Maternally-transferred thyroid hormones and life-history variation in birds

Bin-Yan Hsu[1*], Veli-Matti Pakanen[2], Winnie Boner[3], Tapio Eeva[1], Blandine Doligez[4], Ton G.G.

Groothuis[5], Erkki Korpimäki[1], Toni Laaksonen[1], Asmoro Lelono[5], Pat Monaghan[3], Tom Sarraude[1,5],

Barbara Tschirren[6], Robert L. Thomson[7], Jere Tolvanen[2], Rodrigo A. Vásquez[8], Suvi Ruuskanen[1]

[1] Department of Biology, University of Turku, Finland

[2] Department of Ecology and Genetics, University of Oulu, Finland

[3] Institute of Biodiversity, Animal Healthy and Comparative Medicine, University of Glasgow,

Scotland, United Kingdom

[4] Department of Biometry and Evolutionary Biology, CNRS UMR 5558, Université de Lyon 1, France

[5] Groningen Institute for Evolutionary Life Sciences (GELIFES), University of Groningen, the

Netherlands

[6] Centre for Ecology and Conservation, University of Exeter, United Kingdom

[7] Fitzpatrick Institute of African Ornithology, DST-NRF Centre of Excellence, University of Cape Town,

South Africa

[8] Instituto de Ecologíay Biodiversidad, Departamento de Ciencias Ecológicas, Facultad de Ciencias,

Universidad de Chile, Santiago, Chile

* Corresponding author: biyahs@utu.fi

Abstract

Life-history traits vary largely across species and several physiological parameters have been proposed to be associated with life-history variation, such as metabolic rates, glucocorticoids, and oxidative stress. Interestingly, the association between thyroid hormones (THs) and life history variation has never been considered, despite a close interaction between THs and these physiological traits. Because of the crucial effects on embryonic development, THs can also induce transgenerational plasticity when transferred to developing offspring, for instance, via egg yolks in birds. In this study, we compiled a unique data set of maternal yolk THs in 34 bird species across 17 families and 6 orders, and tested for associations with various life-history traits. Our phylogenetic mixed models indicated that both concentrations and total amounts of the two most important forms of THs (T3 and T4) were higher in the eggs of migratory species than in those of resident species, and that there were higher total amounts of T3 in the eggs of precocial species than in those of altricial species. However, maternal THs did not show clear associations with any traits of the pace-of-life syndrome, such as developmental duration, growth rate, or lifespan. When taking environmental factors into account, we found that captive species deposited higher TH concentrations and larger amounts in the egg yolks than wild species. These findings suggest that maternal THs are likely involved in the evolution of life-history variation, or vice versa.

Key words: life-history variation, yolk hormones, maternal hormone transfer, phylogenetic comparative analysis, phenotypic plasticity

Introduction

Life-history variation constitutes a large part of biodiversity. Across species, life-history traits are often inter-correlated and present along several continuums. For example, many life-history traits, such as lifespan, fecundity and growth rates, co-vary with one another and constitute a continuum representing the 'pace of life' (Ricklefs and Wikelski 2002; Dammhahn et al. 2018). On the one end of this continuum, species exhibit fast growth and development, early maturation, but also fast senescence and short lifespan ("fast" species). On the other end, species have slow growth and development, late maturation and first reproduction, but also live longer ("slow" species). Other life-history continuums, such as the nutrient source for developing embryos (from yolk or via placenta), income versus capital breeders, precocial to altricial developmental modes, and various degrees of migratory tendencies, also exist across various taxa in the animal kingdom.

Identifying the mechanisms underlying the evolution of life history differences has fascinated evolutionary biologists for decades. For example, metabolic rate has been proposed as a mediator for the pace-of-life (POL) continuum, as it exhibits a parallel pattern with fast species usually having higher basal and resting metabolic rates (BMR and RMR), while slow species having lower metabolic rates (e.g. Wikelski et al. 2003; Auer et al. 2018). Some studies also proposed other possible mediators, such as glucocorticoids (Hau et al. 2010), oxidative stress (Vágási et al. 2019), and blood glucose level (Tomasek et al. 2019). We propose that thyroid hormones (THs), which have regulatory functions on metabolism (Mullur et al. 2014) and interactions with glucocorticoids (Darras et al. 1996; Kulkami and Buchholz 2012; Cortés et al. 2014), may be an additional mechanism underlying life-history variation, such as the POL continuum, or explain previously observed associations between metabolic rate or circulating glucocorticoids and life-history variation.

THs do not only regulate metabolisms in adults, but they are also transferred from mothers to developing offspring in all vertebrates (Ruuskanen and Hsu 2018). Such maternally-derived THs (hereafter "maternal THs") play a critical role for early embryonic development (Moog et al. 2017; Darras 2019). In humans, the levels of maternal THs are associated with new-born body mass and

children's IQ (Medici et al. 2013; Korevaar et al. 2016). This suggests that variation in maternal THs

can induce transgenerational phenotypic plasticity, which can constitute an important part of

phenotypic variation in wild animals (Mousseau and Fox 1998; Moore et al. 2019). Nevertheless, the

ecological and evolutionary significance of maternal THs in wild animals has been almost totally

neglected (Ruuskanen and Hsu 2018). Recently, several experimental studies manipulating maternal

THs reported variable effects of yolk TH on nestling traits across species (Ruuskanen et al. 2016a;

Hsu et al. 2017, 2019a). These intriguing species differences suggest species might respond

differently to elevated yolk TH levels and thus that maternal yolk THs might have co-evolved with

life-history differences.

In this study, we explored the potential associations between maternal yolk TH levels and

life-history strategies across 34 bird species. In birds, two maternally derived THs – triiodothyronine

(T3) and thyroxine (T4) are transferred and stored in the egg yolk (Sechman and Bobek 1988; Prati et

al. 1992). We asked whether the inter-specific variation of yolk THs would be associated with life-

history traits across species, while accounting for environmental factors that may potentially

contribute to the variation in yolk THs. The associations between maternal THs and life-history traits,

if they exist, probably reflect the involvement of maternal THs in the evolution of life-history

differences or vice versa.

Based on the known functions of THs, we considered three life-history continuums for which

we hypothesized that maternal yolk THs may be associated with the related life-history traits. The

first is the altricial-precocial developmental spectrum. At the two ends of this life-history continuum,

precocial species and altricial species show distinctive ontogenetic patterns of visual and locomotory

ability (Starck and Ricklefs 1998c), hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis (Wada 2008),

hypothalamic-pituitary-thyroid (HPT) axis (McNabb 2006; de Groef et al. 2013) and

thermoregulation (Price and Dzialowski 2018). In precocial species, the thyroid function already

starts in the middle of incubation and the TH levels in thyroid gland and blood circulation both peak

around hatching. By contrast, the thyroid function of altricial species starts days after hatching, and

their circulating blood TH levels slowly increase towards the adult level (McNabb 2006; de Groef et

al. 2013). Therefore, we hypothesized that such differences in the mode of development may be

associated with yolk TH levels, either because higher maternal THs are required for a comparatively

advanced development at hatching or because the developmental modes at least partly determine

the transfer process of maternal THs, or both.

Second, we considered the life-history differences between migratory and resident species.

THs have been known to regulate seasonal physiology and reproduction (Dardente et al. 2014;

McNabb and Darras 2015; Nishiwaki-Ohkawa and Yoshimura 2016) and also moulting and feather

regeneration (Vézina et al. 2009; Pérez et al. 2018). Several studies have also considered THs as part

of the hormonal mechanism underlying migration (Pérez et al. 2016) and in general migratory

species have higher BMR than resident species (Jetz et al. 2008). We thus hypothesized that

maternal TH levels may be associated with a species' migratory status.

Third, we considered the slow-fast pace-of-life (POL) continuum (Ricklefs and Wikelski 2002;

Dammhahn et al. 2018). As introduced above, metabolic rates (Wikelski et al. 2003; Auer et al.

2018), glucocorticoids (Hau et al. 2010), and oxidative stress (Vágási et al. 2018) have been proposed

to mediate the POL-related life-history variation. Interestingly, THs appear to have associations with

all of them. It is well known that THs have regulatory function on metabolism (Mullur et al. 2014),

and in wild birds, within-species studies have confirmed positive correlations between blood THs

and BMR and RMR (e.g. Chastel et al. 2003; Elliott et al 2013; Welcker et al. 2013). THs also have

cross-talks with the HPA axis (Cortés et al. 2014) and may induce higher oxidative stress due to the

metabolic effects (Villanueva et al. 2013). Therefore, it seems possible that THs may also be a

mediator of pace of life.

In addition to life-history differences, some environmental factors may also contribute to the

inter-specific variation of maternal yolk THs and should be taken into account. First, we expected

that the foraging environment, through its direct influence on food composition, may influence the

inter-specific variation of maternal yolk THs. For example, food conditions before and during the

egg-laying of captive wild-type rock pigeons (*Columba livia livia*) affected maternal yolk TH levels

(Hsu et al. 2016). A possible explanation for this finding is the iodine content in the diet, as iodine is

an essential ingredient for TH production (Bizhanova and Kopp 2009). In humans, even mild iodine

deficiency during pregnancy has been shown to lead to deficiency of maternal T4 and hence

detrimental effects on foetal development (Bath et al. 2013; Trumpff et al. 2013). In wild animals,

environmental iodine availability is associated with antler weights of roe deer (*Capreolus capreolus*)

via its influence on TH production (Lehoczki et al. 2011), and freshwater alligators (*Alligator

mississippiensis*) have on average lower plasma T3 and T4 concentrations than their estuarine

conspecifics (Boggs et al. 2011). Therefore, we hypothesized that iodine availability from the

environment and diet (e.g. Eckhoff and Maage 1997) could contribute to part of the variation in

maternal yolk THs. Moreover, captive environments differ in many aspects from wild environments,

such as in food availability and safety from predators. Confinement and regular human disturbance

might also pose as chronic stressors, which may influence THs (e.g. Angelier et al. 2016) and

therefore maternal TH deposition. We therefore hypothesized that captivity may also influence

maternal yolk THs.

   To test these hypotheses, we collected information on life-history traits pertaining to each

hypothesis from the literature. The environmental variables were assigned for each species based on

the sampled population. We measured maternal THs in egg yolks, constructing the first interspecific

maternal TH data set. By combining data of life-history traits and maternal THs, we were able to run

phylogenetic mixed-effects models using a Bayesian framework to test our hypotheses.

Materials and Methods

Sample collection

We collected unincubated eggs from 34 species of birds across 17 families and 6 orders (n = 1-21 per species, median=7, Table S1). Nests of wild species were located by extensive nest searches in the known breeding habitats of each species or from nest-box populations during 2016-2017. We aimed at collecting eggs from species with varying body sizes and life-history traits and included both precocial and altricial species. All eggs were collected before clutch completion (i.e. when found, the eggs were cold and clutch was not completed) and one, randomly sampled egg per clutch was collected. Therefore, in most of the cases, the laying order of the sampled egg was unknown. Most of the wild species were sampled from Finnish populations near Turku (60°27'N, 22°16'E), Oulu (65°01'N, 25°28'E) and Kauhava (63°06'N, 23°04'E) regions, except thorn-tailed rayaditos (*Aphrastura spinicauda*, sampled mostly from Chiloé island, Chile, 42°40'S, 73°59'W) and collared flycatchers (*Ficedula albicollis*, from Burgsvik, Gotland, Sweden, 57°02'N, 18°16'E). The eggs of captive homing pigeons (*C. l. domesticus*) and domesticated chicken (*Gallus domesticus*) and eggs of semi-captive pheasants (*Phasianus colcichus*) and grey partridges (*Perdix perdix*) were sampled from local breeders in Finland. The eggs of red jungle fowl (*G. g. gallus*) and rock pigeons (*C. l. livia*) were sampled from the captive colonies at the University of Groningen, the Netherlands, and the eggs of captive zebra finches (*Taeniopygia guttata*) were from the University of Glasgow, UK. All collected eggs were first frozen and stored at -20°C until further analysis. For most of the species, the frozen eggs were shipped to the University of Turku, where we separated the yolk for hormone analysis (see *Yolk TH analysis*). Two exceptions are the collared flycatchers and the rock pigeons, for which the eggs had been dissected and the yolk had been homogenized and mixed in known amount of milli-Q (MQ) water before shipped to University of Turku and were already ready for extraction. Eggs of wild species were collected under licenses from the environmental authorities in each country: Finland, VARELY/665/2016, POPELY/61/2016, VARELY/63/2016, VARELY/412/2016, VARELY/6085/2016, and Finnish Wildlife Agency 84/2016; Chile, Agricultural Ministry 404/2017,

Sweden, National Board for Laboratory Animals. Captive species were housed and eggs were

collected following all national and international guidelines.

<u>Yolk TH analysis</u>

We extracted THs from the egg yolks and measured two THs (T3 and T4) at the University of

Turku and Turku Centre of Biotechnology. Yolk was separated from albumen after a short period of

thawing. A few eggs showed signs of very early development and all such eggs were discarded from

the analysis. After dissection, yolks were weighed (~0.01 g), and a half (for passerines) or a quarter

(for other species) of the yolk was weighed for extraction and we added an equal amount of MQ to

facilitate homogenizing.

We used the extraction protocol described previously (Ruuskanen et al. 2016b). In brief, we

first added 2 ml methanol to the yolk-MQ mixture (ca. 300 mg) and homogenized the sample. A

known amount of $^{13}C_{12}$-T4 (Larodan) was added to each sample as an internal tracer, which allowed

us to correct for extraction efficiency (i.e. recovery). Four ml of chloroform was then added and

samples were centrifuged at +4°C 1900g for 15 min. The supernatant was then collected and the

pellet was re-extracted in 2:1 chloroform-methanol mixture, back-extracted with 0.05% $CaCl_2$ into

aqueous phase, and re-extracted with chloroform:methanol:0.05% $CaCl_2$ mixture (3:49:48). The

aqueous phase was further purified on Bio-Rad AG 1-X2 resin columns, eluted with 70% acetic acid,

and then vacuum-evaporated overnight. Samples from different species were spread over extraction

batches and the extraction batch ID was included as a random intercept in the statistical models.

We used a validated nano-flow liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry (LC-MS) protocol

to measure yolk T3 and T4 simultaneously (Ruuskanen et al. 2018). In brief, the dry TH extracts were

re-suspended in 150 µl 0.1% NH_3 and further diluted with 0.01% NH_3. The dilution factor depended

on the expected amount of T3 and T4 in each sample. Internal standards $^{13}C_6$-T3 and $^{13}C_6$-T4 were

added to identify and also quantify T3 and T4 in the samples. A triple quadruple mass spectrometer

(TSQ Vantage, Thermo Scientific, San Jose, CA) and nano-flow HPLC system Easy-nLC (Thermo

Scientific) were used for the measurements. The on-column quantification limits were 10.6 amol and

17.9 amol for T4 and T3, respectively (Ruuskanen et al. 2018). The data was acquired automatically

using Thermo Xcalibur software (Thermo Fisher Scientific) and subsequently analysed by Skyline

(MacLean et al. 2010). TH concentrations were calculated using the peak area ratios of sample to

internal standard, corrected for recovery, and expressed as pg/mg yolk. We further calculated the

total amount of THs per yolk and expressed it as ng/yolk.

<u>Life-history traits and environmental factors</u>

I. Altricial-Precocial continuum (i.e. developmental mode)

We specified each species as precocial or altricial, following Starck and Ricklefs (1998a). The four

semi-precocial species, which all belong to the family Laridae (gulls and terns) and one semi-altricial

species (the kestrel, *Falco tinnunculus*) were pooled with precocial or altricial species, respectively.

II. Migratory status

Each species was categorized as either migratory or resident, based on data compiled in Lehikoinen

et al. (2003), McNab (2009) and Pap et al. (2015). When needed, the migratory status assignment

was made based on the population from which we collected eggs.

III. Pace-of-life continuum

The pace-of-life continuum incorporates many related life-history traits, including a species'

developmental duration, fecundity, metabolic rate, growth rate, and the rate of maturation and

senescence.

(i)   The data on **developmental duration** was collected mainly from the amniote life-history

database compiled by Myhrvold et al. (2015) with supplementation from other literature

(see *supplementary materials*). We collected the **incubation duration** and **the time to**

fledging (from hatching) to represent the prenatal and postnatal part of the developmental

period. We additionally calculated two more variables: **the total length of development**

(incubation duration + time to fledging) and **the proportion of prenatal development**

(incubation duration / total developmental length).

(ii) The **growth rate** data originated from Starck and Ricklefs (1998b) and was supplemented

with other literature (see *supplementary materials*). For comparability, the logistic growth

rate constants were used to represent the growth rate of each species. Whenever multiple

sources of the growth rates are available for a species, an average was used.

(iii) **Species' body mass, clutch size** and **number of clutches per year** were obtained from

Myhrvold et al. (2015).

(iv) **Basal metabolic rates** (BMR) were mainly obtained from McKechnie et al. (2006) and McNab

(2009), supplemented by other literature (see *supplementary materials*).

(v) **Maximum lifespan** and **ages at first reproduction** originated from the database AnAge

(Tacutu et al. 2013), except for the thorn-tailed rayaditos (*Aphrastura spinicauda*), for which

the data was obtained from Moreno et al. (2005) and Quirici et al. (2019).

IV. Environmental factors

For environmental factors, we created two variables to represent a species' **foraging environment**

and **captivity status.** Respectively, species were categorized as marine-bound (foraging on marine

food resources) or terrestrial (foraging on non-marine bound resources) based on the breeding

territory and diet, and wild or captive. Semi-captive species (the pheasant and the grey partridge)

were categorized as captive.

All life-history and environmental data we compiled for this study, the sources we consulted,

and the final values used in all our models, can be found in the supplementary materials.

Phylogenetic mixed models

Model specifications

Following Hadfield and Nakagawa (2010), we ran phylogenetic mixed models with the R package

MCMCglmm (Hadfield 2010). T3 and T4 concentrations (pg/mg yolk) as well as total contents

(ng/yolk) were ln-transformed and standardized and used as dependent variables in separated

univariate models. Species body mass and other life-history and environmental variables (see *Life-*

history traits and environmental factors) were treated as fixed factors and covariates. In order to

facilitate model fitting, body mass was also ln-transformed and standardized. Before fitting models,

all two-level categorical variables were first dummy-coded as -0.5 and 0.5 (Table S2), to facilitate

model mixing/convergence. The life-history traits that are known to be associated with body mass

(BMR, growth rate, maximum lifespan, age at first reproduction) were first corrected for body mass

and phylogenetic relatedness among species using the R package *phytools* (Revell 2009, 2012). BMR

data, in particular, was first converted to mass-specific BMR (KJ/h/g) and ln-transformed and

corrected for body mass and phylogeny.

The four variables of developmental duration were strongly correlated with one another.

Therefore, we conducted a phylogeny-corrected principal component analysis (PCA) using R package

phytools (Revell 2009, 2012). The first two PCs explained 99.74% of the variance (Table S3). The

loadings suggested that PC1 is highly positively correlated with the time to fledging and the total

length of developmental period, and negatively correlated with the proportion of prenatal

development, while PC2 is negatively correlated with the duration of prenatal development (Table

S3). In subsequent phylogenetic mixed models, we therefore used the scores of PC1 and PC2 for

each species to represent the developmental duration.

Because the data of life-history traits were not available for all species, we defined several

sets of models depending on data availability, listed in Table 1. Each model and data set was thus

pruned for the specific set of species where data was available. Each model set consists of separate

models to analyse the concentrations and total contents of T3 and T4, respectively. This is because in

oviparous species, the total contents of maternal hormones in the yolk is fixed after yolk formation.

Therefore, the total content of hormones represents an initial maximum hormone availability and

may represent different biological significance from the concentration.

In all models, the phylogenetic relatedness among all species included was treated as

random effects, following Hadfield and Nakagawa (2010). Additionally, species name was also

included as a random factor to control for within-species non-independence among the multiple

eggs from the same species. For this random factor, homing pigeons and domesticated chickens

were coded separately from their wild-type ancestor rock pigeons and red jungle fowl, despite that

they were not distinguished in the phylogeny (i.e. coded with the same scientific names, *Columba*

livia and *Gallus gallus*). The batch of hormone extraction was also included as an additional random

factor. Response variables were all assumed to follow Gaussian distributions. All models were run

for 750000 iterations with a 350 thinning interval and burn-in of 50000, aiming for an approximately

2000 effective sample size for all parameters. Following Houslay and Wilson (2017), we used an

uninformative parameter-expanded prior following a Cauchy distribution (V=1, nu=1, alpha.mu=0,

alpha.V=25^2) for all random factors. Tests using an uninformative inverse-Wishart prior or

improper flat prior gave qualitatively same results, suggesting the results are robust against the

choice of priors.

Phylogenetic trees and phylogeny uncertainty

Each phylogeny set (Table 1) was correspondingly pruned and obtained from BirdTree.org (Jetz et al.

2012) based on two phylogenetic backbones (Ericson et al. 2006; Hackett et al. 2008). For each

backbone, 100 possible trees were generated and downloaded. All models were tested repeatedly

across the 100 possible trees in each backbone and the posterior means of parameter estimates and

their 95% credible intervals (CIs) were stored. The average posterior mean and the average

boundaries of the 95% CIs were calculated to account for phylogenetic uncertainty (Rubolini et al.

2015) and reported. The results are highly similar across all possible trees (see Fig. S1 for examples)

and between the two backbones. Therefore we only reported the results based on the Hackett

backbone.

Model diagnostics

As models across all possible phylogenetic trees produced highly similar results, we examined model

performance by re-fitting all models with a consensus tree. The consensus tree was derived using

the R package *phytools* (Revell 2012) for each phylogeny set. Model diagnostics were conducted by

visual inspection on the trace plots for proper mixing and on autocorrelations. Model convergence

was also checked using Gelman diagnostics provided in the R package *coda* (Plummer et al. 2006).

For all models, visual inspection did not raise any red flags for poor mixing or substantial

autocorrelation and all models passed the Gelman diagnostics with all potential scale reduction

factors < 1.05.

Phylogenetic signals

Phylogenetic signal, a.k.a. phylogenetic heritability (H^2), was calculated as

307
$$H^2 = \frac{\sigma_a^2}{\sigma_a^2 + \sigma_s^2 + \sigma_e^2}$$

where σ_a^2 represents the variance of the phylogeny; σ_s^2 represents the variance accounted by

individual species; σ_e^2 represents the residual variance. The H^2 calculated this way is equivalent to

the Pagel's λ (Hadfield and Nakagawa 2010).

Because phylogenetic signal is in fact the proportion of the phylogenetic variance over the

total phenotypic variance, the fixed factors included in the model will influence the value of the

phylogenetic signal by changing the estimates of all variance components (Nakagawa and Schielzeth

2010). Therefore we calculated the phylogenetic signals for yolk T4 and T3 based on the

phylogenetic mixed model that only included the life-history traits whose 95% CIs did not encompass

0 (i.e. having credible associations). These are the developmental mode, migratory status, captivity,

and body mass (see *Results*). In these models, all 34 species and the full phylogeny set was included

and we used a consensus tree from the Hackett backbone, derived by using the *phytools* package

(Revell 2012).

Table 1. Model, phylogeny and data sets defined in this study

Model set	Phylogeny	Data set	Model structure (fixed factors)	Remark
1	All 34 species	Full data set	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + maximum lifespan + foraging environment + captivity	
2a	Excluding *Coturnix japonica**	Excluding domesticated Japanese quails and domesticated chicken	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + clutch size + clutches per year + captivity	Domesticated quails and chicken do not lay clear "clutches" of eggs.
2b	Excluding *Coturnix japonica*	Excluding Japanese quails	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + PC1 and PC2 of developmental period + captivity	Time to fledging data was missing for Japanese quails
3	Excluding *Gallus gallus*	Excluding red jungle fowl and domesticated chicken	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + age at first reproduction + captivity	Age at first reproduction data was missing for both jungle fowl and chicken
4	28 species with BMR data	Species with BMR data	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + BMR + captivity	
5	29 species with growth rate data	Species with growth rate data	~developmental mode + migration + body mass + growth rate + captivity	

322 * In Model set 2a, both Japanese quails and domesticated chicken were removed from the "data

323 set" but only *Coturnix japonica* was removed from the phylogeny because *Gallus gallus* was still

324 needed in the phylogeny for the data from red jungle fowl.

Results

Inter-specific variation in yolk THs and phylogenetic signals

We observed substantial inter-specific variation in both T3 and T4 concentrations (Fig. 1,

Table S1). Great tits (*Parus major*) and redshanks (*Tringa totanus*) had the lowest and highest

concentrations of yolk T3 and T4 among the 34 species, respectively. Between the two species, the

difference in average yolk THs reached 100-fold for T3 (great tit, mean ± SD = 0.112 ± 0.032 pg/mg

yolk, n = 11; redshank, mean ± SD = 11.242 ± 5.067 pg/mg yolk, n = 4), and 18-fold for T4 (great tit,

mean ± SD = 0.989 ± 0.292 pg/mg yolk, n = 12; redshank, mean ± SD = 18.101 ± 4.125 pg/mg yolk, n =

4).

The moderate to strong phylogenetic signals indicated that the phylogenetic relatedness

among species accounted for 60%-85% of the inter-specific variation in yolk THs (Table 2). On

average, T3 has stronger phylogenetic signals than T4, although their 95% CIs overlapped.

Table 2. Phylogenetic signals (i.e. phylogenetic heritability) for maternal yolk T3 and T4.

Hormone	Parameter	Posterior mean [95% CI]
T3	concentration	0.84 [0.68, 0.95]
	total content	0.84 [0.71, 0.95]
T4	concentration	0.60 [0.25, 0.87]
	total content	0.75 [0.54, 0.91]

Associations between yolk THs and life-history variables

The estimated posterior means and 95% CIs from all models are presented in Fig. 2.

Precocial species deposited larger total amounts of THs in the egg yolks than altricial species (Fig. 3),

but not higher TH concentrations. The model set 1 supported this difference with positive posterior

means and 95% CIs, when controlling for species body mass and other covariates, especially for T3

contents (Fig. 2D). Also, migratory species generally deposited higher concentrations and also larger

amounts of both THs in the egg yolks than resident species (Fig. 4), which were supported by the

model set 1 (Fig. 2). Species body mass also strongly correlated with yolk TH content, but not with

yolk TH concentration (Fig. 2). Along the slow-fast pace-of-life continuum, however, no traits were

found to be credibly associated with maternal yolk TH concentrations or contents (Fig. 2)

Associations between yolk THs and environmental variables

Although the raw data suggested that marine-bound species deposited larger amounts of yolk THs

than terrestrial species (Fig. S2), this was not supported by the phylogenetic mixed models (Fig. 2).

Between captive and wild species, credible differences in both yolk T3 and T4, and in both

concentrations and total contents (Fig. 2) were found. This suggested that captive species deposited

higher concentrations and larger amounts of yolk THs than wild species (Fig. 5).

Discussion

Maternal THs and life-history variation

Among the three life-history continuums, our phylogenetic mixed models estimated credible differences in maternal yolk THs between the migratory and resident life histories, and between precocial and altricial developmental modes. However, contrary to our expectation, none of the pace-of-life (POL) related traits were found credibly associated with maternal yolk THs, after controlling for body mass. The moderate to strong phylogenetic signals also indicate that a substantial proportion of variation in maternal THs is accounted for by the phylogeny itself. This suggests a substantial extent of phylogenetic inertia, which may present some evolutionary constraints in maternal TH deposition. Despite the constraint, the credible differences of maternal THs between precocial and altricial species, and between migratory and resident species still suggest that maternal THs are associated with the evolution of these two life-history continuums or vice versa.

THs and migration

Migration is a critical and demanding life-history stage. Many physiological changes occur both before and after migration, such as fat deposition, gonadal regression and recrudescence (Hahn et al. 2015). The temporal overlap with other seasonal activities, such as breeding and moult, also tends to be minimized over evolutionary history in migratory species (Hahn et al. 2015). By contrast, resident species usually have a relatively longer time window to coordinate the physiological transition before and after reproduction compared with migratory species. Therefore, migratory species may require a higher sensitivity or accuracy to fine-tune the transition. THs play a central role in the molecular mechanisms of photoperiodic response. The photoperiodic change influences the expression levels of the thyroid-stimulating hormones (TSH) in the hypothalamus, which subsequently induces reciprocal switching of two deiodinases (DIO2, converting T4 to active T3 and DIO3, converting T4 and T3 to inactive THs) that activate and inactivate T3, respectively

(Nakao et al. 2008; Dardente et al. 2014). This photoperiodic DIO2/DIO3 expression pattern further

regulates the seasonal maturation of gonads. Interestingly, the photoperiodic DIO2/DIO3 gene

expression pattern of great tits was only evident in a Swedish population but not in a southern

German population (Perfito et al. 2012), in which the duration of the breeding seasons are likely to

differ. Our result of higher yolk TH levels in migratory than resident species, not only in terms of

higher concentrations but also larger amounts, is therefore in line with the notion that the

differences in maternal THs could have some organizational effects on TH responsiveness later in

life. There may still be species differences in the seasonal regulation of DIO2/DIO3 expression, as a

similar pattern was not found in European starlings (*Sturnus vulgaris*, Bentley et al. 2013).

Comparison of TH-related gene expression between conspecific populations that possess different

migratory propensity, potentially in combination with TH manipulation, may help to identify the

elements responsible for such differences.

Does precocial development require more maternal THs?

We found that precocial species deposited higher amounts of THs (accounted for body

mass), particularly T3, in the egg yolks than altricial species, which fits their distinct developmental

trajectories (Starck and Ricklefs 1998c). Compared with altricial species, precocial species temporally

shift their physiological maturity to an earlier life stage in terms of visual and locomotory ability

(Starck and Ricklefs 1998c), HPA and HPT axis (McNabb 2006; Wada 2008; de Groef et al. 2013) and

thermoregulation (Price and Dzialowski 2018). Our result may suggest the requirement of a larger

amount of maternal THs for such an advanced ontogenetic trajectory in precocial birds.

An alternative way to look at the contrasting ontogenetic differences between precocial and

altricial development may be the placement of hatching on the ontogenetic timeline. Regardless of

the developmental modes, the event of hatching requires a lot of physiological changes to prepare

the chick for the "outside" world and therefore marks a major life-stage transition. As the altricial

developmental mode is assumed to have evolved later than the precocial mode (Starck and Ricklefs

1998c; de Groef et al. 2013), one way to look at the shift is that the event of hatching is moved

earlier along the ontogenetic timeline in the altricial development so that hatching occurs when the

young is still poorly developed. Whether maternal THs mediate such a shift during the evolution

from precocial to altricial development requires further studies, but according to our data such a

change may coincide with a reduction in TH deposition over the evolutionary course. We therefore

could expect intermediate levels of maternal THs in semi-precocial and semi-altricial species.

Interestingly, the only semi-altricial species we measured, the Eurasian kestrel, indeed has higher

maternal TH content than most other altricial species, but lower than most semi-precocial and

precocial species (Fig. 3).

No size-independent associations between maternal THs and pace of life (POL)

Given the known function of THs on metabolism and interactions with glucocorticoids, it is

surprising that we did not detect any associations between maternal THs and all tested POL-related

traits (Fig. 2). Although yolk TH contents show strong correlations with species body mass, this is

because large species produce large eggs and large yolks, hence higher total amounts of yolk THs.

After controlling for body mass and phylogenetic relatedness, only clutch size showed a potential

trend with T4 contents. The model estimated a negative posterior mean and the 95% CI was slightly

overlapped with 0 (Fig. 2B), implying that species with larger clutch sizes tended to deposit less T4 in

the egg yolks. Such a trend is probably driven by the difference between passerines and shorebirds

(Fig. S3). Confirming such a relationship perhaps would require a larger sampling scheme that

includes more species.

The lack of associations between maternal yolk THs and POL-related traits does not support

our hypothesis that THs were mediators of POL. This result therefore implies that either (i) the

effects of maternal THs may not be translated directly to blood THs or (ii) blood THs are not

associated with POL-related traits. The former could be due to limited organizational effects of

maternal THs on the HPT axis or a more complex manifestation, such as sex-specific effects. To our

knowledge, there are only few experimental studies that have examined how maternal THs

influenced blood THs and metabolic rates during the nestling phase. In the great tit, yolk TH

elevation did not influence nestling RMR before fledging (Ruuskanen et al. 2016a). In the rock

pigeon, yolk TH elevation raised the RMR in female nestlings but reduced it in males on hatching

day, a pattern that was consistent with the effects on plasma T4 concentrations (but not T3) at day

14 after hatching (in the middle of the nestling phase, Hsu et al. 2017). Although elevated yolk THs

showed consistent effects on nestling RMR and plasma T4, the sex-specific pattern remains

unexplained. Nevertheless, in domesticated chicken embryos the injection of THs into the yolk

influenced the expression of two TH-transporters in the brain (van Herck et al. 2012). This suggests

that differential exposure to maternal THs may influence brain TH availability. Such changes might

have the potential to alter the sensitivity and responsiveness of the HPT axis in the long term.

Therefore, the notion that maternal THs may organizationally shape the HPT axis cannot yet be ruled

out. Another possibility to explain the lack of associations between maternal THs and POL-related

traits is that blood THs are not associated with POL-related traits. This would be quite surprising

considering the close associations between THs with metabolic rates, glucocorticoids, and oxidative

stress. As POL-related traits are usually strongly associated with body mass, perhaps a much larger

number of species is required to detect such potential associations after accounting for species body

mass.

Maternal THs and life-history variation: cause or consequence?

Above, we have discussed the potential role of maternal THs as mediators of life-history variation.

However, it is possible that differences in life-histories, particularly in migratory behaviour and

developmental mode, may result in physiological differences that cause differential maternal TH

deposition during egg formation across species. For example, migratory birds generally have higher

BMR than residents (Jetz et al. 2008). Given the close relationship between BMR and THs, migratory

species probably also have higher circulating blood TH levels. One study in two closely-related

skylark species indeed found that the migratory Eurasian skylarks (*Alauda arvensis*) had higher pre-

breeding blood T3 levels than the resident Asian short-toed larks (*Calandrella cheleensis*, Zhao et al.

2017). A meta-analysis on the available blood TH data from the literature should be promising to test

the associations between life-history variation and TH physiology but to our knowledge, such a

meta-analysis has not yet been done. If in general migratory species keep comparatively higher

circulating TH levels than resident species, the higher maternal TH deposition could be simply

mirroring the circulating TH levels in the system of migratory birds.

Even if maternal yolk THs are a physiological consequence induced by different life histories,

differential yolk TH deposition may still reinforce the evolution of the life-history variation. Due to

the critical role in embryonic development, maternal THs likely have short-term and long-term

effects on offspring phenotype, such as nestling development, growth, and physiology (Ruuskanen

et al. 2016a; Hsu et al. 2017, 2019a). If higher maternal THs would lend beneficial effects for a

certain life-history strategy, and physiologically such a life history results in a higher maternal TH

transfer, maternal THs may speed up the evolution of associated life-history traits (McGlothin and

Galloway 2014). At the moment, this is a bold speculation. However, considering that yolk T3

deposition has a moderate heritability (h^2 = 0.25, Ruuskanen et al. 2016c) and clear between-

individual difference (Hsu et al. 2019b), there might be evolutionary potential for this to happen.

Future studies may examine the temporal and quantitative differences in the expression patterns of

TH-related genes in embryonic brains between migratory and resident species, and between

precocial and altricial species, to know if there has been fundamental differences during the early

developmental stage. Another angle would be examining whether birds hatching from eggs with

elevated yolk THs may deposit higher yolk THs than control birds to test if maternal TH can induce

any non-genetic inheritance.

Maternal THs and environment

In terms of environmental factors, our models suggested differences in maternal yolk THs between

captive and wild species, but not between terrestrial and marine-bound species.

Captive life has favoured higher maternal TH deposition

Life in captivity is characterised by space confinement, (usually) unlimited food availability and a

predator-free environment (Mason 2010). The contrast to life in the wild can influence phenotypic

expression (i.e. phenotypic plasticity) and even cause selection for certain traits (Driscoll et al. 2009).

For example, captive zebra finches, domesticated or not, started incubating earlier and therefore

induced a stronger degree of hatching asynchrony than wild zebra finches (Gilby et al. 2013). In our

study, all the captive species have acclimated to captive lives for generations. Therefore the result

that captive species deposit higher levels of THs in the egg yolks likely reflects some selection under

captivity. The actual selective force is elusive at the moment, but probably related to traits like faster

acclimation/habituation for anthropogenic diet or perhaps dampened stress response to confined

space and constant human disturbance, which should be favoured in captivity.

Lack of evidence for the potential link with proximity to the sea

The larger yolk TH contents in marine-bound species compared to terrestrial species, apparent from

the raw data, were not supported by the phylogenetic mixed models. Our data likely lacked the

power to statistically partition the effects of environment and phylogeny because all sampled

marine-bound species were from the order Charadriiformes. Future studies should therefore

broaden the sampling scheme to overcome this problem. An alternative to test the relationship

between foraging environment and maternal THs is to focus on a smaller clade, such as a single

order or a single species inhabiting both inland and marine-bound populations. In the present study,

the eggs of the little ringed plover (*Charadrius dubius*) were sampled from an inland population. The

species, interestingly, had the lowest T4 content among all Charadriiform species, which implies

possible influence from the environment. Experimentally manipulating the iodine content of diet in a

captive model system or supplementing iodine-rich food to a wild population would be also an

effective approach in this respect.

<u>Conclusion</u>

Our phylogenetic mixed models suggested that migratory species deposited higher levels of both

THs in the egg yolks than resident species, and precocial species deposited higher total content of T3

in the egg yolks than altricial species. In addition, captive species also consistently deposited higher

levels of yolk THs, suggesting some selection process under captivity. These identified patterns

suggest that maternal THs may be involved in the process of life-history evolution and can respond

to on-going selective forces. Further effort should be invested to uncover the underlying

physiological mechanisms.

Acknowledgement

We thank Jon Brommer for his kind and helpful statistical advice in the beginning stage of data

analysis. We thank Jorma Nurmi for excellent nest-finding skills and effort in the field. Mass

spectrometry analyses were performed at the Turku Proteomics Facility, University of Turku and Åbo

Akademi University. The facility is supported by Biocenter Finland. This study was funded by a grant

from the Academy of Finland to SR (grant no. 286278).

Figure 1. Phylogenetic tree, yolk TH concentrations and total contents of the avian species included in this study. The phylogenetic tree (A) is one possible

tree derived from the Hackett backbone (see text). Different colours in species names represent different orders they belong to. Yolk TH concentrations (B,

D) and total contents (C, E) exhibited substantial inter-specific variation (mean ± SD, see Table S1 for exact values and sample sizes). Red symbols represent

resident species, while blue symbols migratory species. Circles represent altricial species, and squares precocial species.

Figure 2. Posterior means (± 95% credible intervals) between yolk THs and all life-history variables

tested in this study. White area presents the estimates from model set 1 (see text and Table 1). The

shaded areas present the variables tested in model set 2 (the light and medium grey areas) and

model set 3-5 (the darkest grey area). In models 2-5, the estimates of the variables that had been

tested in model set 1 are not redundantly presented. For developmental mode, the estimate

represents the difference of yolk THs in precocial species from altricial species. For migration, the

estimate represents the difference in migratory species from resident species. For captivity, the

estimate represents the difference in captive species from wild species. For foraging environment,

the estimate represents the difference in marine-bound species from terrestrial species.

Figure 3. Boxplots and species-specific averages of yolk T4 (A) and T3 (B) contents (ng/yolk, ln-

transformed raw data) according to developmental mode. Boxplots represent the median (the

middle line) and the first and the third quartiles (the box), and the whiskers extend to 1.5 times of

the interquartile range. Colored dots represent species-specific means (±SE).

Figure 4. Boxplots and species-specific averages of yolk TH concentrations (A, B, pg/mg, ln-transformed raw data) and total contents (C, D, ng/yolk, ln-transformed raw data) between migratory and resident species. Boxplots represent the median (the middle line) and the first and the third quartiles (the box), and the whiskers extend to 1.5 times of the interquartile range. Colored dots represent species-specific means (±SE).

Figure 5. Boxplots of yolk TH concentrations (A, B, pg/mg, ln-transformed raw data) and total contents (ng/yolk, ln-transformed raw data) in between captive and wild species. Boxplots represent the median (the middle line) and the first and the third quartiles (the box), and the whiskers extend to 1.5 times of the interquartile range. Colored dots represent species-specific means (±SE).

References

Angelier, F., Parenteau, C., Ruault, S., Angelier, N. (2016). Endocrine consequences of an acute stress

under different thermal conditions: a study of corticosterone, prolactin, and thyroid hormones in the

pigeon (*Columba livia*). *Comp. Biochem. Physiol. A,* 196, 38-45.

Auer, S.K., Dick, C.A., Metcalfe, N.B., Reznick, D.N. (2018). Metabolic rate evolves rapidly and in

parallel with the pace of life history. *Nat. Commun.,* 9, 14

Bath, S.C, Steer, C.D., Golding, J., Emmett, P., Rayman, M.P. (2013). Effects of inadequate iodine

status in UK pregnant women on cognitive outcomes in their children: results from the Avon

Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC). *Lancet,* 382, 331-337.

Bentley, G.E., Tucker, S., Chou, H., Hau, M., Perfito, N. (2013). Testicular growth and regression are

not correlated with Dio2 expression in a wild male songbird, *Sturnus vulgaris*, exposed to natural

changes in photoperiod. *Endocrinology*, 154, 1813-1819.

Bizhanova, A., Kopp, P. (2009). Minireview: the sodium-iodide symporter NIS and pendrin in iodide

homeostasis of the thyroid. *Endocrinology*, 150, 1084-1090.

Boggs, A.S.P., Hamlin, H.J., Lowers, R.H., Guillette, L.J. Jr. (2011). Seasonal variation in plasma thyroid

hormone concentration in coastal versus inland populations of juvenile American alligators (*Alligator*

mississippiensis): influence of plasma iodide concentrations. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.,* 174: 362-369.

Chastel, O., Lacroix, A., Kersten, M. (2003). Pre-breeding energy requirements: thyroid hormone,

metabolism and the timing of reproduction in house sparrows *Passer domesticus*. *J. Avian Biol.,* 34,

298-306.

Clements, J.F., Schulenberg, T.S., Iliff, M.J., Roberson, D., Fredericks, T.A., Sullivan, B.L. et al. (2018).

The eBird/Clements checklist of birds of the world: v2018. Downloaded from

http://www.birds.cornell.edu/clementschecklist/download/

Cortés, D.C.C., Langlois, V.S., Fernandino, J.I. (2014). Crossover of the hypothalamic pituitary-

adrenal/interrenal-thyroid, and –gonadal axes in testicular development. *Front. Endocrinol.,* 5, 139.

Dammhahn, M., Dingemanse, N.J., Niemelä, P.T., Réale, D. (2018). Pace-of-life syndromes: a

framework for the adaptive integration of behaviour, physiology and life history. *Behav. Ecol.*

Sociobiol., 72: 62.

Dardente, H., Hazlerigg, D.G., Ebling, F.J.P. (2014). Thyroid hormone and seasonal rhythmicity. *Front.*

Endocrinol., 5, 19.

Darras, V.M. (2019). The role of maternal thyroid hormones in avian embryonic development. *Front.*

Endocrinol., 10, 66.

Darras, V.M., Kotanen, S.P., Geris, K.L., Berghman, L.R., Kühn, E.R. (1996). Plasma thyroid hormone

levels and iodothyronine deiodinase activity following an acute glucocorticoid challenge in

embryonic compared with posthatch chickens. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.,* 104, 203-212.

de Groef, B., Grommer, S.V.H., Darras, V.M. (2013). Hatching the cleidoic egg: the role of thyroid

hormone. *Front. Endocrinol.*, 4, 63.

Driscoll, C.A., Macdonald, D.W., O'Brien, S.J. (2009). From wild animals to domesticated pets, an

evolutionary view of domestication. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.*, 106, 9971-9978.

Eckhoff, K.M., Maage, A. (1997). Iodine content in fish and other food products from east Africa

analyzed by ICP-MS. *J. Food Compost. Anal.*, 10, 270-282.

Elliott, K.H., Welcker, J., Gaston, A.J., Hatch, S.A., Palace, V., Hare, J.F. *et al.* (2013). Thyroid

hormones correlate with resting metabolic rate, not daily energy expenditure, in two charadriiform

seabirds. *Biol. Open,* 2, 580-586.

Ericson, P.G.P., Zuccon, D., Ohlson, J.I., Johansson, U.S., Alvarenga, H., Prum, R.O. (2006). Higher-

level phylogeny and morphological evolution of tyrant flycatchers, cotingas, manakins, and their

allies (Aves: Tyrannida). *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.,* 40, 471-483.

Gilby, A.J., Mainwaring, M.C., Griffith, S.C. (2013). Incubation behaviour and hatching synchrony

differ in wild and captive populations of the zebra finch. *Anim. Behav.*, 85, 1329-1334.

Hackett, S.J., Kimball, R.T., Reddy, S., Bowie, R.C.K., Braun, E.L., Braun, M.J. *et al.* (2008). A

phylogenomic study of birds reveals their evolutionary history. *Science,* 320, 1763-1768.

Hadfield, J.D. (2010). MCMC methods for multi-response generalized linear mixed models: the

MCMCglmm R package. *J. Stat. Softw.,* 33, 1-22.

Hadfield, J.D., Nakagawa, S. (2010). General quantitative genetic methods for comparative biology:

phylogenies, taxonomies and multi-trait models for continuous and categorical characters. *J. Evol.*

Biol., 23, 494-508.

Hahn, T.P., Brazeal, K.R., Schultz, E.M., Chmura, H.E., Cornelius, J.M., Watts, H.E. *et al.* (2015). Annual

schedules. In: *Sturkie's Avian Physiology*, 6ᵗʰ edition. (ed. C.G. Scanes). Elsevier Inc., pp. 847-867.

Hau, M., Ricklefs, R.E., Wikelski, M., Lee, K.A., Brawn, J.D. (2010). Corticosterone, testosterone and

life-history strategies of birds. *Proc. R. Soc. B,* 277, 3203-3212.

Houslay, T.M., Wilson, A.J. (2017). Avoiding the misuse of BLUP in behavioural ecology. *Behav. Ecol.,*

28, 948-952.

Hsu, B.-Y., Dijkstra, C., Darras, V.M., de Vries, B., Groothuis, T.G.G. (2016). Maternal adjustment of

constraint: differential effects of food availability on maternal deposition of macro-nutrients,

steroids and thyroid hormones in rock pigeon eggs. *Ecol. Evol.,* 6, 397-411.

Hsu, B.-Y., Dijkstra, C., Darras, V.M., de Vries, B., Groothuis, T.G.G. (2017). Maternal thyroid

hormones enhance hatching success but decrease nestling body mass in the rock pigeon (*Columba*

livia). *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.*, 240, 174-181.

Hsu, B.-Y., Doligez, B., Gustafsson, L., Ruuskanen, S. (2019a). Transient growth-enhancing effects of

elevated maternal thyroid hormones at no apparent oxidative cost during early postnatal period. *J.*

Avian Biol., 50, e01919.

Hsu, B.-Y., Verhagen, I., Gienapp, P., Darras, V.M., Visser, M.E., Ruuskanen, S. (2019b). Between- and

within-individual variation of maternal thyroid hormone deposition in wild great tits (*Parus major*).

Am. Nat., 194, E96-E108.

Jetz, W., Freckleton, R.P., McKechnie, A.E. (2008). Environment, migratory tendency, phylogeny and

basal metabolic rate in birds. *PLoS ONE*, 3, e3261.

Jetz, W., Thomas, G.H., Joy, J.B., Hartmann, K., Mooers, A.O. (2012). The global diversity of birds in

space and time. *Nature,* 491, 444-448.

Korevaar, T.I., Muetzel, R., Medici, M., Chaker, L., Jaddoe, V.W.V., de Rijke, Y.B. *et al.* (2016).

Association of maternal thyroid function during early pregnancy with offspring IQ and brain

morphology in childhood: a population-based prospective cohort study. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol.,*

4. 35-43.

Kulkami, S.S., Buchholz, D.R. (2012). Beyond synergy: corticosterone and thyroid hormone have

numerous interaction effects on gene regulation in *Xenopus tropicalis* tadpoles. *Endocrinology,* 153,

5309-5324.

Lehikoinen, E., Gustafsson, E., Aalto, T., Alho, P., Klemola, H., Laine, J. *et al.* (2003). *Vasinais-Suomen*

Linnut. Turun Lintutieteellinen Yhdistys, Turku. (In Finnish)

Lehoczki, R., Erdélyi, K., Sonkoly, K., Szemethy, L., Csányi. (2011). Iodine distribution in the

environment as a limiting factor for roe deer antler development. *Biol. Trace Elem. Res.*, 139, 168-

176.

MacLean, B., Tomazela, D.M., Shulman, N., Chambers, M., Finney, G.L., Frewen, B. *et al.* (2010).

Skyline: an open source document editor for creating and analyzing targeted proteomics

experiments. *Bioinformatics,* 26, 966-968.

Mason, G.J. (2010). Species differences in responses to captivity: stress, welfare and the comparative

method. *Trends Ecol. Evol.*, 25, 713-721.

McGlothin, J.W., Galloway, L.F. (2014). The contribution of maternal effects to selection response:

an empirical test of competing models. *Evolution*, 68, 549-558.

McKechnie, A.E., Freckleton, R.P., Jetz, W. (2006). Phenotypic plasticity in the scaling of avian basal

metabolic rate. *Proc. R. Soc. B,* 273, 931-937.

McNab, B.K. (2009). Ecological factors affect the level and scaling of avian BMR. *Comp. Biochem.*

Physiol. A, 152, 22-45.

McNabb, F.M.A. (2006). Avian thyroid development and adaptive plasticity. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.,*

147, 93-101.

McNabb, F.M.A., Darras, V.M. (2015). Thyroids. In: *Sturkie's Avian Physiology*, 6th edition. (ed. C.G.

Scanes). Elsevier Inc., pp. 535-547.

Medici, M., Timmermans, S., Visser, W., de Muinck Keizer-Schrama, S.M.P.F., Jaddoe, V.W.W.,

Hofman, A. *et al.* (2013). Maternal thyroid hormone parameters during early pregnancy and birth

weight: the generation R study. *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.,* 98, 59-66.

Moog, N.K., Entringer, S., Heim, C., Wadhwa, P.D., Kathmann, N., Buss, C. (2017). Influence of

maternal thyroid hormones during gestation on fetal brain development. *Neuroscience, 342,* 68-100.

Moore, M.P., Whiteman, H.H., Martin, R.A. (2019). A mother's legacy: the strength of maternal

effects in animal populations. *Ecol. Lett.*, 22, 1620-1628.

Moreno, J., Merino, S., Vásquez, R.A., Armesto, J.J. (2005). Breeding biology of the thorn-tailed

rayadito (Furnariidae) in south-temperate rainforests of Chile. *Condor*, 107, 69-77.

Mousseau, T.A., Fox, C.W. (1998). *Maternal effects as adaptations.* Oxford University Press, New

York, NY.

Mullur, R., Liu, Y.-Y., Brent, G.A. (2014). Thyroid hormone regulation of metabolism. *Physiol. Rev.,* 94,

355-382.

Myhrvold, N.P., Baldridge, E., Chan, B., Sivam, D., Freeman, D.L., Ernest, S.K.M. (2015). An amniote

life-history database to perform comparative analyses with birds, mammals, and reptiles. *Ecology,*

96, 3109.

Nakagawa, S., Schielzeth, H. (2010). Repeatability for Gaussian and non-Gaussian data: a practical

guide for biologists. *Biol. Rev.*, 85, 935-956.

Nakao, N., Ono, H., Yamamura, T., Anraku, T., Takagi, T., Higashi, K. *et al.* (2008). Thyrotrophin in the

pars tuberalis triggers photoperiodic response. *Nature*, 452, 317-323.

Nishiwaki-Ohkawa, T., Yoshimura, T. (2016). Molecular basis for regulating seasonal reproduction in

vertebrates. *J. Endocrinol.,* 229, R117-R127.

Pap, P.L., Vágási, C.I., Vincze, O., Osváth, G., Veres-Szászka, J., Czirják, G.Á. (2015). Physiological pace

of life: the link between constitutive immunity, developmental period, and metabolic rate in

European birds. *Oecologia,* 177, 147-158.

Perfito, N., Jeong, S.Y., Silverin, B., Calisi, R.M., Bentley, G.E., Hau, M. (2012). Anticipating spring: wild

populations of great tits (*Parus major*) differ in expression of key genes for photoperiodic time

measurement. *PLoS ONE*, 7, e34997.

Pérez, J.H., Furlow, J.D., Wingfield, J.C., Ramenofsky, M. (2016). Regulation of vernal migration in

Gambel's white-crowned sparrows: role of thyroxine and triiodothyronine. *Horm. Behav.,* 84, 50-56.

Pérez, J.H., Meddle, S.L., Wingfield, J.C., Ramenofsky, M. (2018). Effects of thyroid hormone

manipulation on pre-nuptial molt, luteinizing hormone and testicular growth in male white-crowned

sparrows (*Zonotrichia leuchophrys gambelii*). *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.,* 255: 12-18.

Plummer, M., Best, N., Cowles, K., Vines, K. (2006). CODA: convergence diagnosis and output analysis

for MCMC. *R News,* 6, 7-11.

Prati, M., Calvo, R., Morreale de Escobar, G. (1992). L-thyroxine and 3,5,3'-triiodothyronine

concentrations in the chicken egg and in the embryo before and after the onset of thyroid function.

Endocrinology, 130, 2651-2659.

Price, E.R., Dzialowski, E.M. (2018). Development of endothermy in birds: patterns and mechanisms.

J. Comp. Physiol. B, 188, 373-391.

Quirici, V., Hammers, M., Botero-Delgadillo, E., Cuevas, E., Espíndola-Hernández, P., Vásquez, R.A.

(2019). Age and terminal reproductive attempt influence laying date in the thorn-tailed rayadito. *J.*

Avian Biol. 50, e02059

Revell, L.J. (2009). Size-correction and principal components for interspecific comparative studies.

Evolution, 63, 3258-3268.

Revell, L.J. (2012). phytools: an R package for phylogenetic comparative biology (and other things).

Methods Ecol. Evol., 3, 217-223.

Ricklefs, R.E., Wikelski, M. (2002). The physiology/life-history nexus. *Trends Ecol. Evol.,* 17, 462-468.

Rubolini, D., Liker, A., Garamszegi, L.Z., Møller, A.P., Saino, N. (2015). Using the BirdTree.org website

to obtain robust phylogenies for avian comparative studies: a primer. *Curr. Zool.,* 61, 959-965.

Ruuskanen, S., Hsu, B.-Y. (2018). Maternal thyroid hormones: an unexplored mechanism underlying

maternal effects in an ecological framework. *Physiol. Biochem. Zool.,* 91, 904-916.

Ruuskanen, S., Darras, V.M., Visser, M.E., Groothuis, T.G.G. (2016a). Effects of experimentally

manipulated yolk thyroid hormone levels on offspring development in a wild bird species. *Horm.*

Behav., 81: 38-44.

Ruuskanen, S., Darras, V.M., de Vries, B., Visser, M.E., Groothuis, T.G.G. (2016b). Experimental

manipulation of food availability leads to short-term intra-clutch adjustment in egg mass but not in

yolk androgen or thyroid hormones. *J. Avian Biol.,* 47: 36-46.

Ruuskanen, S., Gienapp, P., Groothuis, T.G.G., Schaper, S.V., Darras, V.M., Pereira, C. *et al.* (2016c).

Heritable variation in maternally derived yolk androgens, thyroid hormones, and immune factors.

Heredity, 117, 184-190.

Ruuskanen, S., Hsu, B.-Y., Heinonen, A., Vainio, M., Darras, V.M., Sarraude, T. *et al.* (2018). A new

method for measuring thyroid hormones using nano-LC-MS/MS. *J. Chromatogr. B,* 1093-1094, 24-30.

Sechman, A., Bobek, S. (1988). Presence of iodothyronines in the yolk of the hen's egg. *Gen. Comp.*

Endocrinol., 69, 99-105.

Starck, J.M., Ricklefs, R.E. (1998a). Patterns of development: the altricial-precocial spectrum. In:

Avian Growth and Development: Evolution within the Altricial-Precocial Spectrum. (eds. Starck, J.M.,

Ricklefs, R.E.) Oxford University Press, New York, NY, pp. 3-30.

Starck, J.M., Ricklefs, R.E. (1998b). Avian growth rate data set. In: *Avian Growth and Development:*

Evolution within the Altricial-Precocial Spectrum. (eds. Starck, J.M., Ricklefs, R.E.) Oxford University

Press, New York, NY, pp. 381-415.

Starck, J.M., Ricklefs, R.E. (1998c). *Avian Growth and Development: Evolution within the Altricial-*

Precocial Spectrum. Oxford University Press, New York, NY.

Tacutu, R., Craig, T., Budovsky, A., Wuttke, D., Lehmann, G., Taranukha, D. *et al.* (2013). Human

ageing genomic resources: Integrated databases and tools for the biology and genetics of ageing.

Nucleic Acids Res., 41, D1027-D1033.

Tomasek, O., Bobek, L., Kralova, T., Adamkova, M., Albrecht, T. (2019). Fuel for the pace of life:

baseline blood glucose concentration co-evolves with life-history traits in songbirds. *Funct. Ecol.,* 33,

239-249.

Trumpff, C., de Schepper, J., Tafforeau, J., van Oyen, H., Vanderfaeillie, J., Vandervijvere, S. (2013).

Mild iodine deficiency in pregnancy in Europe and its consequences for cognitive and psychomotor

development of children: a review. *J. Trace Elem. Med. Biol.,* 27, 174-183.

Vágási, C.I., Vincze, O., Pătraş, L., Osváth, G., Pénzes, J., Haussmann, M.F. *et al.* (2019). Longevity and

life history coevolve with oxidative stress in birds. *Funct. Ecol.,* 33, 152-161.

van Herck, S.L.J., Geysens, S., Delbaere, J., Tylzanowski, P. Darras, V.M. (2012). Expression profile and

thyroid hormone responsiveness of transporters and deiodinases in early embryonic chicken brain

development. *Mol. Cell. Endocrinol.*, 349, 289-297.

Vézina, F., Gustowska, A., Jalvingh, K.M., Chastel, O., Piersma, T. (2009). Hormonal correlates and

thermoregulatory consequences of molting on metabolic rate in a northerly wintering shorebird.

Physiol. Biochem. Zool., 82, 129-142.

Villanueva, I., Alva-Sánchez, C., Pacheco-Rosado, J. (2013). The role of thyroid hormones as inductors

of oxidative stress and neurodegeneration. *Oxid. Med. Cell. Longev.* 2013, 218145.

Wada, H. (2008). Glucocorticoids: mediators of vertebrate ontogenetic transitions. *Gen. Comp.*

Endocrinol., 156, 441-453.

Welcker, J., Chastel, O., Gabrielsen, G.W., Guillaumin, J., Kitaysky, A.S., Speakman, J.R. *et al.* (2013).

Thyroid hormones correlate with basal metabolic rate but not field metabolic rate in a wild bird

species. *PLoS ONE,* 8, e56229.

Wikelski, M., Spinney, L., Schelsky, W., Scheuerlein, A., Gwinner, E. (2003). Slow pace of life in

tropical sedentary birds: a common-garden experiment on four stonechat populations from different

latitudes. *Proc. R Soc. Lond. B,* 270, 2383-2388.

Zhao, L., Gao, L., Yang, W., Xu, X., Wang, W., Liang, W. *et al.* (2017). Do migrant and resident species

differ in the timing of increases in reproductive and thyroid hormone secretion and body mass? A

case study in the comparison of pre-breeding physiology rhythms in the Eurasian skylark and Asian

short-toed lark. *Avian Res.*, 8, 10.