Title:

Metal toxicity contributes to the structuring of bacterial communities in the

Arabidopsis leaf phyllosphere

Author names and affiliations:

Jan F. Plewka-Mandelkow[1], Anna S. Thomas[1], Julia A. Vorholt[2], Ute Krämer[1][§]

[1]Faculty of Biology and Biotechnology, Ruhr University Bochum, 44801 Bochum, Germany

[2]Institute of Microbiology, ETH Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland

[§]**Corresponding author**: Ute.Kraemer@ruhr-uni-bochum.de

Professor Dr. Ute Krämer

Molecular Genetics and Physiology of Plants

Ruhr University Bochum

Universitätsstraße 150, Box 44, ND3/30

D-44801 Bochum, Germany

Tel.: +49 (0)234 32 24291, FAX: +49 (0)234 32 14187

One sentence summary: Based on the magnitude and variation of metal tolerances among

bacterial strains of the Arabidopsis phyllosphere, we conclude that common leaf apoplastic

cadmium and zinc concentrations can influence bacterial community structure.

List of author contributions: U.K. conceived the project, J.F.P.-M. and U.K. designed

research with contributions from J.A.V., J.F.P.-M. and A.T. performed experiments, J.A.V.

contributed materials, J.F.P.-M., A.T., and U.K. analyzed data, J.F.P.-M. and U.K. wrote the

manuscript, with contributions from J.A.V. All authors read and edited the manuscript.

Funding information: This work was supported by Ruhr University Bochum, Germany, and

the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (RTG 2341 Microbial Substrate Conversion).

Highlights

- Metal(loid) sensitivities of the *Arabidopsis thaliana* phyllosphere bacterial strain (*At-LSPHERE*) collection followed the order of toxicity $Cd^{2+} \gg Cu^{2+} > Zn^{2+} >$ arsenite (As^{III}) $> Mn^{2+} >$ arsenite (As^{V}), whereby the responses of individual strains were uncorrelated between metal(loids) and predicted the sensitivities of multi-strain synthetic communities.

- Upon cultivation of Arabidopsis in unpolluted soil, total Cd^{II} and Zn^{II} in leaf apoplastic fluid were equivalent to concentrations that arrested growth of up to 2.2% and 0.4% of phyllosphere bacterial strains on agar-solidified R2A medium, respectively, whereas apoplastic Cu^{II} and Mn^{II} were 10- to 100-fold below bacteriotoxic levels.

- Phyllosphere bacteria known to strongly influence community composition mostly remained highly sensitive under combined metal(loid) exposure, and elevated tolerances to Cd^{II} and Zn^{II}, but not to other metalloid(s), in phyllosphere compared to soil bacteria were consistent with divergent natural selection in the leaf and soil environments.

- The degree of phyllosphere bacterial metal(loid) tolerances correlates with the presence and copy number of known tolerance genes, with genus accounting for 63% of the variation in gene content and 42% of the phenotypic variation in metal(loid) tolerance.

- In summary, our data suggest that local Cd and Zn levels in the Arabidopsis leaf endosphere influence the composition of bacterial communities and have shaped their phenotypic metal(loid) tolerance properties as a result of natural selection.

Abstract

Diversity and composition of plant-associated microbiota are attributed to host and microbial genotype as well as the environment, yet our understanding of the causal factors driving these patterns remains incomplete. Elevated concentrations of the micronutrients zinc (Zn), manganese (Mn) and copper (Cu), and exposure to non-essential trace elements including cadmium (Cd) and arsenic (As), can be toxic. Here we explored whether differences in metal(loid) homeostasis between plants and bacteria shape microbial community composition in the phyllosphere. Among the biologically relevant metal(loid)s Cd, Cu, Mn, Zn, and As, we identified Cd^{II} as the most toxic, and As^{V} (arsenate) as the most harmless, by screening 224 representative *Arabidopsis thaliana* phyllosphere bacterial strains on metal(loid) concentration series in synthetic media. Comparing bacteriotoxicity profiles with our measurements of the leaf apoplastic fluid ionome indicated that Zn^{2+} and Cd^{2+} concentrations are the most likely to arrest growth of metal-sensitive strains *in planta*. Soil bacterial strains were several-fold more sensitive to both these metals than leaf strains, consistent with selection for increased bacterial Zn and Cd tolerance in the phyllosphere. Keystone strains, known to govern bacterial community structure, were highly metal-sensitive, with only few between-metal interactions and no between-strain interactions modulating single-metal(loid) toxicities. Overall, bacterial genus explained 63% of the variance in metal(loid)-related gene content and 42% of the metal(loid) tolerance phenotypic variance. Cd tolerance correlated with the presence and copy number of known Cd-related genes. In summary, our results support the hypothesis that plant metal homeostasis contributes to structuring bacterial communities in the leaf endosphere.

Keywords

Arabidopsis thaliana, leaf apoplast, phyllosphere, synthetic communities, cadmium, zinc, microbiome

1. Introduction

Diversity among bacteria is unparalleled, and they have colonized the broadest range of habitats in the world, including soil, water, and multicellular organisms. The plant-associated microbiota comprises complex microbial communities influenced by the plant host, microbe-microbe interactions, and other environmental factors, and can have positive effects on plant fitness (Müller, Vogel, et al. 2016; Ritpitakphong et al. 2016; Vogel et al. 2021). Leaves provide two distinct microbial habitats: one on the leaf surface named the phylloplane, and one inside the leaf comprising the apoplast, named the endosphere. One of the largest habitats for bacteria is the leaf surface, with an estimated global area of around 1 billion km^2 (Vorholt 2012). From the surface of a leaf, the leaf endosphere is accessible *via* the stomata while they are open. Within a given plant organ, the volume outside the plasma membranes bordering all cells is referred to as the apoplast, comprising both the cell walls and the intercellular space in between (Sattelmacher 2001). In general, the leaf apoplast is at least partially filled with an extracellular solution, and the remainder of it is occupied by air. In addition to its role as a habitat for microbial communities, the apoplast serves as a site for the inter-cellular movement of gases, water and solutes, as well as for the storage and detoxification of organic and inorganic compounds including metals (Küpper et al. 2000; Sattelmacher 2001; Kajala et al. 2019).

Impacts on bacteria inhabiting the phylloplane, rhizosphere and rhizoplane are determined predominantly by the environment around the plant. The closer the plant host, the stronger is its influence on the microbiota (Chen et al. 2020; Bulgarelli et al. 2013). The plant begins to exert some control over the composition of its apoplast progressively from the root epidermis inwards, where both diffusion from the soil solution and microbial colonization can occur easily on the external side of, or during root developmental stages prior to the formation of, apoplastic barriers. In roots, apoplastic barriers are constituted by the Casparian strip that is positioned radially around root endodermal cells as well as the suberization of the outwardly oriented surfaces of epidermal and endodermal cell layers, both initiated at specific stages of cellular differentiation. Endodermal suberization is plastic to some degree and regulated dependent on both the plant's nutritional status and plant-associated microbial communities (Barberon et al. 2016; Robb et al. 1991; Andersen, Barberon, and Geldner 2015). The apoplast on the internal side of the root apoplastic barriers and of the leaf endosphere represent comparably sheltered niches for the inhabiting microbes. At these sites, the plant host has a

predominant influence on apoplast composition, thus providing opportunities for niche

construction by the plant. To date, little is known about the composition of this micro-habitat

and any evolutionary adaptations to it in the inhabiting microbes.

The plant apoplast is known to function in the storage and detoxification of excess metal

cations, including those of so-called heavy metals, or – more accurately – class B (e.g., Cu^+)

and borderline elements (e.g., Cu^{2+}, Cd^{2+}, Fe^{2+}, Fe^{3+}, Mn^{2+}, Zn^{2+} (Nieboer 1980; Farvardin et

al. 2020)). Among these, the micronutrients (mostly Fe, Zn, Cu, Mn and Ni) are required in

small quantities by all organisms to serve as or within protein cofactors acting in ligand binding

and in the catalysis of a variety of chemical reactions (Pais and Jones 1997; Marschner and

Marschner 2012). Because of their powerful chemical properties, these same nutrients can

become highly toxic even when present in slight excess. Moreover, chemically similar non-

essential metallic trace elements are ubiquitously present in the environment, for example Cd.

All organisms, including bacteria and plants, possess metal homeostasis networks which

operate to fulfill nutritional metal requirements while counteracting metal toxicities across their

specific environmental ranges (Clemens 2001; Nies and Grass 2009; Chandrangsu, Rensing,

and Helmann 2017). Over the course of evolution, metal homeostasis networks, as well as

nutritional metal needs, have diverged between bacteria, fungi and plants to some extent. For

example, the metalloproteome of plants generally requires more Cu and Zn, and less Ni, than

that of most bacteria (Williams 2007). This divergence implies that metal concentrations

maintained and tolerated by the plant within the apoplast may be inhibitory to bacterial

colonists, raising the possibility that plants modulate apoplastic metal levels to selectively

influence microbial community composition. In support of this, *Arabidopsis thaliana* Zn^{2+}

efflux ATPases HMA2 and HMA4 are required for resistance to the necrotrophic fungal

pathogen *Plectosphaerella cucumerina*, demonstrating that plant-controlled apoplastic metal

levels can shape interactions with microbial colonists (Escudero et al. 2022). This concept

parallels nutritional immunity—a process well-established through medical research where the

host manipulates nutrient availability to limit pathogen growth—yet it remains underexplored

in plant science (Murdoch and Skaar 2022; Krämer 2024).

Here we explore the relationship between metal(loid) levels in the plant apoplast and plant-

associated microbial communities. We profiled the metal(loid) tolerances of 224 representative

phyllosphere bacterial strains of the *At*-LSPHERE collection, a curated set of isolates from the

model plant *A. thaliana* (Bai et al. 2015), focusing on elements that could reach bacteriotoxic

levels inside leaves of plants in their natural non-contaminated environments: Cd, Cu, Mn, Zn, and arsenic. We then generated ionomic data for the Arabidopsis leaf apoplast for an evaluation in the context of phyllosphere bacterial metal(loid) tolerances as well as in comparison to tolerance profiles of soil bacteria, and we identified genomic predictors of metal tolerance in phyllosphere bacterial strains. Taking our findings together, we assessed whether metal(loid) co-tolerance patterns reflect shared chemical properties or environmental selection. In summary, our work identifies the modulation of Zn and Cd levels in the leaf apoplast as a potential means for plants to shape the bacterial community in their leaf endosphere.

2. Results

2.1 Profiles of metal(loid) tolerances among Arabidopsis phyllosphere bacterial strains

It is presently unknown whether the metal levels in the leaf apoplast can influence the composition of phyllosphere microbial communities. To obtain information for addressing this question, we profiled the metal(loid) tolerance limits of all individual strains within the publicly available representative collection of Arabidopsis leaf phyllosphere bacteria named *At*-LSPHERE ($n = 224$) (Bai et al. 2015). For comparison, we additionally profiled a publicly available collection of bacteria from unplanted soil ($n = 33$) (Bai et al. 2015). We spotted bacterial suspensions of each strain on agar-solidified R2A media supplemented with concentration series of the essential metals copper^{II} (Cu^{II}), zinc^{II} (Zn^{II}), and manganese^{II} (Mn^{II}), as well as of the non-essential trace metal cadmium^{II} (Cd^{II}), and the metalloid arsenic (As) in two common inorganic forms, arsenite (As^{III}) and arsenate (As^{V}) (Tables S1 to S3).

Cd^{II} was toxic for some *At*-LSPHERE strains at the lowest tested concentration (1.5 µM). Concentrations of 4.3 µM Cd and 49 µM Cd eliminated the growth of 5% and 50% of the bacterial strains, respectively (termed here Effective Concentrations EC$_5$ and EC$_{50}$), with a factor of 130 between the Cd concentrations eliminating the 5% most sensitive (EC$_5$) and the 5% most tolerant strains (EC$_{95}$; based on curve fits, defined here as concentration range; Figure 1A, Table 1). Compared to phyllosphere bacterial strains, soil bacteria were more sensitive to Cd, with EC$_5$, EC$_{50}$ and EC$_{95}$ concentrations of approximately 50%, 20% and 10%, respectively, and only about one-fifth of the concentration range (Figure 1B, Table 1).

We observed EC$_{50}$ values of 0.42, 0.57, and 1.1 mM, respectively, for the trace elements Cu^{II}, Zn^{II}, and arsenite (As^{III}). Of these three elements, Zn began to impede the growth of some

phyllosphere bacterial strains at the lowest tested concentration of 50 µM (EC$_5$ of 83 µM), and it continued to permit the growth of the most tolerant strains up to the highest concentration (EC$_{95}$ of 11 mM; Figure 1A, Table 1), with a concentration range of 130, very similar to that for Cd. Soil bacteria were less Zn-tolerant, showing EC$_5$, EC$_{50}$ and EC$_{95}$ concentrations of approximately 40%, 30% and 6%, respectively, and only about one-eighth of the concentration range, compared to phyllosphere bacteria (Figure 1B, Table 1).

Table 1. Effective concentrations of metals on collections of bacterial strains (based on curve fits).

At-LSPHERE bacterial strain collection			
Element	**EC$_5$ [mM][a]**	**EC$_{50}$ [mM][a]**	**EC$_{95}$ [mM][a]**	**Concentration range[c]**
Cd^{II}	4.3×10^{-3}	0.049	0.56	130
Cu^{II}	0.11	0.42	1.6	15
Zn^{II}	0.083	0.57	11	130
As^{III}	0.17	1.1	6.6	39
Mn^{II}	3.0	9.2	85	28
As^{V}	~0.1[b]	> 100[b]	> 100[b]	>> 100[b]
Soil bacterial strain collection			
Element	**EC$_5$ [mM][a]**	**EC$_{50}$ [mM][a]**	**EC$_{95}$ [mM][a]**	**Concentration range[c]**
Cd^{II}	2.0×10^{-3}	0.010	0.054	27
Cu^{II}	0.25	0.60	1.4	5.6
Zn^{II}	0.040	0.16	0.66	17
As^{III}	0.087	1.1	14	160
Mn^{II}	0.77	15	> 100[b]	>> 100[b]
As^{V}	~0.1[b]	> 20[b]	> 100[b]	>> 100[b]

[a]EC$_n$ denote metal concentration preventing growth of n% of the tested bacterial strains. Values based on curve fits, see Figure 1A, Data S1 and Methods).
[b]Values estimated from experiments (no curve fit possible).
[c]Ratio EC$_{95}$: EC$_5$

The 15-fold difference in Cu concentration between the EC$_5$ of 0.11 and the EC$_{95}$ of 1.6 mM was the narrowest among all metal(loid)s tested in phyllosphere bacteria. Compared to phyllosphere bacteria, soil bacteria were more Cu-tolerant, with approximately 2-fold EC$_5$, 1.5-fold EC$_{50}$, and a similar EC$_{95}$ (around 90%), despite a narrower concentration range of approximately one-third of that observed in phyllosphere bacteria. Consequently, the largest differences between phyllosphere and soil bacteria were observed among EC$_{95}$ values: *ca*. 20-fold higher for Zn and 10-fold for higher for Cd.

Arsenite was less toxic to phyllosphere bacteria than Cd^{II}, Cu^{II}, and Zn^{II}, with an EC$_{50}$ of 1.1 mM (Figure 1A, Table 1). The EC$_{50}$ of Mn^{II} was as high as 9.2 mM, and arsenate was the least

harmful to *At*-LSPHERE strains. At the highest tested arsenate concentration of 100 mM, about 50% of the bacterial strains were still able to grow, although we depleted phosphate in these media (Tables S1 to S3). For these metal(loid)s, phyllosphere bacteria tended to have higher EC_5 concentrations than soil bacteria (about 2-fold for As^{III} and 4-fold for Mn^{II}), similar EC_{50} concentrations, and phyllosphere bacteria had lower EC_{95} concentrations than soil bacteria, clearly different from Zn, Cd and Cu (Figure 1A and B, Table 1). These results suggested that bacterial strains with elevated Cd^{II} and Zn^{II} tolerance are enriched in the phyllosphere of Arabidopsis compared to unplanted soil under natural field conditions.

We next investigated whether the metal tolerances of single strains are representative of those of bacterial communities, using Cd tolerance as an example. We designed three synthetic communities (SynComs) comprising strains that individually exhibited high, intermediate and low Cd tolerance, respectively (Table S4). The composition of these SynComs matched the phylogenetic profile of phyllosphere communities as closely as possible (Figure S1). On solid R2A media, growth of the SynComs reflected that of the most tolerant strain in single-strain assays (Figure S2A and S2B). The relative Cd tolerances of SynComs in liquid R2A media also qualitatively followed the relative Cd tolerances of single strains observed on solid media. Cd toxicity was more severe in liquid media, with growth decreases observed at the lowest tested Cd concentration of 1.5 µM in both the sensitive and the intermediate SynCom, and a complete growth arrest of the sensitive SynCom as well as strongly attenuated growth of the intermediate and tolerant SynComs at 15 µM Cd (Figures 1C and S3, compare with Fig. S2 and Table 1; growth arrest only of the sensitive SynCom at 240 µM on solid R2A media). Taken together, these results supported the relevance of our single-strain tolerance assays in exemplary bacterial communities.

2.2 Magnitudes of apoplastic Cd and Zn concentrations reach levels toxic to a subset of phyllosphere bacterial strains

To address whether any members of phyllosphere bacterial communities might ever encounter toxic metal levels in the leaf endosphere, we examined the composition of the leaf apoplastic fluid (AF). Apoplastic wash fluid (AWF) was extracted from the leaves of seven- to eight-week-old soil-grown *A. thaliana* plants (Tables S5 and S6) using the infiltration-centrifugation method (O'Leary et al. 2014; Figueiredo et al. 2021). Plant cultivation was conducted on a standard greenhouse soil, with an additional experiment using a field-collected soil from a region known for geogenically slightly elevated total Cd levels for comparison (Stein et al.

2017). AWF is commonly obtained using water as an infiltration fluid (IF). IF might affect

metal solubility during the experimental procedure, for instance by increasing the local

extracellular pH within infiltrated leaves. Therefore, we interpret the corresponding results as

estimates of the minimal metal levels encountered in the AF. Our current understanding of

metal partitioning within plants implies that cell walls contain bound metal cations, which

continuously equilibrate with the surrounding AF and can thus affect the microbes in this

compartment. To obtain AWF containing what we interpret as estimates of the maximal metal

concentrations in the leaf AF of plants cultivated under the conditions employed, we used as

the IF a solution of 100 µM ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid (EDTA). EDTA is a synthetic

chelator of metal cations, with affinities following the sequence of $Fe^{3+} > Cu^{2+} >> Zn^{2+} > Fe^{2+}$

$> Mn^{2+} >> Mg^{2+} > Ca^{2+}$ (Norvell 1991), and it can thus be predicted to mobilize the readily

available fraction of transition metal cations from cell walls and other binding sites.

Carrying out the infiltration-centrifugation protocol with insufficient caution can damage cell

integrity, thus causing cytoplasmic contamination of the AWF. Therefore, we generated

additional control samples in which we intentionally provoked cytoplasmic contamination by

inflicting mechanical stress on the leaves through harsh handling during the experimental

procedure at three levels of severity (little, intermediate, and strong damage). We quantified

the concentrations of multiple elements in all AWF samples by ICP-OES and subsequently

calculated the concentrations of nutrient elements and Cd in AF *in vivo* (see Methods). A

principal component analysis (PCA) of the ionomic profiles of all AWF samples demonstrated

that provoked cytoplasmic contamination is associated with strongly elevated concentrations

of calcium (Ca), potassium (K), magnesium (Mg), sulfur (S), and phosphorus (P) (Figure S4A,

PC 1 separates the experimental samples from the control samples obtained after intentionally

inflicting cell damage). Consequently, a PCA of ionomic profiles is a sensitive means to detect

cytoplasmically contaminated AWF samples, all of which were excluded from further analysis

(Figure S4A and B). Notably, neither Cd nor Zn concentrations were increased upon provoking

cytoplasmic contamination (Figure S4A), supporting their predominantly apoplastic – and not

cytoplasmic – origin in our AWF samples.

Compared to total concentrations across entire hydrated leaves, nutrients (Fe, Mo, Cu, Ca, S,

P, Mg, and K) were generally depleted in AF, most strongly for Fe. By comparison to bulk

leaves, there was an enrichment in AF of Mn, Cd and Zn (Figure 1D, see also Figure S4C and

D), consistent with the preferential sequestration of these elements in the apoplastic

compartment. Overall, only a minor proportion of the total amount of all elements was

extracted from leaves in the AWF (Table S7). We calculated Cd and Zn concentrations in

AF_{EDTA} to be at least 0.07 and 5.2 µM, and up to 0.4 and 40 µM, respectively, with considerable

variability between replicate samples and independent experiments (Table S5, Figure 1E,

Figure S4E-G). Accordingly, the range of Zn concentrations in the AF included concentrations

capable of preventing the growth of the most sensitive bacterial strains when tested on solid

R2A medium. Cd concentrations in AF closely approached these magnitudes (Table 1; Figure

1E), although plants were grown on greenhouse soil containing only trace levels of Cd (total

Cd < 0.1 mg kg^{-1}; Table S6). Cd and Zn concentrations in AF were elevated in the presence of

EDTA in the IF, suggesting that EDTA mobilized pools of both metals from extracellular

binding sites within infiltrated leaves (Figure 1E, Table S5, Figure S4A, PC 2 separates

samples obtained with EDTA from those obtained with water as the extraction fluid). It should

be noted that we consider the direct quantitative comparison between metal concentrations in

AF and R2A medium merely as a first reasonable approximation (see also Discussion).

In contrast to Cd and Zn, total concentrations of Cu and Mn in the AF of approximately 1 and

70 µM, respectively, were far below toxic levels in the R2A medium of ≥ 0.1 and ≥ 3 mM for

Cu and Mn, respectively (Figure 1A, Table 1). Overall, Cu concentrations in AF were

independent of whether we used EDTA solution or water as IF, suggesting that negligible

proportions of the apoplastic Cu pool were reversibly bound to cell walls of infiltrated leaves

(Figure 1D, Figure S4G, Table S5). In summary, these results indicated that Cd and Zn are

enriched in the leaf apoplast and have the potential to directly attenuate or eliminate the growth

of a subset of leaf phyllosphere bacteria.

2.3 Towards extrapolating how metals affect phyllosphere bacterial community

composition

Previously published drop-out experiments with synthetic bacterial communities of *A. thaliana*

showed that the absence of single bacterial strains, such as L203-*Microbacterium*, L231-

Sphingomonas, L233-*Rhodococcus,* and L262-*Rhizobium*, can alter the structures of bacterial

communities (Carlström et al. 2019). These strains are thus referred to as keystone strains

(Carlström et al. 2019). In these keystone strains, maximum permissive concentrations (MPC)

were often larger or equal to *At*-LSPHERE-wide EC_{50}, with strain-specific sensitivities to

individual metal(loid)s (MPC < EC_{50}; Cu^{II}: L262, Mn^{II}: L231, Zn^{II}: L262 and L231, arsenite:

L203 and L262, Cd^{II}: all except L262; Data S1) so that none of these strains shared an identical

profile with any other strain. This suggested that metal tolerances in keystone strains reflect distinct evolutionary histories rather than a shared chemical response. L233 was the most Cd-sensitive, with a maximum permissive concentration (MPC) of 1.5 µM Cd (the lowest concentration tested on solid R2A media; 3% of the EC_{50} of 49 µM Cd, see Figure 2A and Table 1). Keystone strains L203 and L231 were also Cd-sensitive (MPC at 30% of EC_{50}). Compared to these Cd concentrations, the maximal Cd concentration in AF (0.4 µM) was lower (see Figure 1E, Table S5). In subsequent experiments we observed that even a concentration of 0.5 µM Cd in liquid R2A medium fully suppressed the growth of L203 and caused a mild growth reduction on L231 and L233 (Table S8). Keystone strain L262 was sensitive to Cu^{II}, arsenite and Zn^{II} (MPCs at $\leq$ 40% of EC_{50}), and tolerant to Cd^{II} (MPC 490% of EC_{50}) (Figure 2A). Besides its sensitivity to Cd^{II} (see above) and As^{III} (MPC 23% of EC_{50}), keystone strain L203 showed moderately elevated tolerance to Cu (MPC 140% of EC_{50}) and Zn (MPC 180% of EC_{50}). Cd-sensitive keystone strains L231 and L233 (see above) had some degree of Cu (140% of EC_{50}) and As^{III} (230% of EC_{50}) tolerance, with additional Zn tolerance in L233 (350% of EC_{50}).

Next, we tested for possible combined effects of metals on the keystone strains. We examined the effects of combining Cd^{II} and Cu^{II}, and of combining Cd^{II}, Zn^{II}, and Mn^{II} in the liquid culture system (Figure 2B and C). The highest tested concentration of Cu^{II} was substantially more toxic to L233 and L262 in the presence of Cd^{II}, implying synergistic toxicity of Cd^{II} and Cu^{II} (Figure 2B, Table S8). A mild growth reduction appeared at concentrations of 0.5 µM Cd^{II} or 100 µM Cu^{II}, whereas the combination of 0.5 µM Cd^{II} and 100 µM Cu^{II} completely eliminated the growth of L233. Similarly, neither Cd^{II} nor Cu^{II} alone were heavily toxic to L262 at the tested concentrations, whereas the combination of 100 µM Cu^{II} with any of the tested Cd^{II} concentrations exacerbated the toxic effects. In contrast, combined treatments appeared to alleviate toxicity in L231 when compared to treatments with Cd^{II} and Cu^{II} alone (Figure 2B, Table S8). Reproducible combined effects were largely restricted to Cu^{II} concentrations in liquid R2A media that were 14- to 300-fold higher than in AF (see Table S5).

In experiments combining up to three metals, the single Zn^{II} concentration tested (50 µM) alone tended to decrease the growth of L203 and L231, and more strongly of L233 and L262 (Table S9). The tested Mn^{II} concentration (10 µM) alone had no consistent effects on the growth of keystone strains (Table S9). When tested in combination with varying concentrations of Cd^{II} (0.5, 5 and 20 µM), Zn^{II} exacerbated the toxicity of all Cd^{II} conditions in strain L262, which

was highly tolerant to Cd alone, whereas Mn^{II} alleviated both the single and combined

toxicities of Zn^{II} and Cd^{II} to this strain (Figure 2C). Zn^{II} also tended to exacerbate the toxicity

of Cd^{II} in L231, and it exacerbated the toxicity of Mn^{II} in L203. Mn^{II} tended to have alleviating

effects, including its effect on L233 and L203 suffering from Cd^{II} toxicity (0.5 µM) or exposed

to a combination of Cd^{II} and Zn^{II}. The sizes of the alleviating effects of Mn were small and

mostly insufficient to rescue growth of these same strains at the next higher tested

concentration of 5 µM Cd, for instance (Table S9). In summary, we observed varied and

generally small combined effects of metals exacerbating or alleviating toxicity in keystone

strains, suggesting that combined effects are unlikely to cause major increases in metal

tolerance of strains compared to single metals as shown in Figure 1A.

2.5 Phylogeny at the Genus Level Explains Most of the Variations in Metal Tolerance

Profiles

Next, we examined metal tolerance profiles in relation to the phylogeny of *At*-LSPHERE

strains. *Actinobacteria* were significantly depleted by Cd concentrations of $\geq$ 15 µM and

enriched among the strains that continued to grow at $\geq$ 0.2 mM Cu and $\geq$ 0.4 mM Zn, when

compared to other classes (Figure 3). Relative to other classes, Gammaproteobacteria were

enriched at high levels of $\geq$ 2.5 mM arsenite. Hierarchical clustering of MPCs identified 10

distinct clusters of bacterial strains sharing similar metal(loid) tolerance profiles (Figure 4).

Cluster I comprised three strains, L92-*Methylobacterium*, L396-*Bradyrhizobium*, and L401-

Bradyrhizobium (all α-Proteobacteria), which were highly tolerant to multiple metals but not

to the metalloid arsenite. These strains were the most Cd-tolerant (1.5 mM) and tolerated more

than twice the EC_{50} concentrations of Cu, Zn, and Mn (Figure 4, Data S1). Cluster II consisted

of five highly Zn- and Cu-tolerant strains. Strains highly tolerant to arsenite grouped in cluster

III, highly Mn-tolerant strains in cluster IV, and highly Mn-tolerant and Cu-sensitive strains in

cluster V. Cluster VI comprised highly to moderately Cu-tolerant strains, some of which were

also highly Cd-tolerant. Clusters VII and VIII contained strains with intermediate Cu tolerance,

whereby cluster VII contained arsenite-sensitive and cluster VIII contained moderately

arsenite-tolerant strains. The final two clusters, IX and X, grouped strains that were highly Cu-

sensitive and sensitive to most other metal(loid)s, with intermediate tolerance to arsenite in

cluster IX and sensitivity to arsenite in cluster X. Metal tolerance profiles were similar within

the genus *Rhizobium*, of which approximately 73% grouped in Cluster X, and 13% in clusters

V and IX, respectively. In contrast, the seven *Rhodococcus* strains were distributed into four

different clusters: one strain in cluster III, two strains in the neighboring cluster VII, three strains in cluster VIII, with two directly next to one another and a third one further away, and finally one strain in cluster X. Similarly, the nine *Pseudomonas* strains were spread across the five clusters V and VII to X, whereby only two of them clustered next to one another in cluster V. These patterns suggested that phylogenetic relationships account for only part of the variation in metal tolerance profiles.

To obtain more quantitative information on the contribution of phylogeny to the variation in metal tolerance we employed dimensionality reduction-based analyses. There were no major differences between strains of different taxonomic classes according to a PCA of strain-wise MPCs (Figure S6A), and a constrained principal coordinate analysis (CPCoA) constrained by class explained only 6% of the variance (Figure S6B; $p < 0.05$). By contrast, CPCoA attributed 42% of the variance to genus (Figure S6C; constrained by genus, $p < 0.001$). In agreement with this, a representation of metal tolerances on a phylogenetic tree based on 16S rRNA DNA sequences (Bai et al. 2015) suggested that closely related strains mostly exhibited similar metal tolerance profiles (Figure 5). For example, *Methylobacterium* strains L90, L92, L119, L121, L122, and L123 were highly Cd tolerant, and *Methylobacterium* L90, L92, and L122 were Cu- and Zn-tolerant (Figure 5). Similarly, all *Bacillus* strains were sensitive to Cd and Cu, and all *Rhizobium* strains (Alphaproteobacteria) were sensitive to Cu and Zn. In summary, metal(loid) tolerances partially followed phylogenetic relationships, most prominently at the genus level, suggesting that the remaining phenotypic variation among *At*-LSPHERE strains reflects recent evolutionary divergence.

2.6 Genetic basis of differential metal tolerances among bacterial strains

We investigated the degree to which molecular mechanisms that were previously characterized in bacteria can explain between-strain variation in metal tolerances. First, we conducted a PCA of strain-wise MPC for Cd and the orthologs of genes described in the literature to increase Cd tolerance that were present in the genome of each strain (Figure 6A). PC 1 clustered the classes *Actinobacteria* and *Bacilli*, which were comparably Cd-sensitive (see Figures 3 and 5), together towards one side, but left the other classes scattered across. PC loadings suggested a relation between enhanced Cd tolerance and the presence of *czcA, B, C, D*, *smtA*, and *tolC*, of *zntA* for PC1 only, as well as the absence of *zntR* and *cadC..smtB* (Figure 6A). Beyond the identity of Cd tolerance genes, their gene dosage (or copy number) in a given genome could be expected to scale with strain-level Cd tolerance. A Kendall's rank correlation analysis of the gene score,

which we calculated as the cumulative number of Cd tolerance-related genes and gene copies

present in the genome, and Cd MPC showed a significant correlation ($\tau = 0.31$, $p < 3.5 \times 10^{-9}$;

Figure 6B).

Subsequently, we addressed more generally whether differences in genomic content of known

bacterial metal tolerance genes are explained by phylogeny. For this, 100 known metal(loid)-

related genes (Data S2) were employed to carry out a CPCoA, constrained by class, which

indicated that 22% of the presence/absence genetic variation for metal tolerance-related genes

was explained by class ($p \leq 0.001$). Genus explained 63% of the genetic variation according to

CPCoA (constrained by genus, $p \leq 0.001$) (Figure S7A-C). These proportions further

highlighted the importance of genus-level taxonomy, consistent with the pattern observed for

phenotypic variation in metal tolerances (Figure S6). A higher proportion of genetic variation

than of phenotypic variation explained by genus (63% vs. 42% as reported in section 2.5) is

consistent with contributions of as yet unidentified genes to metal tolerance, which we would

expect to reduce the correspondence between known gene content and tolerance phenotype.

To test the effect of each gene on metal(loid) tolerances, bacterial strains were split into two

groups for each of the known metal(loid)-tolerance-related genes: one group in which the gene

of interest (GoI) was present in the genome and one group lacking the GoI (Data S3 and S4).

For each metal(loid), we then tested for significant differences between the median MPCs

calculated for the two groups (Wilcox rank-sum test, p-values adjusted with Holm-Bonferroni

correction). This approach identified a total of 51 genes which were significantly associated

with tolerance to one or more metal(loid)s: 21 genes (41%) for Cd, 10 for Cu (20%), 15 (29%)

for Zn, none for As^{III}, 20 (39%) for Mn, and 9 (18%) for As^{V} tolerance (Table S10, Data S4).

Among these, we detected a negative effect on Cd tolerance for *cadC..smtB* and positive effects

for *czcA, czcB, czcC, tolC* and *zntA* in agreement with Figure 6A, as well as additionally a

negative effect for *znuA* and positive effects for *zur* and *mdtA*, with the highest statistical

significances for *czcA*, *czcB*, *mdtA* and *tolC* (Data S4; Figure 7, $p_{adj} < 0.005$). Conversely, the

presence of *comB*, *cmtA*, and *smtB* each decreased the median MPC of Cd by a factor of 40,

and *csoR* decreased it by a factor of four. In addition to genes previously implicated in bacterial

Cd tolerance, our analysis identified *arsC1..arsC*, *arsH*, *cusB..silB*, *mdtA*, *mdtB*, and *mdtC* and

zur as candidate genes for increasing Cd tolerance. *Actinobacteria* and *Bacilli* of the *At-*

LSPHERE collection were characterized by an overall lack of Cd tolerance genes and the

presence of Cd-sensitizing genes, consistent with their Cd sensitivity (Figure 7, see Figures 3

to 5 and 6A). Out of all bacterial strains, the genomes of the four most Cd-sensitive strains

(L454, L172, L263, and L406) contained no or only few metal(loid)-related genes associated

with Cd tolerance, and genes related to Cd sensitivity were present in the genomes of three of

them (L172, L263, and L406; Figure 7). By contrast, the genomes of the most highly Cd-

tolerant strains contained comparably more Cd tolerance-increasing genes and few or no Cd-

sensitizing genes. The genome of strain L92-*Methylobacterium,* one of the two most highly

Cd-tolerant strains, was an exception to this pattern, containing only three known Cd tolerance-

increasing genes, *czcA, czcB* and *zntA*. Taken together, these results support roles in the leaf

phyllosphere for Cd tolerance genes previously characterized in bacterial model systems,

implicate additional metal(loid)-related genes in Cd tolerance, and suggest further

contributions to metal(loid) tolerances from previously uncharacterized or poorly annotated

genes.

3. Discussion

3.1 Metal tolerances of individual strains and their relevance for bacterial community composition in the leaf endosphere

Our results support the conclusion that the levels of Zn and Cd, and possibly also of other

metal(loid)s, in the leaf apoplast contribute to shaping bacterial community composition in the

leaf endosphere of *A. thaliana* by eliminating or attenuating the growth of sensitive bacterial

genotypes. First, we observed marked overall differences in the degrees of tolerance to Zn and

Cd between the bacterial strain collection from the phyllosphere and the collection from

unplanted soil (Figure 1, Table 1). This suggests an enrichment of strains exhibiting elevated

tolerance to these metals among in the *At*-LSPHERE collection by comparison to the collection

from unplanted soil. Second, Zn and Cd concentrations in the leaf apoplastic fluid (AF) of soil-

grown Arabidopsis plants closely approached the metal concentrations that were toxic to metal-

sensitive bacterial strains of the *At*-LSPHERE collection in solid R2A media (Figures 1 and

S4, Table S5). In addition, Cd, Mn and Zn were enriched in AF compared to their

concentrations in bulk leaves. Third, two keystone strains (Carlström et al. 2019), L233-

Rhodococcus and L203-*Microbacterium*, were among the most highly Cd-sensitive strains

(Figures 2, and S5), implying the potential for pronounced secondary effects of Cd toxicity on

overall species composition in the leaf endosphere. Finally, a set of exemplary tests conducted

by us suggested that between-strain and between-metal interactions had no, or only few and

mostly small, reproducible effects alleviating Zn or Cd toxicity (Figures 1 and 2, S2 and S3,
Tables S8 and S9).

Our study has some limitations that should be considered when interpreting these conclusions.
There are some limitations affecting these conclusions from our study. While partly shared soil
environments of origin support the comparability of the bacterial collections (Bai et al. 2015),
the number of strains was considerably smaller in the soil collection than in the *At*-LSPHERE
collection, thus potentially decreasing the precision of the values summarizing
metal(loid)tolerances across soil bacterial strains (Figure 1). Relating metal concentrations in
leaf AF to those in solid or liquid bacterial growth media fundamentally remains an
extrapolation. Considerable proportions of the total metal concentrations accessible to and
measured in AF, as well as those measured in R2A media, are present in chelated form in
solution, within precipitates or bound to the surfaces of solids. Yet, the degree of Cd and Zn
toxicity to bacteria depends on the concentrations of their free aqueous divalent cations. In
addition to this, the levels of other solutes can strongly influence metal toxicity either directly
or indirectly. Importantly, other divalent cations compete with toxic metal cations for bacterial
uptake, and the levels of bioavailable nutrients, such as phosphate, sulfur, iron and manganese,
can alleviate metal toxicity inside bacterial cells. The overall elemental composition of solid
R2A media (*ca*. 5-fold Fe, 10% Ca, 30% Mg, 20% K, 6-fold S, and 2.6-fold P, compared to
AF) suggested that bacterial metal toxicities are broadly comparable between the two matrices
(Table S5). The agar polysaccharide in solid R2A medium contributes a macromolecular
matrix of metal cation binding sites, similar to the cell walls of Arabidopsis which interact with
the AF *in vivo*. Agar also contributes substantial quantities of contaminant Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+}
cations capable of competing with Cd^{2+} and Zn^{2+}, compared to liquid R2A media (Table S3).
Thus, unsurprisingly, bacteria generally tolerated higher Cd concentrations in solid than in
liquid R2A medium ($\geq$ 16-fold difference for L262 and the intermediate SynCom, > 10-fold
for L203 and L233; compare Fig. 1C with Figure S2, Fig. 2A with Suppl. Fig. S5).

We expect the composition of leaf AF to be highly dynamic, which must be kept in mind when
comparing with the metal concentrations in our bacterial tolerance assays. In addition to the
concentrations of free metal cations and other contributing factors outlined above, a pH
decrease (Geilfus 2017; Geilfus et al. 2020) and a more oxidized redox state can directly
enhance metal toxicity in AF by decreasing the proportion of metal cations in complexed or
bound from, thereby increasing the bioavailable fraction of free aqueous metal cations.

Importantly, in response to infection by the necrotrophic fungus *Plectosphaerella cucumerina*, Arabidopsis accumulated Zn^{2+} in the leaf apoplast dependent on the Zn^{2+}/Cd^{2+} efflux pump-encoding genes *AtHMA2* and *AtHMA4* (Escudero et al. 2022). Microbe-induced fluxes of metal cations across the plasma membrane of plant cells may be more widespread than is currently recognized. Interpreting the differences in overall metal tolerances of the *At*-LSHERE collection compared to soil bacterial communities as an outcome of selective strain enrichment would imply that in phyllosphere bacterial communities even the mildest Zn and Cd toxicities are ecologically relevant (compare EC_5 in Table 1). We observed the largest relative differences between *At*-LSPHERE and soil bacterial Zn and Cd tolerances for EC_{95} (Table 1). One possible interpretation of this observation is that severe metal toxicities are ecologically highly important for Zn^{II} (corresponding to the degree of toxicity inflicted by 0.66 to 11 mM Zn in solid R2A medium), Cd^{II} (0.054 to 0.56 mM Cd) and possibly also Cu^{II} (1.4 to 1.6 mM Cu^{II}).

In contrast to Zn, Cd has no known nutritional role in Arabidopsis, raising the question of acquisition and partitioning of Cd by plants in conjunction with the possible biological role in plant-microbe interactions suggested by our results. In addition to HMA2 and HMA4, and among other characterized membrane transporters (Sterckeman and Thomine 2020), Cd^{2+} is a secondary substrate of the high-affinity root Fe^{2+} uptake systems IRT1 of Arabidopsis and RIT1 of pea (Cohen, Garvin, and Kochian 2004; Connolly, Fett, and Guerinot 2002; Vert et al. 2002). In the Zn- and Cd-hyperaccumulating species *Arabidopsis halleri*, extremely high concentrations of 3 to 54 mg g^{-1} Zn and 0.1 to 3.6 mg g^{-1} Cd in bulk leaf dry biomass are thought to function as elemental defenses against biotic stress (Kazemi-Dinan et al. 2014; Stein et al. 2017; Hörger, Fones, and Preston 2013). Maximal Zn and Cd concentrations in leaves of healthy *A. thaliana* plants are less than 10% by comparison, but this does not preclude the possibility of a highly localized accumulation of Zn or Cd to levels that can be toxic for bacteria. Much higher bacterial toxicity of Cd compared to Zn (Table 1), as well as the poor correlation between Cd and Zn tolerance among *At*-LSPHERE strains (Figure 4), argue against the possibility that our findings could merely be a consequence of the general similarity between the chemical properties of Cd and Zn.

For metal(loid)s other than Zn and Cd, there was substantially less evidence for a role in shaping phyllosphere microbial communities. Cu^{II} concentrations in AF were far below Cu^{II} levels toxic for *At*-LSPHERE bacteria on agar-solidified media, and *At*-LSPHERE bacteria

were not generally more Cu^{II}-tolerant than soil bacteria (Figure 1). Cd toxicity to the keystone

strains L233-*Rhodococcus* and L262-*Rhizobium* was potentiated by the additional presence of

Cu^{II} only at a high concentration of 100 µM in liquid R2A medium (Figure 2). However, some

existing knowledge supports that Cu could be relevant in plant-microbe interactions. Human

macrophages mediate the local accumulation of Cu ions in the phagolysosome to kill pathogens

(Achard et al. 2012; White et al. 2009; Samanovic et al. 2012). Transcript profiling revealed

that several copper-related genes were upregulated in *A. thaliana* leaves in response to the

strain *Methylobacterium extorquens* PA1 (Vogel et al. 2016), and the treatment of Arabidopsis

with Cu was reported to enhance its immunity against *Pseudomonas syringae* pv *tomato*

DC3000, for example (Xia et al. 2026). The strongest biotoxic effects of Cu generally result

from redox cycling between oxidized Cu^{II} and reduced Cu^{I}, and from exposure to Cu^{I}

(Samanovic et al. 2012). Plasma membrane-localized gp91^{phox} NADPH oxidases, such as the

superoxide-producing *At*rbohD and *At*rbohF as well as the Cu^{II} chelate reductases *At*FRO4 and

*At*FRO5, could contribute to redox cycling of Cu in a manner analogous to their proposed role

in human immune cells (Torres, Dangl, and Jones 2002; Nathan and Shiloh 2000) and to the

reduction of extracellular Cu^{II} to Cu^{I} (Bernal et al. 2012). Indeed, *AtrbohD* is important for the

maintenance of microbiota in leaves of *A. thaliana* (Pfeilmeier et al. 2021), but a relationship

with Cu was not reported. Total As was below our detection limits in AWF, and bacteria

seemed to be comparably tolerant to arsenite (As^{III}) and arsenate (As^{V}) on solid R2A medium.

Organo-arsenicals, which can be far more toxic than inorganic forms of As, warrant further

investigation, given that *A. thaliana* can take up dimethylarsenate and convert it into

dimethylmonothioarsenate- and dimethyldithioarsenate, for example (Colina Blanco et al.

2023). For Mn and As^{III}, only EC_5 values were higher in the *At*-LSPHERE than in the soil

bacterial collection, implying a possible ecological relevance associated with mildly toxic

concentrations in AF (Table 1), which will require further work. The finding that Mn^{II}

alleviated Cd^{II} toxicity in keystone strain L203-*Microbacterium* in liquid R2A media may be

related to this (Figure 2).

To date, the information available from previous metal(loid) tolerance screens of bacterial

strain collections is limited. Much of the available information is from single bacteria

hypothesized to exhibit enhanced metal(loid) tolerance (Zhao et al. 2015; Tada and Inoue

2000), and from multiple strains collected in environments characterized by high levels of

abiotic stress or heavy metals (Abou-Shanab, van Berkum, and Angle 2007; Nieto, Ventosa,

and Ruiz-Berraquero 1987). Overall, these studies concur with our results regarding the

comparably high toxicity of Cd and the overall narrow concentration range for Cu^{II} (see Table

1, Figure 1). Although *Actinobacteria* were the least Cd-tolerant among *At*-LSPHERE strains,

a study of heavy metal-tolerant *Actinobacteria* identified strains able to tolerate Cd and Cu

concentrations of up to 100 mM, i.e., about 70- and 100-fold higher concentrations than the

most tolerant strains of the *At*-LSPHERE collection (Amoroso et al. 1998). Across these

previous studies, natural variation in bacterial metal tolerances is very large, and the

environment of bacterial origin appears to be more influential than their phylogeny. Metal

tolerances of *At*-LSPHERE strains were mostly lower than those reported in bacteria

originating from metal-rich environments, with some remaining uncertainty given the diversity

of media and designs among tolerance assays used.

3.2 Relationship of metal(loid) tolerance with phylogeny and the gene content of bacterial

genomes

Phylogenetically closely related bacteria tended to exhibit similar metal tolerance profiles, and

our results supported a genetic basis of differential metal tolerance profiles (Figures 5 to 7).

However, there were some notable exceptions of closely related bacteria with contrasting metal

tolerance profiles (Figure 2) and of bacterial strains for which metal tolerance phenotypes

deviated from expectations based on the metal tolerance genes present in the genome. For

instance, only a few of the genes related to Cd tolerance were present in the genome of L92-

Methylobacterium, which was among the three most highly Cd-tolerant strains (Figure 7). The

functions of identically annotated genes may differ between bacterial strains, and of the genes

contributing to bacterial metal tolerances some are likely to remain unidentified, for example

in the Cd-tolerant strains L337- and L137-*Arthrobacter*.

We identified some candidate genes in *At*-LSPHERE strains among the genes annotated as

metal(loid)-related based on previous work in bacterial models (Figures 7, Table S10). Of the

genes strongly implicated in Cd tolerance in the *At*-LSPHERE collection, the *czc* and *znt*

operons are well-known (Figures 6 and 7, Table S10, Data S4). The CzcCBA efflux system of

Ralstonia metallidurans pumps Cd out of cells (Nies et al. 1989; Nies and Silver 1989; Nies

1992b) for Cd resistance (Silver and Walderhaug 1992; Nies 1992a), supported by a virtual

model of *R. metallidurans* (Legatzki et al. 2003). Bacterial ZntA Zn/Cd/Pb-transporting P-type

ATPase proteins often function in Zn detoxification and are also relevant for Cd resistance

(Rensing, Mitra, and Rosen 1997; Singh et al. 1999; Outten, Outten, and O'Halloran 1999;

Beard et al. 1997; Choudhury and Srivastava 2001; Chaoprasid et al. 2015). A low

concentration of Cd (50 μM) completely inhibited growth of an *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* C58 loss-of-function *zntA* mutant (Chaoprasid et al. 2015). Surprisingly, we did not identify the gene encoding the known regulator of *zntA*, *zntR* (Table S10), and its presence even appeared to be inversely related to Cd tolerance (Figure 6).

In addition to these well described Cd tolerance mechanisms, our data implicated Resistance-Nodulation-Division (RND) type multidrug efflux pump component-encoding *mdtA*, *B*, and *C* in Cd tolerance of *At*-LSPHERE bacteria. In *Escherichia coli*, periplasmic MdtA connects the inner membrane efflux pump MdtBC to the outer membrane channel TolC to confer antibiotic resistance (Nagakubo et al. 2002; Nishino, Nikaido, and Yamaguchi 2007; Kim, Nagore, and Nikaido 2010). The fourth gene of the *mdtABCD* operon *mdtD* encodes a putative transporter MdtD, which is also involved in antibiotic resistance and can promote the efflux of citrate, later renamed iron-citrate efflux Transporter IceT in *Salmonella typhimurium* (Frawley et al. 2013). A knockout of *tolC* in *E. coli* resulted in Cd hypersensivity (Achard-Joris et al. 2005). Moreover, mRNA of genes encoding the AcrAB-TolC efflux pump (*acrB* and *tolC*) were upregulated in Cd-adapted *Salmonella* Typhi Ty2 cells (Kaur et al. 2021). The MdtABC system was implicated in Zn and Cu tolerance in *Salmonella enterica* (Nishino, Nikaido, and Yamaguchi 2007). Supporting the *in planta* relevance of RND-type efflux systems, an RND family efflux transporter MFP subunit (Mext_2832) was detected in the *in planta* proteome of *M. extorquens* PA1 (Müller, Schubert, et al. 2016), and efflux systems including CzcABC family RND transporters were among the proteins induced during phyllosphere colonization in *Rhizobium* L68 and *Sphingomonas* L257 (Hemmerle et al. 2022).

Our results implicated genes with well-characterized roles in As tolerance, *arsC1..arsC* and *arsH*, in Cd tolerance of *At*-LSPHERE strains (Figures 6 and 7, Table S10, Data S4). Among three different KO identifiers linked to *arsC* (*arsC1..arsC*, K00537; *arsC2..arsC*; K03741, *arsC*, K18701; Data S4), only *arsC1..arsC* (*arsC1*), described as arsenate reductase that uses glutathione as a cofactor (glutaredoxin) in the KEGG database, showed a positive effect on Cd tolerance. Dhankher et al. (2003) reported that bacterial *arsC1* conferred Cd tolerance to *E. coli*, and to *A. thaliana* and *Nicotiana tabacum* plants, but the underlying mechanism remains unidentified. The second Cd tolerance candidate gene in the *ars* operon, *arsH* was described as a methylarsenite oxidase that can form the less toxic methylarsenate (Yang and Rosen 2016) and as an H_2O_2-producing enzyme that can alleviate oxidative stress in *Synechocystis* PCC 6803 (Lopez-Maury, Florencio, and Reyes 2003). In *Pseudomonas chenduensis* strain MBR,

arsH transcript levels were upregulated under Cd toxicity (Li et al. 2020). There is no published information on roles in Cd tolerance for the two remaining Cd tolerance candidate genes, *cusB* (annotated to encode a component of a Cu^+ detoxification system), and *zur* (encoding a Zn sensor mediating the transcriptional repression of genes encoding high-affinity Zn uptake systems in its Zn^{2+}-bound form). Effective repression of Zn^{2+} uptake may help to decrease inadvertent uptake of Cd^{2+} cations when they are abundant. We detected no effect for *cadC..smtB*, which was previously implicated in bacterial Cd tolerance (Endo and Silver 1995).

Future work should test further the hypothesis supported by our results that apoplastic Zn and Cd contribute to the structuring of bacterial communities in the leaf endosphere of *A. thaliana*, as well as investigate the roles of physiologically relevant chemical forms of Cu and As that could not be tested here. What currently remains limiting is the lack of cell biology tools capable of quantitatively monitoring the dynamics of apoplastic free metal cation concentrations and of genetic tools for changing these without affecting other aspects of plant metal homeostasis that could have indirect effects on microbial performance. In the future, exclusion of epiphytic bacteria may facilitate the analysis of interactions between the plant host and bacteria in the leaf endosphere (Chen et al. 2020). Finally, future functional studies can target metal(loid) tolerance candidate genes identified here in the published genomes of *At*-LSPHERE bacteria.

4. Material and Methods

4.1 Plant Material and Growth Conditions

Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh., accession Columbia (Col-0), wild-type plants were sown on commercially available greenhouse soil (Balster Einheitserdewerk, Fröndenberg, Germany) in 10 cm x 10 cm x 11 cm square pots (~ 100 seeds per pot) and watered once with Previcur Energy (Bayer CropScience, Monheim, Germany) against fungi, followed by stratification at 4°C in darkness for 2 d. Subsequently, plants were transferred into a growth chamber (CLF Plant Climatics, Wertingen, Germany) and grown in short-day conditions (145 μmol m^{-2} s^{-1} and 22°C for 8 h, dark period at 18°C for 16 h). Two weeks later, equal-sized seedlings were transferred into fresh pots (one plant per pot, 0.7 L greenhouse soil, or a mix of natural soil from Bad Gottleuba, 50°50'45.7" N 13°59'43.1" E, with sand and greenhouse soil, at 35 + 15 + 50 volume parts, respectively), and covered with a clear plastic humidity dome for one week. Plants were fertilized once every 14 d (0.3% (v/v) Wuxal Super 8-8-6, Hauert MANNA

Düngewerk GmbH, Nürnberg, Germany), watered with a suspension of *Bacillus thuringiensis israelensis* (Neudomück, W. Neudorff GmbH KG, Emmerthal, Germany) against fungus gnats once a week, and cultivated in individual pots for seven to eight weeks in total.

4.2 Isolation of Apoplastic Wash Fluid from Leaves of *A. thaliana*

All handling of plant tissues was conducted using plastic tweezers. For each sample, leaves of $\geq$ 75% full-grown length that appeared healthy and unscathed were cut off at the petiole using a razor blade, pooled from two *A. thaliana* plants, rinsed in ultrapure water, blotted dry, and weighed. The isolation of apoplastic wash fluid was carried out according to O'Leary et al. (2014), with modifications. Leaves were immersed in an infiltration fluid (IF) of either ultrapure water or 100 µM EDTA (pH 7.2) inside a 1-L side arm vacuum flask containing 1 L of IF and covered by a plastic mesh cover that was weighed down by a glass rod placed on top of the mesh. We conducted three cycles of vacuum infiltration at 30 mbar for 3 min followed by the release of the vacuum over a period of 3 min. After recovering the leaves and blotting them dry gently with soft tissue paper, five to eight leaves of one sample were placed next to one another on a 10 cm x 10 cm segment of Parafilm ("M" strips; PECHINEY PLASTIC PACKAGING, Chicago, United States of America), rolled gently around the outer surface of 5-mL pipette tips, and the arrangements were then placed tip-down into 50-mL polypropylene tubes. This procedure was repeated until all leaves had been processed. Apoplastic wash fluid (AWF) was extracted by centrifuging in a swinging bucket rotor at 1,000x*g* and 4°C for 15 minutes, followed by measuring the volume of each obtained AWF sample and weighing the remaining extracted leaves. Leaf biomass was used as an information to track possible differences in hydration status between plants and experiments, but was not used in any calculations. The recovered AWF was transferred into 1.5-mL tubes, centrifuged at 15,000x*g* for 5 min, and the supernatant transferred into a fresh 1.5-mL tube and stored at -80°C. To estimate the concentrations of solutes in apoplastic fluid (AF) *in vivo* from concentrations measured in AWF samples, we experimentally determined a dilution factor for the AF in the AWF (2.35; n = 4) in one experiment, as described in O'Leary et al. (2014). To test for cytoplasmic contamination, glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase (G6PDH) activity was quantified in one initial experiment using a commercially available assay kit (Sigma-Aldrich) according to the user manual (Data S5). Compared to a PCA of ionomic profiles of AF (Figure S4; see Methods below), G6PDH activity was a far less sensitive marker for the detection of cytoplasmic contamination (Data S5). To identify the effects of cytosolic contamination on

AWF composition, we intentionally damaged leaf samples (in duplicate) using both IF solutions in each experiment. For weak simulated damage, we released the vacuum faster. For intermediate simulated damage, we additionally handled the infiltrated leaves harshly. For strong simulated damage, we additionally pressed the leaves against the 5-mL pipette tips. In each experiment, IF was sampled from the vacuum flasks following the removal of the leaves after infiltration to quantify baseline contamination originating from the leaf surface, as well as from the materials and solutions used.

4.3 Multi-Element Analysis

To estimate the elemental composition of leaf AF of *A. thaliana,* AWF was dried in 1.5-mL polypropylene tubes at 60°C for 7 d, and subsequently acid-digested by adding 500 µL 65% (w/w) HNO_3 and incubating RT overnight, then heating to 60°C for 1 h, 80°C for 1 h and 100°C for 1 h, with automated mixing at 300 rpm for 30 s every 5 min (Thermomixer Comfort, Eppendorf SE, Hamburg, Germany). Digests were transferred to 15 mL polypropylene tubes, together with an additional rinse of the 1.5-mL tubes with 500 µL 65% (w/w) HNO_3, and samples were filled up to a final volume of 5 mL with ultrapure water after cooling. For multi-element analysis of leaves, they were placed into 4.4 × 8 cm paper bags and dried at 60°C for 7 d and then equilibrated at room temperature for $\geq$ 3 d. Dried leaves were homogenized in 1.5-mL tubes with 3 to 5 acid-washed ceramic beads at 30 s^{-1} for 30 s (Retsch MM300, RETSCH GmbH, Haan, Germany). Aliquots of approximately 20 mg dried leaf powder were weighed into perfluoroalkoxy alkane (PFA) vessels and digested in 3 mL 65% (w/w) HNO_3 using microwave-assisted digestion (1600 W, ramp time 20 min, hold time 15 min (190°C)) (MARSX$_{PRESS,}$ CEM Corporation, Matthews, USA). After cooling down to RT in ambient air, digests were transferred into 15-mL polypropylene tubes and filled up to a final volume of 5 mL with ultrapure water. For multi-element analyses of liquid R2A media, 50-mL samples were dried in PFA tubes at 100°C and subsequently digested as described for leaf material. To analyze the agar used in solid R2A media, aliquots of around 120 mg were weighed into 15-mL polypropylene tubes, incubated in 2 mL 65% (w/w) HNO_3 at RT overnight and filled up to a total volume of 10 mL with ultrapure water. Multi-element analysis was conducted using Inductively Coupled Plasma-Optical Emission Spectrometry (ICP-OES) in an iCAPDuo 6500 instrument (Thermo Fisher, Dreieich, Germany). Calibration was done using a blank and a series of five multielement standards that were manually pipetted from single- element standard solutions for 13 (AWF from experiments on greenhouse soil) or 16 (AWF from experiments

on the natural soil mix) elements commonly detected in Arabidopsis and expected to be present
in the apoplast, and 17 elements for analyses of bulk leaves (AAS Standards; Bernd Kraft,
Duisburg, Germany). The precision of measurements was validated by measuring a sample
blank and an intermediate calibration standard, as well as for the analysis of leaves additionally
a certified reference material (Virginia tobacco leaves, INCT-PVTL 6; Institute of Nuclear
Chemistry and Technology, Warsaw, Poland) and an *A. thaliana* lab-internal reference
material. Soil total and HCl-extractable fractions were prepared and analyzed as described
(Stein et al. 2017).

4.4 Media Preparation

Media were prepared as described by Bai et al. (2015) with the following changes: Before
pouring plates, solid R2A media were cooled to 44°C and supplemented with metal or
metalloid from 100 mM or 1 M stock solutions to final concentrations as indicated in Table
S2. All metal and metalloid stock solutions were sterile-filtered after preparation, using a 50
mL syringe (TERUMO EUROPE N.V., Leuven. Belgium) and a sterile syringe filter (Filtropur
S (0.2 μm), SARSTEDT AG & Co. KG, Nürmbrecht, Germany), and stored at room
temperature or 4°C. For the arsenate concentration series including the control, low-phosphate
R2A medium was used (Table S1). Metal tolerance screening was conducted on square (120 x
120 x 17 mm) plates. Liquid media was prepared as described above excluding the addition of
agar.

4.5 High-Throughput Metal Tolerance Screening

Each of the 224 isolates of the *A. thaliana* phyllosphere (*At*-LSPHERE; Bai et al.
2015)collection was cultivated in 3 mL liquid R2A medium containing methanol (0.5% v/v) in
darkness at room temperature, with continuous shaking (300 rpm), for 2 to 3 d. Saturated
cultures were mixed 1:1 (vol:vol) with sterile-filtered 70% (v/v) glycerol in ultrapure water
and stored in 96-well plates at -80°C. Stocks in 96-well plates were defrosted and screened
under sterile conditions on solidified R2A media using a sterilized 96-pin microplate replicator
(Boekel Scientific, Feasterville, USA). The inoculated plates were incubated at RT in the dark
for up to 20 d. Photos were taken after 10 and 20 days of cultivation. Growth was scored based
on the photos. For metal screening, nine independent experiments were performed in total.
Three independent experiments (repeats) were conducted for each metal(loid) series, each
consisting of a control of unamended medium and six different concentrations (Table S2).

When needed, further experiments were conducted including additional metal(loid)
concentrations to estimate growth parameters (Table S2, see data analysis below). Surviving
strains were scored after 10 d of cultivation, and their number normalized to that on the
unamended control medium.

4.6 Assessment of Tolerances of Single Strains in Liquid Medium

The four keystone strains L203-*Microbacterium*, L231-*Sphingomonas*, L233-*Rhodococcus,*
and L262-*Rhizobium* (Carlström et al. 2019) were cultivated on round petri plates containing
agar-solidified R2A medium (60 x 15 mm) at RT for one week. Subsequently, single colonies
were transferred into 3 mL of liquid R2A medium and cultivated at RT for 1 to 2 d. Each strain
was diluted with sterile liquid R2A medium to an OD_{600} of 0.2 (SYNERGY HTX multi-mode
reader, BioTek Instruments GmbH, Bad Friedrichshall, Germany), mixed 1:1 (vol:vol) with
70% (v/v) sterile-filtered glycerol and stored at -80°C. For the quantification of metal
tolerances based on growth curves, five µL of each stock bacterial suspension, or of a 1:1
(vol:vol) mix of liquid R2A medium and sterilized 70% (v/v) glycerol in ultrapure water for
blanks, were added per well containing 195 µL liquid R2A media with or without (control)
metal supplementation (three independent experiments, 5 technical replicates per experiment)
in a 96-well plate. Bacterial strains were cultivated in darkness at 22 to 28°C for 24 h (Cd only,
Figure S5) and 48 h (combined metal toxicities, Figure 2B and C, Table S8 and S9), with hourly
OD_{600} measurements (SYNERGY HTX multi-mode reader) preceded by horizontal shaking at
200 rpm for 5 min.

4.7 Experiments with Synthetic Communities

We designed three synthetic communities (SynComs) consisting of 10 strains with low,
intermediate, and high Cd tolerance, respectively, which matched the phylogenetic profile of
the full *At*-LSPHERE collection as closely as possible (Figure S2 and S3). Strains were pre-
cultivated as described for single-strain tolerance quantification. For each SynCom, 100 µL per
strain of individual 1:1 (vol:vol) suspensions of the bacterial culture and 70% (v/v) sterile-
filtered glycerol were combined to obtain a final total volume of 1 mL, followed by storage of
both the SynComs and the single-strain pre-cultures at -80°C. To test for growth of the
SynComs and the constituent single strains on solid R2A media supplemented with a series of
Cd concentrations, 5-µL aliquots of each stock were spotted manually, and plates were
incubated in darkness at RT for 10 d. Cd tolerances of SynComs were quantified in liquid R2A

medium as described for the keystone strains above, with an OD$_{600}$ measurement once every
30 minutes over a period of $\geq$ 20 h (5 independent experiments, with 6 technical replicates per
experiment).

4.8 Data Analysis and Visualization

All data was organized in Microsoft Excel (Microsoft Corporation, Redmond, USA) and
analyzed using the R computing language (version 4.3.0 (R_Core_Team 2023)) in the Rstudio
environment (version 2023.06.0.421 (Posit_team 2023)). Graphical abstracts, schemes, and
plot fine-tuning were carried out using Inkscape (version 1.2.2 (Inkscape_Project 2020)).

Processing of data from metal(loid) tolerance screening of the At-LSPHERE strain collection

Strains surviving on metal-amended solid R2A media were counted and normalized to the total
number of strains to calculate survival rates. The `GRfit()` function from the *GRmetrics*
package was used to obtain dose-response curves and to calculate various metrics. With a
modified `GRdrawDRC()` function and the *ggplot2* package, data were plotted alongside dose-
response curves ($f(x) = E_{inf}+(1-E_{inf})/(1+(x/EC_{50})^h)$) (Figure 1A & B). To calculate EC$_n$ values
shown in Table 1, $EC_n = ((1+E_{inf})/((1-n/100)-E_{inf})\times EC_{50}{}^h - EC_{50}{}^h)^{1/h}$ was used (E_{inf}: proportion
of bacteria surviving an infinite metal concentration, set to 0 for calculating EC$_n$; EC$_n$:
metal(loid) concentration at which n% of the strains failed to grow; h: Hill coefficient of the
fitted curve; x the metal concentration in the medium [mM]; and y the proportion of surviving
strains [%]. pie plots were generated using the *ggplot2* and *tidyverse* packages from counts of
strains surviving at each specific metal(loid) condition were counted and normalizing by
phylogenetic class. Statistical significance*s* of depletion or enrichment of each class were
calculated using Fisher's exact test, Then, p-values were corrected for false discovery rates by
calculating q-values with the *qvalue* package.

Next, we calculated the strain-wise maximum permissive concentration (MPC) for each
metal(loid) as the median of three independent experiments based on our raw data. For those
bacterial strains and metal(loid)s for which MPCs were apparently below the lowest or above
the highest metal concentrations employed in our initial concentration series, we conducted
additional experiments including lower/higher metal concentrations as appropriate. To show
the metal tolerances of the keystone strains, spider charts were generated using Microsoft
Excel.

 Clustering of metal tolerance profiles and tests for relationships between metal tolerance and

phylogeny

Medians of strain-wise MPC were converted to *z*-scores across isolates for each metal using

the `scale()` function. A Euclidean distance matrix was generated with the `dist()` function

for hierarchical clustering. Based on an agglomerative coefficient of 0.98 calculated using the

`agnes()` function from package *cluster*, Ward clustering was the best-fitting method.

Therefore, for clustering the `hclust()` function was used with the ward.D2 method. The

heatmap plot was generated with the `heatmap.2()` function from the *gplots* package, with a

customized dendrogram created with the *colorspace* (for color palette) and the *dendextend*

packages. Principal components (PCs) were calculated with the `prcomp()` function. To test

the significance of the PC analyses (PCA), the package *PCAtest* was used. Null distributions

for PCA statistics were generated using 999 random permutations, and sampling variance was

estimated based on 999 bootstrap replicates. Loading indices were used to evaluate the effect

of variables (loadings) to each PC. PCAs were plotted using the `ggbiplot()` function from

the package *ggbiplot* and the package *ggplot2*. For a constrained principal coordinate analysis

(CPCoA), the package *vegan* with the `capscale()` function was used. The analysis was

constrained either by class or by genus. Statistical significance of the ordinations and

confidence intervals for the variance were calculated by ANOVA-like permutation tests with

the `permutest()` and `anova.cca()` function with 99 permutations (Robbins et al. 2018).

Results were plotted with the `ggplot()` function from *ggplot2* package.

The phylogenetic tree was built using the 16s rRNA sequences published (Bai et al. 2015). All

206 sequences available for strains of the collection were downloaded from www.at-

sphere.com. To generate a tree, the sequences were aligned with `msa()` function from the *msa*

in R, followed by the computation of a distance matrix using the `msaConvert()` function

from the *msa* package and the `dist.alignment()` function from the *seqinr* package.

Finally, the tree was built with `bionj()` function from *ape* package. For each strain and

metal(loid), the MPC was normalized to the EC_{50} of the full *At*-LSPHERE collection (see Table

1), linked to the tree, and plotted using the *ggtree* and *ggfruit* packages.

Processing of data from time-dependent growth curves in liquid media for Cd and combined

metal tolerances

OD$_{600}$ values were ln-transformed and plotted in R. To calculate doubling times during in Cd-

exposed cultures, the first observed Log phase of growth, the initial (Time T1, ln(OD$_{600}$1),)

and final (Time T2, ln(OD$_{600}$2)) values were extracted using the *zoo* package and a linear

model, followed by the calculation of the growth rate $r = \ln(\text{OD}_{600}2/\text{OD}_{600}1) / (T2-T1)$ and the

doubling time $t_d = \ln(2)/r$ and plotting with R. To analyze tolerances in combined metal

treatments, the growth curves were fitted with generalized additive models with integrated

smoothness estimation. For growth detection, a threshold was established (six times the

standard deviation from all measurements during the initial 4 h of cultivation) and the average

timepoint calculated at which OD$_{600}$ reached this threshold (significance testing by one-way

ANOVA with Tukey's multiple comparisons *post hoc* test). Visual changes of growth curves

(V), defined as noticeable alterations in the trajectory or shape of the growth curve indicating

an impairment relative to the control, were scored together with significant increases in the

time points of threshold crossing (T) and summarized (Table S8 and Table S9). Results were

visualized with the free and open-source vector graphics editor Inkscape.

Analysis for associations between metal tolerance and the presence of metal(loid)-related

candidate genes in the genome

Based on the available KEGG Orthology (KO) database annotations for the *At*-LSPHERE

collection (Bai et al. 2015) we identified genes that named any of the metal(loids) tested here

in the description. Only genes present in at least 8 strains were retained, resulting in a total of

100 genes analyzed further (Data S2). KEGG data were loaded from www.at-sphere.com to

analyze the presence/absence of genes (Data S3) in the genome of each strain of the *At*-

LSPHERE collection. The dataset was organized with the `pivot_longer()` function from

the *tidyr* package. For each metal(loid)- related gene, bacterial strains were split into two

groups, one group in which the gene of interest was present in the genome and one group

lacking the gene of interest. For each metal(loid), we tested for significant differences between

the median of strain-wise MPCs of the two groups employing a Wilcoxon rank-sum test with

Holm-Bonferroni corrections (p_{adj}, Data S4). Among the resulting gene-metal pairs, we then

selected the subset for which the median of at least one MPC differed significantly between

groups by a factor of ≥ 2 (Table S10). We visualized the genomic copy number of genes as a

circular heatmap, as described above for strain-wise MPCs. All 100 genes were used for a

Constrained Principal Component Analysis (CPCoA) on the presence/absence of genes. The

statistical significances of constraints and of axes were assessed using the function

`anova.cca()` from the *vegan* package to conduct an ANOVA-like permutation test for

distance-based redundancy analysis (Permutation test, 999 permutations).

To test for the correlation of Cd tolerance with the number of genes with expected functions in

Cd tolerance present in the genome, we conducted a PCA of presence/absence of these genes

together with the MPC for Cd, selected genes based on literature research, independent of the

approach described above. As a second independent approach, we used the same group of

genes to calculate a "Gene score" for each strain by summing up all genes (each + 1) and their

additional gene copies (each + 1) present in the genome using the `mutate()` function from

the *tidyverse* package. The `cor.test()` function was used to test for a correlation between

"Gene score" and Cd tolerance (MPC) using Kendall's rank correlation, and the results were

plotted using the `ggplot()` function from the *ggplot2* package.

Acknowledgements

864 We thank Prof. Dr. Franz Narberhaus for access to 96-pin microplate replicator. We thank

865 Andreas Aufermann, Rebekka Fresen and Martin Pullack for assistance with plant cultivation

866 and Petra Düchting for contributing her expertise and for conducting all multi-element

867 analyses.

Figure legends

Figure 1. Metal(loid) tolerances of phyllosphere bacterial strains in relation to the leaf

apoplastic fluid ionome of *A. thaliana*. (A, B) Metal(loid) dose-response curves for the

phyllosphere bacterial collection (A, *At*-LSPHERE, $n = 224$ strains) and for a bacterial strain

collection from unplanted soils (B, $n = 25$) (Bai et al. 2015). Each strain was spotted on agar-

solidified R2A medium supplemented with a series of metal(loid) concentrations. Replicate

data points represent independent experiments; lines are curve fits (see Methods, Data S1). **(C)**

Cd tolerance of synthetic bacterial communities (SynComs; datapoints shown by circles, bars

mark mean ± SD, $n = 6$ technical replicates; data from one experiment representative of a total

of four independent experiments). Apparent doubling times of the SynComs were calculated

based on the earliest identifiable log phase of growth from time series of OD_{600} measurements

with cultivation at 26°C for 24 h (see Figure S3). ∞: no growth. Note that the horizontal axis

is not scaled. **(D)** Ionome of leaf apoplastic fluid (AF_{EDTA}, blue line), and of the entire fresh

leaf (Leaf$_{Total}$, red line). Shown is the average (line) and the standard deviation (shadow) for

each element as Log$_{10}$ of the concentration ([mM] for Ca, S, P, Mg, and K; [μM] for Zn, Mo,

Mn, Fe, Cu, and Cd; $n = 4$ samples for AF and $n = 3$ samples for leaves). **(E)** Boxplots showing

metal concentrations in apoplastic fluid (AF$_{EDTA}$, AF$_{Water}$: extracted in 100 μM EDTA and in

water, respectively) of soil-grown plants, alongside metal tolerance of the *At*-LSPHERE

collection (re-plotted from (A)). For AF, boxes show median (central line), 25%/75%ile (box),

and maximum/minimum (bars) of all measurements ($n = 17$; see Table S5, Figure S4E-G). For

metal tolerances, boxes show effective concentration EC$_{50}$ (central line), EC$_{25}$/EC$_{75}$ (boxes)

and EC$_{1-5}$/EC$_{95-99}$ (bars)(see Table 1, and Materials and Methods). Dose-response curves are

from a minimum of 3 independent experiments conducted on R2A medium (A, B). AF data

are from one representative experiment (D; Table S5, GHs 4; Figure S4E-G, E4) and from 4

independent experiments conducted on greenhouse soil (E). Not shown: AF$_{Water}$ for Cd and

data for As were below our detection limits (D, E).

Figure 2. Metal(loid) tolerance profiles of keystone strains of the *A. thaliana* phyllosphere

bacterial community. **(A)** Profiles of maximum permissive concentrations (MPC) normalized

to EC$_{50}$ on solid R2A media. Shown are median values (connected by black lines), with minima

and maxima (grey shadows, $n = 3$ independent experiments), on a Log$_{10}$ scale (1 reflects an

MPC equivalent to EC$_{50}$, see Table 1, Data S1). Values below 0.5 (small red)/0.05 (large red)

and above 5 (small blue) are shown as colored circular shapes. Mn is not shown because of its

low toxicity in these strains. **(B, C)** Combined toxicity effects of Cd and Cu (B), and Cd, Zn,

and Mn (C) on keystone strains in liquid R2A media (see Tables S8 and S9). Symbols show

combined toxicity-enhancing (+) and toxicity-alleviating (-) effects of the metals connected by

the corresponding black line; numbers are concentrations [μM]. Results reproduced in

three/two out of three independent experiments are shown in black/grey color. Grey dotted

lines: effect of the adjacent metal on the combined toxicity of the other two metals (C). Data

not shown (n.e.: results could not be evaluated because of metal sensitivity, B). Circle sizes

adjusted to fit.

Figure 3. Effects of metal(loid) tolerances of *At*-LSPHERE bacterial strains on the

phylogenetic structure among the survivors. Pie fractions reflect the percentage share (with

the number given in white) out of all bacterial strains that were able to grow under a given

condition (Data S1). The metal(loid) concentration is given in black fonts above the chart for

each treatment. *Significant enrichment (black) or depletion (white) compared to the control

condition (*q-value* < 0.05).

Figure 4. Hierarchical clustering of strains according to their metal(loid) tolerance

profiles. Maximum permissive concentrations of Cd, Zn, Cu, arsenite, and Mn in the *At*-

LSPHERE strains (Data S1) were clustered by Euclidean distance-based (Ward) clustering (*z*-

score-based). Clusters (I to X) are emphasized by different colors (left) and separated by

horizontal lines. Symbols mark the positions of *Rhodococcus (n = 6)*, *Pseudomonas* (*n* = 9),

Rhizobium (*n* = 15), and keystone strains (*n* = 4).

Figure 5. Strain-specific metal(loid) tolerances shown over the phylogeny of the *At*-

LSPHERE strain collection. Cladogram of the *At*-LSPHERE strain collection (*n* = 214; 16s

rRNA-based (Bai et al. 2015)) with circular heatmap representations of relative tolerance.

Heatmap color shade reflects strain-wise maximum permissive concentrations (MPC, median

of *n* = 3 independent experiments; Data S1) normalized to the EC_{50}, the concentration

eliminating the growth of 50% of all bacterial strains (Cd: 0.049 mM, Zn: 0.5 mM, Cu: 0.4

mM, As^{III}: 1.1 mM, Mn: 9.2 mM; Table 1). Strains (*n* = 8) not profiled for metal tolerance are

marked by a black line around the colored circle.

Figure 6. Relationships between known Cd tolerance genes and Cd tolerance of *At*-

LSPHERE strains. (A) PCA of strain-wise maximum permissive Cd concentrations (MPC, *z*-

score-based) and presence/absence of known Cd tolerance-related genes. Each datapoint

represents one strain (Data S1-S3). The percentages of variation accounted for by each

significant PC are given in parentheses (95% confidence intervals: PC 1, 31% to 36.7%; PC 2,

10.9% to 13.8%; bootstrapping with 999 replicates). KEGG Orthology (KO) identifiers with

significant loadings on PC1 are: *czcA–D* and *tolC* (alternative short names linked by ".."; Data

S6). **(B)** Plot of strain-wise maximum permissive Cd concentration (MPC, absolute) against a

gene score incorporating both presence/absence and copy number of known Cd tolerance-

related genes. Each datapoint represents one strain (Data S1-S3). The gene score of a strain is

the genome-wide sum of genes with previously published roles in Cd tolerance (see A), with

additional gene copies also counted (Kendall's rank correlation, $\tau = 0.31$, $p = 3.5 \times 10^{-9}$; Data

S7).

Figure 7. Metal(loid)-related genes implicated in Cd tolerance of *At*-LSPHERE strains

shown over phylogeny. Shown are known metal(loid)-related genes of which the presence in

the genome was statistically associated with altered Cd tolerance in our study ($p_{adj} < 0.005$, for

arsH $p_{adj} = 0.023$; with Bonferroni corrections). Colors of KO identifiers reflect whether the

median of maximum permissive concentrations (MPC median) of all positive strains was > 2-

fold higher (red) or > 2-fold lower (blue) than that of all strains lacking an orthologue (Data

S4; else KO id. not shown). Genes (KO identifiers) are only shown if present in at least 30

bacterial strains (Data S4). Strains ($n = 8$) not profiled for metal tolerance are marked by a

black line around the colored circle.

References

Abou-Shanab, R. A., P. van Berkum, and J. S. Angle. 2007. 'Heavy metal resistance and
genotypic analysis of metal resistance genes in gram-positive and gram-negative
bacteria present in Ni-rich serpentine soil and in the rhizosphere of *Alyssum murale*',
Chemosphere, 68: 360-7.
Achard-Joris, M., H. B. van den Berg van Saparoea, A. J. Driessen, and J. P. Bourdineaud.
2005. 'Heterologously expressed bacterial and human multidrug resistance proteins
confer cadmium resistance to *Escherichia coli*', *Biochemistry*, 44: 5916-22.
Achard, Maud E. S., Sian L. Stafford, Nilesh J. Bokil, Jy Chartres, Paul V. Bernhardt, Mark
A. Schembri, Matthew J. Sweet, and Alastair G. McEwan. 2012. 'Copper
redistribution in murine macrophages in response to Salmonella infection', *Biochem J*,
444: 51-57.
Amoroso, M. J., G. R. Castro, F. J. Carlino, N. C. Romero, R. T. Hill, and G. Oliver. 1998.
'Screening of heavy metal-tolerant actinomycetes isolated from the Sali River', *J Gen*
Appl Microbiol, 44: 129-32.
Andersen, T. G., M. Barberon, and N. Geldner. 2015. 'Suberization - the second life of an
endodermal cell', *Curr Opin Plant Biol*, 28: 9-15.
Bai, Y., D. B. Müller, G. Srinivas, R. Garrido-Oter, E. Potthoff, M. Rott, N. Dombrowski, P.
C. Münch, S. Spaepen, M. Remus-Emsermann, B. Hüttel, A. C. McHardy, J. A.
Vorholt, and P. Schulze-Lefert. 2015. 'Functional overlap of the Arabidopsis leaf and
root microbiota', *Nature*, 528: 364-9.
Barberon, M., J. E. Vermeer, D. De Bellis, P. Wang, S. Naseer, T. G. Andersen, B. M.
Humbel, C. Nawrath, J. Takano, D. E. Salt, and N. Geldner. 2016. 'Adaptation of Root
Function by Nutrient-Induced Plasticity of Endodermal Differentiation', *Cell*, 164:
447-59.
Beard, S. J., R. Hashim, J. MembrilloHernandez, M. N. Hughes, and R. K. Poole. 1997.
'Zinc(II) tolerance in *Escherichia coli* K-12: evidence that the *zntA* gene (o732)
encodes a cation transport ATPase', *Mol Microbiol*, 25: 883-91.
Bernal, María, David Casero, Vasantika Singh, Grandon T. Wilson, Arne Grande, Huijun
Yang, Sheel C. Dodani, Matteo Pellegrini, Peter Huijser, and Erin L. Connolly. 2012.
'Transcriptome sequencing identifies SPL7-regulated copper acquisition genes
FRO4/FRO5 and the copper dependence of iron homeostasis in Arabidopsis', *The*
Plant Cell, 24: 738-61.
Bulgarelli, D., K. Schlaeppi, S. Spaepen, E. Ver Loren van Themaat, and P. Schulze-Lefert.
2013. 'Structure and functions of the bacterial microbiota of plants', *Annu Rev Plant*
Biol, 64: 807-38.

Carlström, C. I., C. M. Field, M. Bortfeld-Miller, B. Müller, S. Sunagawa, and J. A. Vorholt. 2019. 'Synthetic microbiota reveal priority effects and keystone strains in the Arabidopsis phyllosphere', *Nat Ecol Evol*, 3: 1445-54.

Chandrangsu, Pete, Christopher Rensing, and John D. Helmann. 2017. 'Metal homeostasis and resistance in bacteria', *Nat Rev Microbiol*, 15: 338-50.

Chaoprasid, Paweena, Sumontha Nookabkaew, Rojana Sukchawalit, and Skorn Mongkolsuk. 2015. 'Roles of *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* C58 ZntA and ZntB and the transcriptional regulator ZntR in controlling $Cd^{2+}/Zn^{2+}/Co^{2+}$ resistance and the peroxide stress response', *Microbiology*, 161: 1730-40.

Chen, T., K. Nomura, X. Wang, R. Sohrabi, J. Xu, L. Yao, B. C. Paasch, L. Ma, J. Kremer, Y. Cheng, L. Zhang, N. Wang, E. Wang, X. F. Xin, and S. Y. He. 2020. 'A plant genetic network for preventing dysbiosis in the phyllosphere', *Nature*, 580: 653-57.

Choudhury, R., and S. Srivastava. 2001. 'Zinc resistance mechanisms in bacteria', *Curr Sci*, 81: 768-75.

Clemens, Stephan. 2001. 'Molecular mechanisms of plant metal tolerance and homeostasis', *Planta*, 212: 475-86.

Cohen, C. K., D. F. Garvin, and L. V. Kochian. 2004. 'Kinetic properties of a micronutrient transporter from *Pisum sativum* indicate a primary function in Fe uptake from the soil', *Planta*, 218: 784-92.

Colina Blanco, A. E., E. Pischke, A. Higa Mori, C. F. Kerl, S. Clemens, and B. Planer-Friedrich. 2023. 'In Planta Arsenic Thiolation in Rice and *Arabidopsis thaliana*', *Environ Sci Technol*, 57: 21846-54.

Connolly, E. L., J. P. Fett, and M. L. Guerinot. 2002. 'Expression of the IRT1 metal transporter is controlled by metals at the levels of transcript and protein accumulation', *Plant Cell*, 14: 1347-57.

Dhankher, Om Parkash, Nupur A. Shasti, Barry P. Rosen, Mark Fuhrmann, and Richard B. Meagher. 2003. 'Increased cadmium tolerance and accumulation by plants expressing bacterial arsenate reductase', *New Phytol*, 159: 431-41.

Endo, G., and S. Silver. 1995. 'CadC, the transcriptional regulatory protein of the cadmium resistance system of *Staphylococcus aureus* plasmid pI258', *J Bacteriol*, 177: 4437-41.

Escudero, Viviana, Álvaro Castro-León, Darío Ferreira Sánchez, Isidro Abreu, María Bernal, Ute Krämer, Daniel Grolimund, Manuel González-Guerrero, and Lucía Jordá. 2022. '*Arabidopsis thaliana* Zn^{2+}-efflux ATPases HMA2 and HMA4 are required for resistance to the necrotrophic fungus *Plectosphaerella cucumerina* BMM', *J Exp Bot*, 73(1):339-350.

Farvardin, A., A. I. Gonzalez-Hernandez, E. Llorens, P. Garcia-Agustin, L. Scalschi, and B. Vicedo. 2020. 'The Apoplast: A Key Player in Plant Survival', *Antioxidants*, 9.

Figueiredo, J., A. R. Cavaco, L. Guerra-Guimaraes, C. Leclercq, J. Renaut, J. Cunha, J. Eiras-Dias, C. Cordeiro, A. R. Matos, M. Sousa Silva, and A. Figueiredo. 2021. 'An apoplastic fluid extraction method for the characterization of grapevine leaves proteome and metabolome from a single sample', *Physiol Plant*, 171: 343-57.

Frawley, E. R., M. L. V. Crouch, L. K. Bingham-Ramos, H. F. Robbins, W. L. Wang, G. D. Wright, and F. C. Fang. 2013. 'Iron and citrate export by a major facilitator superfamily pump regulates metabolism and stress resistance in *Salmonella typhimurium*', *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*, 110: 12054-59.

Geilfus, Christoph-Martin. 2017. 'The pH of the apoplast: dynamic factor with functional impact under stress', *Mol Plant*, 10: 1371-86.

1034   Geilfus, Christoph-Martin, Li Wang, Jiawen Wu, and Cheng Xue. 2020. 'The pH of the leaf
1035   apoplast is critical for the formation of *Pseudomonas syringae*-induced lesions on
1036   leaves of the common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris*)', *Plant Sci*, 290: 110328.
1037   Hemmerle, L., B. A. Maier, M. Bortfeld-Miller, B. Ryback, C. G. Gabelein, M. Ackermann,
1038   and J. A. Vorholt. 2022. 'Dynamic character displacement among a pair of bacterial
1039   phyllosphere commensals *in situ*', *Nat Commun*, 13: 2836.
1040   Hörger, A. C., H. N. Fones, and G. M. Preston. 2013. 'The current status of the elemental
1041   defense hypothesis in relation to pathogens', *Front Plant Sci*, 4: 395.
1042   Kajala, K., K. L. Walker, G. S. Mitchell, U. Krämer, S. R. Cherry, and S. M. Brady. 2019.
1043   'Real-time whole-plant dynamics of heavy metal transport in *Arabidopsis halleri* and
1044   *Arabidopsis thaliana* by gamma-ray imaging', *Plant Direct*, 3: e00131.
1045   Kaur, U. J., A. Chopra, S. Preet, K. Raj, K. K. Kondepudi, V. Gupta, and P. Rishi. 2021.
1046   'Potential of 1-(1-napthylmethyl)-piperazine, an efflux pump inhibitor against
1047   cadmium-induced multidrug resistance in *Salmonella enterica* serovar *typhi* as an
1048   adjunct to antibiotics', *Braz J Microbiol*, 52: 1303-13.
1049   Kazemi-Dinan, A., S. Thomaschky, R. J. Stein, U. Krämer, and C. Müller. 2014. 'Zinc and
1050   cadmium hyperaccumulation act as deterrents towards specialist herbivores and
1051   impede the performance of a generalist herbivore', *New Phytol*, 202: 628-39.
1052   Kim, H. S., D. Nagore, and H. Nikaido. 2010. 'Multidrug efflux pump MdtBC of *Escherichia
1053   coli* is active only as a B2C heterotrimer', *J Bacteriol*, 192: 1377-86.
1054   Krämer, U. 2024. 'Metal Homeostasis in Land Plants: A Perpetual Balancing Act Beyond the
1055   Fulfilment of Metalloproteome Cofactor Demands', *Annu Rev Plant Biol*, 75: 27-65.
1056   Küpper, H., E. Lombi, F. J. Zhao, and S. P. McGrath. 2000. 'Cellular compartmentation of
1057   cadmium and zinc in relation to other elements in the hyperaccumulator *Arabidopsis
1058   halleri*', *Planta*, 212: 75-84.
1059   Legatzki, Antje, Sylvia Franke, Susann Lucke, Toni Hoffmann, Andreas Anton, Dieter
1060   Neumann, and Dietrich H. Nies. 2003. 'First step towards a quantitative model
1061   describing Czc-mediated heavy metal resistance in *Ralstonia metallidurans*',
1062   *Biodegradation*, 14: 153-68.
1063   Li, Lingjuan, Qiang Lin, Tiezhu Li, Xiaohong He, Shuming Peng, and Yong Tao. 2020.
1064   'Transcriptional response of *Pseudomonas chenduensis* strain MBR to cadmium
1065   toxicity', *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol*, 104: 9749-57.
1066   Lopez-Maury, L., F. J. Florencio, and J. C. Reyes. 2003. 'Arsenic sensing and resistance
1067   system in the cyanobacterium *Synechocystis* sp. strain PCC 6803', *J Bacteriol*, 185:
1068   5363-71.
1069   Marschner, Horst, and Petra Marschner. 2012. *Marschner's mineral nutrition of higher plants*
1070   (Elsevier/Academic Press: London ; Waltham, MA).
1071   Müller, D. B., O. T. Schubert, H. Rost, R. Aebersold, and J. A. Vorholt. 2016. 'Systems-level
1072   Proteomics of Two Ubiquitous Leaf Commensals Reveals Complementary Adaptive
1073   Traits for Phyllosphere Colonization', *Mol Cell Proteomics*, 15: 3256-69.
1074   Müller, D. B., C. Vogel, Y. Bai, and J. A. Vorholt. 2016. 'The Plant Microbiota: Systems-
1075   Level Insights and Perspectives', *Annu Rev Genet*, 50: 211-34.
1076   Murdoch, C. C., and E. P. Skaar. 2022. 'Nutritional immunity: the battle for nutrient metals at
1077   the host-pathogen interface', *Nat Rev Microbiol*, 20: 657-70.
1078   Nagakubo, S., K. Nishino, T. Hirata, and A. Yamaguchi. 2002. 'The putative response
1079   regulator BaeR stimulates multidrug resistance of *Escherichia coli* via a novel
1080   multidrug exporter system, MdtABC', *J Bacteriol*, 184: 4161-7.
1081   Nathan, Carl, and Michael U. Shiloh. 2000. 'Reactive oxygen and nitrogen intermediates in
1082   the relationship between mammalian hosts and microbial pathogens', *Proc Natl Acad
1083   Sci U S A*, 97: 8841-48.

Nieboer, E., and Richardson, D.H.S. 1980. 'The replacement of the nondescript term "heavy metals" by a biologically and chemically significant classification of metal ions', *Environ Poll Series B - Chem Phys 1, 3-26.*

Nies, D. H. 1992a. 'CzcR and CzcD, gene products affecting regulation of resistance to cobalt, zinc, and cadmium (czc system) in *Alcaligenes eutrophus*', *J Bacteriol*, 174: 8102-10.

———. 1992b. 'Resistance to cadmium, cobalt, zinc, and nickel in microbes', *Plasmid*, 27: 17-28.

Nies, D. H., A. Nies, L. Chu, and S. Silver. 1989. 'Expression and nucleotide sequence of a plasmid-determined divalent cation efflux system from *Alcaligenes eutrophus*', *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*, 86: 7351-5.

Nies, D. H., and S. Silver. 1989. 'Plasmid-determined inducible efflux is responsible for resistance to cadmium, zinc, and cobalt in *Alcaligenes eutrophus*', *J Bacteriol*, 171: 896-900.

Nies, Dietrich H., and Gregor Grass. 2009. 'Transition metal homeostasis', *EcoSal Plus*, 3: 10-1128.

Nieto, J. J., A. Ventosa, and F. Ruiz-Berraquero. 1987. 'Susceptibility of halobacteria to heavy metals', *Appl Environ Microbiol*, 53: 1199-202.

Nishino, K., E. Nikaido, and A. Yamaguchi. 2007. 'Regulation of multidrug efflux systems involved in multidrug and metal resistance of *Salmonella enterica* serovar *typhimurium*', *J Bacteriol*, 189: 9066-75.

Norvell, W. A. 1991. 'Reactions of Metal Chelates in Soils and Nutrient Solutions.' in, *Micronutrients in Agriculture.*

O'Leary, B. M., A. Rico, S. McCraw, H. N. Fones, and G. M. Preston. 2014. 'The infiltration-centrifugation technique for extraction of apoplastic fluid from plant leaves using *Phaseolus vulgaris* as an example', *J Vis Exp*: 52113.

Outten, C. E., F. W. Outten, and T. V. O'Halloran. 1999. 'DNA distortion mechanism for transcriptional activation by ZntR, a Zn(II)-responsive MerR homologue in *Escherichia coli*', *J Biol Chem*, 274: 37517-24.

Pais, István, and J. Benton Jones. 1997. *The handbook of trace elements* (St. Lucie Press: Boca Raton, Fla.).

Pfeilmeier, S., G. C. Petti, M. Bortfeld-Miller, B. Daniel, C. M. Field, S. Sunagawa, and J. A. Vorholt. 2021. 'The plant NADPH oxidase RBOHD is required for microbiota homeostasis in leaves', *Nat Microbiol*, 6: 852-64.

Rensing, C., B. Mitra, and B. P. Rosen. 1997. 'The *zntA* gene of *Escherichia coli* encodes a Zn(II)-translocating P-type ATPase', *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*, 94: 14326-31.

Ritpitakphong, U., L. Falquet, A. Vimoltust, A. Berger, J. P. Metraux, and F. L'Haridon. 2016. 'The microbiome of the leaf surface of Arabidopsis protects against a fungal pathogen', *New Phytol*, 210: 1033-43.

Robb, J., S. W. Lee, R. Mohan, and P. E. Kolattukudy. 1991. 'Chemical characterization of stress-induced vascular coating in tomato', *Plant Physiol*, 97: 528-36.

Robbins, Chanz, Thorsten Thiergart, Stéphane Hacquard, Ruben Garrido-Oter, Wolfgang Gans, Edgar Peiter, Paul Schulze-Lefert, and Stijn Spaepen. 2018. 'Root-associated bacterial and fungal community profiles of *Arabidopsis thaliana* are robust across contrasting soil P levels', *Phytobiomes*, 2: 24-34.

Samanovic, Marie I., Chen Ding, Dennis J. Thiele, and K. Heran Darwin. 2012. 'Copper in microbial pathogenesis: meddling with the metal', *Cell Host Microbe*, 11: 106-15.

Sattelmacher, B. 2001. 'The apoplast and its significance for plant mineral nutrition', *New Phytol*, 149: 167-92.

Silver, S., and M. Walderhaug. 1992. 'Gene regulation of plasmid- and chromosome-determined inorganic ion transport in bacteria', *Microbiol Rev*, 56: 195-228.

Singh, V. K., A. Xiong, T. R. Usgaard, S. Chakrabarti, R. Deora, T. K. Misra, and R. K. Jayaswal. 1999. 'ZntR is an autoregulatory protein and negatively regulates the chromosomal zinc resistance operon *znt* of *Staphylococcus aureus*', *Mol Microbiol*, 33: 200-7.

Stein, R. J., S. Höreth, J. R. de Melo, L. Syllwasschy, G. Lee, M. L. Garbin, S. Clemens, and U. Krämer. 2017. 'Relationships between soil and leaf mineral composition are element-specific, environment-dependent and geographically structured in the emerging model *Arabidopsis halleri*', *New Phytol*, 213: 1274-86.

Sterckeman, Thibault, and Sébastien Thomine. 2020. 'Mechanisms of Cadmium Accumulation in Plants', *Crit Rev Plant Sci*, 39: 322-59.

Tada, Y., and T. Inoue. 2000. 'Use of oligotrophic bacteria for the biological monitoring of heavy metals', *J Appl Microbiol*, 88: 154-60.

Torres, Miguel Angel, Jeffery L. Dangl, and Jonathan D. G. Jones. 2002. 'Arabidopsis gp91phox homologues AtrbohD and AtrbohF are required for accumulation of reactive oxygen intermediates in the plant defense response', *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*, 99: 517-22.

Vert, G., N. Grotz, F. Dedaldechamp, F. Gaymard, M. L. Guerinot, J. F. Briat, and C. Curie. 2002. 'IRT1, an Arabidopsis transporter essential for iron uptake from the soil and for plant growth', *Plant Cell*, 14: 1223-33.

Vogel, C., N. Bodenhausen, W. Gruissem, and J. A. Vorholt. 2016. 'The Arabidopsis leaf transcriptome reveals distinct but also overlapping responses to colonization by phyllosphere commensals and pathogen infection with impact on plant health', *New Phytol*, 212: 192-207.

Vogel, C. M., D. B. Potthoff, M. Schafer, N. Barandun, and J. A. Vorholt. 2021. 'Protective role of the Arabidopsis leaf microbiota against a bacterial pathogen', *Nat Microbiol*, 6: 1537-48.

Vorholt, J. A. 2012. 'Microbial life in the phyllosphere', *Nat Rev Microbiol*, 10: 828-40.

White, Carine, Jaekwon Lee, Taiho Kambe, Kevin Fritsche, and Michael J. Petris. 2009. 'A role for the ATP7A copper-transporting ATPase in macrophage bactericidal activity', *J Biol Chem*, 284: 33949-56.

Williams, B. 2007. 'The chemistry of evolution: the development of our ecosystem', *Choice: Curr Rev Acad Libr* 44: 1197-97.

Xia, H., Y. Yu, Z. Chen, H. Liu, T. Wang, W. Huang, and Z. Chu. 2026. 'COPT4 interacts with COPT1 or COPT3 to manipulate the signaling response for copper-triggered immunity in Arabidopsis', *New Phytol*, in press.

Yang, Hung-Chi, and Barry P. Rosen. 2016. 'New mechanisms of bacterial arsenic resistance', *Biomed J*, 39: 5-13.

Zhao, C., Y. Zhang, Z. Chan, S. Chen, and S. Yang. 2015. 'Insights into arsenic multi-operons expression and resistance mechanisms in *Rhodopseudomonas palustris* CGA009', *Front Microbiol*, 6: 986.

Keystone strain
Rhodococcus
Pseudomonas
Rhizobium

Cluster

I
II
III
IV
V
VI
VII
VIII
IX
X

L203
L233
L231
L262

z-score
≥ 2
0
≤ -2

Cd Mn As^{III} Zn Cu

A

B

KEGG Orthologs

↓ Cd tolerance

outward

↑ Cd tolerance

■	*csoR..ricR*
■	*smtB*
■	*comB*
■	*PTS-MtlEIIC..mtlA..cmtA*
■	*arsC1..arsC*
■	*arsH*
■	*cusB..silB*
■	*czcA*
■	*czcB*
■	*mdtA*
■	*mdtBC*
■	*tolC*
■	*zntA*
■	*zur*

Genomic copy number

□ 0
▨ 1
■ ≥ 2

Extreme Cd tolerance or sensitivity

▷ MPC ≥ 8-fold EC$_{50}$
▷ MPC ≥ 25-fold EC$_{50}$
▷ MPC ≤ 0.0125-fold EC$_{50}$
▷ no Cd exposure survived

Class

● α-Proteobacteria
● β-Proteobacteria
● γ-Proteobacteria
● Sphingobacteriia
● Flavobacteriia
● Bacilli
● Actinobacteria
● Others