Title:

Comparative Genomics Shows Differences in the Electron Transport and Carbon Metabolic

Pathways of *Mycobacterium africanum* relative to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and suggests an

adaptation to low oxygen tension

Authors and Affiliations:

Boatema Ofori-Anyinam[1,2,3], Abi Janet Riley[2], Tijan Jobarteh[2], Ensa Gitteh[2], Binta Sarr[2], Tutty Isatou

Faal-Jawara[2], Leen Rigouts[1,4], Madikay Senghore[2], Aderemi Kehinde[5,6], Nneka Onyejepu[7], Martin

Antonio[2,8,9], Bouke C. de Jong[1], Florian Gehre[1,2,10], Conor J. Meehan[1,11]*

[1]Mycobacteriology Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium

[2]Vaccines and Immunity Theme, Medical Research Council Unit, The Gambia, Banjul, The Gambia

[3]Center for Global Health Security and Diplomacy, Ottawa, Canada

[4]Department of Biomedical Sciences, Antwerp University, Antwerp, Belgium

[5]Department of Medical Microbiology & Parasitology, University College Hospital, Ibadan, Nigeria

[6]Department of Medical Microbiology & Parasitology, College of Medicine, University of Ibadan,

Ibadan, Nigeria

[7]Center for Tuberculosis Research, Nigeria Institute of Medical Research, Lagos, Nigeria

[8]Division of Infectious and Tropical Diseases, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine,

London, United Kingdom

[9]Medical School, University of Warwick, Coventry, United Kingdom

[10] Bernhard-Nocht Institute for Tropical Medicine, Hamburg, Germany

[11]School of Chemistry and Biosciences, University of Bradford, Bradford, United Kingdom

Corresponding Author: Conor J. Meehan, University of Bradford, Richmond Building, Richmond

Road, BD7 1DP, UK, c.meehan2@bradford.ac.uk

Summary:

The geographically restricted *M. africanum* lineages (MAF) are primarily found in West Africa, where they account for a significant proportion of tuberculosis. Despite this phenomenon, little is known about the co-evolution of these ancient lineages with West Africans. MAF and *M. tuberculosis* sensu stricto lineages (MTB) differ in their clinical, *in vitro* and *in vivo* characteristics for reasons not fully understood. Therefore, we compared genomes of 289 MAF and 205 MTB clinical isolates from the 6 main human- adapted *M. tuberculosis* complex lineages, for mutations in their Electron Transport Chain and Central Carbon Metabolic pathway in an attempt to explain these metabolic differences. Furthermore, we determined, *in silico*, whether each mutation could affect the function of genes encoding enzymes in these pathways.

We found more potentially deleterious mutations in these pathways in MAF lineages compared to MTB lineages. Additionally, we found that convergent evolution in these pathways occurred between MAF and some MTB lineages.

Generally, our findings show further differences between MAF and MTB lineages that may have contributed to the MAF clinical- and growth phenotype and may indicate potential adaptation of MAF lineages to a distinct ecological niche, that we suggest may include areas characterized by low oxygen tension.

Running title: The *M. africanum* respiratory chain and carbon metabolic pathway

Keywords: Tuberculosis, *Mycobacterium africanum*, *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, genome, Electron Transport, Carbon Metabolism

1 Introduction

The *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex (MTBC) consists of a group of human–adapted ecotypes-*Mycobacterium tuberculosis* sensu stricto, *Mycobacterium africanum*, *Mycobacterium canetti* and animal-adapted ecotypes (1-4). There are seven known MTBC lineages (L) associated with particular geographic regions and adapted to specific human populations. These are the five lineages that make up *M. tuberculosis* sensu stricto (lineages 1-4 and lineage 7) and the two *M. africanum* lineages (lineages 5 and 6). Africa uniquely has a representation of all seven lineages.

MTBC strains from the seven lineages differ on average by about 1200 single nucleotide polymorphisms (5), with clear distinction between MAF and MTB lineages (6-8).

MTB Lineages 2 and 4 are more widespread geographically, more pathogenic and more transmissible, while MAF Lineages are exclusively found in West Africa and less transmissible (5, 9, 10). Clinically, MTB L4 is relatively more virulent than MAF L6 as evidenced by significantly faster progression, in contacts of infectious cases, to active disease (11). MAF lineages are associated with extrapulmonary disease and MAF L6 more commonly causes disease in immunocompromised persons and those with lower Body Mass Index, implying a more opportunistic pathogen (10, 12). Furthermore, MAF L5 and L6 grow markedly slower than MTB and prefer microaerobic growth conditions (13-15). Reasons for these differences are not completely known, although ours and other's previous studies have attempted to explain some of the observations. A study documented non-synonymous SNPs or frameshift mutations in some genes associated with growth attenuation in MAF and higher mutation frequency in genes necessary for transport of sulphur, ions and lipids/fatty acids across the cell membrane (14). Another reported under-expression of, and MAF L6 specific mutations in, dormancy regulon genes, a network of genes crucial for the survival of MTB during hypoxia or anaerobiosis (15, 16).

Genes that encode proteins involved in nutrient metabolism and respiration, which are closely linked and together govern bacterial growth and survival, and those of unknown function, the conserved hypotheticals, are highest among the 4173 MTB H37Rv genes reported, emphasizing the importance of the nutrient metabolic and respiratory pathways (17).

As obligate aerobes, the mycobacteria respire and produce energy from varied nutritional or energy sources, such as carbon sources (18, 19). These enable the bacteria even to maintain metabolism without growth. The nutritional demands of the mycobacteria have been a topic of interest for over

100 years. Pioneering work throughout the 20th century elegantly showed that mycobacteria had

unique nutritional requirements (20-29). Central to these findings was that different members of

the MTBC were supported by different nutritional sources and consistent results of multiple

phenotypic studies led to differentiating members of the MTBC based on their nutritional

requirements (20, 30). For instance, it was observed that MTB showed eugonic growth on glycerol,

while colonies of MAF and *M. bovis* were dysgonic, indicating an inability to properly utilize this

carbon source. MAF and *M. bovis* were only able to show luxurious growth in the presence of sodium

pyruvate (20, 30). Furthermore, MAF was found to grow small umbilicated colonies, which on

paraffin embedded thin sections revealed extension deep into the media, rather than the surface

(31).

Almost all the energy used by the bacteria is derived from the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway

(32). After nutrients are metabolized through this pathway, reducing equivalents are generated that

eventually enter into the Electron Transport Chain for the generation of significant amounts of

Adenosine Triphosphate (ATP) (18, 33).

Mycobacteria generate ATP via substrate level phosphorylation and oxidative phosphorylation,

which produces more ATP through the activity of the F_1-F_0 ATP synthase in the Electron Transport

Chain. Substrate level phosphorylation alone is insufficient to support growth of these bacteria (18).

Genome sequencing analyses show that the mycobacteria possess a branched respiratory pathway

for electron transfer from electron donors to acceptors under different growth conditions.

However, it appears that the transfer of electrons to oxygen, which seems to be the most preferred

terminal electron acceptor, occurs with little plasticity, given that only two terminal oxidases have

been found in mycobacteria, the bioenergetically more efficient *aa3*-type cytochrome c and the less

efficient cytochrome *bd*-type menaquinol oxidases (34). During hypoxia or anoxia, mycobacterial

growth is inhibited, even in the presence of alternate terminal electron acceptors within the

branched respiratory chain such as fumarate and nitrate reductase. However, mycobacteria are still

able to adapt and maintain metabolic functions (34).

Therefore, an intact Central Carbon Metabolic pathway and Electron Transport Chain are essential

to mycobacterial growth and survival.

The importance of comparative genomics in unravelling the basis of distinct metabolic phenotypes

in the MTBC has been shown. Using molecular genomic approaches, previous authors found that

the inability of *M. bovis* to use glycerol and carbohydrates as sole carbon sources and its requirement for pyruvate in growth media was caused by a single nucleotide polymorphism in the *pykA* gene, encoding pyruvate kinase, resulting in a Glu220Asp amino acid substitution and causing the disruption of sugar catabolism (35). This mutation was also found in 3 MAF strains tested in the same analysis. Additionally, the authors showed that a frameshift at codon 191 of the *glpK* gene of the same *M. bovis* strain led to an incomplete coding sequence and the inability to use glycerol, although this *glpK* mutation was not present in all *M. bovis* strains.

Therefore, we aimed to investigate the genes involved in central carbon metabolism and respiration in the MTB and MAF lineages using a whole genome sequencing approach coupled with comparative genomics. We find important differences between the MAF and MTB lineages in their energy and nutrient metabolic pathways that likely contributed to the phenotypic differences observed between these lineages.

2   Materials and Methods

2.1   Ethical Statement

The study was conducted within the framework of an intervention trial of Enhanced Case Finding (ECF) in the Greater Banjul Area of The Gambia (Clinicaltrials.gov NCT01660646), piloted in 2012 and conducted between 2013 and 2017. This study was carried out in accordance with the recommendations of the Joint Gambia Government/MRC Ethics Committee and the Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp Institutional Review Board. The protocol, including bacterial sub-studies, was approved by the Joint Gambia Government/MRC Ethics Committee and the Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp Institutional Review Board. Nigerian isolates were collected from Southwest Nigeria within the West African Node of Excellence for TB, AIDS and Malaria (WANETAM) with the recommendations of the University of Ibadan and University College Hospital, Ibadan Joint Ethical Review Committees and the Nigerian Institute of Medical Research, Institutional Board (36). All subjects gave written informed consent in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki and were anonymized.

2.2   Bacterial isolates

In The Gambia, MTB L4 followed by MAF L6 are the most isolated MTBC lineages. For almost a

decade, the prevalence of all the MTBC lineages isolated in The Gambia has remained constant at

4.3% (L1), 2.5% (L2), 0.8% (L3), 57.2% (L4), 1.0% (L5), and 35.4% (L6) (37).

Within the framework of the ECF study conducted in the Greater Banjul Area, we sequenced 280

MAF L6 (32%), 3 MAF L5 (0.3%), 19 MTB L1 (2.2%), 36 MTB L2 (4%)(Beijing), 10 MTB L3 (1%) and

534 (60.5%) MTB L4 consisting of 85 MTB L4 Cameroon (9.6%), 14 MTB L4 Ghana (1.6%), 224 MTB

L4 Haarlem (25.4%), and 211 MTB L4 LAM (23.9%). Given that only 3 MAF L5 were isolated from

The Gambia within the period of analysis, we included 6 MAF L5 from Nigeria (Eastern West

Africa), to improve the representativeness of this lineage.

Of this dataset, we analyzed the whole genome sequences of all 280 MAF L6 strains, the 3 MAF L5

isolated from The Gambia and the 6 MAF L5 from Nigeria, resulting in a total 289 MAF strains. For

the MTB lineages, we analyzed a total 205 strains consisting of all 19 MTB L1, all 10 MTB L3 and 14

MTB L4 Ghana, 35 MTB L2 and a random number of L4 Haarlem (44), Cameroon (36) and LAM

(46), while ensuring that all MTB L4 sublineages isolated were represented and isolates from each

year of isolation, 2012 to 2014, were included.

2.3   DNA Extraction

Genomic DNA was extracted from loopfuls of pure MTBC colonies grown on Lowenstein-Jensen

media (38) using the Maxwell 16 DNA Purification Kit (Promega). DNA from Nigerian strains was

extracted using the Cetyl trimethylammonium bromide (CTAB) method (39).

2.4   Whole-genome sequencing

Sequencing of MTBC isolates was performed at MicrobesNG, Birmingham; GenoScreen, France;

FISABIO, Valencia or the Beijing Genome Institute (BGI), Beijing. Sequencing reads were generated

on a HiSeq or Miseq platform (IIIumina). Quality control was performed for each provider to ensure

adequate sequencing depth (>30X) and genome coverage (>95% of the H37Rv reference strain).

Raw Illumina reads have been deposited in the ENA with accession <to be undertaken on

acceptance>.

2.5   **Bioinformatics Analysis**

2.5.1   **Mapping and Variant calling**

We used Snippy version 3.1 for the analysis of genomes. Briefly, paired-end raw reads of each

sample were mapped to the *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv reference genome (GenBank accession number:

NC_000962.3) using BWA-MEM 0.7.12 (40). Mapped reads were converted to the SAM/BAM format

and sorted using Samtools 1.3 1 (41). Variant calling was done using Freebayes 0.9.20 (42). Variants

were called only if ≥10 reads covered variant positions and ≥90% of those reads differed from the

reference. Genes were annotated with SnpEff 4.1 (43). Samples were assigned to MTBC lineages

based on the classification of Coll and colleagues (44) using the VCF output of snippy and the

PhyResSE SNP list (45).

2.5.2   **Phylogenetic analysis**

Using the Snippy output folders of all isolates and custom python scripts, a SNP alignment and a

count of all excluded invariant sites were created. A maximum-likelihood (ML) phylogeny was

inferred using RAxML version 8.2.9 (46) executing a thousand rapid bootstrap inferences under the

general time-reversible (GTR) model, with ascertainment bias correction using the Stamatakis

reconstituted DNA approach (47, 48). The resulting tree was exported to interactive Tree of Life

(iTOL) for visualization (49).

2.5.3   **Protein Predictions**

The effect of amino acid substitutions were predicted using PROVEAN software tools at default

settings (PROVEAN protein) (50-52). The PROVEAN NCBI non redundant 2012 database is a newer

and larger sequence database than SIFT databases (53) but comparable to SIFT in prediction

accuracy. A PROVEAN score of ≤ -2.5 implies a potentially deleterious amino acid substitution.

3   **Results and Discussion**

As carbon sources within the niche of the mycobacterium are metabolized through the Central

Carbon Metabolic pathway, reducing equivalents in the form of NAD(P)H and $FADH_2$ are generated

and fed into the Electron Transport Chain, that turns over more moles of ATP for cellular processes

(34) (Figure 1).

Given that generalists and specialists differ in the vastness of their ecological niches, we compared the specialist MAF lineages (289 strains) to the generalist MTB lineages (205 strains) for genomic differences in their Electron Transport and Carbon metabolic pathways. We found a large number of potentially deleterious mutations, particularly in MAF lineages (Figure 2 and Figure 4), however, we also observed that convergent evolution in these pathways occurred between some MTB and MAF lineages.

Understanding the differences in metabolism and respiration between the MTBC lineages is important because in recent years, mycobacterial central metabolism and respiration have re-emerged as potential targets for TB chemotherapy. The discovery and successful clinical development of the new TB drug, Bedaquiline (TMC207) and the drug candidate, Telacebec (Q203), both with novel targets in the respiratory chain, has renewed interest and fueled research in this area. Interestingly, even the repurposed drug Clofazimine, and another new drug, Delamanid, through their mechanisms of action reportedly interfere with redox cycling and cellular respiration by generating Reactive Intermediates (54-58), strongly suggesting that respiratory inhibitors may offer the next generation of core drugs against mycobacterial diseases (59).

The majority of work previously done on the Electron Transport Chain and oxidative phosphorylation in mycobacteria were biochemical studies by Brodie and colleagues (60). However, the use of molecular biology in establishing the genetic basis of enzymatic defects, following the molecular Koch's postulate, revolutionized mycobacteriology. It is now increasingly apparent that genetic and metabolic differences between the MTBC human-adapted lineages have the potential to affect transmission, diagnostics and treatment (5, 61-66). Moreover, niche adaptation is influenced by the metabolic requirements of an organism, a consequence of evolution.

3.1   Mutations in genes encoding Central Carbon Metabolic pathway enzymes.

We examined mutations in all genes in the glycolytic pathway, the Tricarboxylic Acid cycle and the Methylcitrate Cycle. Genes and enzymes in these pathways contribute directly to the growth and virulence of the MTBC, by generating products that feed directly into the Electron Transport Chain (67). Therefore, deleterious mutations in these genes would have obvious consequences downstream, for energy generation, survival and ultimately, the virulence of members of the MTBC.

We found mutations in major genes encoding enzymes in these pathways that together drive central

carbon metabolism. MAF lineages had predicted deleterious mutations in *eno*, *pykA*, *mdh*, *pca* and

icl2a (Figure 2, Figure 6, Table 1 and Supplementary File S1). For MTB lineages, mutations were

detected in *pgi*, *pfkB*, *pca*, *icd2*, *icl2a* and *pckA* (Figure 3, Figure 7, Table 1 and Supplementary File

S2). In MTB, predicted deleterious mutations were mostly found in L3.

3.1.1 The Glycolytic Pathway

In MAF lineages, all genes involved in the reversible reactions from the start of glycolysis leading to

the breakdown of sugars to 2-phosphoglycerate, at the seventh step (Figure 6), were generally

conserved. However, at the critical stage of pyruvate metabolism, deleterious mutations were

detected in Enolase (*eno*), the gene responsible for the penultimate step of glycolysis, where 2-

phosphoglycerate is converted to Phosphoenolpyruvate, in the gene responsible for the irreversible

reaction converting Phosphoenolpyruvate to Pyruvate (*pykA*) and in that responsible for the

conversion of Pyruvate to Oxaloacetate, Pyruvate carboxylase (*pca*). Of these three genes, it had

previously been shown, in *M. bovis* and 3 MAF strains that, the mutation in *pykA* rendered the

critical enzyme pyruvate kinase inactive, resulting in a metabolic block at the level of pyruvate

biosynthesis (35). We also confirm this mutation in the MAF strains we analyzed in our study (Figure

2). However, to the best of our knowledge this is the first report on lineage-specific potentially

deleterious mutations in the essential gene *eno*, in MAF L6. *eno* is found on the surface of many

pathogenic bacteria and beyond its primary role in glycolysis, aids in tissue remodeling and invasion

of host cells (68). This gene was recently reported as a novel target for the 2-aminothiazoles of the

aminothiazole (AT) series, that exerted its effect by inhibiting *eno* in MTB H37Rv (L4 strain) and

interfering with energy metabolism, glucose metabolism, ATP homeostasis and the metabolism of

cell wall precursors. Therefore, the potentially deleterious mutations we detected in *eno* in our

analysis of all MAF L6 may affect energy metabolism and potentially contributes to the metabolic

block at the level of pyruvate biosynthesis, reducing the fitness of this lineage further.

Unlike we found for MAF lineages, MTB lineages, notably, had no deleterious mutations in *eno* and

pykA (Figure 7), implying a general ability to complete glycolysis, however, mutations were detected

in Glucose-6-phosphate isomerase (*pgi*) in L4 LAM and in Phosphofructokinase B (*pfkB*) in MTB L3,

at the second and third steps of glycolysis respectively, where Glucose-6-phosphate is converted to

Fructose-6-phosphate and subsequently to Fructose-1-6-biphosphate (Figure 7). *pgi* is essential for

the *in vitro* growth of *M. tuberculosis*, and *M. smegmatis pgi* mutants are glucose auxotrophs.

Moreover, an additional role for *pgi* in cell wall biosynthesis was reported (38, 69-71). Therefore,

pgi is important and the effect of the deleterious mutations we detected in *pgi* in L4 LAM should be

investigated to determine if L4 LAM shows a distinct growth phenotype, such as slower growth or

altered colony morphology, compared to other lineages/sublineages. However, the defect in *pfkB*

in MTB L3 is unlikely to affect glycolysis given that Phosphofructokinase activity has so far only been

associated with *pfkA*. In *M. tuberculosis*, a *pfkA* deletion mutant was neither able to grow on glucose

in vitro nor to have any detectable Phosphofructokinase activity and the mutant could not be

rescued by expressing *pfkB* (33, 72).

Interestingly, additional genes, Pyruvate carboxylase (*pca*) in MAF L5 and MTB L3 and

Phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase (*pckA*) in MTB L4 Cameroon, were mutated at the level of

pyruvate metabolism (Figure 6 and Figure 7).

The genes*, pca* and *pckA* secrete enzymes contribute significantly to the control of metabolic flux to

glycolysis, gluconeogenesis and anaplerosis. These genes carry out functions related to cholesterol

detoxification and lipogenesis during intracellular survival. Disruption of *pca* and *pckA* lead to severe

in vitro and intracellular growth defects and *pckA* was shown to be essential for virulence in *M. bovis*

(73, 74). Indeed, oxaloacetate, also generated from pyruvate via the activity of Pyruvate carboxylase

(*pca*), feeds into the Methylcitrate cycle (75, 76). Therefore, the mutations we identified in these

key Central Carbon Metabolic genes (Table 1) could disrupt energy metabolism and growth in the

respective lineages they occur in.

3.1.2   The Tricarboxylic Acid Cycle

At the final stage of glycolysis, pyruvate is generated and converted to Acetyl Coenzyme A (Figure

1, Figure 6 and Figure 7), that is fed into the critical Tricarboxylic Acid Cycle (TCA), for the release of

reducing equivalents into the Electron Transport Chain. Therefore, the ability to complete this cycle,

whether by progression through all stages of the cycle or via the crucial glyoxylate by-pass, is

essential for the generation of ATP.

Overall, genes encoding enzymes of the TCA cycle were largely conserved in MAF and MTB lineages,

however, in MTB L1-L3, L4 Haarlem, L4 Ghana and MAF lineages, we found potentially deleterious

mutations in Isocitrate lyase (*icl2a*) and Isocitrate dehydrogenase (*icd2*).

The genes encoding isocitrate dehydrogenase are reportedly non-essential for growth, based on

transposon mutagenesis experiments. This may be because *M. tuberculosis* is able to use the

glyoxylate shunt, mediated by Isocitrate lyase, encoded by ICD1 (*icl*) and ICD2 (*aceAa/aceAb*), as a

shortcut to divert isocitrate, without going through additional steps in the TCA cycle (33, 69, 70).

Therefore, the deleterious mutations we found in *icd2* of MTB L3 may have no direct impact on

growth. However, further *in vitro* experiments should confirm this.

Emphasizing the importance of the glyoxylate shunt, *M. tuberculosis* strains lacking both ICDs are

unable to grow on fatty acids *in vitro*, establish and maintain a chronic infection in mice and were

said to be the most severely attenuated strains (33, 77). It is not certain whether the frameshift

mutation previously found in H37Rv, an L4 strain (78), which we, for the first time to the best of our

knowledge, also report in MTB L4 Haarlem and Ghana, MTB L1, L2, L3, MAF L5 and L6 (Table 1), will

affect growth in these lineages, however, it is reported that the activity of ICD2 is lower than that

of ICD1, and ICD2 does not play a significant role in the glyoxylate pathway (79). Yet, interestingly,

we did not detect this frameshift in MTB L4 Cameroon and LAM (Figure 4).

As stated earlier, in section 3.1.1, Pyruvate carboxylase (*pca*), that converts pyruvate to

oxaloacetate towards the final stage of glycolysis, was mutated in L5, however, at the last step of

the TCA cycle, malate dehydrogenase (*mdh*) that converts malate to oxaloacetate, was also mutated

(Figure 6 and Table 1), implying that both routes for the production of oxaloacetate in MAF L5 have

mutated genes. Given that oxaloacetate feeds not only into the TCA cycle but also into the

methylcitrate cycle, impaired function of *mdh* may affect energy metabolism in MAF L5.

3.1.3   Additional Mutations in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway

We detected other mutations in genes of the Central Carbon Metabolic pathway that could

potentially impact on enzyme function during metabolism even though their PROVEAN scores were

slightly above the cutoff score for classifying mutations as potentially deleterious (Supplementary

File S5). We found these mutations in *fba*, again in *mdh* and *icd2*, in *korB*, *aceE* and *glpK* in MAF

lineages, in *pfkA* in L4 Cameroon and in *pckA* in L4 LAM and MAF L5.

Having discussed the role of *pfkA*, *mdh*, *pckA* and *icd2* in sections 3.1.1 and 3.1.2, we now discuss

the role of *korB* in the TCA cycle and of *fba*, *glpK* and *aceE*, in the glycolytic pathway.

The Ketoglutarate ferredoxin oxidoreductase (*korAB*), mediating the conversion of α-ketoglutarate

to succinate, has its mutants showing reduced or no growth at all (33). Defects in *korB* in MAF

lineages may produce a similar effect. Fructose biphosphate aldolase (*fba*) that functions at the

fourth stage of the glycolytic pathway is a known essential gene for *in vitro* growth. Therefore, a

defective gene could also affect the glycolytic process in MAF lineages.

In MTB H37Rv, defects in the essential gene *aceE*, encoding Pyruvate decarboxylase E1 Component, required for the generation of Acetyl Coenzyme A that is indispensable for initiation of the TCA cycle- at the last stage of glycolysis, produced a slow growth mutant (70). In an analysis comparing MTB H37Ra and H37Rv, *aceE* was expressed at high levels in virulent H37Rv throughout the course of infection (80). Due to defects in *aceE*, an earlier report described this gene as a potential cause of MAF growth attenuation (14). Therefore, the mutation we detected in our analysis is potentially linked to MAF growth attenuation.

During glycolysis, glycerol metabolism is also important and Glycerol kinase (*glpK*) mediates the metabolism of glycerol as it enters into the glycolytic pathway (35). According to an earlier study, *glpK* is a pseudogene in GM041182, the MAF L6 reference strain. Moreover, in 3 other MAF strains tested in that study, *glpK* was non-synonymously mutated (14). In our analysis, all 289 MAF strains we report on, had a non-synonymously mutated *glpK*, confirming results of previous studies. Recently, mutations in *glpK* have been associated with drug tolerance (81), making our findings critical. Notably, another recent study reported slower response to TB first-line treatment and slower sputum smear conversion for *M. africanum* L6 infected patients (82). It will be interestingly to determine if the *glpK* mutations we detected in MAF lineages in our study promote drug tolerance.

To summarize our findings on Central Carbon Metabolism, we observe that for MAF lineages, deleterious mutations largely accrue at critical stages of energy metabolism: 1. At the final stage of glycolysis, the level of pyruvate metabolism and the conversion of pyruvate to Acetyl CoA, indispensable for initiation of the TCA cycle, and 2. At the end of the TCA cycle where intermediates feed into the Methylcitrate cycle.

Overall, with major blocks in Central Carbon Metabolism in MAF lineages, the number of reducing equivalents produced via the central carbon metabolic pathway for electron transport may be lower.

MTB lineages largely had a conserved glycolytic pathway and TCA cycle, however, different MTB lineages have previously been shown to have different growth rates and patterns (83-85). Notably, the growth rate of MTB L3 is reportedly lower compared to other MTB lineages (83, 84). Therefore, in MTB lineages/sublineages where we found more potentially deleterious mutations, particularly in MTB L3, further investigations on the effect of these mutations on energy metabolism need to be

348 carried out, because, slower growth of these lineages may be directly linked to impaired energy
349 metabolism (83, 84).

3.2   Mutations in genes encoding Electron Transport Chain enzymes

As reducing equivalents, like NADH, from the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway deliver electrons
into the Electron Transport Chain, NADH dehydrogenases serve as the gateway of the Electron
Transport Chain in the MTBC and electrons are transferred from NADH oxidation to quinone
reduction and ultimately to ATP synthase for ATP production in greater quantities (Figure 1).
Therefore, defects in the Electron Transport Chain are bound to affect the net yield of ATP
generated.

Relative to MTB lineages, MAF lineages had multiple predicted deleterious mutations in genes
encoding key enzymes of the Electron Transport Chain (Figure 4 and Figure 8). Potentially
deleterious mutations were detected in *ndhA*, *pruB*, *qcrC*, *ctaB*, *frdA*, *atpHG*, *sdhA* and *ald* (Figure 4,
Table 2 and Supplementary File S3). Interestingly, for some MTB lineages, predicted deleterious
mutations were also found in *ndhA*, *Rv0249c*, *frdB*, *atpD*, and *nuoDHF* (Figure 5, Table 2 and
Supplementary File S4).

To receive NADH from central metabolism into the Electron Transport Chain, *M. tuberculosis*
possesses two NADH dehydrogenases, NDH-1 and -2. NDH-1 has 14 subunits (*nuo*A-N) while two
copies of NDH-2 exist in *M. tuberculosis*, *ndh* and *ndhA*. Between the two NADH dehydrogenases,
an essential role of *ndh* for the growth of *M. tuberculosis* was shown and a function of *ndh* in
recycling NADH and maintaining an energized membrane was reported (34, 86). Even though *ndhA*
is dispensable for growth, it was recently shown that both *ndh* and *ndhA* differentially control
oxygen consumption (86, 87). We found a potentially deleterious mutation in *ndhA* of all MAF L5.
Given the adaptation of MAF lineages towards a microaerophilic lifestyle, *ndhA* may be redundant
in MAF L5 and defects in this gene may have coincided with the adaptation to a microaerophilic
lifestyle.

For all genomes in our analysis, though, no potentially deleterious mutations were detected in the
essential *ndh*. Of note, *M. leprae* has deleted the entire *nuo* operon (NDH-1) and maintained only
ndh in its reduced genome, emphasizing the significance of this gene for survival of the
mycobacteria (88). Missense mutations found in *ndh* in a clade of Lineage 6, were not predicted to

be deleterious for function of the enzyme (Table 2). This implies that the function of *ndh* is likely

conserved across the MTBC lineages. Clofazimine, the anti-leprosy drug (prodrug), repurposed for

the treatment of TB, is activated to exert its killing effect through its reduction by the essential NDH-

2, leading to the release of Reactive Oxygen Species (ROS) following reoxidation by oxygen (55, 86).

At the second stage of electron transport, electrons are transferred from NADH dehydrogenase

(*nuoA-N*, NDH-1) to the essential complex, Succinate dehydrogenase 1 (*Rv0247c-Rv0249c*, SDH-1)

during aerobic respiration when oxygen and nutrients are abundant or from NDH-2 (*ndh/ndhA*) to

SDH-2 (*sdhABCD*) during hypoxia/anaerobiosis and when nutrients are limited (34, 87, 89) (Figure 8

and Figure 9). Succinate dehydrogenases are a direct link between the TCA cycle and electron

transport and typically reduce succinate to fumarate (90).

The only potentially deleterious mutations we detected in the Succinate dehydrogenases were in

sdhA of SDH2 in a clade of MAF L6 and in SDH1, *Rv0249c*, in a clade of MTB L1 (Figure 5 and Figure

9). Given the essential role of SDH1 for growth and survival, where the deletion of SDH1 was shown

to impair the rate of respiration through the Electron Transport Chain and to reduce cell viability

(87), future studies should determine if electron transport and aerobic respiration are affected in

certain MTB L1 strains, as recent studies report slower growth and a lower odds to grow in culture

for MTB L1 and the MAF lineages (65, 83).

Electrons from Succinate dehydrogenases, move into the quinone pool, ready for transfer to the

third and fourth complexes Cytochrome bc1-aa3 (*qcrABC* and *ctaBCDE*), during aerobic respiration,

when oxygen is abundant, and to the less efficient cytochrome bd oxidase (*cydABCD*) when oxygen

is limited (Figure 8 and Figure 9).

The bc1-aa3 complexes are the major respiratory route in mycobacteria under standard aerobic

conditions and are essential for growth where they play a key role in oxidative phosphorylation and

electron transport that yields more ATP (34, 91), yet in our analysis, we detected potentially

deleterious mutations in *qcrC* and *ctaB* of the bc1-aa3 complexes in MAF lineages and intact gene

complexes in MTB lineages (Figure 4 and Figure 5). To the best of our knowledge, this is the first

work demonstrating that the critical bc1-aa3 complex is mutated in MAF lineages. We submit that

this finding is crucial to understanding the difference in energy metabolism, particularly oxidative

phosphorylation, between the MTB and MAF lineages, especially because MAF lineages

preferentially grow microaerobically (15, 92-95) and significantly underexpress the dormancy

regulon required for adaptation to oxygen limitation (15). Notably, the Imidazopyridine amide in

Phase 2 clinical trials, Telacebec (Q203), inhibits *qcrB* of Cytochrome bc1, further emphasizing the

importance of this complex for the survival of MTB. Therefore, the predicted deleterious mutations

we found in *qcrC*, the heme of the cytochrome bc1-complex, in MAF L6 (Figure 4 and Figure 8) likely

impairs aerobic respiration and growth in this lineage severely, given that *qcrC*, like *qcrB*, is essential

for survival (89).

M. smegmatis strains that had mutations in the bc1-aa3 complex were significantly growth

impaired, confirming the essentiality of the bc1-aa3 respiratory pathway for mycobacterial growth.

Taken together, our analysis provides further support for the view that MAF is adapted to a distinct

niche, less dependent on aerobic respiration and more adapted to a microaerobic lifestyle (15).

Furthermore, mutations in bc1-aa3 complex genes likely contribute to the slow growth phenotype

of the MAF lineages. Reasons for this potential niche adaptation and the benefit to the pathogen in

its interaction with its host should be investigated further.

As electrons are transferred through the various complexes, protons are pumped outside the

membrane, generating the proton motive force that produces a membrane potential, keeps the

membrane energized and drives the ATP Synthase pump to produce ATP from ADP and Pi, at the

final stage of oxidative phosphorylation.

Ultimately, with an impaired bc1-aa3 complex, the function of ATP synthase, the terminal electron

acceptor during aerobic respiration, will be impaired, resulting in reduced ATP yield overall. This is

likely the case in MAF lineages. Moreover, should MAF lineages engage the less efficient cytochrome

bd oxidase, net ATP yield will still be reduced. Therefore, we postulate that ATP yield through

oxidative phosphorylation in the MAF lineages is lower compared to the MTB lineages.

The F_1-F_0 ATP synthase itself, the target for Bedaquiline (96), is rather conserved in the different

lineages. However, in MAF L5 and MTB L2 we detected potentially deleterious mutations in *atp*

genes (Table 2). The F_1-F_0 ATP synthase operon is encoded by *atpIBEFHAGDC* and is required for

survival as all genes in the operon are essential (69, 97). A defective ATP synthase may coincide with

the microaerophilic lifestyle of MAF. However, for MTB L2, it is not clear what the advantage is for

acquiring mutations in genes encoding ATP synthase. Interestingly though, compared to MTB L4,

MTB L2 was found to have a lower growth rate (83).

The branched respiratory chain of *the* MTBC permits anaerobic survival. During hypoxic or anaerobic

conditions when oxygen is limited, Fumarate reductase (FRD, *frdABCD*) and Nitrate reductase (NR,

narGHJI) can serve as terminal electron acceptors to maintain the membrane potential. Therefore, these enzymes are critical. Moreover, further studies of *sdh* suggested that FRD could partially compensate for a lack of SDH activity (98). Defects in any of the subunits of *frd* could limit the overall function of the FRD complex. Notably, the attenuated strain H37Ra grown under low-oxygen conditions showed a lag in gene expression of *frdA* and *frdB* (80). The mutations we found in *frdA* and *frdB* in MAF L5 may be related to the adaptation of this lineage to a hypoxic or microaerophilic lifestyle. Therefore, the effect of mutations on gene function in MAF L5 and MTB L4 sublineage, Haarlem, should be determined experimentally.

Other key dehydrogenases that contribute to redox balance of NADH for initiation of electron transport were also mutated in the MAF lineages (Figure 4 and Figure 8), indicating potential redox imbalance in MAF lineages with the likelihood to impede electron transport. From our analysis, all MAF lineages had potentially deleterious mutations in Alanine dehydrogenase (*ald*) and all MAF L5 had potentially deleterious mutations in Proline dehydrogenase (*pruB*). Proline dehydrogenase is associated with the adaptation to hypoxia, slow growth rate and is essential for growth (69, 97, 99, 100). Alanine dehydrogenase has been shown to play a role in redox balance during low oxygen conditions and the downshift of *M. tuberculosis* to the state of nonreplicating persistence (NRP). *ald* mutants had altered NADH/NAD ratios and significant delays in growth resumption after reaeration. Additionally, induction of *ald* rescued the bc1-aa3 complex mutant while its disruption made the growth defect of the mutant worse (100, 101). Some suggestions have been made to administer a combination of *ald* inhibitors, Telacebec and Bedaquiline although the synergy between drugs in such a combination is yet to be shown (102).

Given that *ald* and the bc1-aa3 complex were mutated in all MAF in our analysis, MAF lineages are most probably natural mutants of *ald* and the bc1-aa3 complex. It is possible that these mutations in the MAF lineages contribute significantly to their slower growth compared to MTB due to impaired energy production. Moreover, these polymorphisms further support the adaptation of MAF to a hypoxic niche.

3.2.1 Additional Mutations in the Electron Transport Chain

Like we did for the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway, we report on other mutated genes, *cydB* and *narG*, in the Electron Transport that are noteworthy, given their significance in respiration and the fact that their provean scores were only slightly above the cut off score indicating potentially deleterious mutations (Supplementary File S5).

cydB was mutated in all L6 and *narG* in all L5 (Figure 4). Interestingly, both are critical components

of the mycobacterial Electron Transport Chain, specifically the anaerobic respiratory chain (34).

narGHJI allows nitrate respiration during oxygen limitation and *narG* is an important part of this

operon. A *narG* mutant of *M. bovis* BCG was unable to reduce nitrate under anaerobic conditions.

Moreover, SCID mice infected with the *narG* mutant showed no signs of clinical disease even after

> 200 days relative to wild type MTB infected mice that showed signs after 50 days and succumbed

after 80 days, implying that *narG* mutants are less virulent (103).

cydAB encodes cytochrome-bd menaquinol oxidase, which functions under microaerophilic

conditions and supports aerobic growth during inhibition of the cytochrome bc1 complex (34, 104,

105), also mutated in MAF based on our findings. Notably, the respiratory inhibitor, Q203, which

targets the primary terminal oxidase, cytochrome bc1-aa3, is bacteriostatic in *M. tuberculosis*

because *M. tuberculosis* has the alternate cytochrome bd-type terminal oxidase that, to an extent,

serves as a rescue when the bc1-aa3 complex is defective. In contrast, *M. ulcerans* strains from

Africa and Australia lack cytochrome bd and rely solely on the bc1-aa3 complex during respiration.

Therefore, Q203 was found to be bactericidal against *M. ulcerans* (106). It is very possible that MAF

L6 will be comparatively more susceptible to Q203 than MTB, given that the cytochrome bd rescue

is also mutated in MAF L6. Indeed, MAF lineages may be generally more susceptible to respiratory

inhibitors.

3.3   The case of convergence in electron transport and central metabolism pathways

For multiple genes in the Electron Transport Chain and the Central Carbon Metabolic pathway, we

observed convergent evolution within the MTBC. In some cases, the same mutation was shared

between lineages in the same gene and in other cases different mutations occurred. These

mutations may confer a selective advantage and/or contribute to adaptation. In the Central Carbon

Metabolic Pathway, we found a high level of convergence (Table 1).

In the glycolytic pathway, we detected the same mutations in *ppgk* at the first stage of glycolysis

where glucose is converted to Glucose-6-phosphate, in all MTB and MAF lineages (Table 1). In MTB

L1, L2, L3, MAF L5 and L6, we found the same mutation in the essential gene, *eno* and in *prpD* that

functions in the Methylcitrate cycle. In *glpK*, encoding glycerol kinase for glycerol metabolism, the

same mutation was detected in MTB L1 and in all MAF lineages. Additionally, convergence was

detected in *pca* in the glycolytic cycle and *korB* in the Tricarboxylic Acid Cycle, in MTB L3 and MAF

L5, although different, and in MTB L3 and MAF L6 in *icd2*. Convergence also occurred in MTB L4

Cameroon, a clade of L4 LAM and MAF L5 in *pckA*.

Notably, the same frameshift was seen in *icl2a* in MTB L1, L2, L3, L4 Haarlem and Ghana and in MAF

L5 and L6 (Table 1). However, MTB Cameroon and LAM may have evolved to retain an intact copy

of *icl2a*, because no frameshift was detected in these lineages.

Only those mutations detected in *pca* in MTB L3 and MAF L5 and those detected in *icl2a* were

predicted to be deleterious.

In the Electron Transport Chain, the same mutations were found in *gpdA2*, *frdC* and *nuoG* in all MTB

and MAF lineages and in *nuoI* in MTB L3 and all MAF lineages. In MTB L1, MTB L3 and MAF L5, we

found mutations in *ndhA* and in MTB L4 LAM and a clade of MAF L6, in *sdhA*. In all lineages, we

detected the same mutation in *sdhD*.

Of these mutations, only those found in *ndhA* were predicted to be deleterious.

Overall, more convergence occurred between MTB L1, MTB L3 and the MAF lineages. This is

interesting as the MAF lineages, MTB L1 and L3 lineages all reportedly grow relatively slower than

the MTB L2 and L4 lineages (14, 65, 83, 84, 107). We postulate that the slower growth rate of these

lineages and the convergence we observe in their metabolic pathways, may be linked to their similar

migration and dispersal patterns in Africa and Eurasia (108), where L2 and L4 have become widely

dispersed, while L5, L6, and L7, had more geographically restricted expansion, adapting to more

specific hosts. This may have influenced niche adaptation, where L2 and L4, in line with increased

dispersion and range expansion, also increased their replicative/growth capacity and ability to

transmit, while the more host restricted lineages maintained a lower replicative/growth potential

in line with expansion in situ.

3.4   Limitations

Limitations of our analysis include the small sample size of MAF L5 analyzed. In the Gambia and

other countries in Western West Africa, the prevalence of L5 is significantly lower than L6 and is less

likely to be isolated compared to L6. Over an 8-year period, the prevalence of MTBC lineages isolated

in The Gambia remained constant at 1.0% for MAF L5 and 35.4% for MAF L6 (37). In our isolation of

the 289 MAF strains included in this study, only 3 from The Gambia were MAF L5. However, to

ensure that the mutations we detected in L5 from The Gambia were more representative of the

MAF L5 lineage, we included L5 from Nigeria (Eastern West Africa), where the prevalence of L5 is

high and L6 is significantly less likely to be isolated (109). Another limitation is that we did not

experimentally confirm any of our in silico phenotype predictions.

4 Conclusion

In this comparative analysis, we describe genomic differences between the MTB and MAF lineages

in genes encoding enzymes of the Electron Transport Chain and the Central Carbon Metabolic

pathway, which may explain the differences in the clinical- and *in vitro* phenotype described for the

MAF and MTB lineages. Generally, it appears from our analysis that compared to MTB lineages, MAF

lineages had the most mutated Central Carbon Metabolic and Electron Transport Pathways, with

mutations occurring in critical components of each pathway. The combined effect of a defective

Carbon Metabolic Pathway and Electron Transport Chain in MAF lineages, likely contributes to the

reduced fitness of the MAF lineages. We speculate that our findings may contribute to 1 - slower

growth of MAF lineages, 2 - relative attenuation of the MAF L6 lineage compared to MTB lineages

and 3 - host specificity to West Africans. Further validation experiments are needed to test these

hypotheses. We also suggest that future studies should investigate the Electron Transport Chain and

Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway of the different MTB lineages beyond MTB L4 and H37Rv to

determine if the different growth patterns observed for MTB lineages are directly linked to defects

in energy generating pathways.

It is intriguing that in the different MTBC lineages multiple deleterious mutations occurred in the

same gene. This convergence largely found in MTB lineages 1, 2, 3 and the MAF lineages, indicates

there may be a selective advantage for this. Interestingly, these lineages, compared to MTB L4

strains, have been associated with slower growth and cytokine induction patterns suggestive of

immune evasion (8, 14, 65, 83-85, 107, 110, 111).

If the potentially deleterious mutations we report on in this analysis affect energy metabolism in

the different MTBC lineages, fitness will differ and ultimately the infection and transmission

potential of these lineages. Therefore, our findings are not only relevant for TB product

development but also for transmission studies and interventions. The literature already provides

credence to and evidence for our hypothesis (9, 85, 112, 113).

4.1 Future Proposed Investigations

4.1.1 Functional Studies

Significant genomic differences between MTB and MAF lineages presented in this analysis warrant

further studies in order to properly characterize the regulatory network of MAF. Recently, the

regulatory network of H37Rv (MTB L4) was characterized yet what pertains to MAF lineages is not

clearly defined, even though it has been shown that master regulators like *PhoPR* and *Rv0081* as

well as the DosR regulon are underexpressed and/or mutated in MAF (15, 114-116). A single

mutation in PhoP, which abrogates ESX1 secretion, explains the complete loss of virulence of H37Ra.

Moreover, the PhoPR regulatory system has also been associated with the regulation of

components of the respiratory pathway (*ald* and *nuo*) and the glyoxylate pathway (ICL) (116).

Interestingly, *ald* and *icl2a* were also mutated in MAF in our analysis. It is possible that the PhoPR

system controls other components of the respiratory and central metabolic pathway. However, this

is yet to be shown. We present the H37Rv regulatory network showing differentially regulated and

or mutated genes in MAF L5 and L6 compared to MTB H37Rv (15, 117), and include the mutations

we detected in MAF lineages in the present study (Figure 6, Figure 8 and Figure 10). We suspect that

the potentially deleterious mutations we report on will produce growth phenotypes (Table 3).

Therefore, we propose functional genomic assays involving insertion/deletion mutagenesis

followed subsequently by *in vitro* and *in vivo* characterization of mutants to confirm the contribution

each gene makes to the growth and survival of MAF under defined conditions. Such studies on the

MAF lineages are limited, but not for MTB, particularly the generalist MTB L4. Recent studies provide

data describing functional consequences of synonymous SNPs (118-120), i.e. caution needs to be

taken in inferring the relative significance or impact of observed genomic mutations from

sequencing data alone. Therefore, further studies to correlate genotype with phenotype are

necessary and our findings serve as a prelude to such experimental studies.

4.1.2 Investigate Bioenergetics in MAF lineages

It is highly plausible that adaptation of MAF lineages to growth under low oxygen (microaerobic)

conditions could be a strategy to escape the harmful effects of ROS generated as electrons leak

from a defective respiratory chain and react with built up oxygen (121). Moreover, reduced

aerobic respiration or oxygen consumption in the MAF lineages could potentially affect the

sensitivity of rapid diagnostics like the automated MGIT 960 system, that depends on oxygen

consumption to detect growth (122). Interestingly, the percentage of MAF in certain parts of West

and Central Africa was reported to have suddenly and sharply declined over the last decade (4,

123-126), yet, in evolutionary terms, such a scenario would be unrealistic and could possibly be

due to the introduction and use of new diagnostics like the MGIT 960 system. Of note, we recently

detected, in a retrospective analysis based on genotyping, that 84% of strains that did not grow in

the MGIT 960 system were MAF L6 (Ofori-Anyinam *et al.*, unpublished). Since growth and survival,

driven by nutrient and energy metabolism, sustain pathogen transmission, and given that the

success of drugs and phenotypic diagnostics rely on metabolic properties of the bacteria,

understanding metabolism in these bacteria is essential. As far as we know, energy metabolism,

including oxidative phosphorylation in MAF has not been investigated and the efficiency of the

Electron Transport Chain and the effectiveness of electron transport in the MAF lineages has not

been established yet, even though it is known that MAF lineages grow significantly slower than

MTB (14) and preferentially grow microaerobically (15). We hypothesize that MAF lineages

generate less ATP and are more exposed to ROS than MTB lineages (Table 3). Therefore, we

propose studies to investigate energy metabolism in MAF lineages relative to the MTB lineages,

including whether MAF lineages are more exposed to ROS during growth.

4.1.3   Host Genetics

One common feature of host specificity is genomic decay. Genomes of specialists usually show signs

of genome decay evidenced by gene deletions or gene inactivation via point mutations. A driving

force for the accumulation of mutations in some key electron transport and carbon metabolism

genes in the specialist/host-restricted MAF lineages could indicate adaptation of the MAF lineages

to a specific host, West Africans, or a niche within the host, due to altered or loss of function of

these genes. This potential niche adaptation could be driven by a precise feature of the host

environment that favors the association between MAF lineages and West Africans such as has been

described for some diseases (127). Some findings have been made, including MAF lineage-specific

mutations in genes and pseudogenes involved in vitamin B12 and vitamin B3 metabolism, important

cofactor biosynthetic pathways for many cellular functions. Unlike MAF though, MTB is fully capable

of synthesizing vitamin B12. Therefore, it has been suggested that the mutations in the vitamin B12

pathway of the MAF lineages may affect their host range to West Africans. According to a study in

the United States, black persons, reportedly have higher levels of vitamin B12 relative to other

ethnicities (8, 10, 128-130). Future studies should investigate the molecular mechanisms underlying

host specificity. MAF lineages appear to provide a snapshot of the features that have contributed to

the virulence of the MTBC.

5   Supplementary Information

Supplementary File S1

Supplementary File S2

Supplementary File S3

Supplementary File S4

Supplementary File S5

6   Author Contributions

BO, FG, BdJ and CM designed the study. BO, FG, AR, TJ, BS and CM undertook analyses. BO, BdJ, FG

and CM wrote the manuscript. All authors contributed discussion and reviewed the final manuscript.

7   Competing financial interests

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

8   Funding

This work was supported by the European Research Council-INTERRUPTB starting grant nr.311725

(to BdJ, FG, CM, LR, BO, MA) and The UK Medical Research Council and the European & Developing

Countries Clinical Trials Partnership (EDCTP) Grant No. CB. 2007. 41700.007.

9   Acknowledgments

The authors thank all study participants and colleagues for their contribution to the present analysis.

References

1.   Brosch R, Gordon SV, Marmiesse M, Brodin P, Buchrieser C, Eiglmeier K, et al. A new

evolutionary scenario for the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex. Proceedings of the national

academy of Sciences. 2002;99(6):3684-9.

2.   Comas I, Coscolla M, Luo T, Borrell S, Holt KE, Kato-Maeda M, et al. Out-of-Africa migration

and Neolithic coexpansion of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* with modern humans. Nature genetics.

2013;45(10):1176-82.

3.   Gagneux S, DeRiemer K, Van T, Kato-Maeda M, de Jong BC, Narayanan S, et al. Variable

host-pathogen compatibility in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Proceedings of the National Academy

of Sciences of the United States of America. 2006;103(8):2869-73.

4.   Michel KG, Guislaine R, Serge PD, Sanou A, Antoinette K, Adama O, et al. Spoligotyping of

Mycobacterium africanum, Burkina Faso. Emerging Infectious Disease journal.

2012;18(1):117.

5.   Coscolla M, Gagneux S. Consequences of genomic diversity in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*.

Semin Immunol. 2014;26.

6.   Bentley SD, Comas I, Bryant JM, Walker D, Smith NH, Harris SR. The Genome of

Mycobacterium Africanum West African 2 Reveals a Lineage-Specific Locus and Genome Erosion

Common to the M. tuberculosis Complex. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2012;6.

7.   Mostowy S, Onipede A, Gagneux S, Niemann S, Kremer K, Desmond EP, et al. Genomic

analysis distinguishes *Mycobacterium africanum*. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2004;42(8):3594-

9.

8.   Winglee K, Manson McGuire A, Maiga M, Abeel T, Shea T, Desjardins CA, et al. Whole

Genome Sequencing of *Mycobacterium africanum* Strains from Mali Provides Insights into the

Mechanisms of Geographic Restriction. PLoS neglected tropical diseases. 2016;10(1):e0004332.

9.   Asare P, Asante-Poku A, Prah DA, Borrell S, Osei-Wusu S, Otchere ID, et al. Reduced

transmission of *Mycobacterium africanum* compared to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in urban

West Africa. International Journal of Infectious Diseases. 2018;73:30-42.

10.   Sharma A, Bloss E, Heilig CM, Click ES. Tuberculosis Caused by *Mycobacterium africanum*,

United States, 2004-2013. Emerging infectious diseases. 2016;22(3):396-403.

11.   De Jong BC, Hill PC, Aiken A, Awine T, Antonio M, Adetifa IM. Progression to Active

Tuberculosis, but Not Transmission, Varies by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Lineage in The Gambia.

J Infect Dis. 2008;198.

12.   de Jong BC, Hill PC, Brookes RH, Otu JK, Peterson KL, Small PM, et al. *Mycobacterium*

africanum: a new opportunistic pathogen in HIV infection? Aids. 2005;19(15):1714-5.

13.   de Jong BC, Adetifa I, Walther B, Hill PC, Antonio M, Ota M, et al. Differences between

tuberculosis cases infected with *Mycobacterium africanum*, West African type 2, relative to Euro-

American Mycobacterium tuberculosis: an update. FEMS immunology and medical microbiology.

2010;58(1):102-5.

14.   Gehre F, Otu J, DeRiemer K, de Sessions PF, Hibberd ML, Mulders W, et al. Deciphering the

growth behaviour of *Mycobacterium africanum*. PLoS neglected tropical diseases.

2013;7(5):e2220.

15.   Ofori-Anyinam B, Dolganov G, Van T, Davis JL, Walter ND, Garcia BJ, et al. Significant under

expression of the DosR regulon in *M. tuberculosis* complex lineage 6 in sputum. Tuberculosis.

2017;104:58-64.

16.   Leistikow RL, Morton RA, Bartek IL, Frimpong I, Wagner K, Voskuil MI. The *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis DosR regulon assists in metabolic homeostasis and enables rapid recovery from

nonrespiring dormancy. Journal of bacteriology. 2010;192(6):1662-70.

17.   Lew JM, Kapopoulou A, Jones LM, Cole ST. TubercuList--10 years after. Tuberculosis

(Edinburgh, Scotland). 2011;91(1):1-7.

18.   Cook GM, Berney M, Gebhard S, Heinemann M, Cox RA, Danilchanka O, et al. Physiology of

mycobacteria. Advances in microbial physiology. 2009;55:81-319.

19.   Warner DF. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* metabolism. Cold Spring Harbor perspectives in

medicine.5(4):a021121.

20.   David HL, Jahan MT, Jumin A, Grandry J, Lehman EH. Numerical taxonomy analysis of

Mycobacterium africanum. Int J Syst Bacteriol. 1978;28.

21.   Dubos RJ. The effect of lipids and serum albumin on bacterial growth. The Journal of

experimental medicine. 1947;85(1):9.

22.   Edson N. The intermediary metabolism of the mycobacteria. Bacteriological reviews.

1951;15(3):147.

23.   Goldman DS. ENZYME SYSTEMS IN THE MYCOBACTERIA XV. Initial Steps in the Metabolism

of Glycerol. Journal of bacteriology. 1963;86(1):30-7.

24.   Hunter G. The oxidation of glycerol by mycobacteria. Biochemical Journal. 1953;55(2):320.

25.   Merrill MH. Studies on Carbon Metabolism of Organisms of the Genus Mycobacterium: II.

Utilization of Organic Compounds in a Synthetic Medium. Journal of bacteriology. 1931;21(5):361.

26.   Pattyn SR, Portaels F, Spanoghe L, Magos J. Further studies on African strains of

Mycobacterium tuberculosis: comparison with *M. bovis* and *M.microti*. Annales des Societes belges

de medecine tropicale, de parasitologie, et de mycologie. 1970;50.

27.   Tepper BS. Differences in the utilization of glycerol and glucose by *Mycobacterium phlei*.

Journal of bacteriology. 1968;95(5):1713-7.

28.   Youmans AS, Youmans GP. STUDIES ON THE METABOLISM OF MYCOBACTERIUM

TUBERCULOSIS IV.: The Effect of Fatty Acids on the Growth of M. tuberculosis var. hominis1.

Journal of bacteriology. 1954;67(6):731.

29.   Youmans GP, Youmans AS. STUDIES ON THE METABOLISM OF MYCOBACTERIUM

TUBERCULOSIS I.: The Effect of Carbohydrates and Alcohols on the Growth of *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis var. hominis1. Journal of bacteriology. 1953;65(1):92.

30.   Pattyn SR, Portaels F, Spanoghe L, Magos J. Further studies on African strains of

Mycobacterium tuberculosis: comparison with M. bovis and M. microti. Annales des Societes

belges de medecine tropicale, de parasitologie, et de mycologie. 1970;50(2):211-27.

31.   de Medeiros D, Castets M, Diop S. [Comparative morphological aspects of *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis, classical type, and *Mycobacterium africanus* (preliminary note)]. Bulletin de la Societe

medicale d'Afrique noire de langue francaise. 1973;18(4):477-84.

32.   BCCM Belgian Coordinated Collections of Microorganisms. 2017 [cited 2017 12 May].

Available from: http://bccm.belspo.be

33.   Baughn AD, Rhee KY. Metabolomics of Central Carbon Metabolism in *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis. Microbiology spectrum. 2014;2(3).

34.   Cook GM, Hards K, Vilcheze C, Hartman T, Berney M. Energetics of Respiration and

Oxidative Phosphorylation in Mycobacteria. Microbiology spectrum. 2014;2(3).

35.   Keating LA, Wheeler PR, Mansoor H, Inwald JK. The pyruvate requirement of some

members of the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex is due to an inactive pyruvate kinase:

implications for in vivo growth. Mol Microbiol. 2005;56.

36.   Gehre F, Otu J, Kendall L, Forson A, Kwara A, Kudzawu S, et al. The emerging threat of pre-

extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis in West Africa: preparing for large-scale tuberculosis

research and drug resistance surveillance. BMC Medicine. 2016;14(1):160.

37.   Gehre F, Kumar S, Kendall L, Ejo M, Secka O, Ofori-Anyinam B, et al. A Mycobacterial

Perspective on Tuberculosis in West Africa: Significant Geographical Variation of M. africanum and

Other *M. tuberculosis* Complex Lineages. PLoS neglected tropical diseases. 2016;10(3):e0004408.

38.   Singhal N, Sharma P, Kumar M, Joshi B, Bisht D. Analysis of intracellular expressed proteins

of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* clinical isolates. Proteome Science. 2012;10(1):14.

39.   Hosek J, Svastova P, Moravkova M, Pavlik I, Bartos M. Methods of mycobacterial DNA

isolation from different biological material: a review. Veterinarni medicina. 2006;51(5):180-92.

40.   Li H. Aligning sequence reads, clone sequences and assembly contigs with BWA-MEM. arXiv

preprint arXiv:13033997. 2013.

41.   Li H, Handsaker B, Wysoker A, Fennell T, Ruan J, Homer N, et al. The Sequence

Alignment/Map format and SAMtools. Bioinformatics (Oxford, England). 2009;25(16):2078-9.

42.   Garrison E, Marth G. Haplotype-based variant detection from short-read sequencing. arXiv

preprint arXiv:12073907. 2012.

43.   Cingolani P, Platts A, Wang LL, Coon M, Nguyen T, Wang L, et al. A program for annotating

and predicting the effects of single nucleotide polymorphisms, SnpEff: SNPs in the genome of

Drosophila melanogaster strain w1118; iso-2; iso-3. Fly. 2012;6(2):80-92.

44.   Coll F, McNerney R, Guerra-Assuncao JA, Glynn JR, Perdigao J, Viveiros M, et al. A robust

SNP barcode for typing *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex strains. Nature communications.

2014;5:4812.

45.   Feuerriegel S, Schleusener V, Beckert P, Kohl TA, Miotto P, Cirillo DM, et al. PhyResSE: a

Web Tool Delineating *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Antibiotic Resistance and Lineage from Whole-

Genome Sequencing Data. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2015;53(6):1908-14.

46.   Stamatakis A. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large

phylogenies. Bioinformatics (Oxford, England). 2014;30(9):1312-3.

47.   Leache AD, Banbury BL, Felsenstein J, de Oca AN, Stamatakis A. Short Tree, Long Tree, Right

Tree, Wrong Tree: New Acquisition Bias Corrections for Inferring SNP Phylogenies. Systematic

biology. 2015;64(6):1032-47.

48.   Lewis PO. A likelihood approach to estimating phylogeny from discrete morphological

character data. Systematic biology. 2001;50(6):913-25.

49.   Letunic I, Bork P. Interactive Tree Of Life (iTOL): an online tool for phylogenetic tree display

and annotation. Bioinformatics (Oxford, England). 2007;23(1):127-8.

50.   Choi Y. A fast computation of pairwise sequence alignment scores between a protein and a

set of single-locus variants of another protein. Proceedings of the ACM Conference on

Bioinformatics, Computational Biology and Biomedicine; Orlando, Florida. 2382989: ACM; 2012. p.

414-7.

51.   Choi Y, Chan AP. PROVEAN web server: a tool to predict the functional effect of amino acid

substitutions and indels. Bioinformatics (Oxford, England). 2015;31(16):2745-7.

52.   Choi Y, Sims GE, Murphy S, Miller JR, Chan AP. Predicting the Functional Effect of Amino

Acid Substitutions and Indels. PloS one. 2012;7(10):e46688.

53.   Kumar P, Henikoff S, Ng PC. Predicting the effects of coding non-synonymous variants on

protein function using the SIFT algorithm. Nature protocols. 2009;4(7):1073-81.

54.   Barry VC, Belton JG, Conalty ML, Denneny JM, Edward DW, O'Sullivan JF, et al. A new series

of phenazines (rimino-compounds) with high antituberculosis activity. Nature.

1957;179(4568):1013-5.

55.   Lechartier B, Cole ST. Mode of Action of Clofazimine and Combination Therapy with

Benzothiazinones against <span class="named-content genus-species"

id="named-content-1">*Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Antimicrobial

Agents and Chemotherapy. 2015;59(8):4457.

56.   Lewis JM, Sloan DJ. The role of delamanid in the treatment of drug-resistant tuberculosis.

Therapeutics and clinical risk management. 2015;11:779-91.

57.   Xavier AS, Lakshmanan M. Delamanid: A new armor in combating drug-resistant

tuberculosis. Journal of pharmacology & pharmacotherapeutics. 2014;5(3):222-4.

58.   Yano T, Kassovska-Bratinova S, Teh JS, Winkler J, Sullivan K, Isaacs A, et al. Reduction of

clofazimine by mycobacterial type 2 NADH:quinone oxidoreductase: a pathway for the generation

of bactericidal levels of reactive oxygen species. The Journal of biological chemistry.

2011;286(12):10276-87.

59.   Van Deun A, Decroo T, Piubello A, de Jong BC, Lynen L, Rieder HL. Principles for

constructing a tuberculosis treatment regimen: the role and definition of core and companion

drugs. The international journal of tuberculosis and lung disease : the official journal of the

International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease. 2018;22(3):239-45.

60.   Brodie AF, Kalra VK, Lee SH, Cohen NS. Properties of energy-transducing systems in

different types of membrane preparations from *Mycobacterium phlei*--preparation, resolution,

and reconstitution. Methods in enzymology. 1979;55:175-200.

61.   Cohen T, Colijn C, Murray M. Modeling the effects of strain diversity and mechanisms of

strain competition on the potential performance of new tuberculosis vaccines. Proceedings of the

National Academy of Sciences. 2008;105(42):16302.

62.   Gagneux S, Small PM. Global phylogeography of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and

implications for tuberculosis product development. Lancet Infect Dis. 2007;7.

63.   Homolka S, Niemann S, Russell DG, Rohde KH. Functional Genetic Diversity among

Mycobacterium tuberculosis Complex Clinical Isolates: Delineation of Conserved Core and Lineage-

Specific Transcriptomes during Intracellular Survival. PLoS pathogens. 2010;6(7):e1000988.

64.   Ofori-Anyinam B, Kanuteh F, Agbla SC, Adetifa I, Okoi C, Dolganov G, et al. Impact of the

Mycobaterium africanum West Africa 2 Lineage on TB Diagnostics in West Africa: Decreased

Sensitivity of Rapid Identification Tests in The Gambia. PLoS neglected tropical diseases.

2016;10(7):e0004801.

65.   Sanoussi CN, Affolabi D, Rigouts L, Anagonou S, de Jong B. Genotypic characterization

directly applied to sputum improves the detection of *Mycobacterium africanum* West African 1,

under-represented in positive cultures. PLoS neglected tropical diseases. 2017;11(9):e0005900.

66.   Sanoussi CN, de Jong BC, Odoun M, Arekpa K, Ali Ligali M, Bodi O, et al. Low sensitivity of

the MPT64 identification test to detect lineage 5 of the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex.

Journal of medical microbiology. 2018;67(12):1718-27.

67.   Dalton T, Cegielski P, Akksilp S, Asencios L, Campos Caoili J, Cho SN, et al. Prevalence of and

risk factors for resistance to second-line drugs in people with multidrug-resistant tuberculosis in

eight countries: a prospective cohort study. Lancet (London, England). 2012;380(9851):1406-17.

68.   Rahi A, Matta SK, Dhiman A, Garhyan J, Gopalani M, Chandra S, et al. Enolase of

Mycobacterium tuberculosis is a surface exposed plasminogen binding protein. Biochimica et

biophysica acta General subjects. 2017;1861(1 Pt A):3355-64.

69.   Griffin JE, Gawronski JD, Dejesus MA, Ioerger TR, Akerley BJ, Sassetti CM. High-resolution

phenotypic profiling defines genes essential for mycobacterial growth and cholesterol catabolism.

PLoS pathogens. 2011;7(9):e1002251.

70.   Sassetti CM, Boyd DH, Rubin EJ. Genes required for mycobacterial growth defined by high

density mutagenesis. Molecular microbiology. 2003;48(1):77-84.

71.   Tuckman D, Donnelly RJ, Zhao FX, Jacobs WR, Jr., Connell ND. Interruption of the

phosphoglucose isomerase gene results in glucose auxotrophy in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*.

Journal of bacteriology. 1997;179(8):2724-30.

72.   Phong WY, Lin W, Rao SP, Dick T, Alonso S, Pethe K. Characterization of

phosphofructokinase activity in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* reveals that a functional glycolytic

carbon flow is necessary to limit the accumulation of toxic metabolic intermediates under hypoxia.

PloS one. 2013;8(2):e56037.

73. Collins DM, Wilson T, Campbell S, Buddle BM, Wards BJ, Hotter G, et al. Production of

avirulent mutants of *Mycobacterium bovis* with vaccine properties by the use of illegitimate

recombination and screening of stationary-phase cultures. Microbiology (Reading, England).

2002;148(Pt 10):3019-27.

74. Liu K, Yu J, Russell DG. pckA-deficient *Mycobacterium bovis* BCG shows attenuated

virulence in mice and in macrophages. Microbiology (Reading, England). 2003;149(Pt 7):1829-35.

75. Daffe M, Crick DC, Jackson M. Genetics of Capsular Polysaccharides and Cell Envelope

(Glyco)lipids. Microbiology spectrum. 2014;2(4):Mgm2-0021-2013.

76. Singh A, Crossman DK, Mai D, Guidry L, Voskuil MI, Renfrow MB, et al. *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis WhiB3 maintains redox homeostasis by regulating virulence lipid anabolism to

modulate macrophage response. PLoS pathogens. 2009;5(8):e1000545.

77. Munoz-Elias EJ, McKinney JD. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isocitrate lyases 1 and 2 are

jointly required for in vivo growth and virulence. Nat Med. 2005;11(6):638-44.

78. Nandakumar M, Nathan C, Rhee KY. Isocitrate lyase mediates broad antibiotic tolerance in

Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Nature communications. 2014;5:4306.

79. Honer Zu Bentrup K, Miczak A, Swenson DL, Russell DG. Characterization of activity and

expression of isocitrate lyase in *Mycobacterium avium* and *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Journal of

bacteriology. 1999;181(23):7161-7.

80. Li AH, Lam WL, Stokes RW. Characterization of genes differentially expressed within

macrophages by virulent and attenuated *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* identifies candidate genes

involved in intracellular growth. Microbiology (Reading, England). 2008;154(8):2291-303.

81. Bellerose MM, Baek SH, Huang CC, Moss CE, Koh EI, Proulx MK. Common Variants in the

Glycerol Kinase Gene Reduce Tuberculosis Drug Efficacy. 2019;10(4).

82. Diarra B, Kone M, Togo ACG, Sarro YDS, Cisse AB, Somboro A, et al. *Mycobacterium*

africanum (Lineage 6) shows slower sputum smear conversion on tuberculosis treatment than

Mycobacterium tuberculosis (Lineage 4) in Bamako, Mali. 2018;13(12):e0208603.

83. Sarkar R, Lenders L, Wilkinson KA, Wilkinson RJ, Nicol MP. Modern Lineages of

Mycobacterium tuberculosis Exhibit Lineage-Specific Patterns of Growth and Cytokine Induction in

Human Monocyte-Derived Macrophages. PLoS one. 2012;7(8):e43170.

84. Tanveer M, Hasan Z, Kanji A, Hussain R, Hasan R. Reduced TNF-α and IFN-γ responses to

Central Asian strain 1 and Beijing isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in comparison with

H37Rv strain. Transactions of The Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene.

2009;103(6):581-7.

85.   Yimer SA, Norheim G, Namouchi A, Zegeye ED, Kinander W, Tønjum T, et al. <span

class="named-content genus-species" id="named-content-

1">*Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Lineage 7 Strains Are Associated with

Prolonged Patient Delay in Seeking Treatment for Pulmonary Tuberculosis in Amhara Region,

Ethiopia. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2015;53(4):1301.

86.   Vilcheze C, Weinrick B, Leung LW, Jacobs WR, Jr. Plasticity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*

NADH dehydrogenases and their role in virulence. Proceedings of the National Academy of

Sciences of the United States of America. 2018;115(7):1599-604.

87.   Hartman T, Weinrick B, Vilchèze C, Berney M, Tufariello J, Cook GM, et al. Succinate

dehydrogenase is the regulator of respiration in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. PLoS pathogens.

2014;10(11):e1004510.

88.   EPFL.

89.   Minato Y, Gohl DM, Thiede JM, Chacón JM, Harcombe WR, Maruyama F, et al. Genome-

wide assessment of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* conditionally essential

metabolic pathways. bioRxiv. 2019:534289.

90.   Goldberg I, Lonberg-Holm K, Bagley EA, Stieglitz B. Improved conversion of fumarate to

succinate by Escherichia coli strains amplified for fumarate reductase. Applied and environmental

microbiology. 1983;45(6):1838-47.

91.   Matsoso LG, Kana BD, Crellin PK, Lea-Smith DJ, Pelosi A, Powell D, et al. Function of the

cytochrome bc1-aa3 branch of the respiratory network in mycobacteria and network adaptation

occurring in response to its disruption. Journal of bacteriology. 2005;187(18):6300-8.

92.   De Jong BC, Antonio M, Gagneux S. *Mycobacterium africanum*—Review of an Important

Cause of Human Tuberculosis in West Africa. PLoS Negl Trop Dis. 2010;4.

93.   Frothingham R, Strickland PL, Bretzel G, Ramaswamy S, Musser JM, Williams DL.

Phenotypic and Genotypic Characterization of *Mycobacterium africanum* Isolates from West

Africa. Journal of clinical microbiology. 1999;37(6):1921-6.

94.   Niemann S, Richter E, Rusch-Gerdes S. Differentiation among members of the

Mycobacterium tuberculosis complex by molecular and biochemical features: evidence for two

pyrazinamide-susceptible subtypes of M. bovis. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2000;38(1):152-7.

95.   Parsons LM, Brosch R, Cole ST, Somoskovi A, Loder A, Bretzel G, et al. Rapid and simple

approach for identification of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex isolates by PCR-based genomic

deletion analysis. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2002;40(7):2339-45.

96.   Trauner A, Sassetti CM, Rubin EJ. Genetic Strategies for Identifying New Drug Targets.

Microbiology spectrum. 2014;2(4):Mgm2-0030-2013.

97.   Zhang YJ, Ioerger TR, Huttenhower C, Long JE, Sassetti CM, Sacchettini JC, et al. Global

Assessment of Genomic Regions Required for Growth in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. PLoS

pathogens. 2012;8(9):e1002946.

98.   Guest JR. Partial replacement of succinate dehydrogenase function by phage- and plasmid-

specified fumarate reductase in *Escherichia coli*. Journal of general microbiology. 1981;122(2):171-

9.

99.   Berney M, Cook GM. Unique flexibility in energy metabolism allows mycobacteria to

combat starvation and hypoxia. PloS one. 2010;5(1):e8614.

100.   Giffin MM, Shi L, Gennaro ML, Sohaskey CD. Role of alanine dehydrogenase of

Mycobacterium tuberculosis during recovery from hypoxic nonreplicating persistence. PloS one.

2016;11(5):e0155522.

101.   Jeong J-A, Park SW, Yoon D, Kim S, Kang H-Y, Oh J-I. Roles of Alanine Dehydrogenase and

Induction of Its Gene in <span class="named-content genus-species"

id="named-content-1">*Mycobacterium smegmatis* under

Respiration-Inhibitory Conditions. Journal of bacteriology. 2018;200(14):e00152-18.

102.   Jeong JA, Oh JI. Alanine dehydrogenases in mycobacteria. Journal of microbiology (Seoul,

Korea). 2019;57(2):81-92.

103.   Weber I, Fritz C, Ruttkowski S, Kreft A, Bange FC. Anaerobic nitrate reductase (narGHJI)

activity of *Mycobacterium bovis* BCG in vitro and its contribution to virulence in immunodeficient

mice. Molecular microbiology. 2000;35(5):1017-25.

104.   Arora K, Ochoa-Montaño B, Tsang PS, Blundell TL, Dawes SS, Mizrahi V, et al. Respiratory

Flexibility in Response to Inhibition of Cytochrome c Oxidase in <span

class="named-content genus-species" id="named-content-

1">*Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy.

2014;58(11):6962.

105.   Kalia NP, Hasenoehrl EJ, Ab Rahman NB, Koh VH, Ang MLT, Sajorda DR, et al. Exploiting the

synthetic lethality between terminal respiratory oxidases to kill *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis and clear host infection. Proceedings of the National Academy of

Sciences. 2017;114(28):7426.

106.   Scherr N, Bieri R, Thomas SS, Chauffour A. Targeting the *Mycobacterium ulcerans*

cytochrome bc1:aa3 for the treatment of Buruli ulcer. 2018;9(1):5370.

107. Reiling N, Homolka S, Walter K, Brandenburg J, Niwinski L, Ernst M, et al. Clade-Specific

Virulence Patterns of <span class="named-content genus-species"

id="named-content-1">*Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Complex Strains

in Human Primary Macrophages and Aerogenically Infected Mice. mBio. 2013;4(4):e00250-13.

108. O'Neill MB, Shockey A, Zarley A, Aylward W, Eldholm V, Kitchen A, et al. Lineage specific

histories of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* dispersal in Africa and Eurasia. Molecular ecology. 2019.

109. Molina-Moya B, Gomgnimbou MK, Spinasse L, Obasanya J, Oladimeji O, Dacombe R, et al.

Mycobacterium tuberculosis complex genotypes circulating in Nigeria based on spoligotyping

obtained from Ziehl-Neelsen stained slides extracted DNA. PLoS neglected tropical diseases.

2018;12(2):e0006242.

110. Ates LS, Dippenaar A, Sayes F, Pawlik A, Bouchier C, Ma L, et al. Unexpected Genomic and

Phenotypic Diversity of *Mycobacterium africanum* Lineage 5 Affects Drug Resistance, Protein

Secretion, and Immunogenicity. Genome Biology and Evolution. 2018;10(8):1858-74.

111. Newton SM, Smith RJ, Wilkinson KA, Nicol MP, Garton NJ, Staples KJ, et al. A deletion

defining a common Asian lineage of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* associates with immune

subversion. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America.

2006;103(42):15594-8.

112. Albanna AS, Reed MB, Kotar KV, Fallow A, McIntosh FA, Behr MA, et al. Reduced

Transmissibility of East African Indian Strains of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. PloS one.

2011;6(9):e25075.

113. Nebenzahl-Guimaraes H, Verhagen LM, Borgdorff MW, Van Soolingen D. Transmission and

progression to disease of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* phylogenetic lineages in The Netherlands.

Journal of clinical microbiology. 2015;53(10):3264-71.

114. Broset E, Martín C, Gonzalo-Asensio J. Evolutionary Landscape of the <span

class="named-content genus-species" id="named-content-

1">*Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Complex from the Viewpoint of PhoPR:

Implications for Virulence Regulation and Application to Vaccine Development. mBio.

2015;6(5):e01289-15.

115. Gonzalo-Asensio J, Malaga W, Pawlik A, Astarie-Dequeker C, Passemar C, Moreau F, et al.

Evolutionary history of tuberculosis shaped by conserved mutations in the PhoPR virulence

regulator. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America.

2014;111(31):11491-6.

116. Gonzalo-Asensio J, Mostowy S, Harders-Westerveen J, Huygen K, Hernandez-Pando R,

Thole J, et al. PhoP: a missing piece in the intricate puzzle of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*

virulence. PloS one. 2008;3(10):e3496.

117. Galagan JE, Minch K, Peterson M, Lyubetskaya A, Azizi E, Sweet L, et al. The *Mycobacterium*

tuberculosis regulatory network and hypoxia. Nature. 2013;499(7457):178-83.

118. Capon F, Allen MH, Ameen M, Burden AD, Tillman D, Barker JN, et al. A synonymous SNP of

the corneodesmosin gene leads to increased mRNA stability and demonstrates association with

psoriasis across diverse ethnic groups. Human molecular genetics. 2004;13(20):2361-8.

119. Duan J, Wainwright MS, Comeron JM, Saitou N, Sanders AR, Gelernter J, et al. Synonymous

mutations in the human dopamine receptor D2 (DRD2) affect mRNA stability and synthesis of the

receptor. Human molecular genetics. 2003;12(3):205-16.

120. Golby P, Nunez J, Witney A, Hinds J, Quail MA, Bentley S, et al. Genome-level analyses of

Mycobacterium bovis lineages reveal the role of SNPs and antisense transcription in differential

gene expression. BMC genomics. 2013;14:710-.

121. Baez A, Shiloach J. Effect of elevated oxygen concentration on bacteria, yeasts, and cells

propagated for production of biological compounds. Microbial cell factories. 2014;13:181-.

122. Siddiqi SaR-G, S. MGIT™ Procedure Manual, For BACTEC™ MGIT 960™ TB System

(Also applicable for Manual MGIT), Mycobacteria Growth Indicator Tube (MGIT)

Culture and Drug Susceptibility Demonstration Projects. 2006.

123. Godreuil S, Torrea G, Terru D, Chevenet F, Diagbouga S, Supply P, et al. First molecular

epidemiology study of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in Burkina Faso. Journal of clinical

microbiology. 2007;45(3):921-7.

124. Groenheit R, Ghebremichael S, Svensson J, Rabna P, Colombatti R, Riccardi F, et al. The

Guinea-Bissau family of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex revisited. PloS one.

2011;6(4):e18601.

125. Niobe-Eyangoh SN, Kuaban C, Sorlin P, Cunin P, Thonnon J, Sola C, et al. Genetic

Biodiversity of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Complex Strains from Patients with Pulmonary

Tuberculosis in Cameroon. Journal of clinical microbiology. 2003;41(6):2547-53.

126. Ouassa T, Borroni E, Loukou GY, Faye-Kette H, Kouakou J, Menan H, et al. High prevalence

of shared international type 53 among *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex strains in retreated

patients from Cote d'Ivoire. PloS one. 2012;7(9):e45363.

127.   Campbell MC, Tishkoff SA. African genetic diversity: implications for human demographic

history, modern human origins, and complex disease mapping. Annual review of genomics and

human genetics. 2008;9:403-33.

128.   Amouzou EK, Chabi NW, Adjalla CE, Rodriguez-Gueant RM, Feillet F, Villaume C, et al. High

prevalence of hyperhomocysteinemia related to folate deficiency and the 677C-->T mutation of

the gene encoding methylenetetrahydrofolate reductase in coastal West Africa. The American

journal of clinical nutrition. 2004;79(4):619-24.

129.   Gagneux S. Strain variation in the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex: its role in biology,

epidemiology and control. Springer, Heidelberg. 2017.

130.   Moore SE, Mansoor MA, Bates CJ, Prentice AM. Plasma homocysteine, folate and vitamin

B12 compared between rural Gambian and UK adults. British Journal of Nutrition. 2008;96(3):508-

15.

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023

Figures:

Figure 1: Link between central carbon metabolism and the Electron Transport Chain. Reducing equivalents like NADH and FADH2 enter into the Electron Transport Chain that drives the production of high amounts of ATP for cellular processes

NAD - Nicotinamide Adenine Dinucleotide
NADH - Reduced Nicotinamide Adenine Dinucleotide
FAD - Flavin Adenine Dinucleotide
FADH2 - Reduced Flavin Adenine Dinucleotide
MQ - Menaquinone
ADP - Adenosine Diphosphate
Pi - Inorganic Phosphate
ATP - Adenosine Triphosphate
e- - Electron flow during aerobic respiration
H+ - Proton flow during aerobic respiration
e- - Electron flow during anaerobic respiration
H+ - Proton flow during anaerobic respiration

Figure 2: Mutations detected in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway of **MAF L6** **and** **MAF L5.** Genes in **bold** have potentially deleterious mutations that can affect gene function.

aceE acn citA dlaT **eno** **fba** fum gap glcB glpD1 glpD2 **glpK** glpX gpgP icd1 **icd2** icl1 **icl2a** icl2b korA **korB** lpdC **mdh** **pca** **pckA** pfkA pfkB pgi pgk pgmA ppgk prpC prpD **pykA** tpi

Figure 3: Mutations detected in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway of MTB **L4 Ghana**, **L4 Haarlem**, **L1**, **L3**, **L2**, **L4 Cameroon** **and L4 LAM.** Genes in **bold** have potentially deleterious mutations that can affect gene function.

aceE acn citA dlaT eno fba gap glcB glpD1 glpD2 glpK glpX gpgP icd1 **icd2** **icl2a** icl2b korA korB lpdC **pca** **pckA** **pfkA** **pfkB** **pgi** pgk ppgk prpC prpD pykA

Figure 4: Mutations detected in the Electron Transport Chain of *M. africanum* **MAF L6** **and** **MAF L5.** Genes in **bold** have potentially deleterious mutations that can affect gene function.

atpA atpB atpC atpD atpE **atpG** **atpH** **ctaB** cydA **cydB** cydC cydD **frdA** frdB frdC **ald** sdhA sdhD gpdA1gpdA2mqo **narG** narH narI narJ **ndhA** ndh nirB nirD nuoA nuoCnuoD nuoE nuoF nuoGnuoI nuoJ nuoK nuoL nuoM pruA **pruB** qcrA qcrB **qcrC**

Figure 5: Mutations detected in the Electron Transport Chain of MTB L4 Ghana, L4 Haarlem, L1, L3, L2, L4 Cameroon and L4 LAM. Genes in **bold** have potentially deleterious mutations that can affect gene function.

atpA atpB **atpD** atpG atpH ctaB cydA cydC cydD frdA **frdB** frdC ald gpdA2 mqo narG narH narI narJ **ndhA** ndh nirB nirdD nuoA nuoD **nuoF** nuoG nuoH nuoI nuoL nuoM nuoN pruA pruB qcrA qcrC sdhA sdhB sdhC sdhD **Rv0249c**

Figure 6: Mutations in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway of MAF. Genes with a **red** colour code have deleterious mutations in the

MAF lineages indicated next to the gene.

Figure 7: Mutations in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway of MTB. Genes with a **red** colour code have deleterious mutations in the

MTB lineages indicated next to the gene.

Figure 8: The core and alternate respiratory chain of mycobacteria during *in vitro* exponential growth when oxygen is abundant and when oxygen is limited. Mutations in MAF lineages are indicated in red boxes next to each affected complex. The core chain consists of type I NADH:menaquinone oxidoreductase (NuoA-N), succinate: menaquinone oxidoreductase 1 (SDH1), cytochrome aa3-bc supercomplex (Qcr-Cta) and F1F0-ATPase while the route used during oxygen limitation is composed of the Type II NADH:menaquinone oxidoreductase (Ndh); succinate:menaquinone oxidoreductase (SDH2); nitrate reductase (Nar); Fumarate Reductase (Frd) and cytochrome bd oxidase (Cyd), a high affinity terminal oxidase allowing hypoxic survival.

Figure 9: The core and alternate respiratory chain of mycobacteria during *in vitro* exponential growth when oxygen is abundant and when oxygen is limited. Mutations in MTB lineages are indicated in red boxes next to each affected complex. The core chain consists of type I NADH:menaquinone oxidoreductase (NuoA-N), succinate: menaquinone oxidoreductase 1 (SDH1), cytochrome aa3-bc supercomplex (Qcr-Cta) and F1F0-ATPase while the route used during oxygen limitation is composed of Type II NADH:menaquinone oxidoreductase (Ndh); succinate:menaquinone oxidoreductase (SDH2); nitrate reductase (Nar); Fumarate Reductase (Frd) and cytochrome bd oxidase (Cyd), a high affinity terminal oxidase allowing hypoxic survival.

Figure 10: The MTB H37Rv proposed regulatory network showing differentially regulated and or mutated genes in MAF lineages based on findings from our present analysis, Ofori-Anyinam *et al.*, Tuberculosis, 2017, Galagan *et al.*, Nature, 2013 and Gonzalo-Asensio *et al.*, Plos One, 2008).

Table 1: Mutations in genes encoding enzymes in the Central Carbon Metabolic Pathway. Information in red indicates potentially deleterious changes and the corresponding lineages they were detected in. **x** implies convergence occurred between MTB and MAF lineages and **x** implies the mutation is potentially deleterious.

Gene	MTB amino acid change	MTB Mutation	MTB Lineage	MAF amino acid change	MAF Mutation	MAF Lineage	Convergent evolution
ppgk	Ile203Thr	I203T	All lineages	Ile203Thr	I203T	L5, L6	x
pgi	Arg546His	R546H	clade of L4 LAM				
pfkA	Gln51His	Q51H	L4 Cameroon				
pfkB	Leu221Phe	L221F	L3				
fba				Ile137Val	I137V	L6	
glpK	Val460Ala	V460A	L1	Val460Ala	V460A	L5,L6	x
				Glu209Lys	E209K		
				Val192fs	V192fs		
eno	Arg8Gly	R8G	L1, L2, L3	Arg8Gly	R8G	L5, L6	x
	Lys429Gln	K429Q		Arg179Ser	R179S		
pykA				Glu220Asp	E220D	L5,L6	
aceE				Ala777Thr	A777T	L6	

Gene	Mutation	Code	Lineage	Mutation	Code	Lineage	
				Ala528Thr	A528T		
				Ser221Phe	S221F		
pca	Ala406Thr	A406T	L3	Ala926Thr	A926T	L5	x
icd2	Gly655Ser	G655S	L3	Val447Met	V447M	L6	
	Leu254Val	L254V		Lys117Asn	K117N		
mdh				Leu326Ile	L326I	L5, L6	
				Ala112Thr	A112T		
				Asp253Ala	D253A		
korB	Val293Ala	V293A	L3	Ala309Gly	A309G	L5	x
icl2a	Gly179Asp	G179D	L1,L2,L3,L4	Ala146Thr	A146T	L5, L6	x
	Thr296fs	T296fs	Haarlem, L4	His151Arg	H151R		
			Ghana	Gly179Asp	G179D		
				Thr296fs	T296fs		
prpC	Val46Met	V46M	L1				
prpD	Asp3Gly	D3G	L1,L2,L3	Asp3Gly	D3G	L5, L6	x
pckA	Met108Ile	M108I	L4	Lys422Thr	K422T	L5	x
	Ala536Gly	A536G	Cameroon, clade of L4 LAM				

Table 2: Mutations in genes and gene subunits encoding Electron Transport Chain enzymes. Information in **red** indicates potentially deleterious changes and the corresponding lineages they were detected in. **x** indicates that convergence occurred between MTB and MAF lineages and **x** indicates that the mutation is potentially deleterious.

Gene	MTB amino acid change	MTB Mutation	MTB Lineage	MAF amino acid change	MAF Mutation	MAF Lineage	Convergent evolution
ndh				Val117ile	V117I	clade of L6	
				Lys341Glu	K341E		
ndhA	Asn360Ser	N360S	clade of L2	Ala341fs	A341fs	L5	x
	Met325Thr	M325T	L1				
	Gly229Val	G229V	L3				
gpdA1				Thr190Ala	T190A	L6	
gpdA2	Pro133Ala	P133A	All lineages	Pro133Ala	P133A	L5, L6	x
pruB				Arg257Cys	R257C	L5	
qcrC				Lys228Gln	K228Q	L6	
ctaB				Ala68Thr	A68T	L5, L6	
cydB				Met98Ile	M98I	L6	
frdA				Gly16Asp	G16D	L5	
frdB	Ser157Leu	S157L	L4 Haarlem				
frdC	Met40Val	M40V	All lineages	Met40Val	M40V	L5, L6	x

Gene							
narG				Ser435Arg	S435R	L5	
narH	Ala467Val	A467V	L4 Ghana, L4 Haarlem				
nirB	Val775Leu	V775L	L2				
atpG				Tyr220Ser	Y220S	L5	
atpH				Gly403Asp	G403D	L5	
				Ser434Leu	S434L		
atpD	Val371Ala	V371A	L2				
nuoD	Gly392Ala	G392A	clade of L4 LAM				
nuoG	Ile474Met	I474M	All lineages	Ile474Met	I474M	L5, L6	x
	Thr604Ala	T604A		Thr604Ala	T604A		
nuoH	Gly5_His6insArg	G5_H6insR	clade of L4 LAM				
nuoF	Pro19Leu	P19L	L3				
nuoM				Asp309Glu	D309E	clade of L6	
nuoI	Thr180Ala	T180A	L3	Thr180Ala	T180A	L6, L5	x
sdhA	Glu269Asp	E269D	L4 LAM	Gly533Asp	G533D	clade of L6	x
Rv0249c	Thr17fs	T17fs	clade of L1				
sdhC	Leu54Ile	L54I	L1				

sdhD	Val54Leu	V54	All lineages	Val54Leu	V54L	L5, L6	x
	Thr112Ala	T112A					
ald				Gln89fs	Q89fs	L5, L6	
				Asp198Val	D198V		
				Ala123_Asp124del	A123_D124del		

Table 3: Future proposed experiments.

Examination	Proposed Experiments	Predicted Phenotype/ Expected outcome
Experimentally determine if mutations detected in *eno*, *pca*, *pgi*, *pckA*, *korB*, *fba*, *aceE* and *glpK* of the Glycolytic Pathway and TCA cycle contribute to slow growth.	Mutagenesis experiments, complementation studies, Growth studies.	MAF, MTB L1 and L3 will show attenuated growth relative to MTB L2 and L4.
Experimentally determine if mutations detected in *ndhA*, *pruB*, *qcrC*, *ctaB*, *frdAB*, *sdhA*, *atpDHG*, *ald*, *Rv0249c*, *narG* and *cydB* of the respiratory pathway contribute to slow growth.	Mutagenesis experiments, complementation studies, Growth studies.	MAF, MTB L1 and L3 will show attenuated growth compared to MTB L2 and L4.
Energy generation, in the form of ATP, for cellular processes	ATP quantitation assays.	MAF lineages will generate less ATP via the respiratory chain compared to MTB lineages
ROS accumulation and DNA damage in MAF cultures relative to MTB	Flow cytometry experiments and terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase dUTP nick end labelling (TUNEL) assay.	Higher levels of ROS in MAF cultures and greater DNA damage of MAF relative to MTB.
Host-Pathogen interactions driving geographic restriction of MAF lineages to West Africa	Host genetics and Genome-wide association studies.	Specific genes in West Africans have undergone strong positive selection and increased the susceptibility of West

	48	Africans to MAF infection, permitting host restrictedness.