.D., 2001. Analysis of relative gene expression data

using real-time quantitative PCR and the 2(-Delta Delta C(T)) Method. Methods 25,

402-408.

Maddocks, S., Setchell, B.P., 1990. Recent-evidence for immune privilege in

the testis. J. Reprod. Immunol. 18, 9-18.

Magurran, A.E., Garcia, M., 2000. Sex differences in behaviour as an indirect

consequence of mating system. J. Fish Biol. 57, 839-857.

Mair, P., Wilcox, R., 2016. Robust statistical methods in r using the wrs2

package. Harvard Univ., Cambridge, MA, USA, Tech. Rep.

Marr, A.K., MacIsaac, J.L., Jiang, R., Airo, A.M., Kobor, M.S., McMaster,

W.R., 2014. *Leishmania donovani* infection causes distinct epigenetic DNA

methylation changes in host macrophages. PLoS Pathog. 10.

Martin, M.U., Falk, W., 1997. The interleukin-1 receptor complex and

interleukin-1 signal transduction. Eur. Cytokine Netw. 8, 5-17.

Matsuda, K.I., Mori, H., Kawata, M., 2012. Epigenetic mechanisms are

involved in sexual differentiation of the brain. Rev. Endocr. Metab. Disord. 13, 163-

171.

McIlwain, D.R., Berger, T., Mak, T.W., 2013. Caspase functions in cell death

and disease. CSH Perspect Biol 5.

Medina-Gali, R., Bello-Perez, M., Martinez-Lopez, A., Falco, A., Ortega-

Villaizan, M.M., Encinar, J.A., Novo, B., Coll, J., Perez, L., 2018. Chromatin

immunoprecipitation and high throughput sequencing of SVCV-infected zebrafish

reveals novel epigenetic histone methylation patterns involved in antiviral immune response. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 82, 514-521.

Mele, M., Ferreira, P.G., Reverter, F., DeLuca, D.S., Monlong, J., Sammeth, M., Young, T.R., Goldmann, J.M., Pervouchine, D.D., Sullivan, T.J., Johnson, R., Segre, A.V., Djebali, S., Niarchou, A., Wright, F.A., Lappalainen, T., Calvo, M., Getz, G., Dermitzakis, E.T., Ardlie, K.G., Guigo, R., Consortium, G.T., 2015. The human transcriptome across tissues and individuals. Science 348, 660-665.

Milla, S., Depiereux, S., Kestemont, P., 2011. The effects of estrogenic and androgenic endocrine disruptors on the immune system of fish: a review. Ecotoxicology 20, 305-319.

Moore, L.D., Le, T., Fan, G., 2013. DNA methylation and its basic function. Neuropsychopharmacology 38, 23-38.

Navarro-Martin, L., Vinas, J., Ribas, L., Diaz, N., Gutierrez, A., Di Croce, L., Piferrer, F., 2011. DNA methylation of the gonadal aromatase (*cyp19a*) promoter is involved in temperature-dependent sex ratio shifts in the European sea bass. PLoS Genet. 7.

Netea, M.G., Joosten, L.A.B., Latz, E., Mills, K.H.G., Natoli, G., Stunnenberg, H.G., O'Neill, L.A.J., Xavier, R.J., 2016. Trained immunity: A program of innate immune memory in health and disease. Science 352.

Nunn, C.L., Lindenfors, P., Pursall, E.R., Rolff, J., 2009. On sexual dimorphism in immune function. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences 364, 61-69.

Pacis, A., Mailhot-Léonard, F., Tailleux, L., Randolph, H.E., Yotova, V., Dumaine, A., Grenier, J.-C., Barreiro, L.B., 2019. Gene activation precedes DNA

demethylation in response to infection in human dendritic cells. PNAS 116, 6938-

6943.

Pagès, H., 2018. BSgenome: Software infrastructure for efficient

representation of full genomes and their SNPs. R Package version 1.46. 0.

Piferrer, F., Anastasiadi, D., Valdivieso, A., Sánchez-Baizán, N., Moraleda-Prados,

J., Ribas, L., 2019. The model of the conserved epigenetic regulation of sex. Front.

Genet. (in press).

Polan, M.L., Loukides, J.A., Nelson, P., 1991. The role of IL-1 in the ovary,

in: Gibori, G. (Ed.), Signaling Mechanisms and Gene Expression in the Ovary, pp.

163-169.

Potok, M.E., Nix, D.A., Parnell, T.J., Cairns, B.R., 2013. Reprogramming the

maternal zebrafish genome after fertilization to match the paternal methylation

pattern. Cell 153, 759-772.

Pradhan, A., Olsson, P., 2014. Juvenile ovary to testis transition in zebrafish

involves inhibition of ptges. Biol. Reprod.

Press, C.M., Evensen, O., 1999. The morphology of the immune system in

teleost fishes. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 9, 309-318.

Qiu, J., 2006. Epigenetics: Unfinished symphony. Nature 441, 143-145.

Quinlan, A.R., Hall, I.M., 2010. BEDTools: a flexible suite of utilities for

comparing genomic features. Bioinformatics 26, 841-842.

Ribas, L., Crespo, B., Sanchez-Baizan, N., Xavier, D., Kuhl, H., Rodriguez,

J.M., Diaz, N., Boltana, S., MacKenzie, S., Moran, F., Zanuy, S., Gomez, A.,

Piferrer, F., 2019. Characterization of the European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*)

gonadal transcriptome during sexual development. Mar. Biotechnol.

Ribas, L., Piferrer, F., 2014. The zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) as a model

organism, with emphasis on applications for finfish aquaculture research. Rev.

Aquacult. 6, 209-240.

Ribas, L., Robledo, D., Gomez-Tato, A., Vinas, A., Martinez, P., Piferrer, F.,

2016. Comprehensive transcriptomic analysis of the process of gonadal sex

differentiation in the turbot (Scophthalmus maximus). Mol. Cell. Endocrinol. 422,

132-149.

Ribas, L., Valdivieso, A., Diaz, N., Piferrer, F., 2017. Appropriate rearing

density in domesticated zebrafish to avoid masculinization: links with the stress

response. J. Exp. Biol. 220, 1056-1064.

Rodríguez-Marí, A., Canestro, C., BreMiller, R.A., Nguyen-Johnson, A.,

Asakawa, K., Kawakami, K., Postlethwait, J.H., 2010. Sex reversal in zebrafish fancl

mutants is caused by tp53-mediated germ cell apoptosis. PLoS Genet. 6, e1001034.

Saillant, E., Fostier, A., Menu, B., Haffray, P., Chatain, B., 2001. Sexual

growth dimorphism in sea bass *Dicentrarchus labrax*. Aquaculture 202, 371-387.

Sakamaki, K., Satou, Y., 2009. Caspases: evolutionary aspects of their

functions in vertebrates. J. Fish Biol. 74, 727-753.

Schmittgen, T.D., Livak, K.J., 2008. Analyzing real-time PCR data by the

comparative CT method. Nat. Protoc 3, 1101-1108.

Secombes, C.J., Belmonte, R., 2016. Overview of the Fish Adaptive Immune

System, in: Adams, A. (Ed.), Fish Vaccines, pp. 35-52.

Secombes, C.J., Wang, T., Bird, S., 2011. The interleukins of fish. Dev.

Comp. Immunol. 35, 1336-1345.

Shalini, S., Dorstyn, L., Dawar, S., Kumar, S., 2015. Old, new and emerging

functions of caspases. Cell Death Differ. 22, 526-539.

Sharma, E., Kuenstner, A., Fraser, B.A., Zipprich, G., Kottler, V.A., Henz,

S.R., Weigel, D., Dreyer, C., 2014. Transcriptome assemblies for studying sex-

biased gene expression in the guppy, Poecilia reticulata. BMC Genom. 15.

Sinclair, S.H.G., Yegnasubramanian, S., Dumler, J.S., 2015. Global DNA

methylation   changes   and   differential   gene   expression   in   Anaplasma

phagocytophilum-infected human neutrophils. Clin. Epigenetics 7.

Small, C.M., Carney, G.E., Mo, Q., Vannucci, M., Jones, A.G., 2009. A

microarray analysis of sex- and gonad-biased gene expression in the zebrafish:

Evidence for masculinization of the transcriptome. BMC Genom. 10, 579.

Smith, D.E., Renshaw, B.R., Ketchem, R.R., Kubin, M., Garka, K.E., Sims,

J.E., 2000. Four new members expand the interleukin-1 superfamily. J. Biol. Chem.

275, 1169-1175.

Stein, C., Caccamo, M., Laird, G., Leptin, M., 2007. Conservation and

divergence of gene families encoding components of innate immune response

systems in zebrafish. Genome Biol. 8.

Straussman, R., Nejman, D., Roberts, D., Steinfeld, I., Blum, B., Benvenisty,

N., Simon, I., Yakhini, Z., Cedar, H., 2009. Developmental programming of CpG

island methylation profiles in the human genome. Nat. Struct. Mol. Biol. 16, 564-

571.

Tabernero, J., Lenz, H.J., Siena, S., Sobrero, A., Falcone, A., Ychou, M.,

Humblet, Y., Bouche, O., Mineur, L., Barone, C., Adenis, A., Yoshino, T., Goldberg,

R.M., Sargent, D.J., Wagner, A., Laurent, D., Teufel, M., Jeffers, M., Grothey, A.,

Van Cutsem, E., 2015. Analysis of circulating DNA and protein biomarkers to

predict the clinical activity of regorafenib and assess prognosis in patients with

metastatic colorectal cancer: a retrospective, exploratory analysis of the CORRECT

trial. Lancet Oncol. 16, 937-948.

Toguyeni, A., Fauconneau, B., Boujard, T., Fostier, A., Kuhn, E.R., Mol,

K.A., Baroiller, J.F., 1997. Feeding behaviour and food utilisation in tilapia,

Oreochromis niloticus: Effect of sex ratio and relationship with the endocrine status.

Physiol. Behav. 62, 273-279.

Tort, L., Balasch, J.C., Mackenzie, S., 2003. Fish immune system. A

crossroads between innate and adaptive responses. Inmunología 22, 277-286.

Uren Webster, T.M., Rodriguez-Barreto, D., Martin, S.A.M., Van Oosterhout,

C., Orozco-terWengel, P., Cable, J., Hamilton, A., Garcia De Leaniz, C., Consuegra,

S., 2018. Contrasting effects of acute and chronic stress on the transcriptome,

epigenome, and immune response of Atlantic salmon. Epigenetics 13, 1191-1207.

Wan, Z.Y., Xia, J.H., Lin, G., Wang, L., Lin, V.C.L., Yue, G.H., 2016.

Genome-wide methylation analysis identified sexually dimorphic methylated regions

in hybrid tilapia. Sci. Rep. 6.

Wang, Y.Y., Sun, L.X., Zhu, J.J., Zhao, Y., Wang, H., Liu, H.J., Ji, X.S.,

2017. Epigenetic control of cyp19a1a expression is critical for high temperature

induced Nile tilapia masculinization. J. Therm. Biol. 69, 76-84.

Wei, T., Simko, V., Levy, M., Xie, Y., Jin, Y., Zemla, J., 2017. Package

'corrplot'. Statistician 56, 316-324.

Wickham, H., 2016. ggplot2: elegant graphics for data analysis. Springer.

Wiencke, J.K., Butler, R., Hsuang, G., Eliot, M., Kim, S., Sepulveda, M.A.,

Siegel, D., Houseman, E.A., Kelsey, K.T., 2016. The DNA methylation profile of

activated human natural killer cells. Epigenetics 11, 363-380.

a

b

a

b

a

b