1	Headwaters fed by subterranean ice: potential climate refugia for mountain stream
2	communities?
3	
4	Lusha M. Tronstad ^{1,*} , Scott Hotaling ^{2,*} , J. Joseph Giersch ³ , Oliver J. Wilmot ⁴ , and Debra S.
5	Finn ⁵
6	
7	Affiliations:
8	¹ Wyoming Natural Diversity Database, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY, USA
9	² School of Biological Sciences, Washington State University, Pullman, WA, USA;
10	scott.hotaling@wsu.edu
11	³ U.S. Geological Survey, Northern Rocky Mountain Science Center, West Glacier, MT, USA;
12	jgiersch@usgs.gov
13	⁴ Wyoming Natural Diversity Database, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY, USA;
14	owilmot@uwyo.edu
15	⁵ Department of Biology, Missouri State University, Springfield, MO, USA;
16	DFinn@MissouriState.edu
17	* Contributed equally
18	
19	Correspondence: Lusha M. Tronstad, Wyoming Natural Diversity Database, University of
20	Wyoming, 1000 E. University Ave., Laramie, WY 82071 USA; Phone: (307) 766-3115; Email
21	tronstad@uwyo.edu
~ ~	

- 22
- 23 Running head: Mountain stream climate refugia

24	

ABSTRACT

25	Near-term extirpations of macroinvertebrates are predicted for mountain streams worldwide as a
26	warming climate drives the recession of high-elevation ice and snow. However, hydrological
27	sources likely vary in their resistance to climate change. Streams fed by more resistant sources
28	could persist as climate refugia for imperiled biota. In 2015-2016, we measured habitat
29	characteristics and quantified macroinvertebrate community structure along six alpine streams in
30	the Teton Range, Wyoming, USA. Strong differences in habitat characteristics (e.g., temperature,
31	bed stability, conductivity) confirmed three major alpine stream sources: surface glaciers,
32	perennial snowfields, and subterranean ice. Subterranean ice-fed streams - termed "icy seeps" -
33	are common but globally understudied. Macroinvertebrate communities in glacier- and
34	snowmelt-fed streams differed significantly in multivariate space, with icy-seep communities
35	intermediate, incorporating components of both glacier- and snowmelt-fed assemblages. Because
36	the thermal environment of subterranean ice, including rock glaciers, is decoupled from large-
37	scale climatic conditions, we predict that icy seeps may persist longer on the landscape than
38	streams fed by surface ice and snow sources. Our results suggest that icy seeps are suitable
39	habitat for many macroinvertebrates occupying streams fed by vulnerable hydrological sources.
40	Thus, icy seeps may act as key climate refugia for mountain stream biodiversity, an idea in need
41	of further investigation.

42

INTRODUCTION

43 The highest rates of climate change are occurring above the permanent treeline in alpine 44 and arctic ecosystems (Bradley et al. 2006). In the Rocky Mountains, warming is proceeding two 45 to three times more quickly than the global average (Hansen et al. 2005, Pederson et al. 2010), 46 resulting in extensive loss of glaciers and long-term snowpack (Hall & Fagre 2003). Streams fed 47 by permanent ice may exhibit short-term increases in flow as air temperature rises and source ice 48 melts more quickly, but eventually they will shift to reduced flow with the potential for 49 intermittency or drying permanently (Hotaling et al. 2017a). As climate change proceeds, 50 invertebrate diversity at the mountain range scale is predicted to decrease due to both overall loss 51 of habitat and summit traps, where the highest-altitude species and communities have nowhere 52 left to disperse as warmer conditions and lower elevation communities shift upward. Biodiversity 53 loss will be compounded by the loss of specific aquatic habitat types, particularly the unique 54 conditions associated with meltwater from once-permanent sources like glaciers, snowfields, or 55 subterranean ice (Brown et al. 2007, Milner et al. 2009, Jacobsen et al. 2012, Finn et al. 2013a. 56 2013b, Hotaling et al. 2017a). Given that many alpine stream communities appear adapted to 57 unique, meltwater-associated regimes, they are likely to be highly vulnerable to climate change 58 (Giersch et al. 2017, Lencioni 2018). However, because alpine streams are heterogeneous with 59 respect to hydrological source, the potential also exists to identify stream types that may be 60 locally buffered from broad-scale climate patterns and therefore represent potential climate 61 refugia for alpine stream biota (Morelli et al. 2016).

A major focus of alpine stream biology is understanding the links between hydrological
sources, the in-stream conditions they promote, and resident biotic communities (Ward 1994,
Hotaling et al. 2017a). Historically, according to primary hydrological source, three types of

65 alpine streams have been recognized, following Ward (1994): surface glacier-fed, snowmelt-fed, 66 and groundwater-fed streams. A fourth, understudied stream type exists – icy seeps – which are 67 fed by subterranean ice (Hotaling et al. 2017a, Hotaling et al. 2019a). The most common form of 68 subterranean ice in alpine zones is rock glaciers, masses of debris-covered ice that act as 69 conveyor belts moving fallen rock and other debris slowly downhill (Anderson et al. 2018). 70 There may be more than 10,000 rock glaciers in the western United States (Johnson 2018) and 71 they also appear common in mountainous regions worldwide (e.g., Lilleøren et al. 2011, Scotti et 72 al. 2013, Charbonneau & Smith. 2018). In contrast, there are ~1,250 surface glaciers and ~3,750 73 perennial snowfields in the western United States (Fountain et al. 2017). Thermal conditions in 74 rock glaciers are decoupled from ambient climate due to insulating debris cover (Clark et al. 75 1994, Anderson et al. 2018, Knight et al. 2019) and local-scale air circulation patterns (Millar et 76 al. 2013). In a climate change context, an intriguing aspect of rock glaciers and other 77 subterranean ice is their potential to persist on the landscape longer than surface glaciers, 78 snowfields, and other more vulnerable sources of alpine streams. Icy seeps therefore may act as 79 climate refugia for cold-adapted stream organisms (Hotaling et al. 2019a). 80 Population genetic studies of alpine-endemic species of the Rocky Mountains have 81 revealed substantial genetic structure across relatively short geographic distances (Finn et al. 82 2006, Hotaling et al. 2018, 2019b), suggesting that mountaintop populations have evolved in 83 considerable isolation. This process contributes to the elevated *beta* (among-stream) diversity of 84 alpine streams (Brown et al. 2007, Jacobsen et al. 2012, Finn et al. 2013a), but genetic isolation 85 and small population sizes can lead to bottlenecking and/or inbreeding depression in alpine-86 endemic species that are undergoing range contraction (e.g., Jordan et al. 2016). Like many 87 mountain ranges worldwide, virtually nothing is known of alpine stream ecology and

88 biodiversity in the Teton Range, a granite-dominated, young subrange of the Rocky Mountains. 89 Previous studies of montane (but not alpine) streams revealed high diversity in streams in the 90 range, particularly when compared to nearby lentic habitats (Tronstad et al. 2016, Hotaling et al. 91 2017b). Generally speaking, groundwater aquifers are rare in the Teton Range massif, and as 92 such, groundwater-fed streams are also virtually non-existent (L.M.T., personal observation). 93 Because groundwater-fed streams are traditionally considered to be the alpine stream type most 94 resistant to warming (e.g., Milner et al. 2009, Jacobsen et al. 2012), their rarity in the Teton 95 Range suggests alpine stream biodiversity in the region may be especially vulnerable to climate 96 change. 97 In this study, we addressed two major objectives. First, we sought to provide the first 98 assessment of alpine stream macroinvertebrate communities in the Teton Range. Second, we 99 explored associations between primary hydrological sources (surface glaciers, snowfields, and 100 subterranean ice) and community structure. Specifically, we asked if benthic communities 101 associated with icy seeps have substantial taxonomic overlap with the more vulnerable stream 102 types (glacier- and snowmelt-fed streams). Our study provides a preliminary look into whether 103 an underappreciated but globally common alpine stream type -icy seeps - may act as refugia for 104 ecological patterns and processes threatened by global change in mountain ecosystems. 105 Furthermore, our results provide new insight into the biodiversity in one of North America's 106 flagship protected areas, Grand Teton National Park, and neighboring wilderness areas. 107 108 **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

109

Study area

110	During the summers of 2015 and 2016 (26 July-10 August), we sampled six streams in
111	the Teton Range of Grand Teton National Park and the adjacent Jedediah Smith Wilderness in
112	northwestern Wyoming, USA (Figure 1; Table 1). Study streams were selected to span the
113	breadth of alpine hydrological sources in the range and included two streams fed by surface
114	glaciers ('glacier-fed' hereafter), two fed by subterranean ice ('icy seep' hereafter) and two fed
115	by permanent snowpack ('snowmelt-fed'). In 2015, we sampled both upstream (near the source)
116	and downstream sites on each stream (Figure 1). On average, upper sites were 111 m higher in
117	elevation and 690 m stream distance from lower sites (Table 1). In 2016, we re-sampled the
118	upper sites with the same methods to assess inter-annual variability. We focused on upper sites
119	because they were as 'true' to primary hydrological source as possible while lower sites
120	inherently reflected various degrees of mixing among sources. In both years, snow depth in the
121	range was lower than average (152 cm in May, 1981-2010) with 2015 and 2016 at 63.3% and
122	80% of normal, respectively (Teton Pass, USDA SNOTEL).
123	
124	Environmental data
125	At each site, we measured several environmental variables to characterize local habitat
126	and evaluate whether instream environmental conditions varied among stream types. We
127	measured water temperature for a full year (2015-2016) with in situ loggers (HOBO Pro v2,
128	Onset Computer Corporation) that recorded temperature hourly. We measured specific
129	conductivity (SPC), oxidation-reduction potential (ORP), pH, and dissolved oxygen (DO) with a
130	Yellow Springs Instrument (YSI) Professional Plus multiparameter sonde calibrated at the
131	trailhead (SPC, ORP, and pH) or at each site (DO). We estimated streambed stability with a
132	modified version of the Pfankuch Index (PI) following Peckarsky et al. (2014). Total suspended

133	sediments (TSS) were measured by filtering known volumes of streamwater through pre-
134	weighed filters (PALL Type A/E glass fiber filters) and measuring dry mass to the 10^{-5} grams.
135	Using the annual temperature data from each stream, we calculated mean temperature for
136	the entire year (T_{YEAR}), mean temperature between the summer solstice (21 June) and autumn
137	equinox (22 September; T_{SUMMER}), and maximum annual temperature range (T_{RANGE}). We also
138	estimated the date when seasonal snow covered (S $_{\rm ON}$) and uncovered (S $_{\rm OFF}$) each site by visually
139	inspecting thermographs to approximate the date when intraday variation ceased and in-stream
140	temperatures became constantly ~0°C (S _{ON}) or the opposite occurred (S _{OFF}). Using these values,
141	we calculated S_{DURATION} , the total days a site was snow covered between study years (S_{DURATION}
142	= S_{ON} - S_{OFF}). Finally, we used Principle Components Analysis (PCA; PC-ORD, McCune and
143	Mefford 2006) to characterize the upper sites on each stream according to four variables (SPC,
144	TSS, PI, T_{RANGE}) which comprise a modified 'glaciality index' (Ilg & Castella 2006). The
145	glaciality index has been useful in characterizing alpine stream hydrological sources globally
146	(e.g., Finn et al. 2013a, Cauvy-Fraunié et al. 2015).
147	
148	Macroinvertebrate sampling
149	We quantitatively sampled benthic macroinvertebrates at each site using a Surber sampler
150	(Area: 0.09 m ² , Mesh size: 243 μ m). At each location, a composite sample of 5-10 replicates was
151	collected depending on stream size, apparent biomass, and microhabitat diversity. Samples were
152	elutriated in the field to reduce the amount of inorganic substrate and stored in Whirl-Pak bags
153	with ~80% ethanol. In the laboratory, invertebrate samples were divided into large (>2 mm
154	mesh) and small (between 250 μ m and 2 mm) fractions. For the large fraction, all invertebrates
155	were identified. The small fraction was subsampled using the record player method when smaller

156	invertebrates were numerous (Waters 1969). Invertebrates were sorted, identified to the lowest
157	taxonomic level possible and counted under a dissecting microscope using keys in Merritt et al.
158	(2008) and Thorp & Covich (2010). Insects were typically identified to genus when mature
159	specimens were present, except Chironomidae which were classified into two groups,
160	Tanypodinae or non-Tanypodinae. We estimated density by summing the total number of
161	individuals for a given site and dividing by the area of streambed sampled. We calculated
162	biomass by measuring the length of the first 20 individuals of each taxon and then using length-
163	mass regressions to estimate individual biomass (Benke et al. 1999). We multiplied the mean
164	individual biomass for each taxon by the total number collected to estimate total biomass.
165	
166	Biological data analysis
167	We used analysis of variance (ANOVA) statistical tests and the R package 'plyr' (R Core
168	Development Team 2017; Wickham 2011) to characterize differences in invertebrate density,
169	biomass and richness among stream types. When stream type was significant ($\alpha = 0.05$), we used
170	Tukey's HSD to distinguish which stream types differed from one another ($P \le 0.05$). Our use of
171	Tukey's HSD tests was highly conservative, given the small sample size of streams in this
172	preliminary study. To assess the relationship between taxonomic richness or biomass with stream
173	characteristics of interest ($S_{DURATION}$, T_{SUMMER} , Pfankuch Index), we performed both Pearson and
174	Spearman's rank-order correlations using the R package 'Hmisc' (Harrell Jr. 2013). For
175	correlation analyses, taxonomic richness and biomass were averaged for 2015 and 2016 for each
176	upper site.
177	We evaluated differences in community structure across streams, sites, and years using
178	non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMS) with PC-ORD (McCune & Mefford 2006). We

179	$log_{10}(n + 1)$ transformed density data for all taxa, removed rare taxa (either those private to a
180	single site in the matrix and/or representing < 1% of the total abundance), and used Sørensen's
181	dissimilarities to create distance matrices. We ran NMS analyses independently on two data
182	matrices: one including each of the upper and lower sites collected in 2015 only ($N = 12$ sites)
183	and the other including only the upper sites (sampled in both 2015 and 2016; $N = 12$ sites).
184	Dimensionality of the final solutions was chosen as the number of axes that produced the lowest
185	stress following 200 iterations. Following NMS we applied multi-response permutation
186	procedures (MRPP) in PC-ORD to assess whether there were differences in either community
187	structure and/or mean community distance within the following groups: upstream compared to
188	downstream sites in 2015 and among the three stream types for the upper sites only (2015 $+$
189	2016).
190	
191	RESULTS
191 192	RESULTS Environmental variation
191 192 193	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the
191 192 193 194	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the glaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2).
191 192 193 194 195	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the glaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2). Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest in
191 192 193 194 195 196	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the glaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2). Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in glacier-fed streams (Table 2). Annual temperature range
191 192 193 194 195 196 197	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the glaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2). Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in glacier-fed streams (Table 2). Annual temperature range (T _{RANGE}) was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in icy seeps. Specific conductivity was
191 192 193 194 195 196 197 198	RESULTSEnvironmental variationThe upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to theglaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2).Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest insnowmelt-fed streams and lowest in glacier-fed streams (Table 2). Annual temperature range(T _{RANGE}) was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in icy seeps. Specific conductivity washighest in icy seeps (SPC >100 μ S cm ⁻¹ at upper sites) and minimal in the other two stream types
191 192 193 194 195 196 197 198 199	RESULTS Environmental variation The upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to the glaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2). Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in glacier-fed streams (Table 2). Annual temperature range (T _{RANGE}) was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in icy seeps. Specific conductivity was highest in icy seeps (SPC >100 µS cm ⁻¹ at upper sites) and minimal in the other two stream types (Table 2). Total suspended solids (TSS) was highest in glacier-fed streams (mean TSS, glacier-
 191 192 193 194 195 196 197 198 199 200 	RESULTSEnvironmental variationThe upper sites of our study streams clearly separated into three groups according to theglaciality index: glacier-fed streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps (Figure 2; Table 2).Streambed stability, measured by the Pfankuch Index (Peckarsky et al. 2014), was highest insnowmelt-fed streams and lowest in glacier-fed streams (Table 2). Annual temperature range(T _{RANGE}) was highest in snowmelt-fed streams and lowest in icy seeps. Specific conductivity washighest in icy seeps (SPC >100 μ S cm ⁻¹ at upper sites) and minimal in the other two stream types(Table 2). Total suspended solids (TSS) was highest in glacier-fed streams (mean TSS, glacier-fed = 0.157 g/L, Table 2), indicating active glacier beds were present upstream.

202	2.2 °C), and higher in snowmelt-fed streams (mean = 6.9 °C; Table 2). T_{SUMMER} was correlated
203	with T_{RANGE} and therefore excluded from the PCA. Upper sites were on average 1.2°C colder in
204	the summer and had less stable stream beds than lower sites (mean PI, upper = 27 ; mean PI,
205	lower = 20.33; Table 1). Other environmental metrics (i.e., DO, pH, ORP, days under snow) did
206	not vary consistently among stream types or between upper and lower sites (Table 2).
207	
208	Biological variation
209	We collected a total of 35 invertebrate taxa of which 28 were insects (Supplementary
210	Appendix 1). Insects composed 95% of the total mean densities and 92% of the total biomass.
211	The highest densities, biomass, and richness of invertebrate communities were collected in
212	snowmelt-fed streams. Total macroinvertebrate density did not differ among stream types (F =
213	1.3, df = 2, $P = 0.31$; Figure 3A), but biomass was ~7x higher in snowmelt-fed streams compared
214	to glacier-fed streams and icy seeps (F = 7.1, df = 2, $P < 0.009$; Tukey's HSD, $P \le 0.02$; Figure
215	3B). Additionally, invertebrate richness was ~2x higher in snowmelt-fed streams than glacier-fed
216	streams and icy seeps (F = 10.4, df = 2, $P < 0.002$, Tukey's HSD, $P < 0.008$; Figure 3C). We
217	observed generally higher and more variable densities (F = 2.7, df = 1, $P = 0.13$; Figure 3D) and
218	higher biomass (F = 2.6, df = 1, $P = 0.13$; Figure 3E) at the lower sites. We also observed ~50%
219	more taxa at lower versus upper sites (F = 8.5, df = 1, $P = 0.012$; Figure 3F). Pearson
220	correlations between richness or biomass and $S_{DURATION}$, T_{SUMMER} , or streambed stability
221	indicated that only T_{SUMMER} was significantly correlated with the biological responses (Richness:
222	Pearson $r = 0.81$, $P = 0.002$; Biomass: Pearson $r = 0.63$, $P = 0.038$; Figure 4). Spearman's rank-
223	order correlations of the same relationships exhibited similar patterns, again with only T_{SUMMER}

exhibiting significant correlations with richness (Spearman's r = 0.89, P = 0.003) and biomass (Spearman's r = 0.67, P = 0.023).

226 The most stable NMS solution for comparing community structure between upper and 227 lower sites in 2015 was three-dimensional (stress = 9.6). The first two axes explained 88% of the 228 total variation. Communities from the six lower sites overlapped substantially in ordination space 229 with communities from the six upper sites (MRPP A = 0.013; P = 0.27). However, the mean 230 pairwise community distance was greater among the upper sites than the lower (0.58 vs, 0.47), a 231 trend that is apparent in the NMS bi-plot (Figure 5A) as a constriction of the total ordination 232 space occupied by lower sites compared to the increased space occupied by the upper sites. 233 The NMS analysis that included upper sites only (2015 and 2016) converged on a two-234 dimensional solution as the most stable result (stress = 8.9). The two axes explained 86% of the 235 total variation, with axis-1 alone explaining 70% of the variation. In general, communities 236 occupying glacier-fed streams had the lowest axis-1 values, communities in snowmelt-fed 237 streams had the highest axis-1 values and icy seep communities had intermediate axis-1 values 238 (Figure 5B). MRPP results suggested that communities occupying these three stream types were 239 significantly different from one another (A = 0.19; P = 0.006). Pairwise differences were strong 240 between glacier-fed and snowmelt-fed communities (A = 0.21; P = 0.005) and were weaker but 241 significant for the two pairs that included icy seep communities (icy seep vs. glacier-fed: A =242 0.11; P = 0.05; icy seep vs. snowmelt: A = 0.12; P = 0.03).

- 243
- 244

DISCUSSION

As climate change proceeds and mountain glaciers recede, there is a need to develop a clearer understanding of how patterns of extant biodiversity and habitat heterogeneity are linked 247 in high-elevation ecosystems. In this study, we provide the first description of macroinvertebrate 248 diversity in the high Teton Range, Wyoming, where three primary stream types exist: glacier-fed 249 streams, snowmelt-fed streams, and icy seeps. To the best of our knowledge, no streams fed by 250 groundwater aquifers have been documented in the alpine zone of the granitic Teton Range. 251 From a global perspective, icy seeps, which are fed by subterranean ice (primarily by rock 252 glaciers), rather than aquifers of liquid water, are of particular interest as they are likely to persist 253 on the landscape longer than surface ice features (Hotaling et al. 2019a). For the Teton Range, a 254 scarcity of groundwater-fed streams suggests that biodiversity in the region may be even more 255 reliant on meltwater than other high-alpine regions (e.g., European ranges, Brown et al. 2007; 256 tropical Andes, Finn et al. 2016; Glacier National Park, Giersch et al. 2017), and thus may be 257 especially reliant on icy seep-associated climate refugia in the decades to come. In the streams 258 sampled for this study, glacier- and snowmelt-fed streams exhibited significantly different 259 invertebrate communities; however, icy seeps were intermediate between the two in terms of 260 community structure and invertebrate density, biomass, and richness. These results suggest that 261 icy seep communities share some characteristics with both glacier- and snowmelt-fed streams 262 and might have the potential to act as climate refugia for at least a subset of the unique 263 communities present in each of the other more vulnerable stream types. Thus, the potential for 264 icy seeps and ice-influenced terrestrial refugia (Millar et al. 2015) to buffer climate-induced 265 biodiversity loss has profound, global implications. 266 The recession of meltwater sources is predicted to strongly affect downstream

invertebrate communities (Jacobsen et al. 2012). In the near term, rising in-stream temperatures
 are expected as ice melt comprises ever smaller proportions of stream flow. In alpine streams
 worldwide, warmer conditions have been correlated with increased species richness for microbial

270 diversity (e.g., Wilhelm et al. 2013, Hotaling et al. 2019a), diatoms (Fell et al. 2018) and 271 macroinvertebrates (Finn & Poff 2005, Jacobsen et al. 2012). Our study adds another line of 272 evidence to this global pattern as we detected a positive correlation between species richness and 273 mean summer temperature (T_{SUMMER}) for macroinvertebrate communities of the Teton Range. 274 We also observed greater richness at lower (mean = 15 taxa) versus upper (mean = 10 taxa) sites. 275 This finding also aligned with, and extended, the conclusions of Tronstad et al. (2016), the only 276 other study to investigate longitudinal patterns of macroinvertebrate richness in montane streams 277 of the Teton Range. We observed far fewer taxa at our highest elevation sites (10 taxa; ~3,150 278 m) versus the highest elevation sites included in Tronstad et al. (2016): 26 taxa at ~2,700 m. 279 Although local (alpha) diversity is expected to increase with warming water 280 temperatures, among-stream (beta) diversity may decrease as more diverse communities shift 281 upstream, effectively homogenizing biological diversity at the regional scale (Jacobsen et al. 282 2012, Wilhelm et al. 2013, Hotaling et al. 2017a). In the Teton Range, we observed greater beta 283 diversity among our upper sample sites than our lower sites, even with wide variation in 284 landscape features (e.g., a lake separating stream reaches at one of our sites) and variable 285 distances between upper and lower sites among our six focal streams. This spatial pattern 286 suggests that in the Teton Range, like elsewhere in the world, heterogeneous hydrological 287 sources bolster regional-scale alpine stream biodiversity. 288 Ultimately, the degree to which alpine streams will be affected by climate change in

terms of flow magnitude and persistence remains largely unknown. While many studies of alpine streams operate under the assumption that perennial flow will continue for many streams in the decades to come (e.g., Jacobsen et al. 2012), this may not be the case (e.g., Haldorsen & Heim 1999). Thus, the biological ramifications of declining meltwater sources in places like the Teton

293 Range, where groundwater aquifer-fed springs are scarce, may be even more profound than in 294 ranges with a greater diversity of alpine stream sources (e.g., Glacier National Park, Giersch et 295 al. 2017). Indeed, if alpine streams supported by surface glaciers and permanent snowfields 296 transition to intermittency or dry completely, the future of biodiversity in these ecosystems may 297 depend almost exclusively on icy seeps. Our study paired with the broader glaciological 298 literature, however, suggests that there is room for optimism in this regard. Indeed, icy seeps 299 have the potential to span a wide beta diversity profile, perhaps bridging the taxonomic gap 300 between glacier- and snowmelt-fed communities (e.g., Hotaling et al. 2019a). Moreover, rock 301 glaciers and other subterranean ice forms are common in alpine regions worldwide and likely the 302 most resistant ice form to future warming. Clearly, research focused on subterranean ice sources 303 and associated icy seeps, and the biological communities they support, represents a pressing need 304 in alpine stream biology. We suggest that future studies incorporate temporal monitoring of 305 alpine stream types, including icy seeps, to explicitly test how biodiversity and habitat 306 characteristics may be altered across alpine stream types as climate change proceeds. 307

308

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

309 Financial support was provided by The University of Wyoming-National Park Service Research 310 Station and the Teton Conservation District. We thank Lydia Zeglin for assistance in the field 311 and Hanna Foster, Logan Fox, Alexis Lester, Jackson Marr, Jake Ruthven, Joe Wannemuehler, 312 and Kara Wise who helped sort invertebrate samples. Matthew Green provided helpful 313 comments on the manuscript. Any use of trade, firm, or product names is for descriptive 314 purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

316	LITERATURE CITED
317	Anderson, R. S., L. S. Anderson, W. H. Armstrong, M. W. Rossi & S. E. Crump. 2018.
318	Glaciation of alpine valleys: the glacier – debris-covered glacier – rock glacier
319	continuum. Geomorphology 311:127-142.
320	Benke, A. C., A. D. Huryn, L. A. Smock & J. B. Wallace. 1999. Length-mass relationships for
321	freshwater macroinvertebrates in North America with particular reference to the
322	Southeastern United States. Journal of the North American Benthological Society
323	18:308-343.
324	Bradley, R. S., M. Vuille, H. F. Diaz & W. Vergara. 2006. Threats to water supplies in the
325	tropical Andes. Science 312:1755-1756.
326	Brown, L. E., D. M. Hannah & A. M. Milner. 2007. Vulnerability of alpine stream biodiversity
327	to shrinking glaciers and snowpacks. Global Change Biology 13:958-966.
328	Cauvy-Fraunié, S., , R. Espinosa, P. Andino, D. Jacobsen & O. Dangles. 2015. Invertebrate
329	metacommunity structure and dynamics in an Andean glacial stream network facing
330	climate change. PLoS ONE 10:e0136793.
331	Charbonneau, A. A. & D. J. Smith. 2018. An inventory of rock glaciers in the central British
332	Columbia Coast Mountains, Canada, from high resolution Google Earth imagery. Arctic,
333	Antarctic, and Alpine Research 50:e1489026.
334	Clark, D. H., M. M. Clark & A. R. Gillespie, 1994. Debris-covered glaciers in the Sierra Nevada,
335	California, and their implications for snowline reconstructions. Quaternary Research
336	41:139-153.

0 T F F

2010 D 11 1

1 .

331	Fell, S. C., J. L. Carrivick, M. G. Kelly, L. Fureder & L. E. Brown. 2018. Declining glacier cover
338	threatens the biodiversity of alpine river diatom assemblages. Global Change Biology
339	24(12):5828-5840.

T... 1

D 11 0

007

0

- 340 Finn, D. S., A. C. Encalada & H. Hampel. 2016. Genetic isolation among mountains but not
- between stream types in a tropical high-altitude mayfly. Freshwater Biology 61(5):702714.
- 343 Finn, D. S., K. Khamis & A. M. Milner. 2013a. Loss of small glaciers will diminish beta

344 diversity in Pyrenean streams at two levels of biological organization. Global Ecology345 and Biogeography 22:40-51.

- 346 Finn, D. S. & N. L. Poff. 2005. Variability and convergence in benthic communities along the
- 347 longitudinal gradients of four physically similar Rocky Mountain streams. Freshwater
 348 Biology 50:243-261.
- 349 Finn, D. S., D. M. Theobald, W. C. Black & N. L. Poff. 2006. Spatial population genetic
- 350 structure and limited dispersal in a Rocky Mountain alpine stream insect. Molecular
 351 ecology 15:3553–3566.
- 352 Finn, D. S., C. Zamora-Muñoz, C. Múrria, M. Sáinz-Bariáin & J. Alba-Tercedor. 2013b.
- 353 Evidence from recently deglaciated mountain ranges that *Baetis alpinus* (Ephemeroptera)
- 354 could lose significant genetic diversity as alpine glaciers disappear. Freshwater Science
 355 33:207-216.
- Fountain, A. G., B. Glenn & H. J. Basagic. 2017. The geography of glaciers and perennial
- 357 snowfields in the American West. Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research 49:391-410.

338	Giersch, J. J., S. Hotaling, R. P. Kovach, L. A. Jones & C. C. Munifeld. 2017. Climate-induced
359	glacier and snow loss imperils alpine stream insects. Global Change Biology 23(7):2577-
360	2589.

- 361 Giersch, J. J., S. Jordan, G. Luikart, L. A. Jones, F. R. Hauer & C. C. Muhlfeld. 2015. Climate-
- induced range contraction of a rare alpine aquatic invertebrate. Freshwater Science 34:53-65.
- Haldorsen, S. & M. Heim, 1999. An Arctic groundwater system and its dependence upon
 climatic change: An example from Svalbard. Permafrost and Periglacial Processes
 10:137-149.
- 367 Hall, M. H. P. & D. B. Fagre. 2003. Modeled climate-induced glacier change in Glacier National
 368 Park, 1850-2100. Bioscience 53:131-140.
- 369 Hansen, J., L. Nazarenko, R. Ruedy, M. Sato, J. Willis, A. Del Genio, D. Koch, A. Lacis, K. Lo,
- 370 S. Menon, T. Novakov, J. Perlwitz, G. Russell, G. A. Schmidt & N. Tausnev. 2005.

Earth's energy imbalance: confirmation and implications. Science 308:1431-1435.

372 Harrell, F. E. J. 2013. Hmisc: Harrell miscellaneous. R package version 3.12-2. [Computer

373 software]. Available from http://cran.R-project.Org/web/packages/Hmisc.

374 Hotaling, S., D. S. Finn, J. J. Giersch, D. W. Weisrock & D. Jacobsen. 2017a. Climate change

375 and alpine stream biology: progress, challenges, and opportunities for the future.

- Biological Reviews 92:2024-2045.
- 377 Hotaling, S., M. Foley, L. Zeglin, D. Finn, L. Tronstad, J. Giersch, C. Muhlfeld & D. W.
- 378 Weisrock. 2019a. Microbial assemblages reflect environmental heterogeneity in alpine
- 379 streams. Global Change Biology.

0 - - 0

200	Hatalina	C	T	Т	Cianach	D	C	Einn	т	NΛ	Tronstad	C	Iondon	т	\mathbf{L}	Com	n 0	D	C	C_{all}	\mathbf{C}	\mathbf{C}
200	notanng,	.з.,	J	J.	Glersch	, D	. ວ.	ГШП	, L.	. IVI	. Tronstau	,ວ	. Jordan	, L	. с.	Ser	pa,	к.	U.	Call	, U.	U.

- 381 Muhlfeld & D. W. Weisrock. 2019b. Congruent population genetic structure but differing
- 382 depths of divergence for three alpine stoneflies with similar ecology and geographic
- distributions. Freshwater Biology 64:335-347.
- Hotaling, S., C. C. Muhlfeld, J. J. Giersch, O. A. Ali, S. Jordan, M. R. Miller, G. Luikart & D.
- W. Weisrock. 2018. Demographic modelling reveals a history of divergence with gene
 flow for a glacially tied stonefly in a changing post-Pleistocene landscape. Journal of
- 387 Biogeography 45:304-317.
- 388 Hotaling, S., L. M. Tronstad & J. C. Bish. 2017b. Macroinvertebrate richness is lower in high-
- elevation lakes vs nearby streams: evidence from Grand Teton National Park, Wyoming.
 Journal of Natural History 51:1657-1669.
- 391 Ilg, C. & E. Castella. 2006. Patterns of macroinvertebrate traits along three glacial stream
 392 continuums. Freshwater Biology 51:840-853.
- Jacobsen, D., A. M. Milner, L. E. Brown & O. Dangles. 2012. Biodiversity under threat in
 glacier-fed river systems. Nature Climate Change 2:361–364.
- 395 Johnson, G. F. 2018. Rock Glaciers of the Contiguous United States: Spatial Distribution,
- 396 Cryospheric Context, and Riparian Vegetation. Dissertations and Theses 4507:1-147.
- 397 Jordan, S., J. J. Giersch, C. C. Muhlfeld, S. Hotaling, L. Fanning, T. H. Tappenbeck & G.
- Luikart. 2016. Loss of genetic diversity and increased subdivision in an endemic alpine
 stonefly threatened by climate change. PLoS ONE 11(6):e0157386.
- 400 Knight, J., S. Harrison & D. B. Jones. 2019. Rock glaciers and the geomorphological evolution
- 401 of deglacierizing mountains. Geomorphology 324:14-24.

- 402 Lencioni, V. 2018. Glacial influence and stream macroinvertebrate biodiversity under climate
 403 change: Lessons from the Southern Alps. Science of The Total Environment 622:563404 575.
- 405 Lilleøren, K. S. & B. Etzelmüller. 2011. A regional inventory of rock glaciers and ice \Box cored
- 406 moraines in Norway. Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical Geography 93:175-191.
- 407 McCune, B. & M. Mefford. 2006. PC-ORD. Multivariate analysis of ecological data. Version 5.
- 408 Merritt, R. W., K. W. Cummins & M. B. Berg. 2008. An Introduction To The Aquatic Insects of
 409 North America, 4th Edition. Kendall/Hunt Publishing Company, Dubuque, Iowa.
- 410 Millar, C. I., R. D. Westfall & D. L. Delany. 2013. Thermal and hydrologic attributes of rock
- 411 glaciers and periglacial talus landforms: Sierra Nevada, California, USA. Quaternary
 412 International 310:169-180.
- 413 Millar, C. I., R. D. Westfall, A. Evenden, J. G. Holmquist, J. Schmidt-Gengenbach, R. S.
- 414 Franklin, J. Nachlinger & D. L. Delany. 2015. Potential climatic refugia in semi-arid,
- 415 temperate mountains: Plant and arthropod assemblages associated with rock glaciers,
- 416 talus slopes, and their forefield wetlands, Sierra Nevada, California, USA. Quaternary
- 417 International 387:106-121.
- 418 Milner, A. M., L. E. Brown & D. M. Hannah. 2009. Hydroecological response of river systems
 419 to shrinking glaciers. Hydrological Processes 23:62-77.
- 420 Morelli, T. L., C. Daly, S. Z. Dobrowski, D. M. Dulen, J. L. Ebersole, S. T. Jackson, J. D.
- 421 Lundquist, C. I. Millar, S. P. Maher, W. B. Monahan, K. R. Nydick, K. T. Redmond, S.
- 422 C. Sawyer, S. Stock & S. R. Beissinger. 2016. Managing climate change refugia for
- 423 climate adaptation. PLoS ONE 11:e0159909.

- 424 Peckarsky, B. L., A. R. McIntosh, S. C. Horn, K. McHugh, D. J. Booker, A. C. Wilcox, W.
- Brown & M. Alvarez. 2014. Characterizing disturbance regimes of mountain streams.
 Freshwater Science 33:716-730.
- 427 Pederson, G. T., L. J. Graumlich, D. B. Fagre, T. Kipfer & C. C. Muhlfeld. 2010. A century of
- 428 climate and ecosystem change in Western Montana: what do temperature trends portend?
 429 Climatic Change 98:133-154.
- 430 R Development Core Team. 2017. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R
- 431 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL http://www.R-project.org.
- 432 Scotti, R., F. Brardinoni, S. Alberti, P. Frattini & G. B. Crosta. 2013. A regional inventory of
- rock glaciers and protalus ramparts in the central Italian Alps. Geomorphology 186:136-149.
- Thorp, J. H. & A. P. Covich (eds). 2010. Ecology and Classification of North American
 Freshwater Invertebrates. 3rd edition. Academic Press, London.
- 437 Tronstad, L. M., S. Hotaling & J. C. Bish. 2016. Longitudinal changes in stream invertebrate
- 438 assemblages of Grand Teton National Park, Wyoming. Insect Conservation and Diversity439 9:320-331.
- 440 Ward, J. V., 1994. Ecology of alpine streams. Freshwater Biology 32:277-294.
- 441 Waters, T. F., 1969. Subsampler for dividing large samples of stream invertebrate drift.
- 442 Limnology and Oceanography 14:813-815.
- 443 Wickham, H. 2011. The Split-Apply-Combine Strategy for Data Analysis. 2011 40:29.
- 444 Wilhelm, L., G. A. Singer, C. Fasching, T. J. Battin & K. Besemer. 2013. Microbial biodiversity
- 445 in glacier-fed streams. ISME Journal 7:1651-1660.

446

TABLES

447 Table 1. Key characteristics of the study streams and sites in the Teton Range, Wyoming, USA.

448 Distances to source (*D*) are cumulative. Both elevation and *D* are in meters.

Stream	Code	Site	Туре	Lat., Long.	Elev.	D
Petersen Glacier	PG	Upper	Glacier-fed	43.782, -110.846	2,922	51
		Lower	Glacier-fed	43.785, -110.841	2,900	673
Middle Teton	MT	Upper	Glacier-fed	43.728, -110.795	2,955	178
		Lower	Glacier-fed	43.725, -110.790	2,802	780
South Cascade Creek	SCC	Upper	Icy seep	43.722, -110.838	3,152	165
		Lower	Icy seep	43.729, -110.837	2,943	1,051
Wind Cave	WC	Upper	Icy seep	43.666, -110.961	2,692	29
		Lower	Icy seep	43.667, -110.955	2,564	144
S. Fork Teton Creek	SFT	Upper	Snowmelt	43.691, -110.843	2,987	1,227
		Lower	Snowmelt	43.693, -110.859	2,881	2,757
N. Forlz Toton Crook	NFT	Upper	Snowmelt	43.777, -110.860	2,955	9
IN. FOIR TELOII CIEEK		Lower	Snowmelt	43.775, -110.861	2,910	393

450	Table 2. Environmental characteristics of the streams and sites included in this study. T_{YEAR} :
451	mean temperature for a calendar year. T_{SUM} : mean temperature between the summer solstice (21
452	June) and autumn equinox (22 September). T_{RANGE} : the difference between the maximum and
453	minimum temperatures recorded in the stream during the calendar year. S_{ON} and S_{OFF} indicate
454	the day of the year when a site was covered (S_{ON}) or uncovered (S_{OFF}) by snow according to
455	thermographs. $S_{DURATION}$ (S_{DUR} below) is the approximate total number of days each site spent
456	under snow in 2015-2016. Abbreviations and units: temperature (T; °C), dissolved oxygen (DO,
457	percent saturation), specific conductivity (SPC; μ S cm ⁻¹), oxidation-reduction potential (ORP,
458	mV), total suspended solids (TSS; g/L; upper sites only) and the Pfankuch Index (PI; higher
459	values correspond to a less stable streambed). All data (except for S_{ON} , S_{OFF} , and S_{DUR}) are for
460	2015 only. Stream codes are provided in Table 1.

Stream	Site	Tyear	T _{SUM}	T _{RANGE}	Son	S_{OFF}	S _{DUR}	DO	SPC	pН	ORP	TSS	PI
PG	Upper	0.6	1.4	13.7	306	195	254	118	3.7	7.9	128.4	0.21	42
	Lower	1.9	6.0	16.2	303	128	190	103	9.9	8.6	24.8		23
MT	Upper	0.7	1.7	10.3	300	128	193	101	4.8	8.4	41.2	0.105	42
	Lower	1.5	4.1	13.6	296	150	219	100	5.7	8.9	62.9		30
SCC	Upper	0.5	1.5	10.0	298	204	271	104	113.2	8.5	-4.6	0.033	21
	Lower	1.5	4.6	13.0	297	155	223	104	110.3	8.4	58.4		16
WC	Upper	1.7	2.9	4.4		No cov	ver	102	176.8	8.6	47	0.023	18
	Lower	1.9	4.2	7.3	309	98	154	99	175.2	8.4	77.2		18
SFT	Upper	1.9	7.1	17.7	300	174	239	101	74.3	8.6	-0.2	0.013	24
	Lower	Logger failed					101	114.7	8.5	23		17	
NFT	Upper	2.5	6.6	15.2	300	125	190	101	11.1	8.5	64.9	0.024	15
	Lower	2.5	6.0	10.7	328	133	170	96	11.8	7.8	89.6		18

461

FIGURES



Figure 1. All streams and sites in the Teton Range, Wyoming, USA, included in this study.
Upper sites were selected to be as close to the primary hydrological source as possible. Numbers
in the top panel correspond to satellite imagery (DigitalGlobe, 15 October 2015, bottom panel)
with stream channel (light blue) and sample sites (red dots) marked.



467

468 Figure 2. Principal components analysis (PCA) results showing environmental variation among

the upper sites according to the four variables of the glaciality index.





471 Figure 3. Macroinvertebrate density, biomass and richness among sites categorized by

472 hydrologic source (a-c) or site (d-f). Bold lines are median values, lower and upper box limits
473 indicate the 25th and 75th percentiles, respectively, and whiskers represent the lower and upper
474 limits of the data (excluding outliers which are shown as circles).

bioRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/788273; this version posted October 1, 2019. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted bioRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under aCC-BY 4.0 International license.



Figure 4. Bivariate plots of biomass (a-c) and richness (d-f) versus the Pfankuch Index, a measure of stream bed stability (higher = less stable), $S_{DURATION}$ (the approximate number of days each stream was snow-covered in 2015-2016), and T_{SUMMER} (mean stream temperature between the summer and autumn solstices). Significant Pearson correlations (P < 0.05) are in bold with trendlines shown. The number of data points varies across plots due to a lack of snow cover at upper Wind Cave during the study period and a failed temperature logger at lower South Fork Teton Creek (see Table 2).



483

Figure 5. Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMS) plots of macroinvertebrate communities
comparing (a) upper (circles) versus lower (triangles) sites in 2015 only and (b) upper sites only
between 2015 (circles) and 2016 (squares). Colored polygons in (a) reflect the breadth of NMS
space occupied by upper (dashed lines, green fill) and lower (solid lines, blue fill) sites.