A new genome allows the identification of genes associated with natural

variation in aluminium tolerance in *Brachiaria* grasses

Margaret Worthington[1#], Juan Guillermo Perez[1], Saule Mussurova[2], Alexander Silva-

Cordoba[1], Valheria Castiblanco[1], Charlotte Jones[3], Narcis Fernandez-Fuentes[3], Leif

Skot[3], Sarah Dyer[2&], Joe Tohme[1], Federica Di Palma[2], Jacobo Arango[1], Ian

Armstead[3], Jose J De Vega[2*]

1. International Center for Tropical Agriculture (CIAT), A.A. 6713, Cali, Colombia.

2. Earlham Institute, Norwich Research Park, Norwich, NR4 7UZ, UK.

3. Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences (IBERS), Aberystwyth

University, Aberystwyth, UK.

Present address: Department of Horticulture, University of Arkansas, 306 Plant

Sciences Bldg, Fayetteville, AR, 72701, USA.

& Present address: NIAB, Huntingdon Road, Cambridge, CB3 0LE, UK.

* Correspondence to jose.devega@earlham.ac.uk; Earlham Institute, Norwich

Research Park, Norwich, NR4 7UZ, UK.

Running title: Genetic control of aluminium tolerance in *Brachiaria.*

6,494 words.

HIGHLIGHT

We identified QTLs, genes and molecular responses in high and low tolerant *Brachiaria* grasses associated with aspects of response to aluminium stress, such as regulation, cell-wall composition and active transport.

ABSTRACT

Toxic concentrations of aluminium cations and low phosphorus availability are the main yield-limiting factors in acidic soils, which represent half of the potentially available arable land. *Brachiaria* grasses, which are commonly sown as a forage in the tropics because of their resilience and low demand for nutrients, have a greater tolerance to high concentrations of aluminium cations than most other grass crops. In this work, we explored the natural variation in tolerance to aluminium cations (Al^{3+}) between high and low tolerant *Brachiaria* species and characterised their transcriptional differences during stress. We also identified three QTLs associated with root vigour during Al^{3+} stress in their hybrid progeny. By integrating these results with a new *Brachiaria* reference genome, we have identified 30 genes responsible for Al^{3+} tolerance in *Brachiaria*. We also observed differential expression during stress of genes involved in RNA translation, response signalling, cell wall composition and vesicle location genes homologous to aluminium-induced proteins involved in limiting uptake or localizing the toxin. However, there was limited regulation of malate transporters in *Brachiaria*, which are associated with external tolerance mechanisms to Al^{3+} stress in other grasses. The contrasting regulation of RNA translation and response signalling suggests response phasing is critical to Al^{3+} tolerance.

KEYWORDS: Acid soils, Aluminium tolerance, *Brachiaria*, genome assembly, differential expression, QTL mapping, grass, *Urochloa*

INTRODUCTION

Acidic soils constitute approximately 30 % of the world's total land area and 50 % of the potentially available arable land (Von Uexküll and Mutert, 1995). Acidic soils are particularly predominant in a northern "temperate belt" and a southern "subtropical belt". Therefore, a broad range of vegetable, cereal and forage crops can be yield-limited in these conditions (Hede *et al.*, 2001). The adverse effects of soil acidity are mostly associated with several mineral toxicities and deficiencies, particularly increased concentrations of soluble forms of manganese, iron and aluminium, and reduced levels of available forms of phosphorus, calcium, magnesium and potassium. Among these, lower phosphorus solubility and aluminium toxicity are considered the main limiting factors on productivity (Eswaran *et al.*, 1997). As soil pH decreases below 5, aluminium becomes soluble as the aluminium trivalent cation (Al^{3+}), a form highly toxic to plants. Soluble Al^{3+} effect on root apices results in diminished ion and water uptake.

Although acid soils can be conditioned for improved agricultural use through the addition of lime, in general, the most sustainable strategy is a combination of agronomic practices and growing tolerant cultivars. Natural variation in aluminium tolerance has been identified for a number of crops with rice (*Oryza sativa*) being the most aluminium-tolerant among the food staples (Rao *et al.*, 2016). All *Brachiaria* (Trin.) Griseb. (syn. *Urochloa* P. Beauv.) species show greater tolerance to Al^{3+} toxicity than most other grass crops, including maize (*Zea mays*), rice or wheat (*Triticum aestivum*) (Kochian *et al.*, 2015).

Brachiaria grasses are native to East Africa and are widely sown as a forage to feed ruminants across the tropics, particularly in areas with marginal soils. *Brachiaria* has a set of desirable genetic characteristics linked to drought and waterlogging tolerance, poor and acidic soils tolerance, and resistance to major diseases. However, *Brachiaria* resilience is principally a result of low demand for soil nutrients (Pizarro *et al.*, 2013). As a consequence, toxic cation levels (and not reduced levels of mineral solutes) are the limiting factors on *Brachiaria* species productivity in acidic soil conditions.

Al^{3+} tolerance has been established to be a multigenic trait, though major genes can

also be important (Kochian *et al.*, 2015; Ryan *et al.*, 2009). The incomplete transfer of

tolerance from parents to near-isogenic lines in sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor*) (Melo *et*

al., 2013), maize (Guimaraes *et al.*, 2014), and wheat (Johnson *et al.*, 1997; Tang *et*

al., 2002) supports polygenic inheritance of Al^{3+} resistance.

Al^{3+} tolerance mechanisms are classified as external and internal tolerance

mechanisms (Furlan *et al.*, 2018; Kochian *et al.*, 2015). In the first group, plants

prevent Al^{3+} uptake by raising the pH in the rhizosphere or forming binding complexes

by exudation of citrate, malate and oxalate. In the second group, Al^{3+} is absorbed and

localized to cell organelles or the apoplast. In the tolerant rice variety Nipponbare, both

exclusion mechanisms and internal detoxification are important in withstanding

toxicity, while primarily internal detoxification occurs in the sensitive rice variety Modan

(Roselló *et al.*, 2015).

Little is known about the genetic basis of Al^{3+} tolerance in *Brachiaria*. Nevertheless,

screening experiments have evidenced different but consistent aluminium tolerance

among *Brachiaria* species and cultivars, which indicates the genetic basis of the trait

(Arroyave *et al.*, 2013). The three most important commercial species, *Brachiaria*

brizantha (A.Rich.) Stapf., *B. decumbens* Stapf., and *B. humidicola* (Rendle) Schweick

exist primarily as apomicts with varying levels of polyploidy (Valle and Savidan, 1996).

The diploid sexual species *B. ruziziensis* (Germ. & C.M. Evrard) is also used in

breeding as a bridge between apomictic species (Miles, 2007). *B. decumbens* is

significantly more tolerant to Al^{3+} than *B. ruziziensis* (Arroyave *et al.*, 2011; Bitencourt

et al., 2011).

Brachiaria is one of the most widely used and promising forage genera in the American

and African tropics. For the potential of this species to be realised, it is important that

varieties are tailored to the particular demands of each environment in which it is

grown (Bailey-Serres *et al.*, 2019). While genomic approaches can accelerate genetic

gain from crop breeding, these approaches rely on resources that are costly and often

scarce in "orphan crops". As part of this project, we have also consequently produced

some of the fundamental genomic resources previously absent for *Brachiaria*,

uniquely a reference genome. We have applied these new genomic resources to

develop a better understanding of the molecular basis of a key trait affecting *Brachiaria* productivity, namely Al^{3+} tolerance.

METHODS

Plant materials and phenotyping

The interspecific mapping population used in this work consisted of 169 genotypes of F1 progeny from a cross between the synthetic autopolyploid *B. ruziziensis* accession BRX 44-02 and the segmental allopolyploid *B. decumbens* accession CIAT 606 (cv. Basilisk). This population was generated initially to create saturate linkage maps and identify markers linked to apomixis (Worthington *et al.*, 2016). Accessions were phenotyped for aluminium tolerance at CIAT in Cali, Colombia, following Wenzl *et al*. (2006). Briefly, the experiment consisted of six cycles (replications over time) with 1-7 replicate plants per cycle. Plants were grown for 20 days in hydroponic solutions with 0 or 200 µM $AlCl_3$ and phenotyped in each condition (control -C- and Al^{3+} stress -A-) for cumulative root length (RLC and RLA), root biomass (RBC and RBA), and root tip diameter (RDC and RDA) at the end of each experimental cycle. Data were transformed to meet the assumption of normality; root length and biomass were square-root transformed and root tip diameter was natural log-transformed. The PROC MIXED method (SAS v. 9.2, Cary, NC) was used to fit a totally random effect model. Genotypic best linear unbiased predictors (BLUPs) were calculated from stress (200 µM $AlCl_3$) and control (0 µM $AlCl_3$) conditions individually and back transformed to calculate relative root length (RRL), relative root biomass (RRB), and relative root tip diameter (RRD) ratios.

Genome sequencing, assembly and annotation

We selected the *B. ruziziensis* genotype CIAT 26162 (2n = 2x = 18) as the source of genomic DNA. This is a semi-erect diploid accession from Burundi (-3.1167, 30.1333) that is believed to have been mutagenised with colchicine to produce the synthetic autotetraploid *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02, one of the progenitors of the interspecific mapping population analysed. The ploidy of CIAT 26162 has recently been verified by

cytogenetics (*P. Tomaszewska, personal comm.*). Two paired-end libraries were
created and sequenced in Illumina HiSeq 2500 machines in rapid run mode by the
Earlham Institute (approx. 70X) and the Yale Center for Genome Analysis (approx.
30X). Additionally, a Nextera mate-pair (MP) library with insert length of 7 Kb was
sequenced to improve the scaffolding. Read quality was assessed, and contaminants
and adaptors removed. Illumina Nextera MP reads were required to include a fragment
of the adaptor to be used in the following steps (Leggett *et al.*, 2013a). The pair-end
shotgun libraries were assembled and later scaffolded using the MP library with
Platanus v1.2.117, which is optimized for heterozygous genomes (Kajitani *et al.*,
2014). We did not use Platanus' gap-closing step. Approximately 1 million Pacbio
reads from this same genotype were generated in a PacBio RSII sequencer and used
for gap filling using PBJelly v.15.8.24 (English *et al.*, 2012). Scaffolds shorter than 1
Kbp were filtered out. We used 31mer spectra analysis to compare the assemblies
produced by different pipelines, as well as our final assembly with the assemblies from
preceding steps. A K-mer spectrum is a representation of how many fixed-length
words or K-mers (y-axis) appear a certain number of times or coverage (x-axis). The
K-mer counting was performed with KAT (Mapleson *et al.*, 2016). The completeness
of the assembly was checked with BUSCO (Simão *et al.*, 2015).
174
Repetitive and low complexity regions of the scaffolds were masked using
RepeatMasker (Tarailo-Graovac and Chen, 2009) based on self-alignments and
homology with the RepBase public database and specific databases built with
RepeatModeler (Smit and Hubley, 2008). Long terminal repeat (LTR)
retrotransposons were detected by LTRharvest (Ellinghaus *et al.*, 2008) and classified
with RepeatClassifier. The 5′ and 3′ ends of each LTR were aligned to each other with
MUSCLE (Edgar, 2004) and used to calculate the nucleotide divergence rate with the
Kimura-2 parameter using MEGA6 (Tamura *et al.*, 2013). The insertion time was
estimated by assuming an average substitution rate of 1.3×10^{-8} (Schmutz *et al.*, 2014)
184
Our annotation pipeline (De Vega *et al.*, 2015) uses four sources of evidence: (a) *De*
novo and genome-guided *ab initio* transcripts deduced from RNA-Seq reads from the
B. ruziziensis genotype assembled with Trinity (Grabherr *et al.*, 2011) and Tophat and
Cufflinks (Trapnell *et al.*, 2012), (b) gene models predicted by Augustus (Stanke *et al.*,
2006), (c) homology-based alignments of transcripts and proteins from four close

species with Exonerate and GMAP (Wu *et al.*, 2016), and (d) the repeats annotation.

Finally, MIKADO (Venturini *et al.*, 2018) built the gene models to be compatible with

this previous information. Proteins were compared with the NCBI non-redundant

proteins and EBI's InterPro databases and the results were imported into Blast2GO

(Conesa *et al.*, 2005) to annotate the GO and GO slim terms, enzymatic protein codes

and KEGG pathways. Proteins were also functionally annotated with the GO terms of

any significant orthologous protein in the eggNOG database (Powell *et al.*, 2014),

using the eggNOG-mapper pipeline (Huerta-Cepas *et al.*, 2017).

Comparative genomics

Syntenic blocks between *B. ruziziensis* and foxtail millet (*Setaria italica* (L.) P. Beauv)

whole genomes were identified with Minimap (Li, 2016), and plotted with D-GENIES

(Cabanettes and Klopp, 2018). Previously, we filtered out any scaffold shorter than 10

Kbp that did not contain any gene. The assembly was anchored to foxtail millet by

assigning each scaffold to the chromosome position where it had the longest

alignment chain after combining proximal alignments. For clustering, proteins from five

related species were assigned to eggNOG orthologous groups as before. A

phylogenetic tree based on these data was built with MUSCLE by aligning the

orthologous proteins within each eggnog cluster, filtering sets with one member per

specie (*P. virgatum* was excluded from this analysis), and finally estimating the

nucleotide divergence rate using MEGA v6, as before.

Population genotyping and genetic map construction

Genotyping-by-sequencing libraries were prepared and sequenced for the 169 F1

progenies and the two parents as described in Worthington *et al.* (2016). Reads were

demultiplexed according to the forward and reverse barcodes used during library

preparation with FastGBS (Torkamaneh *et al.*, 2017) and adaptors and enzymatic

motifs removed with Cutadapt (Martin, 2011). Reads were aligned to the genome

using BWA MEM (Li, 2013). SNP calling was done for each sample with GATK's

Haplotycaller (Van der Auwera *et al.*, 2013) without the duplicated read filter (-drf

DuplicateRead) and recalled for the population with GATK's GenotypeGVCFs, in both

tools with "--ploidy 4". In agreement with filtering criteria previously tested in tetraploid

Brachiaria samples (Worthington *et al.*, 2016), we used SNPs only, and required at

least 12 reads to call a homozygous site in any sample and a minimum allele

frequency of 5 %. We removed any site not called in a progenitor or in more than 20 %

of the progeny. Markers that were heterozygous in only one parent and had a

segregation ratio of a heterozygote to homozygote progeny of approximately 1:1

(between 0.5 and 1.75) were classified as single-dose allele (SDA) markers and used

in the linkage map construction. Separate genetic linkage maps of BRX 44-02 and

CIAT 606 were constructed in JoinMap v5 (Van Ooijen, 2011) using a threshold

linkage logarithm of odds (LOD) score of 10 to establish linkage groups. Marker order

was then determined using regression mapping with default settings. Downstream

QTL analysis with MapQTL 6 (Van Ooijen and Kyazma, 2009) was conducted using

only the *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 map.

RNA-seq sequencing and analysis

Two replicate plants of *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 (cv. Basilisk) and *B. ruziziensis* BRX

44-02 were grown in high aluminium (200 µM $AlCl_3$) and control (0 µM $AlCl_3$) conditions

in the greenhouse, as described previously. After three days of growth, roots and

leaves were harvested from each plant. RNA extraction was performed with RNeasy

Plant Mini kit (Qiagen, CA, USA) and sent to the sequencing service provider (Earlham

Institute, Norwich, UK) where Illumina RNA-seq libraries were prepared and

sequenced using the HiSeq 2500 platform. Sixteen libraries were independently

generated and sequenced: two tissues (roots and leaves), from two species (*B.*

ruziziensis and *B. decumbens*), in two conditions (0 and 200 µM $AlCl_3$ hydroponic

solutions), and two replicates. Contaminations in the raw data were discarded with

Kontaminant (Leggett *et al.*, 2013b). Adaptors were removed with Cutadapt (Martin,

2011) and quality checked with FastQC. Reads were mapped to the assembled

genome using STAR (Dobin *et al.*, 2013) and the gene models annotation for

guidance. Counts were estimated with Stringtie (Pertea *et al.*, 2015). We used DEseq

v2 (Love *et al.*, 2014) for analysing differential expression. Enriched GO terms and

other categories in each group of differentially expressed genes were identified in R

using TOPGO (Alexa and Rahnenfuhrer, 2010) using a Fisher's test (FDR<0.05) and

the "weight01" algorithm. The relation among GO terms was plotted in R using ggplot

(Wickham and Chang, 2008). We also reanalysed using this pipeline the publicly

available data (PRJNA314352) from Salgado *et al*. (2017), obtained from harvested root tips from 12 day-old *B. decumbens* cv. Basilisk seedlings screened in similar experimental conditions to those described in our study but after 8 hours of treatment (instead of 72 hours).

<div align="center">**RESULTS**</div>

Root morphology in *Brachiaria* species in different aluminium cation concentrations

We demonstrated the superior aluminium tolerance of the *B. decumbens* accession CIAT 606 compared with *B. ruziziensis* accession BRX 44-02 (Figure 1). The root morphology of CIAT 606 was less affected than BRX 44-02 after growing for 20 days in high aluminium (200 µM $AlCl_3$) and control (0 µM $AlCl_3$) concentration hydroponic solutions. Under stress conditions, the roots of *B. decumbens* were over three times as long and had twice the biomass of *B. ruziziensis.* However, the root tip diameter increased in stress conditions in a similar ratio in both species (Supplementary table S1).

The interspecific progeny obtained by crossing aluminium-tolerant *B. decumbens* accession CIAT 606 and aluminium-sensitive *B. ruziziensis* accession BRX 44-02 showed segregation in cumulative root length (RL), root biomass (RB), and root tip diameter (RD) (Figure 2; Supplementary File 1). We obtained highly significant ($p < 0.001$) genotypic differences in control and stress conditions for the three traits (RL, RB and RD). The root biomass ($r = 0.73$), length ($r = 0.76$) and diameter ($r = 0.69$) of the progeny were significantly correlated when grown in stress (200 µM $AlCl_3$) and non-stress (0 µM $AlCl_3$) conditions.

Assembly and annotation of a *Brachiaria* reference genome

A whole-genome assembly (WGA) of CIAT 26162 was produced using Platanus v.1.2.4 (Kajitani *et al*., 2014), from Illumina paired-end and Nextera mate-pair reads with a coverage of approximately 100X and 7X, respectively (Supplementary table

S2). Platanus outperformed the contiguity results obtained with other pipelines.
Although the combination of ABySS for the contigs assembly and SOAP2 for the
scaffolding resulted in a larger assembly, a kmer frequency analysis (Mapleson *et al.*,
2016) evidenced that the additional content was repeated under-collapsed
heterozygosity that Platanus had purged instead (Supplementary figure S1). A gap-
filling step using approximately 1 million Pacbio reads with an average length of 4.8
Kbp resulted in a reduced percentage of ambiguous nucleotides (Ns) from 17.45 % to
11.39 %. We finally discarded all the sequences under 1 Kbp to produce the reference
genome we used for the downstream analysis (Table 1). To assess the completeness
of the assembly, we verified that 1,345 (93.4 %) of the 1,440 BUSCO orthologous
genes (Simão *et al.*, 2015) were present in the assembly; 1,216 of which were
completed and in a single copy, 32 were duplicated, and 97 were fragmented. This
WGA is deposited at NCBI with the accession number GCA_003016355. The raw
reads are deposited in the Bioproject PRJNA437375.

The repeat content (Supplementary table S3) was 51 % of the total genome
(656,355,643 bp, after excluding ambiguous bases, Ns), which is close to the 46 %
repeat content in foxtail millet (*Setaria italica* (L.) P. Beauv) (Zhang *et al.*, 2012). We
found a large number of *Gypsy* and *Copia* LTRs, which represent 24 % and 9.5 % of
the total genome excluding Ns. These transposons and proportions are also very
similar to those observed in foxtail millet. We compared the divergence between the
flanking tails in the LTRs (Supplementary figure S2) and identified a single very recent
burst of LTR *Gypsy* activity around 0.6 MYA (Kimura = 0.042 ± 0.026) and of LTR
Copia also around 0.6 MYA (Kimura = 0.041 ± 0.027). Other repeat elements,
including LINEs (Long Interspersed Nuclear Elements), simple repeat patterns of the
sequence, satellites, and transposons were much less common, except for En/Spm
DNA transposons observed in 4.2 % of the genome.

We annotated 42,232 coding genes, which included 42,359 predictive open reading
frames (ORFs), as well as 875 non-coding genes without a predicted ORF
(Supplementary file 2). Together these transcripts and non-coding genes define
43,234 targets for the expression analysis. 35,982 of the coding transcripts had a
homologous protein in the NCBI non-redundant (*nr*) database. In 58% of the cases,
the top hit was a *S. italica* sequence (Supplementary figure S3). Among those 35,982,

33,963 were functionally annotated with at least one GO term, and 39,488 had an
InterPro annotation. We also identified the best reciprocal hits with *Arabidopsis*
thaliana, rice, *Panicum halli* Vasey, foxtail millet, and *Setaria viridis* (L.) Beauv; and
the top homologous protein in Uniprot (Supplementary file 3). We aligned the
transcripts and proteins from five sequenced species in the subfamily Panicoideae,
foxtail millet, *S. viridis*, maize, *P. halli* and switchgrass (*P. virgatum* L.) on the WGA,
and found that on average 78 % and 72 % of the transcripts and proteins aligned with
an identity over 0.7, respectively (Supplementary table S4).

334
335

Comparative genomics with related grasses

We could assign 35,831 *Brachiaria* proteins to an eggNOG orthologous group (Powell
et al., 2014), and 13,570 proteins could be further annotated with GO terms from the
eggNOG database. We also assigned the proteins from other species in the Poaceae
family to these eggNOG orthologous groups for Poaceae (poaVIR) in the eggNOG
database in order to identify shared clusters of proteins among these species
(Supplementary file 4; Supplementary figure S4). More than 70 % of the clusters of
proteins had double or triple the number of proteins in switchgrass than the other
species because of relatively recent whole-genome duplication events
(Supplementary table S5). Approximately 20 % of the clusters in maize and *B.*
ruziziensis had two proteins. From this analysis, we also estimated that there are
approximately two thousand proteins in other close species that were missed in our
Brachiaria assembly.

We estimated the divergence between these species based on the Kimura divergence
values between pairs of orthologous proteins in 6,450 clusters of proteins that included
only one member from each species (*P. virgatum* was excluded from this analysis;
Supplementary figure S5). By assuming an average substitution rate of two-times
(diploid) 1.3×10^{-8} (Schmutz *et al.*, 2014), we estimated that *Brachiaria* diverged from
the other Paniceae genera, *Setaria* and *Panicum*, around 13.4-15.5 million years ago
(MYA), while the split of the Paniceae and Andropogonodae tribes of subfamily
Panicoideae took place around 23.8-26.3 MYA (Supplementary figure S6).

The 23,076 scaffolds in the WGS longer than 10 Kbp or with at least one annotated

gene (533.9 Mbp) were aligned with the nine chromosomes of foxtail millet, the closest

relative with a high quality sequenced genome (Zhang *et al.*, 2012). Up to 21,145 of

the 23,076 scaffolds (91.6 %), which comprise 525.1 Mbp, could be aligned (Figure 3;

Supplementary file S5). Furthermore, we assigned chromosomal positions to 41,847

coding genes (41,974 transcripts) contained in these anchored sequences

(Supplementary file S6). We identified 59 synteny blocks, 36 of which were longer than

1 Mbp in both species (Figure 3). There were three large translocations when

comparing the foxtail millet and *B. ruziziensis* genomes between chromosomes 1 and

7, 2 and 6, as well as 3 and 5. Four inversions (smaller than the translocations) were

identified between tails in chromosomes 1 and 4 (both ends), 2 and 9 (proximal end),

and 2 and 3 (proximal end).

QTL mapping in the interspecific *B. ruziziensis* X *B. decumbens* population

Between 78.8 and 91.5 % of the Genotyping-by-sequencing (GBS) reads from each

169 interspecific progeny and the parents could be aligned in the assembly. After

filtering, there were an average of 81,831 SNPs and 15,595 indel sites per sample. In

total, 799,155 polymorphic sites were called in the population, 85.7 % of these sites

were SNPs. After filtering, 15,074 SNP sites were homozygous in the female parent

(*B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02) and heterozygous in the male parent (*B. decumbens* CIAT

606) (annotated as nnxnp markers in Joinmap), 4,891 sites were heterozygous in only

the female parent (lmxll), and 1,652 were heterozygous in both parents (hkxhk). We

classified 4,817 nnxnp and 1,252 lmxll sites as single dose alleles (SDAs, or "simplex"

markers) based on their 1:1 heterozygous/homozygous segregation ratio in the

progeny and used them in the genetic map construction. We used in our analysis the

genetic map of the male parent (*B. decumbens* CIAT 606), which included 4,427

markers placed in 18 linkage groups (Supplementary figure S7, Supplementary file 7).

This corresponds with the number of base chromosomes expected in an allotetraploid

(2n = 4x = 36) *Brachiaria* population. Linkage groups had an average length of 74.7 ±

22.7 cM. Using the same raw data, a join genetic map of both parents and composed

of 36 linkage groups was generated in Worthington *et al.* (2016). Two linkage groups

were assigned to each the nine base chromosomes of *B. ruziziensis* based on

alignments of each SNP to the WGA and named following the numbering system used

for foxtail millet. We also aligned the WGA scaffolds with the genetic map to compare

the co-linearity between the position of each marker in the genetic map and genome

assembly (Supplementary file S7).

QTL mapping was performed to identify genetic regions associated with root length

(RL), biomass (RB) and root tip diameter (RD) under control and Al^{3+} stress conditions

in the interspecific mapping population. Three hundred and seventy-one markers had

an LOD over 3 associated with one or more of the traits. Two hundred and twelve

WGS scaffolds contained at least one marker with LOD over 3 (Supplementary file 7).

Three significant QTL were identified (Figure 4). The first QTL, which peaked at 5.22,

12.65, 25.797 and 26.027 cM and extended from 5.22 to 32.481 cM on LG 1 (Chr 8),

was associated with root length and biomass under control and Al^{3+} stress conditions

but not with relative root length or relative root biomass. The second QTL, which

peaked at 79.738 and 96.802 cM and extended from 79.738 to 98.851 cM on LG 3

(Chr 7) was associated with relative root length, root tip diameter under Al^{3+} stress

conditions, and relative root tip diameter. The last QTL extended from 49.12 to 62.127

cM (peak at 50.423 cM) on LG 4 (Chr 3) and was only associated with relative root tip

diameter. These three QTLs each explained from 12.8 % to 16.1% of the phenotypic

variance for the associated traits (Supplementary table S6).

Transcriptional differences during stress between *Brachiaria* species

We performed RNA-seq from stem and root tissue samples extracted from *B.*

decumbens CIAT 606 and *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02 after growing for three days in

control (0 μM $AlCl_3$) or high (200 μM $AlCl^3$) aluminium cation concentration hydroponic

solutions. When the normalised counts for all the genes were used to cluster the

samples, these clusters firstly grouped by tissue, secondly by genotype, and thirdly by

treatment (Supplementary figure S8). There were 4,481 differentially expressed (DE)

genes in total, with 3,996 of these differentially regulated in a single genotype and

tissue (Figure 5). Among these 4,481 DE genes, 4,162 genes were DE in roots only,

265 in stems only, and 54 in both tissues.

The three QTL regions contained 918 genes; 581 in LG1, 153 in LG3, and 184 in LG4.
Of these 918, 84 were DE genes (Supplementary file 8). Twenty-seven DE genes
were annotated as membrane components, 21 were annotated as involved in
response to hormones or biotic/abiotic stress, and 23 were annotated as binding to
different molecular compounds, including ATP/ADP/GTP, metal ions and DNA. 34 of
the 87 genes were not annotated with one of these previous GO terms, but several
were annotated with several GO terms.

An enrichment analysis of GO terms over-represented among DE genes in each
species allowed us to identify the biological processes (BP) and molecular functions
(MF) that are similarly or differently regulated among them. After annotating the genes
with the full set of GO terms (Supplementary figure S9 and S10), we also simplified
the results to "GO slim" terms, contain the subset of higher-level terms from the GO
resource (Figure 6; Supplementary Table S7). For the enrichment analysis we
considered the either up-regulated or down-regulated genes in each sample. There
was limited overlap among GO terms based on the DE genes included in each term
(Supplementary figure S11).

Five MF terms related to RNA/mRNA/rRNA binding with the ribosome (MF:3723,
3729, 19843; and 3735 and 5198) and two BP terms, "translation" and
"ribonucleoprotein complex assembly" (BP: 6412, 22618), were significantly enriched
among down-regulated during stress genes in *B. ruziziensis* (146 genes) and *B.*
decumbens (39 genes).

Genes annotated as "transmembrane transporters" (MF:22857) were highly over-
represented among up-regulated during stress DE genes (44 in *B. decumbens* and 70
in *B. ruziziensis*). Fifteen DE transmembrane transporters were common to both
species, and five were annotated as induced by aluminium and are later discussed.

Several GO terms showed contrasting regulation between both species. E.g. "Cell wall
organization and biogenesis" was enriched in both species and included 51 down-
regulated DE genes in *B. ruziziensis*, but 17 up-regulated DE genes in *B. decumbens*.
Most of these genes were peroxidases and expansin proteins induced by various plant
hormones (e.g. ethylene, GA, auxin) and involved in toxin removal during oxidative

stress (Kochian *et al.*, 2015). The GO term "glycosyl hydrolase" was also enriched
among down-regulated genes in *B. ruziziensis* (39 genes), but among up-regulated
genes in *B. decumbens* (18 genes). Most of the genes annotated as "Glycosyl
hydrolases" were also annotated as involved in the "carbohydrate metabolism"
(BP:5975).
467
468 Several of the DE genes that exhibited high fold-changes in both species were
469 involved in phospholipid, phosphate, magnesium, auxin, nitrate and miRNA transport
470 in the cell (Genes 6944G2, 12087G2, 8068G4, 26018G2, 4534G2, 2708G4).
471
By reanalysing the data from Salgado *et al*. 2017, we could also compare the enriched
GO terms between *B. decumbens* cv. Basilisk exposed to 200 µM AlCl$_3$ for 8 hours
and 72 hours (Supplementary Figure S12 and Supplementary Table S7). This
comparison evidenced differences between 8 hours and 72 hours in the same
genotype in GO terms related to RNA translation and response to stress (BP:6950),
among others.
478
479
480   **DISCUSSION**
481
482 **Forward genetics and newly produced genomic resources to identify candidate**
483 **loci for abiotic stress tolerance**
484
The negative effects of soil acidity on crop production are associated with different
mineral toxicities and deficiencies. Aluminium cation toxicity has long been established
to be the single most important limiting factor of acidic soil productivity (Eswaran *et al.*,
1997). All *Brachiaria* species show some tolerance to Al^{3+} toxicity, particularly
compared with other grasses such as wheat, rice and maize (Arroyave *et al.*, 2013;
Kochian *et al.*, 2015). While most crops reduce root growth to 50 % when exposed to
5 µM Al^{3+}, *Brachiaria* species need to be exposed to up to 35 µM to exhibit a reduced
root growth of 25 % (Poschenrieder *et al.*, 2008).
493
Natural adaptation to acid soils can be measured by estimating root vigour in low pH
conditions and tolerance to high concentrations of Al^{3+} (Wenzl *et al.*, 2006). In our

experiment, *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 (cv. Basilisk) root morphology was less affected
than *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02 after growing for 20 days in control and high 200 μM
Al^{3+} concentration hydroponic solutions. As a comparison, in a 21-day long term study
using a similar experimental protocol, four *B. decumbens* and four *B. ruziziensis*
genotypes showed intermediate tolerance of Al^{3+}, one *B. ruzizensis* genotype was
sensitive, and only the *B. decumbens* cultivar Basilisk was unaffected by high Al^{3+}
(Bitencourt *et al.*, 2011). Interestingly, Furlan *et al.* (2018) recently reported a higher
Al^{3+} tolerance in *B. brizantha* cv. Xaraes than in *B. decumbens* cv. Basilisk.

The three QTLs we identified were of moderate effect (LOD scores under 6, each
accounting 12.8 % to 16.1% of observed phenotypic variance), but were observed for
several root traits. DE genes in the QTLs highlighted a link with membrane transport
(including metal ions), regulation and signalling (binding to DNA), and energy
(carbohydrate metabolism and binding to ATP/ADP/GTP) molecular mechanisms in
the three QTLs. The three QTLs were associated with similar molecular functions.
Eight genes in the QTL were DE in both species, including two metal-binding
transmembrane P450 cytochromes (8440G2 and 598G8), one root-exclusive
potassium ion membrane transporter (94G8) induced by potassium starvation
(Banuelos *et al.*, 2002), a cysteine XCP1 protease (869G16) that may have a
developmental senescence specific cell death function during apoptosis and heavy
metal detoxification (De Michele *et al.*, 2009), and a protein (8234G4) not found in
other related species.

We are also making publicly available the genome assembly and gene annotation of
a diploid accession of *B. ruziziensis*. This diploid accession collected in Burundi is
likely the genotype that was mutagenised with colchicine to produce CIAT BRX 44-02,
the autotetraploid *B. ruziziensis* progenitor of the interspecific population analysed in
this study. Our transcriptomic study and comparative genomics analysis are examples
of its utility. While tetraploid *Brachiaria* are the main accessions used for breeding, we
opted for a non-polyploid diploid accession because *Brachiaria* grasses are
heterozygous outcrossing species.

The assembly was partially scaffolded to the pseudomolecule level using a genetic
linkage map of *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 containing approximately 5,000 markers. This

genetic map had previously been assembled without a genome (Worthington *et al.*,
2016), but a higher number of markers were incorporated by conducting SNP calling
using this new reference. The incorporation of long reads could improve this assembly
and allow for polyploid *Brachiaria* genome references in the near future. Because of
the limited number of markers, almost all the scaffolds were also placed on the high-
quality foxtail millet genome. While we identified three large chromosomal
translocations, there was a very high collinearity between the two species as
previously observed (Worthington *et al.*, 2016) and as might be predicted from species
that we quantified diverged "only" 13-15 MYA.

Differentially expressed genes associated with internal tolerance mechanisms
to Al^{3+} in *Brachiaria*

Aluminium internal tolerance mechanisms involve either modification of the properties
of the root cell wall, or the uptake and sequestration of Al^{3+} once it enters the plant
(Kochian *et al.*, 2015). Ramos *et al.* (2012) observed that *B. decumbens* accumulated
Al^{3+} in the mucilage layer of root apices, which reduced the quantity of Al^{3+} reaching
the cell wall and crossing the plasma membrane. Arroyave *et al.* (2013) suggested
that the presence of a complex exodermis in *B. decumbens*, absent in *B. ruziziensis*,
may contribute to a more efficient exclusion of Al^{3+}. On the other hand, a higher
concentration of root pectin measured in *B. ruziziensis* during stress could evidence
increased apoplastic aluminium binding (Horst *et al.*, 2010).

Changes in the structural properties of cell wall carbohydrates are mediated by
expansins, endo-β-1,4-glucanases, xyloglucan transferases and hydrolases (XTH)
(e.g. AtXTH31 and AtXTH15) and pectin methylesterases (Kochian *et al.*, 2015; Yang
et al., 2011). Contrasting regulation (Up-regulated in one species but down-regulated
in the other) in enriched GO terms between *B. decumbens* and *B. ruziziensis,*
suggests different regulation of genes associated with xyloglucan transfer
(GO:16762), glycosyl hydrolase (MF:16798) and oxidation (GO:52716). This
contrasting enrichment was largely due to 12 XTH proteins that were down-regulated
during stress in *B. ruziziensis*, but not in *B. decumbens*. One of them (5400G2) was
located in the QTL region on LG1 (Chr 8). There were three additional differentially

expressed XTH proteins that were up-regulated during stress: 5233G2 (AtXTH23) only in *B. decumbens*, and 6544G2 (AtXTH32) and 11683G4 (AtXTH27) in both *B. decumbens* and *B. ruziziensis*. Related to this, AtSLK2 is involved in cell wall pectin methylesterification in response to Al^{3+} stress (Geng *et al.*, 2017). The *Brachiaria* homologous gene to SLK2 (1984G2) was up-regulated in both *B. ruziziensis* and *B. decumbens*, but only DE under stress in *B. decumbens*.

Once Al^{3+} has entered the root, the uptake and sequestration of Al^{3+} includes molecular binding and eventually compartmentation of the toxin. ALS (Aluminium Sensitive) transporters and NRAM metal ion transporters have been proposed as the key proteins in Al^{3+} localization to the tonoplast and other cell organelles, and away from the sensitive root tips in *A. thaliana* and rice (Huang *et al.*, 2010; Huang *et al.*, 2012; Larsen *et al.*, 2007). Specifically, an NRAM aluminium transporter (NRAT1) localized in the plasma membrane appears to be expressly involved in storing Al^{3+} in root vacuoles in rice and maize. In *Brachiaria*, we identified 21 NRAM proteins, but only three of them were DE: the homologous gene (2499G8) to OsTITANIA (AtOBE3/ATT1), which is the transcription factor that functions as a regulator of NRAM and other metal transporter genes (Tanaka *et al.*, 2018) and two of the three *Brachiaria* proteins showing close homology to NRAT1 (3672G6 and 30107G2). These were significantly up-regulated in both *B. decumbens* and *B. ruziziensis* during stress. Eight genes in the *Brachiaria* genome are homologous to ALS1 and annotated as aluminium-induced ABC transporters, but only one gene (3096G6) was up-regulated during stress in *B. ruziziensis.*

In rice, the complex formed by STAR1 and STAR2/AtALS3 (Sensitive To Aluminium Rhizotoxicity) is involved in aluminium-induced alterations of the cell wall composition related to less aluminium-binding in the apoplast (Huang *et al.*, 2010; Huang *et al.*, 2009). These ABC transporters appear to mediate the efflux of UDP-glucose into the cell wall, which could alter the cell wall composition and lead to a reduction in Al-binding capacity (Kochian *et al.*, 2015). Fifteen proteins were homologous to STAR/ALS in *Brachiaria*, but only two were DE: gene 8448G4 homologous to OsSTAR1, and gene 7361G2 homologous to OsSTAR2. STAR1 and STAR2 were up-regulated in both *B. ruziziensis* and *B. decumbens* during stress.

Differentially expressed genes associated with external tolerance mechanisms to Al^{3+} in *Brachiaria*

Most aluminium tolerant crops additionally rely on external restriction to prevent the uptake of aluminium and its entry into the root cells through the release of anionic organic acids in the rhizosphere that chelate the Al^{3+} (Kochian *et al.*, 2015; Rao *et al.*, 2016). However, *Brachiaria* appears to not rely on secreted organic acids since there was no difference in secreted organic acids between *Brachiaria* species (Arroyave *et al.*, 2013; Wenzl *et al.*, 2001). The lack of correlation between exudation and resistance has also been observed in rice (Famoso *et al.*, 2010; Ma *et al.*, 2002). Furthermore, tolerant *B. decumbens* accessions secreted 3-30 times less organic acids than sensitive species such as maize and wheat (Arroyave *et al.*, 2018; Wenzl *et al.*, 2001). However, while *B. decumbens* citrate exudation was about 200 times lower than that observed in aluminium-tolerant rice, the same study evidenced high oxalate exudation in *B. decumbens* roots, but only between 24 and 36 hours after exposure to the toxic concentration (Arroyave *et al.*, 2018). It appears that other mechanisms of resistance overshadow the impact of root exudation.

Two families of membrane transporters, aluminium-activated malate transporter (ALMT) and the multidrug and toxic compound extrusion (MATE) family, are responsible for plasma membrane malate and citrate efflux, respectively (Guimaraes *et al.*, 2014; Raman *et al.*, 2005; Rao *et al.*, 2016). Citrate is a much stronger chelating agent for Al^{3+} than malate (Ma, 2000). In *Brachiaria*, we identified three citrate MATE proteins, which were homologous to FRDL (Ferric Reductase Defective Like) proteins and up-regulated with large fold-changes in *B. decumbens* only (61G2), or in both species (259G14 and 675G12). In rice, FRDL4 is responsible for aluminium-induced citrate efflux required for external detoxification (Yokosho *et al.*, 2011).

We identified thirteen aluminium-activated malate transporters (AMLTs) in the genome. However, only two were differentially expressed: 11634G4 was up-regulated 4.74 fold-change during stress in *B. decumbens*, and 462G24 was down-regulated 2.35 fold-change in *B. ruziziensis*. We identified a cluster with three contiguous non-DE AMLTs (5136G2, 5136G4 and 5136G6) in scaffold 5136 (LG3 (Chr. 7): 71.83-

72.95 cM) around 10 cM from the QTL. This is consistent with the observation that

copy-number variation of ALMT correlated with aluminium resistance in rye and maize

(Collins *et al.*, 2008; Maron *et al.*, 2013).

C_2H_2-type zinc-finger transcription factors STOP1 (ART1 in rice) and STOP2 regulate

aluminium-induced expression of several MATE and ALMT genes in Arabidopsis and

rice (Iuchi *et al.*, 2007; Kobayashi *et al.*, 2014; Yamaji *et al.*, 2009). We identified three

transcription factors homologous to AtSTOP1, one DE in *B. ruziziensis* (29G2) and

another two (3833G12 and 243G34) which were not. We also identified two

transcription factors homologous to AtSTOP2, both DE with high fold-change in *B.*

ruziziensis and *B. decumbens* (126G26 and 1615G2). All five were homologous to

OsART1, the STOP1 homolog in rice, which up-regulated at least 31 genes in an Al-

dependent manner, including STAR1, FRDL, NRAMP proteins (Kochian *et al.*, 2015;

Yamaji *et al.*, 2009).

The "transmembrane transporters" GO term (MF:22857) were highly overrepresented

among up-regulated DE genes during stress in both species (44 genes in *B.*

decumbens and 70 genes in *B. ruziziensis*). Fifteen transmembrane transporters were

DE in both species, and five were annotated as induced by aluminium: NRAT1

(3672G6), STAR1 (8448G4), ALS3 (7361G2) and two citrate MATE transporter

(675G12 and 259G14). All these have been highlighted in our discussion, up-

regulated with high fold-changes in both species, and likely indispensable genes for

aluminium-tolerance in *Brachiaria*.

In this work we have presented a comprehensive analysis of the molecular mechanism

linked to aluminium tolerance in *Brachiaria* species. By assembling and annotating a

diploid genotype of *B. ruziziensis* we have developed the capability for genomic-based

studies of desirable phenotypic traits. Using this resource, we have identified three

QTLs associated to root architecture and vigour during Al^{3+} stress in a hybrid

population from a high and low tolerant accession. We have also identified a number

of genes and molecular responses that impact on different aspects of signalling, cell-

wall composition and active transports as response to aluminium stress. *Brachiaria*

tolerance appears to build in the same genes than in rice. However, we found that

external mechanisms such sequestration of Al^{3+} common in other grasses might be

not that important in *Brachiaria.* Also, contrasting regulation in the same genotype after

8 or 72 hours of Al^{3+} stress of numerous genes involved in RNA translation can explain

the different levels of tolerance among different Brachiaria species. The newly

annotated draft genome represents an important base upon which study other aspects

of *Brachiaria* biology.

672   **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

673   This work was partially funded by a BBSRC's Global Challenge Research Fund

674   BB/P028098/1 and a BBSRC's Newton Fund Postdoctoral Twinning Award

675   BBS/OS/NW/000011.

677   **DATA AVAILABILITY**

Raw reads are deposited in SRA under accession PRJNA437375. The genome

assembly is deposit at NCBI with accession GCA_003016355.1; The genome

assembly, chromosomal anchoring in AGP format, and gene annotation in GFF3

format can also be downloaded as individual files

(http://dx.doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3703092). Individual scaffolds can be accessed at

NCBI's GenBank accession numbers PVZT01000001 to PVZT01102577.

REFERENCES

Alexa A, Rahnenfuhrer J. 2019. topGO: enrichment analysis for gene ontology. R package version **2.37.0**.

Arroyave C, Barceló J, Poschenrieder C, Tolrà R. 2011. Aluminium-induced changes in root epidermal cell patterning, a distinctive feature of hyperresistance to Al in *Brachiaria decumbens*. Journal of Inorganic Biochemistry **105**, 1477-1483.

Arroyave C, Tolrà R, Chaves L, de Souza MC, Barceló J, Poschenrieder C. 2018. A proteomic approach to the mechanisms underlying activation of aluminium resistance in roots of Urochloa decumbens. Journal of Inorganic Biochemistry **181**, 145-151.

Arroyave C, Tolrà R, Thuy T, Barceló J, Poschenrieder C. 2013. Differential aluminum resistance in *Brachiaria* species. Environmental and Experimental Botany **89**, 11-18.

Bailey-Serres J, Parker JE, Ainsworth EA, Oldroyd GE, Schroeder JI. 2019. Genetic strategies for improving crop yields. Nature **575**, 109-118.

Banuelos MA, Garciadeblas B, Cubero B, Rodrıguez-Navarro A. 2002. Inventory and functional characterization of the HAK potassium transporters of rice. Plant Physiology **130**, 784-795.

Bitencourt GdA, Chiari L, Laura VA, Valle CBd, Jank L, Moro JR. 2011. Aluminum tolerance on genotypes of signal grass. Revista Brasileira de Zootecnia **40**, 245-250.

Cabanettes F, Klopp C. 2018. D-GENIES: dot plot large genomes in an interactive, efficient and simple way. PeerJ **6**, e4958.

Collins N, Shirley N, Saeed M, Pallotta M, Gustafson J. 2008. An ALMT1 gene cluster controlling aluminum tolerance at the Alt4 locus of rye (*Secale cereale* L.). Genetics **179**, 669-682.

Conesa A, Götz S, García-Gómez JM, Terol J, Talón M, Robles M. 2005. Blast2GO: a universal tool for annotation, visualization and analysis in functional genomics research. Bioinformatics **21**, 3674-3676.

De Michele R, Vurro E, Rigo C, Costa A, Elviri L, Di Valentin M, Careri M, Zottini M, di Toppi LS, Schiavo FL. 2009. Nitric oxide is involved in cadmium-induced programmed cell death in *Arabidopsis* suspension cultures. Plant Physiology **150**, 217-228.

De Vega JJ, Ayling S, Hegarty M, Kudrna D, Goicoechea JL, Ergon Å, Rognli

OA, Jones C, Swain M, Geurts R. 2015. Red clover (*Trifolium pratense* L.) draft

genome provides a platform for trait improvement. Scientific reports **5**, 17394.

Dobin A, Davis CA, Schlesinger F, Drenkow J, Zaleski C, Jha S, Batut P,

Chaisson M, Gingeras TR. 2013. STAR: ultrafast universal RNA-seq aligner.

Bioinformatics **29**, 15-21.

Edgar RC. 2004. MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and

high throughput. Nucleic acids research **32**, 1792-1797.

Ellinghaus D, Kurtz S, Willhoeft U. 2008. LTRharvest, an efficient and flexible

software for de novo detection of LTR retrotransposons. BMC Bioinformatics **9**, 18.

English AC, Richards S, Han Y, Wang M, Vee V, Qu J, Qin X, Muzny DM, Reid

JG, Worley KC. 2012. Mind the gap: upgrading genomes with Pacific Biosciences

RS long-read sequencing technology. PloS One **7**, e47768.

Eswaran H, Reich P, Beinroth F. 1997. Global distribution of soils with acidity. In:

Monis AC *et al.*, eds. Plant-Soil interactions at low pH, 159-164.

Famoso AN, Clark RT, Shaff JE, Craft E, McCouch SR, Kochian LV. 2010.

Development of a novel aluminum tolerance phenotyping platform used for

comparisons of cereal aluminum tolerance and investigations into rice aluminum

tolerance mechanisms. Plant Physiology **153**, 1678-1691.

Furlan F, Borgo L, Rabêlo FHS, Rossi ML, Martinelli AP, Azevedo RA, Lavres J.

2018. Aluminum-induced stress differently modifies *Urochloa* genotypes responses

on growth and regrowth: root-to-shoot Al-translocation and oxidative stress.

Theoretical and Experimental Plant Physiology **30**, 141-152.

Geng X, Horst WJ, Golz JF, Lee JE, Ding Z, Yang ZB. 2017. *LEUNIG_HOMOLOG*

transcriptional co-repressor mediates aluminium sensitivity through *PECTIN*

METHYLESTERASE 46-modulated root cell wall pectin methylesterification in

Arabidopsis. The Plant Journal **90**, 491-504.

Grabherr MG, Haas BJ, Yassour M, Levin JZ, Thompson DA, Amit I, Adiconis

X, Fan L, Raychowdhury R, Zeng Q. 2011. Full-length transcriptome assembly

from RNA-Seq data without a reference genome. Nature Biotechnology **29**, 644.

Guimaraes CT, Simoes CC, Pastina MM, Maron LG, Magalhaes JV,

Vasconcellos RC, Guimaraes LJ, Lana UG, Tinoco CF, Noda RW. 2014. Genetic

dissection of Al tolerance QTLs in the maize genome by high density SNP scan.

BMC Genomics **15**, 153.

Hede A, Skovmand B, Lopez Cesati J. 2001. Acid soils and aluminum toxicity.

Application of Physiology in Wheat Breeding. CIS-3160, CIMMYT.

Horst WJ, Wang Y, Eticha D. 2010. The role of the root apoplast in aluminium-

induced inhibition of root elongation and in aluminium resistance of plants: a review.

Annals of Botany **106**, 185-197.

Huang C-F, Yamaji N, Ma JF. 2010. Knockout of a bacterial-type ATP-binding

cassette transporter gene, AtSTAR1, results in increased aluminum sensitivity in

Arabidopsis. Plant Physiology **153**, 1669-1677.

Huang CF, Yamaji N, Chen Z, Ma JF. 2012. A tonoplast-localized half-size ABC

transporter is required for internal detoxification of aluminum in rice. The Plant

Journal **69**, 857-867.

Huang CF, Yamaji N, Mitani N, Yano M, Nagamura Y, Ma JF. 2009. A bacterial-

type ABC transporter is involved in aluminum tolerance in rice. The Plant Cell **21**,

655-667.

Huerta-Cepas J, Forslund K, Coelho LP, Szklarczyk D, Jensen LJ, von Mering

C, Bork P. 2017. Fast genome-wide functional annotation through orthology

assignment by eggNOG-mapper. Molecular Biology and Evolution **34**, 2115-2122.

Iuchi S, Koyama H, Iuchi A, Kobayashi Y, Kitabayashi S, Kobayashi Y, Ikka T,

Hirayama T, Shinozaki K, Kobayashi M. 2007. Zinc finger protein STOP1 is critical

for proton tolerance in *Arabidopsis* and coregulates a key gene in aluminum

tolerance. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences **104**, 9900-9905.

Johnson JP, Carver BF, Baligar V. 1997. Expression of aluminum tolerance

transferred from Atlas 66 to hard winter wheat. Crop Science **37**, 103-108.

Kajitani R, Toshimoto K, Noguchi H, Toyoda A, Ogura Y, Okuno M, Yabana M,

Harada M, Nagayasu E, Maruyama H. 2014. Efficient *de novo* assembly of highly

heterozygous genomes from whole-genome shotgun short reads. Genome research

24, 1384-1395.

Kobayashi Y, Ohyama Y, Kobayashi Y, Ito H, Iuchi S, Fujita M, Zhao C-R,

Tanveer T, Ganesan M, Kobayashi M. 2014. STOP2 activates transcription of

several genes for Al-and low pH-tolerance that are regulated by STOP1 in

Arabidopsis. Molecular Plant **7**, 311-322.

Kochian LV, Piñeros MA, Liu J, Magalhaes JV. 2015. Plant adaptation to acid

soils: the molecular basis for crop aluminum resistance. Annual Review of Plant

Biology **66**, 571-598.

Larsen PB, Cancel J, Rounds M, Ochoa V. 2007. *Arabidopsis* ALS1 encodes a

root tip and stele localized half type ABC transporter required for root growth in an

aluminum toxic environment. Planta **225**, 1447.

Leggett RM, Clavijo BJ, Clissold L, Clark MD, Caccamo M. 2013a. NextClip: an

analysis and read preparation tool for Nextera Long Mate Pair libraries.

Bioinformatics **30**, 566-568.

Leggett RM, Ramirez-Gonzalez RH, Clavijo B, Waite D, Davey RP. 2013b.

Sequencing quality assessment tools to enable data-driven informatics for high

throughput genomics. Frontiers in Genetics **4**, 288.

Li H. 2013. Aligning sequence reads, clone sequences and assembly contigs with

BWA-MEM. arXiv preprint:1303.3997.

Li H. 2016. Minimap and miniasm: fast mapping and de novo assembly for noisy

long sequences. Bioinformatics **32**, 2103-2110.

Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and

dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome biology **15**, 550.

Ma JF. 2000. Role of organic acids in detoxification of aluminum in higher plants.

Plant and Cell Physiology **41**, 383-390.

Ma JF, Shen R, Zhao Z, Wissuwa M, Takeuchi Y, Ebitani T, Yano M. 2002.

Response of rice to Al stress and identification of quantitative trait loci for Al

tolerance. Plant and Cell Physiology **43**, 652-659.

Mapleson D, Garcia Accinelli G, Kettleborough G, Wright J, Clavijo BJ. 2016.

KAT: a K-mer analysis toolkit to quality control NGS datasets and genome

assemblies. Bioinformatics **33**, 574-576.

Maron LG, Guimarães CT, Kirst M, Albert PS, Birchler JA, Bradbury PJ,

Buckler ES, Coluccio AE, Danilova TV, Kudrna D. 2013. Aluminum tolerance in

maize is associated with higher MATE1 gene copy number. Proceedings of the

National Academy of Sciences **110**, 5241-5246.

Martin M. 2011. Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from high-throughput

sequencing reads. EMBnet Journal **17**, 10-12.

Melo JO, Lana UG, Piñeros MA, Alves VM, Guimarães CT, Liu J, Zheng Y,

Zhong S, Fei Z, Maron LG. 2013. Incomplete transfer of accessory loci influencing

SbMATE expression underlies genetic background effects for aluminum tolerance in

sorghum. The Plant Journal **73**, 276-288.

Miles JW. 2007. Apomixis for cultivar development in tropical forage grasses. Crop

Science **47**, S-238-S-249.

Pertea M, Pertea GM, Antonescu CM, Chang T-C, Mendell JT, Salzberg SL.

2015. StringTie enables improved reconstruction of a transcriptome from RNA-seq

reads. Nature Biotechnology **33**, 290.

Pizarro EA, Hare MD, Mutimura M, Changjun B. 2013. *Brachiaria* hybrids:

potential, forage use and seed yield. Tropical Grasslands-Forrajes Tropicales **1**, 31-

35.

Poschenrieder C, Gunsé B, Corrales I, Barceló J. 2008. A glance into aluminum

toxicity and resistance in plants. Science of the Total Environment **400**, 356-368.

Powell S, Forslund K, Szklarczyk D, Trachana K, Roth A, Huerta-Cepas J,

Gabaldon T, Rattei T, Creevey C, Kuhn M. 2014. eggNOG v4. 0: nested orthology

inference across 3686 organisms. Nucleic Acids Research **42**, D231-D239.

Raman H, Zhang K, Cakir M, Appels R, Garvin DF, Maron LG, Kochian LV,

Moroni JS, Raman R, Imtiaz M. 2005. Molecular characterization and mapping of

ALMT1, the aluminium-tolerance gene of bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.).

Genome **48**, 781-791.

Rao IM, Miles JW, Beebe SE, Horst WJ. 2016. Root adaptations to soils with low

fertility and aluminium toxicity. Annals of Botany **118**, 593-605.

Roselló M, Poschenrieder C, Gunse B, Barceló J, Llugany M. 2015. Differential

activation of genes related to aluminium tolerance in two contrasting rice cultivars.

Journal of inorganic biochemistry **152**, 160-166.

Ryan PR, Raman H, Gupta S, Horst WJ, Delhaize E. 2009. A second mechanism

for aluminum resistance in wheat relies on the constitutive efflux of citrate from roots.

Plant Physiology **149**, 340-351.

Salgado LR, Lima R, dos Santos BF, Shirakawa KT, de Almeida Vilela M,

Almeida NF, Pereira RM, Nepomuceno AL, Chiari L. 2017. *De novo* RNA

sequencing and analysis of the transcriptome of signalgrass (*Urochloa decumbens*)

roots exposed to aluminum. Plant Growth Regulation **83**, 157-170.

Schmutz J, McClean PE, Mamidi S, Wu GA, Cannon SB, Grimwood J, Jenkins

J, Shu S, Song Q, Chavarro C. 2014. A reference genome for common bean and

genome-wide analysis of dual domestications. Nature Genetics **46**, 707.

Simão FA, Waterhouse RM, Ioannidis P, Kriventseva EV, Zdobnov EM. 2015.

BUSCO: assessing genome assembly and annotation completeness with single-

copy orthologs. Bioinformatics **31**, 3210-3212.

Smit AF, Hubley R. 2008. RepeatModeler Open-1.0. Available from http://www.

repeatmasker. org.

Stanke M, Keller O, Gunduz I, Hayes A, Waack S, Morgenstern B. 2006.

AUGUSTUS: ab initio prediction of alternative transcripts. Nucleic Acids Research

34, W435-W439.

Tamura K, Stecher G, Peterson D, Filipski A, Kumar S. 2013. MEGA6: molecular

evolutionary genetics analysis version 6.0. Molecular Biology and Evolution **30**,

2725-2729.

Tanaka N, Uraguchi S, Kajikawa M, Saito A, Ohmori Y, Fujiwara T. 2018. A rice

PHD-finger protein OsTITANIA, is a growth regulator that functions through elevating

expression of transporter genes for multiple metals. The Plant Journal **96**, 997-1006.

Tang Y, Garvin DF, Kochian L, Sorrells M, Carver BF. 2002. Physiological

genetics of aluminum tolerance in the wheat cultivar Atlas 66. Crop Science **42**,

1541-1546.

Tarailo-Graovac M, Chen N. 2009. Using RepeatMasker to identify repetitive

elements in genomic sequences. Current Protocols in Bioinformatics **25**, Chapter 4,

Unit 4.10.

Torkamaneh D, Laroche J, Bastien M, Abed A, Belzile F. 2017. Fast-GBS: a new

pipeline for the efficient and highly accurate calling of SNPs from genotyping-by-

sequencing data. BMC Bioinformatics **18**, 5.

Trapnell C, Roberts A, Goff L, Pertea G, Kim D, Kelley DR, Pimentel H, Salzberg

SL, Rinn JL, Pachter L. 2012. Differential gene and transcript expression analysis

of RNA-seq experiments with TopHat and Cufflinks. Nature Protocols **7**, 562.

Valle CBd, Savidan YH. 1996. Genetics, cytogenetics, and reproductive biology of

Brachiaria. In: Miles, John W; Maass, Brigitte L; Valle, Cacilda Borges do; Kumble,

Vrinda (eds.). Brachiaria: Biology, agronomy, and improvement. Centro Internacional

de Agricultura Tropical (CIAT), 147-163.

Van der Auwera GA, Carneiro MO, Hartl C, Poplin R, Del Angel G, Levy-

Moonshine A, Jordan T, Shakir K, Roazen D, Thibault J. 2013. From FastQ data

to high-confidence variant calls: the genome analysis toolkit best practices pipeline.

Current Protocols in Bioinformatics **43**, Chapter 11, Unit 11.10.

Van Ooijen J. 2011. Multipoint maximum likelihood mapping in a full-sib family of an

outbreeding species. Genetics Research **93**, 343-349.

Van Ooijen J, Kyazma B. 2009. MapQTL® 6, Software for the mapping of

quantitative trait in experiment populations of diploid species. Kyazma BV,

Wageningen.

Venturini L, Caim S, Kaithakottil GG, Mapleson DL, Swarbreck D. 2018.

Leveraging multiple transcriptome assembly methods for improved gene structure

annotation. GigaScience **7**, giy093.

Von Uexküll H, Mutert E. 1995. Global extent, development and economic impact

of acid soils. Plant and Soil **171**, 1-15.

Wenzl P, Arango A, Chaves AL, Buitrago ME, Patino GM, Miles J, Rao IM. 2006.

A greenhouse method to screen brachiariagrass genotypes for aluminum resistance

and root vigor. Crop Science **46**, 968-973.

Wenzl P, Patino GM, Chaves AL, Mayer JE, Rao IM. 2001. The high level of

aluminum resistance in signalgrass is not associated with known mechanisms of

external aluminum detoxification in root apices. Plant Physiology **125**, 1473-1484.

Wickham H, Chang W. 2008. ggplot2: An implementation of the Grammar of

Graphics. R package version 0.7, URL: http://CRAN. R-project. org/package=

ggplot2

Worthington M, Heffelfinger C, Bernal D, Quintero C, Zapata YP, Perez JG, De

Vega J, Miles J, Dellaporta S, Tohme J. 2016. A parthenogenesis gene candidate

and evidence for segmental allopolyploidy in apomictic *Brachiaria decumbens*.

Genetics **203**, 1117-1132.

Wu TD, Reeder J, Lawrence M, Becker G, Brauer MJ. 2016. GMAP and GSNAP

for genomic sequence alignment: enhancements to speed, accuracy, and

functionality. In: *Statistical Genomics*: Springer, 283-334.

Yamaji N, Huang CF, Nagao S, Yano M, Sato Y, Nagamura Y, Ma JF. 2009. A

zinc finger transcription factor ART1 regulates multiple genes implicated in aluminum

tolerance in rice. The Plant Cell **21**, 3339-3349.

Yang JL, Zhu XF, Peng YX, Zheng C, Li GX, Liu Y, Shi YZ, Zheng SJ. 2011. Cell

wall hemicellulose contributes significantly to aluminum adsorption and root growth

in *Arabidopsis*. Plant Physiology **155**, 1885-1892.

919 **Yokosho K, Yamaji N, Ma JF**. 2011. An Al-inducible MATE gene is involved in

920 external detoxification of Al in rice. The Plant Journal **68**, 1061-1069.

921 **Zhang G, Liu X, Quan Z, Cheng S, Xu X, Pan S, Xie M, Zeng P, Yue Z, Wang W**.

922 2012. Genome sequence of foxtail millet (*Setaria italica*) provides insights into grass

923 evolution and biofuel potential. Nature Biotechnology **30**, 549.

925 **Table 1:** Statistics associated with the assembly of the *Brachiaria ruziziensis*
926 reference genome and anchored in pseudo-molecules.

	Whole genome assembly (WGA)	Pruned WGA*	Anchored assembly
Total length	732.5 Mbp	533.9 Mbp	525.1 Mbp
% Ns	10.6 %	11.7 %	12.18 %
Number sequences	102,579	23,076	7 pseudo-chrs
N50	27.8 Kbp	44.6 Kbp	55.9 Mbp
N20	76.1 Kbp	91.7 Kbp	62.7 Mbp
N80	3.9 Kbp	19.5 Kbp	44.1 Mbp

927 WGA deposited in NCBI, accession number GCA_003016355. Anchoring available in
928 AGP format, together with the raw reads, in the Bioproject PRJNA437375.
929 *Sequences without genes and under 10Kbp have been removed. Ns: Ambiguous
930 nucleotides.

931 **Table 2:** *Brachiaria* genes differentially expressed during Al^{3+} in *Brachiaria* highlighted in our analysis.

GeneID	Bruz	Bdec	Gene name	*P. halli*	*S. italica*	*S. viridis*	*A. thaliana*	Uniprot	Function and induction
29G2	0.71	0.17	STOP1	3G044400	7G287100	7G299300	AT1G34370	STOP1_ORYSJ	Zinc-finger Transcription factor involved in aluminium tolerance
61G2	0.88	0.23	Citrate transporter detoxification 42	9G552400	9G489200	9G493200	AT1G51340	DTX42_ARATH	Citrate transporter responsible for citrate exudation into the rhizosphere to protect roots from aluminium toxicity. Up-regulated by aluminium. Expressed in roots, but not in shoots.
94G8	7.68	2.36	P transmembrane transporter	7G133200	7G082600	7G090100	AT4G13420	HAK1_ORYSJ	**In the QTL.** Potassium transmembrane transported induced by P starvation exclusively in roots.
126G26	1.83	0.95	STOP1	6G306100	6G252000	6G256600	AT5G22890	STOP1_ORYSJ	Transcription factor involved in aluminium tolerance
259G14	2.36	1.43	Citrate transporter protein detox. 42	9G201000	9G204700	9G203100	AT1G51340	DTX42_ARATH	Citrate transporter responsible for citrate exudation into the rhizosphere to protect roots from aluminium toxicity. Up-regulated by aluminium. Expressed in roots, but not in shoots.
462G24	-2.35	0.38	AMLT10	4G147500	4G162600	4G130000	-	K3XVN8_SETIT	Aluminium-activated malate transporter 10-like
598G8	-0.97	-2.58	Cytochrome P450	7G003400	1G019400	1G019300	AT5G07990	C93G1_ORYS	**In the QTL.** Metal-binding transmembrane P450 cytochromes
675G12	4.27	3.89	Citrate transporter protein detox. 42	5G042400	9G489200	9G493200	AT1G51340	DTX42_ARATH	Citrate transporter responsible for citrate exudation into the rhizosphere to protect roots from aluminium toxicity. Up-regulated by aluminium. Expressed in roots, but not in shoots.
869G16	1.36	1.83	Cysteine XCP1 protease	2G435100	8G204200	8G213900	AT4G35350	XCP1_ARATH	**In the QTL.** A proteinase that may have a developmental senescence specific cell death function during apoptosis and metal detoxification
1615G2	2.69	1.29	STOP1	6G306100	6G252000	6G256600	AT5G22890	STOP1_ORYSJ	Zinc-finger Transcription factor involved in aluminium tolerance
1984G2	1.09	0.82	SLK2	4G345700	4G015400	4G015300	AT5G62090	SLK2_ARATH	DNA-binding adapter subunit of the SEU-SLK2 transcriptional corepressor of abiotic stress (e.g. salt and osmotic stress) response genes by facilitating auxin response and sustaining meristematic potential.
2499G8	1.18	-0.15	OsTITANIA/AtOBE3	9G552000	9G488800	9G492800	AT1G14740	TTA1_ORYSJ	Widely expressed transcription factor that functions as regulator of metal transporter genes responsible for essential metals delivery to shoots and normal plant growth. Required for the maintenance of metal transporter gene expression, such as IRT1, IRT2, ZIP1, ZIP9, NRAMP1 and NRAMP5.
2708G4	1.64	1.94	Auxin transport protein BIG	2G178200	2G154800	2G160200	AT3G02260	BIG_ORYSJ	Auxin-mediated developmental responses (e.g. cell elongation, apical dominance, lateral root production, inflorescence architecture, general growth and development).
3096G6	0.51	0.27	ALS1	9G083700	9G088000	9G086400	AT5G39040	AB25B_ORYSJ	Metal transporter involved in the sequestration of aluminium into vacuoles, which is required for cellular detoxification of aluminium. Induced by aluminium in roots. Expressed in primary roots and lateral roots.
3672G6	2.54	2.26	NRAT1	1G025100	1G098100	1G097200	AT1G80830	NRAT1_ORYSJ	Metal transporter Al3+, but not divalent cations Fe2+, Mg2+, Cd2+. Involved in Al tolerance by taking up Al in root cells, where it is detoxified by chelation with organic acid anions and sequestration into the vacuoles. Induced by aluminium in roots. Positively regulated by ART1.
4534G2	4.74	0.43	SAD2 importin beta-like transporter	7G101600	7G051600	7G057300	AT2G31660	SAD2_ARATH	Involved in the regulation of the abscisic acid (ABA)-mediated pathway in response to cold or salt stress, UV-B responses. Involved in trichome initiation. Negative regulator miRNA activity. Expressed in roots, epidermal and guard cells of leaves, stems and siliques
5233G2	1.07	1.18	XTH23	4G029300	4G246200	4G258800	AT4G25810	XTH23_ARATH	Xyloglucan endotransglucosylase hydrolase protein 23 cleaves and religates xyloglucan polymers, an essential constituent of the primary

GeneID	Bruz	Bdec	Annotation	P. halli	S. itallica	S. viridis	A. thaliana	Uniprot	Function and induction
									cell wall, and thereby participates in cell wall construction of growing tissues. Up-regulated by abscisic acid (ABA).
5400G2	-1.38	-0.05	XTH	8G197800	8G142000	8G151900	AT5G13870	XTH5_ARATH	Cleaves and religates xyloglucan polymers, an essential constituent of the primary cell wall, and thereby participates in cell wall construction of growing tissues. Strongly down regulated by abscisic acid. Root specific.
6544G2	-0.07	0.95	XTH32	2G372300	2G313800	2G324800	AT2G36870	XTH8_ORYSJ	Xyloglucan endotransglucosylase hydrolase protein 32 cleaves and religates xyloglucan polymers, an essential constituent of the primary cell wall, and thereby participates in cell wall construction of growing tissues. May be involved in cell elongation processes. Induced by gibberellic acid (GA3).
6944G2	1.92	2.01	Phospholipid transporting ATPase	4G247400	4G147300	4G165700	AT1G26130	ALA12_ARATH	Involved in transport of phospholipids.
7361G2	2.26	1.39	STAR2/ALS3	3G099200	3G043600	3G044400	AT2G37330	STAR2_ORYSJ	Associates with STAR2 to form a functional transmembrane ABC transporter required for detoxification of aluminium (Al) in roots. Can specifically transport UDP-glucose. Induced by Al in roots. Positively regulated by ART1. Root specific.
8068G4	2.77	2.12	Mg transporter MRS2-D	7G150800	7G099600	7G107500	AT3G19640	MRS2D_ORYSJ	Putative magnesium transporter.
8234G4	-1.40	-1.30	Uncharacterised	-	-	-	-	A0A3L6T2E7_PANMI	**In the QTL.** Uncharacterised protein.
8440G2	0.88	-1.68	Cytochrome P450	6G227500	2G094000	2G096800	AT4G36380	C90C1_ARATH	**In the QTL.** Metal-binding transmembrane P450 cytochromes
8448G4	0.59	1.26	STAR1	4G029500	4G246800	4G259400	AT1G67940	STAR1_ORYSJ	Associates with STAR2 to form a functional transmembrane ABC transporter required for detoxification of aluminium (Al) in roots. Can specifically transport UDP-glucose. Induced by Al in roots. Positively regulated by ART1. Root specific.
11634G4	0.04	4.75	AMLT1	7G143300	7G007400	7G102000	AT3G11680	ALMT8_ARATH	Malate transporter.
11683G4	1.00	0.66	XTH27	-	-	-	-	A0A1D6K9K3_ZM	Xyloglucan endotransglucosylase hydrolase protein 27 cleaves and religates xyloglucan polymers, an essential constituent of the primary cell wall, and thereby participates in cell wall construction of growing tissues.
12087G2	1.31	3.21	Phosphate transporter pho1-2	1G440700	1G360400	1G367100	AT3G23430	PHO12_ORYSJ	Involved in the transfer of inorganic phosphate (Pi) from roots to shoots. Not induced by Pi deficiency in roots. Specifically expressed in roots.
26018G2	1.08	0.98	transporter NRT1 nitrate transporter	9G390400	9G327900	9G333900	AT2G26690	PTR27_ARATH	Low-affinity proton-dependent nitrate transporter. Up-regulated in the shoots by nitrate, but no changes in the roots.
30107G2	3.24	3.02	NRAT1	2G074500	1G098100	1G097200	AT1G80830	NRAT1_ORYSJ	Metal transporter Al3+, but not divalent cations Fe2+, Mg2+, Cd2+. Involved in Al tolerance by taking up Al in root cells, where it is detoxified by chelation with organic acid anions and sequestration into the vacuoles. Induced by aluminium in roots. Positively regulated by ART1.

932 GeneID: Gene number in our reference genome. Bruz/Bdec: Differential expression fold-change values in *B. ruziziensis* and *B.*

933 *decumbens,* significant p-values under 0.05 are coloured. *P. halli/S. itallica/S. viridis/A. thaliana*: Top Blastp result in each of these

934 species. Uniprot and "Function and induction": Top Blastp result and associated annotation in the Uniprot database.

Figure 1: Root growth in *B. decumbens* accession CIAT 606 and *B. ruziziensis* accession BRX 44-02 (cv. Basilisk) after growing for 20 days in control and high (200 µM) Al^{3+} concentration hydroponic solutions.

Figure 2: Root length (RL), root biomass (RB), and root tip diameter (RD) ratio values

between Al^{3+} stress and control measured values (stress/control) in the interspecific

progeny (n=169) between *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02 and *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 (cv.

Basilisk).

Figure 3: Synteny between the *Brachiaria ruziziensis* and foxtail millet (*Setaria italica*)

genomes. The 36 synteny blocks longer than 1 Mbp and translocations are highlighted

in red or green boxes according to their direction.

Figure 4: 4,427 genetic markers placed in 18 linkage groups. We defined three QTLs each in LG 1 (Chr 8) for root length and biomass under control and Al^{3+} stress conditions, LG 3 (Chr 7) for root length ratio and root tip diameter ratio (stress/control), and LG 4 (Chr 3) for root tip diameter ratio.

958 **Figure 5:** Differentially expressed (DE) genes in roots and stems from the

959 susceptible genotype *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02 and the tolerant genotype *B.*

960 *decumbens* CIAT 606 (cv. Basilisk) between control and high (200 µM AlCl$_3$)

961 aluminium cation concentrations in hydroponic experiments at CIAT.

Figure 6: Enrichment analysis of the GO slim terms overrepresented among

differentially expressed genes that are either up-regulated (red) or down-regulated

(blue) during stress in roots from the susceptible *B. ruziziensis* BRX 44-02 (*B.ruziz*)

or the tolerant genotype *B. decumbens* CIAT 606 cv. Basilisk (*B.decu*) genotypes.