Field evaluation of biocontrol agents against black-foot and Petri diseases of grapevine

María del Pilar Martínez-Diz[1,2], Emilia Díaz-Losada[1], Marcos Andrés-Sodupe[3], Rebeca Bujanda[3], María Mercedes Maldonado-González[3], Sonia Ojeda[3], Amira Yacoub[4], Patrice Rey[4], David Gramaje[3]

[1]Estación de Viticultura e Enoloxía de Galicia (AGACAL-EVEGA), Ponte San Clodio s/n 32428-Leiro-Ourense, Spain.
[2]Universidade da Coruña, Facultade de Ciencias, Zapateira, 15071 A Coruña, Spain.
[3]Instituto de Ciencias de la Vid y del Vino (ICVV), Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas - Universidad de la Rioja - Gobierno de La Rioja, Ctra. LO-20 Salida 13, Finca La Grajera, 26071 Logroño, Spain.
[4]INRA, ISVV, UMR1065 SAVE, F-33140, Villenave d'Ornon, France.

* Correspondence to: D. Gramaje, Instituto de Ciencias de la Vid y del Vino (ICVV), Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Universidad de la Rioja, Gobierno de La Rioja, Ctra. LO-20 Salida 13, 26007 Logroño, Spain.
E-mail: david.gramaje@icvv.es

ABSTRACT

BACKGROUND: Black-foot and Petri diseases are the main fungal diseases associated with young grapevine decline. Two field experiments were established to evaluate the preventive effect of two potential biocontrol agents (BCAs), i.e. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 and *Pythium oligandrum* Po37, and three BCA-commercial products containing *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1, *Trichoderma koningii* TK7 and *Pseudomonas fluorescens+Bacillus atrophaeus* on fungal infection in grafted plants and plant growth parameters.

RESULTS: The effectiveness of some BCA in reducing the incidence and severity of both diseases was dependent on the plant part analyzed and the plant age. No single BCA application was able to control both diseases. *Streptomyces* sp. E1+R4 were able to reduce significantly black-foot disease infection while *P. oligandrum* Po37 and *Trichoderma* spp. were able to reduce significantly Petri disease infection. BCA treatments had no effect on the shoot weight, and root weight was significantly lower in all BCA treatments with respect to the control.

CONCLUSIONS: The combination of the disease-suppressive activity of two or more beneficial microbes in a biocontrol preparation is required to prevent infection by black-foot and Petri disease fungi in vineyards.

Keywords: Bacillus, grapevine trunk diseases, *Pseudomonas, Pythium, Streptomyces, Trichoderma, Vitis vinifera* L.

1

1 INTRODUCTION

Grapevine trunk diseases (GTDs) are one of the most damaging diseases affecting the grapevine industry in all grape-growing regions worldwide, being responsible for yield and productivity loss, and one of the main causes of an early vines death.[1] Among them, black-foot and Petri diseases are the two most common GTDs affecting planting material at nurseries, newly planted vines and young vineyards (<5 years old).[2-4] In La Rioja (northern Spain), the annual financial cost of the replacement of death plants cv Tempranillo in due to black-foot and Petri diseases is estimated to be 7.16 million €/year.[5] Field symptoms of black-foot and Petri diseases affected vines include overall stunting growth, delayed budbreak, retarded or absent sprouting, shortened internodes, chlorotic and sparse foliage with necrotic margins, leaves or entire shoots wilting, and dieback.[3] However, these symptoms also resemble those associated with abiotic disorders such as spring frost, winter damage and/or nutrient deficiency.[1] Characteristic symptoms of black-foot disease include dark brown and soft areas in roots and black discolouration and necrosis in the basal end of the rootstock.[2] Regarding Petri disease, dissected affected vines display brown and black vascular streaking, mainly in the rootstock, and gumming that turns dark when exposed to air.[3]

Up to 32 species of the genera *Campylocarpon, Cylindrocladiella, Dactylonectria, Ilyonectria, Neonectria, Pleiocarpon* and *Thelonectria* have been reported to cause black-foot disease,[1,6-8] *Dactyonectria torresensis* being the most prevalent species associated with diseased vines in Europe.[9-11] These fungal species are known to be soilborne and persist as mycelium and conidia in rotten root fragments or as resting spores (chlamydospores) that can survive in the soil for extended periods of time after infected plants are removed.[4,12] Apparently healthy plants placed in infested nursery soil can become infected through trunk wounds or roots, such as the incomplete callused rootstock end.[2]

The main fungal species associated with Petri disease is *Phaeomoniella (Pa.) chlamydospora*.[13] However, other fungal species that have also been isolated in relatively high frequencies from Petri diseased vines are 29 species of the genus *Phaeoacremonium, Pleurostoma richardsiae*, and 6 *Cadophora* spp.[1] Among those, *Phaeoacremonium (Pm.) minimum* and *Cadophora luteo-olivacea* are the most prevalent.[13,14] *Pa. chlamydospora* and *Phaeoacremonium* spp. can spend part of their disease cycle in soil as mycelium and conidia in infected rootstock wood, roots or pruning debris,[15,16] or chlamydospores in the case of *Pa. chlamydospora*.[15] The presence of *Cadophora* spp. in soils has been recently confirmed using ITS high-throughput amplicon sequencing (HTAS) approach.[17] Therefore, the main hypothesis is that these fungi could gain entry into the xylem of young plants at the nursery or newly established vineyards through root and/or basal end of the rootstock infections. In addition, they are also disseminated through the dispersion of airborne spores (conidia and/or ascospores) by rain, wind or arthropods until they land on susceptible and fresh pruning wounds.[15]

Presently, no curative measures are available to reduce the impact of these diseases once the vines are infected, making their management in the field difficult. Furthermore, the loss of the most effective preventative chemical products such as the banning in the early 2000s of sodium arsenite or benzimidazoles,[18] and the high current restrictions and difficulties that chemicals are facing in most countries around the world because of the risks for human health and the environment,[19,20] increase even more the complexity of their control. Nowadays, the best way to handle these diseases is by using an Integrated Pest Management (IPM) strategy[21] where several strategies are combined to reduce GTDs infections, such as the use of physical (e.g. hot-water treatment), biological (e.g. antagonist microorganisms) and cultural practices (e.g. crop management, irrigation, soil preparation, etc.), throughout the nursery mother blocks and newly planted vineyards.[1]

Investigation of BCAs able to prevent or at least reduce the development of GTDs are considered a research priority.[1] In fact, over the last 10 years there has been a frantic search by

100 the GTDs research community for microbial antagonists, including fungi,[21-33] bacteria,[29,34-40]
101 and oomycetes.[41,42] Although some of these studies provided promising findings, the results
102 have not been consistent, observing differences in efficacy depending on the nature of the BCA,
103 the target pathogen, application method, time of exposure to the BCA and even the grapevine
104 cultivars and rootstocks subjected to study. In addition, most of these studies have been
105 performed so far under *in vitro* laboratory,[26,29,31,32,34-40] greenhouse[29,31,32,35-37,41,42] or nursery[21-25,28,33,38]
106 controlled conditions by using rootstock or scion cuttings.
107   Three *Trichoderma*-based biological products are currently registered in Spain for the
108 preventive protection of pruning wounds against GTD fungi, namely Esquive® (*Trichoderma*
109 *atroviride* I-1237), Blindar® (*Trichoderma asperellum* ICC012 + *Trichoderma gamsii*
110 ICC080) and Vintec® (*T. atroviride* SC1).[43] Only Vintec® has been additionally registered to
111 control Petri disease pathogens in grapevine grafted nursery stock.[43] Therefore, we propose to
112 apply registered BCA products in Spain for control of GTD fungi both on grapevine and/or
113 other hosts, and other potential BCAs as a preventive strategy in pre- and post-planting. The
114 main objectives of this study were: (i) to evaluate the effectiveness of several BCA root
115 treatments under field conditions in reducing natural infections of fungal pathogens associated
116 with black-foot and Petri diseases over two growing seasons, and (ii) to assess the BCA root
117 treatments influence in plant growth parameters.
118
119 **2 MATERIALS AND METHODS**
120
121 **2.1. Planting material**
122 One-year old grapevine grafted plants of 'Tempranillo'/110 Richter combination with uniform
123 root distribution were obtained from a commercial nursery in Spain and used in this experiment.
124 Roots were trimmed to 10 cm length and dormant plants were hot-water treated at 53°C for 30
125 min to reduce any existing infections by black-foot and Petri disease pathogens[44,45] and then
126 acclimatized for 24 h at 20°C before biological control agents (BCA) inoculation.
127
128 **2.2. Grafted plants inoculation and experimental design**
129 Hot-water treated plants were inoculated by dipping the roots and the basal part of the plants
130 for 24 h at room temperature with 25 l water suspensions of the following treatments: (T1)
131 *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 (1.35 x 10^9 CFU ml^{-1}) at 7.5 ml l^{-1}, (T2) *Trichoderma koningii* TK7
132 (Condor Shield®, ATENS; 1 x 10^9 CFU g^{-1} formulated product) at 2 g l^{-1}, (T3) *T. atroviride*
133 SC1 (Vintec®, Belchim Crop Protection; 2 x 10^{10} CFU g^{-1} formulated product) at 2 g l^{-1}, (T4)
134 *Pseudomonas fluorescens + Bacillus atrophaeus* (Stilo Cruzial®, SIPCAM Iberia; 1x 10^8 CFU
135 g^{-1} formulated product) at 2 g l^{-1}, (T5), *Pythium oligandrum* Po37 (Biovitis, France; 1.28 x 10^6
136 CFU g^{-1}) at 2 g l^{-1}, and (C) water as untreated control. We selected T1 and T5 due to the
137 previously demonstrated efficacy against GTD fungi in young vines.[38,41] T2 and T4 are not
138 registered as a phytosanitary product in Spain yet. The viability of the *Trichoderma* conidia in
139 the products T2 and T3 was checked to be at a minimum of 85% before the trial, as described
140 by Pertot *et al.*[28]

141   Inoculated grafted plants were immediately planted in May 2017 in two field sites located
142 in Logroño (La Rioja, Spain). Both fields were under grapevine nursery planting material
143 rotation, which is very common in the area of study. Standard cultural practices were used in
144 both sites during the grapevine growing season. The plant groups (40 plants) were spaced 100
145 cm from other groups, plants being 30 cm apart from center to center. Each field plot was 12 m
146 long and included 24 rows, each with a plant group of 40 plants (960 plants per field). In both
147 sites, the experimental design consisted of four randomized blocks, each containing a plant
148 group (40 plants) of each treatment (160 plants per treatment), with 200 cm between each block.

149 Plots were less than 1 km apart and had very similar climates. Soil samples were taken for
150 physicochemical properties analysis as described below. A drip irrigation system was laid on
151 the soil of each row. An additional stock of 50 grafted plants was used to check for their
152 phytosanitary status immediately after hot-water treatment (HWT).

153

154 **2.3. GTD fungal isolation and identification**
155 In February 2018, once grafted plants had completed their cycle of vegetative growth and were
156 in a dormant state, 50% of the 2-year-old plants in each field were carefully dug out from the
157 soil to keep the root system intact and taken back to the laboratory for immediate processing.
158 In order to isolate black-foot and Petri disease pathogens, two plant parts were evaluated, roots
159 and the basal ends of the rootstocks. Root necrotic sections from 2-3 cm near the basal end of
160 the rootstock and wood sections of 3 cm length of the basal end of the rootstock were cut,
161 washed under running tap water, surface sterilized in 33% sodium hypochlorite (commercial
162 40 g Cl/l) for 1 min and rinsed twice with sterile distilled water. Five small root or xylem pieces
163 were plated on Malt Extract Agar (MEA) supplemented with 0.35 gl^{-1} of streptomycin sulphate
164 (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) (MEAS). Four MEAS plates were used per plant (two
165 per plant part). Plates were incubated for 10-15 days at 25 °C in the dark and all colonies were
166 transferred to Potato Dextrose Agar (PDA). Isolates were single-spored prior to morphological
167 and molecular identification with the serial dilution method.[46]
168 In May 2018, the remaining 50% of the plants in each field were drip inoculated with all
169 treatments (0.5 l per plant using the same inoculum concentration as described above). In
170 February 2019, these 3-year-old plants were carefully dug out and processed for fungal isolation
171 as described above. All planting material was washed and also assessed for undried shoot and
172 total root weight. The disease incidence (DI) of black-foot and Petri disease pathogens was
173 determined as the mean percentage of grafted plants that was infected by these fungi. The
174 disease severity (DS) in infected grafted plants was determined as the mean percentage of root
175 or wood segments (ten segments per plant each) that was colonized by these fungi. The presence
176 of *Trichoderma* spp. was also recorded to provide an indication of the extent of colonization
177 following treatment with the *Trichoderma* formulations (T2 and T3). The stock of 50 plants
178 was also analysed after HWT as described before.
179 Fungal isolates resembling black-foot and Petri disease pathogens were identified by
180 molecular techniques. For DNA extraction, 300 mg of fungal mycelium and conidia from single
181 spore isolates grown on PDA for 2 to 3 weeks at 25°C in the dark were scraped and
182 homogenised twice in a Fastprep®-24 tissue homogenizer (MP Biomedicals, USA). Total DNA
183 was extracted using the E.Z.N.A. Plant Miniprep Kit (Omega Bio-tek, Doraville, USA)
184 following manufacturer's instructions. DNA was visualized on 1% agarose gels stained with
185 RedSafe (iNtRON Biotechnology, Lynnwood, WA, USA). DNA was stored at −20°C. Black-
186 foot species were identified by sequencing part of the histone gene (*his*3) using CYLH3F and
187 CYLH3R primers.[47-49] The identification of *Pa. chlamydospora* isolates was performed by
188 analysis of the ITS region of DNA amplified using the fungal primers Pch1/Pch2.[50] *Pm.*
189 *minimum* and *C. luteo-olivacea* were identified by sequence analysis of the β-tubulin (*tub2)*
190 using the primer pairs T1[51] and Bt2b[52] for *Phaeoacremonium*, and BTCadF/BTCadR[53] for
191 *Cadophora*. *Trichoderma* spp. were isolated on MEAS and identified at species level by
192 sequencing the ITS region using the universal primers ITS1F/ITS4.[54] *P. oligandrum* was
193 isolated on Corn Meal Agar added with Pimaricin, Ampicilliun, Rifampicin and
194 Pentachloronitrobenzene (CMA-PARP) and identified by morphological features.[41]
195 Polymerase chain reaction (PCR) products were purified with the High Pure PCR Product
196 Purification Kit (Roche Diagnostics, Mannheim, Germany), and sequenced in both directions

4

197 by Macrogen Inc. (Seoul, Republic of Korea). The sequences obtained were then blasted in
198 GenBank.
199
2.4. Soil physicochemical properties analysis
201 Four soil cores were collected to a depth of 20 cm from each field and bulked into a single soil
202 sample per field. Samples were mixed well, air-dried for one week and sieved (2-mm to 5-mm
203 mesh size) prior to soil physicochemical analyses. Soil samples were tested for electric
204 conductivity (EC) in water and pH with a soil solution ratio of 1:5, soil texture by laser
205 diffraction particle size (Diffractometer LS 13 320, Beckman Coulter Inc., Brea, Calif.), soil
206 organic matter (SOM) by dichromate oxidation,[55] cation exchange capacity (CEC) by the
207 cobaltihexamine method,[56] carbonate total by infrared (Equilab CO-202; Equilab, Jakarta,
208 Indonesia), assimilable magnesium and calcium by inductively coupled plasma (ICP)
209 spectroscopy (ARL-Fison 3410, USA) and the cobaltihexamine method and P, K, S, Mg, Mn,
210 Fe, Ca and Na by ICP and Mehlich method.[57] Analyses were conducted in the official Regional
211 Laboratory of La Grajera (Logroño, Spain) in April 2017, before the beginning of the
212 experiment.
213
2.5. Data analysis
215 Prior to statistical analyses, data were checked for normality and homogeneity of variances, and
216 transformed when needed. Percentage data were transformed into arcsin $(DI or DS/100)^{1/2}$.
217 Each treatment means (DI, DS, root and shoot weights) was calculated from the corresponding
218 values in each sampling moment. The statistical analysis of the experimental results was carried
219 out in a two-way ANOVA with blocks and treatments as independent variables, and the
220 following dependent variables: DI (%), DS (%), root weight (g) and shoot weight (g). In the 3-
221 year-old plants, the percentage of reduction (PR) of the fungal pathogen detection at each
222 isolation plant part and for each fungal GTD species was calculated as $PR = 100(PC - PT)/PC$,
223 where PC is the mean pathogen incidence or severity in the control and PT is the mean pathogen
224 incidence or severity in the BCA treatment. Means were compared by the Student's t least
225 significant difference (LSD) at $P < 0.05$. Soil physicochemical variables were subjected to
226 analyses of variance. LSD test was calculated to compare variable means. Data from all
227 experiments were analysed using the Statistix 10 software (Analytical Software).
228
3 RESULTS
230
3.1 Plant viability and fungal identification
232 None of the treatments had a negative influence on callus or initial shoot growth. The viability
233 of planting material was estimated to be of 94% and 92% for the 2-year-old and 3-year-old
234 plants at the end of growing season, respectively. After HWT, six and four out of the 50 grafted
235 plants stock tested positive for *Diplodia seriata* and *Neofusicoccum parvum*, respectively, other
236 fungi associated with GTDs. No black-foot and Petri disease pathogens were isolated from hot-
237 water treated plants. In the 2-year-old plants, a total of 1,650 Petri disease (83.6% from the
238 basal end of the rootstock and 16.4% from roots) and 896 black-foot disease pathogens (15.8%
239 from the basal end of the rootstock and 84.2% from roots) isolates were collected. Petri disease
240 pathogens were identified as *C. luteo-olivacea* (57.8%), followed by *Pa. chlamydospora*
241 (27.3%) and *Pm. minimum* (14.9%).
242   Black-foot pathogens were identified as *Dactylonectria torresensis* (66.4%), followed by
243 *Dactylonectria macrodidyma* (22.6%), *Ilyonectria liriodendri* (6.2%) and *Dactylonectria*
244 *alcacerensis* (4.8%). In the 3-year-old plants, a total of 1,825 Petri disease (89.4% from the
245 basal end of the rootstock and 10.6% from roots) and 1,632 black-foot pathogens (26.9% from
246 the basal end of the rootstock and 73.1% from roots) isolates were collected. Petri disease

247   pathogens were identified as *C. luteo-olivacea* (54.6%), followed by *Pa. chlamydospora*
248   (31.1%) and *Pm. minimum* (14.3%). Black-foot pathogens were identified as *D. torresensis*
249   (66.0%), followed by *I. liriodendri* (16.0%), *D. macrodidyma* (9.2%), *Ilyonectria robusta*
250   (4.4%), *D. alcacerensis* (2.5%) and *Ilyonectria pseudodestructans* (1.8%). Representative
251   black-foot and Petri diseases isolate sequences obtained in this study were deposited to
252   GenBank (Supplementary Table S1).
253   *Trichoderma atroviride* was isolated from 30 and 22% of the 2-year-old and 3-year-old
254   plants, respectively. *Trichoderma koningii* was isolated from 12 and 18% of the 2-year-old and
255   3-year-old plants, respectively. Our attempts to isolate *P. oligandrum* were unsuccessful.

257   **3.2 Disease incidence and disease severity in grafted plants**
258   Neither field site, nor block, nor its interaction significantly affected the DI and DS ($P>0.05$,
259   ANOVA not shown). Therefore, data from both field sites were combined and analysed
260   together. There was a significant effect of treatment on mean Petri disease incidence values in
261   the roots and the basal ends for both 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants (Table 1). In the 3-year-
262   old plants, percentage of infected plants (DI) in the basal ends were significantly lower in
263   treatments with *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) (40.2% ± 8.3) than in the control treatment (61.5% ±
264   5.6) (Figure 1A). In both 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants, percentage of infected plants (DI) in
265   the roots were significantly lower in treatments with *P. oligandrum* Po37 (T5) (2-year-old
266   plants: 7.5% ± 1.4, and 3-year-old plants: 4.8% ± 1.3) than in the control treatment (2-year-old
267   plants: 23.1% ± 2.8, and 3-year-old plants: 18.3% ± 3.9) (Figure 1B). Biocontrol treatments had
268   a significant effect on mean Petri disease severity in basal ends of 2-year-old plants, and in roots
269   and basal ends for 3-year-old plants (Table 1). *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) in the 2-year-old plants
270   (19.4% ± 1.4) and both *Trichoderma* spp. treatments (T2: 25.5% ± 2.5, and T3: 25.8% ± 2.3)
271   in the 3-year-old plants significantly reduced the percentage of DS in the basal ends compared
272   to the control treatment (2-year-old plants: 36.1% ± 4.3, and 3-year-old plants: 39.5% ± 4.9)
273   (Figure 1A). *Trichoderma* spp. treatments (T2: 9.1% ± 1.3, and T3: 10.8% ± 1.8) resulted in
274   significant lower DS in roots of the 3-year-old plants than the control treatment (16.8% ± 3.8)
275   (Figure 1B).
276   Analysis of variance showed no significant effect of biocontrol treatments on black-foot
277   disease incidence and severity in roots of both 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants (Table 1). There
278   was a significant effect of treatment on mean black-foot disease incidence values in the basal
279   ends for both 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants (Table 1). In the 2-year-old plants, all treatments
280   resulted in significant lower DI in the basal ends than the control treatment (Figure 2A). In the
281   3-year-old plants, percentage of infected plants (DI) in the basal ends were significantly lower
282   in treatments with *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 (T1) (4.8% ± 2.1) than in the control treatment
283   (13.2% ± 3.2) (Figure 2A). There was a significant effect of treatment on mean black-foot
284   disease severity values in the basal ends of 2-year-old plants (Table 1). *Streptomyces* sp. E1 +
285   R4 (T1) (10.0% ± 2.3) significantly reduced the percentage of DS in the basal ends compared
286   to the control treatment (19.1 ± 0.8) (Figure 2A).

288   **3.3 Fungal species incidence and severity in grafted plants**
289   Considering the fungal species within each disease individually, *P. oligandrum* Po37 (T5) and
290   *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) significantly reduced the DI of *C. luteo-olivacea* in the roots and the
291   basal ends, respectively, of 2-year-old plants compared to the control treatment ($P<0.05$,
292   ANOVA not shown) (Table 2). Percentage of DI in the roots of both 2-year-old and 3-year-old
293   plants, and DS in the roots of 2-year-old plants caused by *Pa. chlamydospora* were significantly
294   lower in treatments with *P. oligandrum* Po37 (T5) than in the control treatment ($P<0.05$,
295   ANOVA not shown) (Table 2). In the 3-year-old plants, *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) significantly

6

296 reduced both DI and DS caused by *Pa. chlamydospora* in the basal ends compared to the control
297 treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 2). Both *T. koningii* TK7 (T2) and *P.*
298 *fluorescens + B. atrophaeus* (T4) treatments resulted in significant lower DI caused by *Pm.*
299 *minimum* in the roots of 2-year-old plants than the control treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not
300 shown) (Table 2). Furthermore, *T. koningii* TK7 (T2) treatment resulted in significant lower DS
301 caused by *Pm. minimum* in the roots of 3-year-old plants than the control treatment (*P*<0.05,
302 ANOVA not shown) (Table 2). *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) significantly reduced the DS of *Pm.*
303 *minimum* in the roots of both 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants compared to the control treatment
304 (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 2).
305   Regarding black-foot pathogens, all treatments significantly reduced the DI of *D.*
306 *torresensis* and *D. macrodidyma* in the basal ends of 2-year-old plants compared to the control
307 treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 3). *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 (T1) significantly
308 reduced *D. torresensis* DS in the basal ends of 2-year-old plants and DI in the basal ends of 3-
309 year-old plants compared to the control treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 3). In
310 both the 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants, percentages of DI in the roots and DS in the basal
311 ends caused by *D. macrodidyma* were significantly lower in treatments with *Streptomyces* sp.
312 E1 + R4 (T1) than in the control treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 3). *T. atroviride*
313 SC1 (T3) also resulted in significant lower DS in the basal ends of 3-year-old plants than the
314 control treatment (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Table 3). Low levels of *Trichoderma* spp.
315 (<30%) were isolated from roots and basal ends of 2-year-old and 3-year-old plants subjected
316 to T2 and T3 treatments in both fields.
317   The percentage of reduction (PR) was calculated for treatments statistically different from
318 the control in the 3-years-old plants (Table 4). In roots, *P. oligandrum* Po37 (T5) provided
319 93.6% disease incidence reduction of *Pa. chlamydopora*. On *Trichoderma* spp. treated plants,
320 there was a reduction in *Pm. minimum* severity when compared with untreated controls, which
321 ranged from 80% for *T. koningii* TK7 (T2) and 69.6% for *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3). In the basal
322 ends, *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) provided 69.4% disease incidence and 56.6% disease severity
323 reduction of *Pa. chlamydopora*, while *T. koningii* TK7 (T2) provided 52.3% disease severity
324 reduction of *Pm. minimum*. None of the BCA treatments statistically reduced the disease
325 incidence and severity of black-foot disease fungi in roots (Tables 3 and 4). In the basal ends,
326 *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 (T1) reduced the incidence of *D. torresensis* and the severity of *D.*
327 *macrodidyma* by 89.1 and 100%, respectively. *T. atroviride* SC1 (T3) provided 100% disease
328 severity reduction of *D. macrodidyma*.

329

330 **3.4 Root and shoot weights in grafted plants, and physicochemical properties of the soil**
331 Analysis of variance showed no significant effect of biocontrol treatments on the shoot weight
332 of 3-year-old plants (*P*>0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Figure 3). Mean shoot weight ranged from
333 55.3 g ± 5.7 (T3) to 64.9 g ± 8.2 (T2). Biological control treatments had a significant effect on
334 the root weight of 3-year-old plants (*P*<0.05, ANOVA not shown) (Figure 3). Mean root weight
335 ranged from 41.9 g ± 3.7 (T3) to 52.9 g ± 2.9 (C). All treatments resulted in significant lower
336 root weight than the control treatment (Figure 3). Analyses of variance indicated no significant
337 differences for the soil physicochemical properties between fields (*P*>0.05, ANOVA not
338 shown).

339

340 **4 DISCUSSION**

341

342 This study represents the first approach to evaluate the effectiveness of different antagonistic
343 microorganisms (bacteria, fungi and an oomycete) applied preventively to control black-foot
344 and Petri diseases under field conditions. The use of BCA against soilborne pathogens are on
345 the forefront of research; however, most experiences are on a laboratory scale, thus avoiding

346 the problems related to the production of large quantities of antagonists and their formulations,
347 and disease control trials are performed in simplified environment such as growth chambers or
348 experimental greenhouses, thus avoiding the risk of large-scale experiments in the field.
349   In this study, Petri disease infection was mainly detected in the basal ends of the rootstock,
350 while fungi associated with black-foot disease were most frequently isolated from roots. *D.*
351 *torresensis* was the most frequent isolated species (>60%) associated with black-foot disease at
352 both plant ages. This agrees with previous research carried out on black-foot in Europe.[9-11]
353 Regarding Petri disease, more than 80% of the fungi were identified as *C. luteo-olivacea* and
354 *Pa. chlamydospora* at both plant ages. Both fungal species were frequently isolated from
355 nursery stock and young vines worldwide.[3]
356   In our specific pathosystems, the effectiveness of some BCA in reducing the incidence and
357 severity of both diseases under field conditions were dependent on the plant part analysed and
358 the plant age. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4 treatment was highly effective in reducing black-foot
359 disease incidence at both plants ages and the severity of 2-year-old plants in the basal ends.
360 However, the effect of these actinobacteria against Petri disease pathogens after 2 years in the
361 field was very low. In contrast, Álvarez-Pérez *et al*.[38] evaluated the effectiveness of these
362 bacterial strains individually, previously isolated from the endo- (strain E1) and rhizosphere
363 (strain R4) of the grapevine root system, for black-foot and Petri diseases control in 1-year-old
364 grafted plants under field conditions by partially immersing the grafts (up to 10 cm depth) in a
365 rooting hormone solution containing the actinobacteria for 24 h at room temperature. They
366 found significant reductions of the infection rates at the lower end of the rootstock of the fungal
367 pathogens *Dactylonectria* sp., *Ilyonectria* sp., *Pm. minimum* and *Pa. chlamydospora*.[38] These
368 differences in the effectiveness of the bacteria against Petri disease between experiments could
369 be due to the commonly unpredictably behaviour of BCA when tested in different
370 environments.[58]
371   Other bacterial treatment tested in our study was a commercial product containing
372 *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Bacillus atrophaeus*. No biocontrol effect of this treatments was
373 observed on fungal pathogens associated with black-foot and Petri diseases. Despite this fact,
374 some strains of these bacterial species have been previously reported as plant growth-promoting
375 bacteria (PGPB) and have been found to be potential BCA of plant diseases in several crops.[59-
376 62] In grapevine, different *P. fluorescens* strains were identified as prospective new BCA against
377 *Botrytis cinerea*[63] and to induce systemic resistance against *Plasmopara viticola* and *B. cinerea*
378 by priming common and distinct defensive pathways.[64]
379   The *in vitro* effects of beneficial bacteria in reducing GTDs has been also tested.[65,66]
380 *Bacillus subtilis* AG1 showed promising in reducing the growth of *Lasiodiplodia theobromae*,
381 *Pa. chlamydospora*, and *Pm. minimum* in an artificial culture medium.[34] Rezgui *et al*.[37] recently
382 identified antagonistic traits against GTDs pathogens of several *B. subtilis* strains inhabiting the
383 wood tissues of mature grapevines in Tunisia. The antagonistic activity of *Pantoea*
384 *agglomerans* and *Bacillus pumilus* against *N. parvum* and *Pa. chlamydospora* was
385 demonstrated in inoculated ungrafted grapevine cuttings.[35,36] A recent study performed by
386 Trotel-Aziz *et al*.[40] highlighted the effect of *B. subtilis* strain PTA-271 to efficiently attenuate
387 the characteristic Botryosphaeria dieback symptoms caused by *N. parvum*.
388   Most studies on biological control of GTDs have examined the application of *Trichoderma*
389 spp. in grapevine nurseries and young vineyards.[21-25,29] In our study, we individually evaluated
390 two *Trichoderma*-based products containing *T. koningii* strain TK7 and *T. atroviride* strain
391 SC1. A certain effect was observed in reducing *Pm. minimum* disease incidence for 2-year-old
392 plants and disease severity for 3-year-old plants at the root level by *T. koningii* TK7 treatment.
393 Little information is still available related to the biocontrol effect of TK7 strain to combat
394 plants' fungal pathogens. Howell *et al*.[67] showed that the application of *T. koningii* TK7 to
395 cotton seeds before planting was ineffective to control cotton seedlings damping-off in

8

396   artificially *Rhizoctonia solani*-infested cotton field soil flats. Other strains of this species have
397   been recently reported as potential BCA for fungal pathogens in different crops, such as
398   *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *melonis* in melon[68] or *Sclerotium rolfsii* in groundnut.[69]
399   *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1 was effective in reducing *Pa. chlamydospora* disease
400   incidence and severity in the basal ends of 3-year-old plants. In accordance with our results, a
401   study carried out in Spain by Berbegal *et al.*[33] also found reductions in the incidence and
402   severity of *Pa. chlamydospora* and *Pm. minimum* when analysed the rootstock basal end and
403   root system of 1-day *T. atroviride* SC1 inoculated grafted plants in nurseries. In the same study,
404   Berbegal *et al.*[33] also evaluated the effect of *T. atroviride* SC1 treatment in two fields during
405   two growing seasons. The basal parts of the treated plants were soaked for 1 h in a *T. atroviride*
406   SC1 suspension before planting, observing no BCA effect on incidence and severity of black-
407   foot disease associated pathogens and significant reductions on pathogens associated with Petri
408   disease at both fields after the first growing season. In Italian grapevine nurseries, the
409   application of *T. atroviride* strain SC1 at several stages of the nursery process (pre-storage and
410   pre-grafting hydration, stratification, callusing, and rooting) protected plants from infection by
411   *Pm. minimum* and *Pa. chlamydospora* after a single artificial inoculation with both pathogens
412   following the grafting stage.[28]
413   Regarding *P. oligandrum* Po37 treatment, a significant reduction of Petri disease incidence
414   and severity was observed in 2-year-old plants and disease incidence in 3-year-old plants, at
415   roots level. Yacoub *et al.*[41] reported a significant reduction in necrosis length caused by *Pa.*
416   *chlamydospora* when the roots of 'Cabernet Sauvignon' cuttings were colonized by different
417   *P. oligandrum* strains. The efficacy of *P. oligandrum* strain Sto7 in reducing the necrosis length
418   caused by *N. parvum* and *Pa. chlamydospora* was demonstrated on grafted young 'Cabernet
419   Sauvignon' vines cultivated in a nursery greenhouse, separately or in combination with two
420   bacterial strains previously isolated from vineyards.[42] The ability of *P. oligandrum* strain Po37
421   to act as an inducer of plant systemic resistance against pathogens is thought to be due to the
422   presence of three elicitin-like proteins in its genome.[70]
423   Diverse formulations (dry or water suspensions), application methods and times of
424   exposure of plants to BCA have been tested in the different studies carried out to assess the
425   biocontrol potential of antagonist microorganisms.[28,30,33,38,41,42,71-73] In our assay, a 24-h soaking
426   of the trimmed root systems and the basal end of the plants in BCA water suspensions was
427   carried out before planting, but the percentage of *Trichoderma* spp. recovery was low in all
428   cases (<30%). In this sense, Halleen *et al.*[74] were also able to only isolate a 2.3% of
429   *Trichoderma* spp. from the basal ends of the rootstock and none from roots of grafted plants
430   subjected to *Trichoderma* treatments, applied by dipping the basal ends of the rootstock for 1
431   min before planting, after 7 months in a nursery field. In a recent study, González-García *et*
432   *al.*[72] evaluated the colonization efficiency of *Streptomyces* sp. in the root system by comparing
433   two inoculation methods, plant immersion in a bacterial suspension or direct injection of the
434   bacterial suspension into the vegetal tissues and concluded that both methods allowed effective
435   BCA colonization. This is also in accordance with Berbegal *et al.*[33] who used 24-h soak in *T.*
436   *atroviride* SC1 water suspension to inoculate 110R rootstock cuttings before grafting, with
437   percentages of recovery over 80% at both nursery and vineyard experiments. Van Jaarsveld *et*
438   *al.*[73] evaluated different methods of application of *T. atroviride* on commercially planted
439   nursery vines and concluded that dipping of basal ends in the *Trichoderma* dry formulation
440   consistently gave higher colonization percentages than the 1-h soak of bases of vines before
441   planting or *Trichoderma* field drenching. Further research is needed to evaluate the
442   effectiveness of soaking vines in *T. koningii* TK7 or *T. atroviride* SC1 dry formulations
443   compared to soaking vines for 24-h in BCA water suspensions before planting.
444   Biological control agent treatments did not affect the shoot weight, and root weight was
445   significantly lower for all BCA treatments with respect to the untreated control at the end of the

second growing season (3-year-old plants). The impact of BCA treatments on grapevine development was very variable on previous research.[29,73,74] *Trichoderma* spp. and *B. subtilis*-based treatments resulted in lower mean root and shoot dry weight values when compared with the negative controls.[29] Nevertheless, Halleen *et al*.[74] found that none of the *Trichoderma* formulations tested yielded plants with roots or shoots mass significantly different than the water treated controls. Berbegal *et al*[33] observed a significantly higher undried shoot weight for *T. atroviride* SC1 treated plants at the end of the first growing season, but this effect was not observed in the second growing season. Likewise, the application of actinobacteria to grafted grapevine plants did not show a significant effect, either positive or negative, on plants growth.[38] In contrast, Fourie *et al*.[22] observed that *T. harzianum* treatments significantly improved root development but not shoot mass in comparison with the control vines in nurseries. Several studies indicate that BCA treatments can enhance the growth of other crops, such as tomato[75] or rice.[76] All this variability could be related to the lack of proper long-standing implantation by these antagonist microorganisms in grapevine roots or the vigour level of the rootstock cultivar tested. BCA are living organisms whose activities depend mainly on the different physicochemical environmental conditions to which they are subjected,[77] and the greatest long-term effects probably occur with rhizosphere-competent strains with the ability to colonize and grow in association with plant roots.[78]

5 CONCLUSIONS

This study highlighted the potential of some BCA to reduce GTD infection under field conditions. No single BCA application was able to control both diseases. Further studies should evaluate the combination of the disease-suppressive activity of two or more beneficial microbiomes in a biocontrol preparation against black-foot and Petri diseases. Our results also open up the possibility to combine the application of BCA as a pre- planting strategy with other measures in an Integrated Pest Management (IPM) programme against GTDs. For example, BCA can be applied after hot-water treatment (HWT) of dormant grafted plants or after soil biofumigation. In this regard, recent research highlighted the effectiveness of HWT at 53ºC for 30 min[45] and white mustard biofumigation[30] to reduce GTD incidence in planting material and grapevine nursery soil, respectively.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

REFERENCES

1 Gramaje D, Urbez-Torres JR and Sosnowski MR, Managing grapevine trunk diseases with respect to etiology and epidemiology: current strategies and future prospects. *Plant Dis* **102**:12-39 (2018).

2 Halleen F, Fourie, PH and Crous PW, A review of black foot disease of grapevine. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **45**:S55-67 (2006).

3 Gramaje D and Armengol J, Fungal trunk pathogens in the grapevine propagation process: potential inoculum sources, detection, identification, and management strategies. *Plant Dis* **95**:1040-1055 (2011).

4 Agustí-Brisach C and Armengol J, Black-foot disease of grapevine: an update on taxonomy, epidemiology and management strategies. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **52**:245-261 (2013).

495 5 Martínez-Diz MP, Díaz-Losada E, Barajas E, Ruano-Rosa D, Andrés-Sodupe and Gramaje
496   D, Screening of Spanish *Vitis vinifera* germplasm for resistance to *Phaeomoniella*
497   *chlamydospora*. *Scient Hortic* **246**:104-109 (2019a).
498 6 Aigoun-Mouhous W, Elena G, Cabral A, León M, Sabaou N, Armengol J, Chaouia C,
499   Mahamedi AE and Berraf-Tebbal A, Characterization and pathogenicity of
500   *Cylindrocarpon*-like asexual morphs associated with black foot disease in Algerian
501   grapevine nurseries, with the description of *Pleiocarpon algeriense* sp. nov. *Eur J Plant*
502   *Pathol* **154**:887-901 (2019).
503 7 Lawrence DP, Nouri MT and Trouillas FP, Taxonomy and multi-locus phylogeny of
504   cylindrocarpon-like species associated with diseased roots of grapevine and other fruit and
505   nut crops in California. *FUSE* **4**:59-75 (2019).
506 8 Berlanas C, Ojeda S, López-Manzanares B, Andrés-Sodupe B, Bujanda R, Martínez-Diz MP,
507   Díaz-Losada E and Gramaje D, Occurrence and diversity of black-foot disease fungi in
508   symptomless grapevine nursery stock in Spain. *Plant Dis* **104**:94-104 (2020).
509 9 Reis P, Cabral A, Nascimento T, Oliveira H and Rego C, Diversity of *Ilyonectria* species in
510   a young vineyard affected by black foot disease. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **52**:335-346 (2013).
511 10 Berlanas C, López-Manzanares B and Gramaje D, Estimation of viable propagules of black-
512   foot disease pathogens in grapevine cultivated soils and their relation to production
513   systems and soil properties. *Plant Soil* **417**:467-479 (2017).
514 11 Carlucci A, Lops F, Mostert L, Halleen F and Raimondo, ML, Occurrence fungi causing
515   black foot on young grapevines and nursery rootstock plants in Italy. *Phytopathol Mediterr*
516   **56**:10-39 (2017).
517 12 Petit E, Barriault E, Baumgartner E, Wilcox WF and Rolshausen PE, *Cylindrocarpon*
518   species associated with black-foot of grapevine in northeastern United States and
519   southeastern Canada. *Am J Enol Viticult* **62**:177-183 (2011).
520 13 Mostert L, Groenewald JZ, Summerbell RC, Gams W and Crous PW, Taxonomy and
521   pathology of *Togninia* (*Diaporthales*) and its *Phaeoacremonium* anamorphs. *Stud Mycol*
522   **54**:1-113 (2006).
523 14 Gramaje D, Mostert L and Armengol J, Characterization of *Cadophora luteo-olivacea* and
524   *C. melinii* isolates obtained from grapevines and environmental samples from grapevine
525   nurseries in Spain. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **50**:S112-S126 (2011).
526 15 Gubler WD, Rooney-Latham S, Vasquez SJ and Eskalen A, Esca (Black Measles) and Petri
527   disease, in Grape Pest Management, Third Edition, ed. by Bettiga LJ, University of
528   California, Agriculture and Natural Resources, Oakland, CA, Publication 3343. pp. 120-
529   126 (2013).
530 16 Gramaje D, Mostert L, Groenewald JZ and Crous PW, *Phaeoacremonium*: from esca disease
531   to phaeohyphomycosis. *Fungal Biol* **119**:759-783 (2015).
532 17 Martínez-Diz MP, Andrés-Sodupe M, Bujanda R, Díaz-Losada E, Eichmeier A and Gramaje
533   D, Soil-plant compartments affect fungal microbiome diversity and composition in
534   grapevine. *Fungal Ecol* **41**:234-244 (2019b).
535 18 Mondello V, Songy A, Battiston E, Pinto C, Coppin C, Trotel-Aziz P and Fontaine F,
536   Grapevine trunk diseases: a review of fifteen years of trials for their control with chemicals
537   and biocontrol agents. *Plant Dis* **7**:1189-1217 (2018).
538 19 Larignon P, Darné G, Ménard E, Desaché F and Dubos B, Comment agissait l'arsénite de
539   sodium sur l'esca de la vigne? *Prog Agric Vitic* **125**:642-651 (2008).
540 20 Spinosi J, Févotte J and Vial G, Éléments techniques sur l'exposition professionnelle aux
541   pesticides arsenicaux. Matrice cultures - expositions aux pesticides arsenicaux. Institut de
542   veille sanitaire, Saint-Maurice, France (2009).
543 21 Halleen F and Fourie P, 2016. An integrated strategy for the proactive management of
544   grapevine trunk disease pathogen infections in grapevine nurseries. *S Afr J Enol and Vitic*

545   **37**:104-114.

22 Fourie PH, Halleen F, van der Vyver J and Schrueder W, Effect of *Trichoderma* treatments on the occurrence of decline pathogens on the roots and rootstocks of nursery plants. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **40S**, 473-478 (2001).

23 Di Marco S, Osti F and Cesari A, Experiments on the control of Esca by *Trichoderma*. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **43**:108-115 (2004).

24 Fourie PH and Halleen F, Proactive control of Petri disease of grapevine through treatment of propagation material. *Plant Dis* **88**:1241-1245 (2004).

25 Fourie PH and Halleen F, Chemical and biological protection of grapevine propagation material from trunk disease pathogens. *Eur J Plant Path* **116**:255-265 (2006).

26 Petit E and Gubler WD, Influence of *Glomus intraradices* on black foot disease caused by *Cylindrocarpon macrodidymum* on *Vitis rupestris* under controlled conditions. *Plant Dis* **90**:1481-1484 (2006).

27 Mutawila C, Fourie PH, Halleen F and Mostert L, Grapevine cultivar variation to pruning wound protection by *Trichoderma* species against trunk pathogens. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **50**:S264-S276 (2011).

28 Pertot I, Prodorutti D, Colombini A and Pasini L, *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1 prevents *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora* and *Phaeoacremonium aleophilum* infection of grapevine plants during the grafting process in nurseries. *Biocontrol* **61**:257-267 (2016).

29 Santos RF, Heckler LI, Lazarotto M, Garrido LR, Rego C and Blume E, *Trichoderma* spp. and *Bacillus subtilis* for control of *Dactylonectria macrodidyma* in grapevine. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **55**:293-300 (2016).

30 Berlanas C, Andrés-Sodupe M, López-Manzanares B, Maldonado-González MM and Gramaje D, Effect of white mustard cover crop residue, soil chemical fumigation and *Trichoderma* spp. root treatment on black-foot disease control in grapevine. *Pest Manag Sci* **74**:2864-2873 (2018).

31 Del Frari G, Cabral A, Nascimento T, Boavida Ferreira R and Oliveira H, *Epicoccum layuense* a potential biological control agent of esca-associated fungi in grapevine. *PLoS ONE* **14**:e0213273 (2019).

32 Mondello V, Spagnolo A, Larignon P, Clément C and Fontaine F, Phytoprotection potential of *Fusarium proliferatum* for control of Botryosphaeria dieback pathogens in grapevine. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **58**:293-306 (2019).

33 Berbegal M, Ramón-Albalat A, León M and Armengol J, Evaluation of long-term protection from nursery to vineyard provided by *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1 against fungal grapevine trunk pathogens. *Pest Manag Sci* **76**:967-977 (2020).

34 Alfonzo A, Conigliaro G, Torta L, Burruano S and Moschetti G, Antagonism of *Bacillus subtilis* strain AG1 against vine wood fungal pathogens. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **48**:155-158 (2009).

35 Haidar R, Deschamps A, Roudet J, Calvo-Garrido C, Bruez E, Rey and Fermaud M, Multi-organ screening of efficient bacterial control agents against two major pathogens of grapevine. *Biol Control* **92**:55-65 (2016a).

36 Haidar R, Roudet J, Bonnard O, Dufour M, Corio-Costet M, Fert M, Gautier T, Deschamps A and Fermaud M, Screening and modes of action of antagonistic bacteria to control the fungal pathogen *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora* involved in grapevine trunk diseases. *Microbiol Res* **192**:172-184 (2016b).

37 Rezgui A, Ben Ghnaya-Chakroun A, Vallance J, Bruez E, Hajlaoui MR, Sadfi-Zouaoui N and Rey P, Endophytic bacteria with antagonistic traits inhabit the wood tissues of grapevines from Tunisian vineyards. *Biol Control* **99**:28–37 (2016).

38 Álvarez-Pérez JM, González-García S, Cobos R, Olego MA, Ibañez A, Díez-Galán A, Garzón-Jimeno E and Coque JJR, Use of endophytic and rhizospheric actinobacteria from

grapevine plants to reduce nursery fungal infections that lead to young grapevine decline. *Appl Environ Microb* **83**:e01564-17 (2017).

39 Andreolli M, Zapparoli G, Angelini E, Lucchetta G, Silvia Lampis S and Vallini G, *Pseudomonas protegens* MP12: A plant growth-promoting endophytic bacterium with broad-spectrum antifungal activity against grapevine phytopathogens. *Microbiol Res* **219**:123-131 (2019).

40 Trotel-Aziz P, Abou-Mansour E, Courteaux B, Rabenoelina F, Clément C, Fontaine F and Aziz A, *Bacillus subtilis* PTA-271 Counteracts Botryosphaeria Dieback in Grapevine, Triggering Immune Responses and Detoxification of Fungal Phytotoxins. *Front Plant Sci* **10**:25 (2019).

41 Yacoub A, Gerbore J, Magnin N, Chambon P, Dufour MC, Corio-Costet MF, Guyoneaud R and Rey P, Ability of *Pythium oligandrum* strains to protect *Vitis vinifera* L., by inducing plant resistance against *Phaeomoniella chlamydospora*, a pathogen involved in Esca, a grapevine trunk disease. *Biol Control* **92**:7-16 (2016).

42 Daraignes L, Gerbore J, Yacoub A, Dubois L, Romand C, Zekri O, Roudet J, Chambon P and Fermaud M, Efficacy of *P. oligandrum* affected by its association with bacterial BCAs and rootstock effect in controlling grapevine trunk diseases. *Biol Control* **119**:59-67 (2018).

43 MAPA, Official Registry of Phytosanitary Products, Ministerio de Agricultura, Pesca y Alimentación, Consulted on 13 January 2020 from https://www.mapa.gob.es/es/agricultura/temas/sanidad-vegetal/productos-fitosanitarios/registro/menu.asp, Spain (2020).

44 Gramaje D, Alaniz S, Abad-Campos P, García-Jiménez J and Armengol J, Effect of hot-water treatments in vitro on conidial germination and mycelial growth of grapevine trunk pathogens. *Ann Appl Biol* **156**:231-241 (2010).

45 Eichmeier A, Pecenka J, Penázová E, Baránek M, Català-García S, León M, Armengol J and Gramaje D, High-throughput amplicon sequencing-based analysis of active fungal communities inhabiting grapevine after hot-water treatments reveals unexpectedly high fungal diversity. *Fungal Ecol* **36**:26-38 (2018).

46 Dhingra O and Sinclair JB, Basic Plant Pathology Methods, CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, p. 434 (1995).

47 Crous PW, Groenewald JZ, Risede JM and Hywel-Jones NL, *Calonectria* species and their *Cylindrocladium* anamorphs: Species with sphaeropedunculate vesicles. *Stud Mycol* **50**:415-429 (2004).

48 Cabral A, Groenewald JZ, Rego C, Oliveira H and Crous PW, Cylindrocarpon root rot: Multi-gene analysis reveals novel species within the *Ilyonectria radicicola* species complex. *Mycol Progr* **11**:655–688 (2012a).

49 Cabral A, Rego C, Nascimento T, Oliveira H, Groenewald JZ and Crous PW, Multi-gene analysis and morphology reveal a novel *Ilyonectria* species associated with black foot disease of grapevines. *Fungal Biol* **116**:62-80 (2012b).

50 Tegli S, Bertelli E and Surico G, Sequence analysis of ITS ribosomal DNA in five *Phaeoacremonium* species and development of a PCR-based assay for the detection of *P. chlamydosporum* and *P. aleophilum* in grapevine tissue. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **39**:134-149 (2000).

51 O'Donnell K and Cigelnik E, Two divergent intragenomic rDNA ITS2 types within a monophyletic lineage of the fungus *Fusarium* are nonorthologus. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* **7**:103-116 (1997).

52 Glass NL and Donaldson G, Development of primer sets designed for use with PCR to amplify conserved genes from filamentous ascomycetes. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **61**:1323-1330 (1995).

645 53 Travadon R, Lawrence DP, Rooney-Latham S, Gubler WD, Wilcox WF, Rolshausen PE and
646   Baumgartner K, *Cadophora* species associated with wood-decay of grapevine in North
647   America. *Fungal Biol* **119**:53-66 (2015).
648 54 Gardes M and Bruns TD, ITS primers with enhanced specificity for Basidiomycetes:
649   application to the identification of mycorrhizae and rusts. *Mol Ecol* **2**:113-118 (1993).
650 55 Nelson DW and Sommers LE, Total carbon, organic carbon, and organic matter, in Methods
651   of Soil Analysis Part 2, Second Edition, ed. by Page AL, American Society of Agronomy,
652   Soil Science Society of America, Madison, WI, pp. 539-594 (1982).
653 56 Orsini L and Remy JC, Utilisation du chlorure de cobaltihexammine pour la determina-tion
654   simultanée de la capacité d'échange et des bases échangeables des sols. *Scie Sol* **4**:269-
655   275 (1976).
656 57 Mehlich A, Mehlich 3 soil test extractant: a modification of Mehlich 2 extractant. *Commun*
657   *Soil Sci Plant Anal* **15**:1409–1416 (1984).
658 58 Vannacci G and Gullino ML, Use of biocontrol agents against soil-borne pathogens: results
659   and limitations. *Acta Hortic* **532**:79-88 (2000).
660 59 Compant S, Duffy B, Nowak J, Clément C and Barka EA, Use of plant growth-promoting
661   bacteria for biocontrol of plant diseases: principles, mechanisms of action, and future
662   prospects. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **71**:4951-4959 (2005).
663 60 Zhang X, Li B, Wang Y, Guo Q, Lu X, Li S and Ma P, Lipopeptides, a novel protein, and
664   volatile compounds contribute to the antifungal activity of the biocontrol agent *Bacillus*
665   *atrophaeus* CAB-1. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* **97**:9525-9534 (2013).
666 61 Guardado-Valdivia L, Tovar-Pérez E, Chacón-López A, López-García U, Gutiérrez-
667   Martínez P, Stoll A and Aguilera S, Identification and characterization of a new *Bacillus*
668   *atrophaeus* strain B5 as biocontrol agent of postharvest anthracnose disease in soursop
669   (*Annona muricata*) and avocado (*Persea americana*). *Microbiol Res* **210**:26-32 (2018).
670 62 Ma J, Wang C, Wang H, Liu K, Zhang T, Yao L, Zhao Z, Du B and Ding Y, Analysis of the
671   Complete Genome Sequence of *Bacillus atrophaeus* GQJK17 Reveals Its Biocontrol
672   Characteristics as a Plant Growth-Promoting Rhizobacterium. *Biomed Res Int*
673   **2018**:9473542 (2018).
674 63 Trotel-Aziz P, Couderchet M, Biagianti S and Aziz A, Characterization of new bacterial
675   biocontrol agents *Acinetobacter*, *Bacillus*, *Pantoea* and *Pseudomonas* spp. mediating
676   grapevine resistance against *Botrytis cinerea*. *Environ Exp Bot* **64**:21-32 (2008).
677 64 Lakkis S, Trotel-Aziz P, Rabenoelina F, Schwarzenberg A, Nguema-Ona E, Clément C and
678   Aziz A, Strengthening Grapevine Resistance by *Pseudomonas fluorescens* PTA-CT2
679   Relies on Distinct Defense Pathways in Susceptible and Partially Resistant Genotypes to
680   Downy Mildew and Gray Mold Diseases. *Front Plant Sci* **10**:1112 (2019).
681 65 Compant S, Brader G, Muzammil S, Sessitsch A, Lebrihi A and Mathieu F, Use of beneficial
682   bacteria and their secondary metabolites to control grapevine pathogen diseases.
683   *BioControl* **58**:435-455 (2013).
684 66 Compant S and Mathieu F, Biocontrol of major grapevine diseases: leading research, CABI,
685   Wallingford, UK, pp. 160–170 (2017).
686 67 Howell CR, Hanson LE, Stipanovic RD and Puckhaber LS, Induction of Terpenoid
687   Synthesis in Cotton Roots and Control of *Rhizoctonia solani* by Seed Treatment with
688   *Trichoderma virens*. *Phytopathology* **90**:248-252 (2000).
689 68 Gava CAT and Pinto JM, Biocontrol of melon wilt caused by *Fusarium oxysporum* Schlect
690   f. sp. *melonis* using seed treatment with *Trichoderma* spp. and liquid compost. *Biol*
691   *Control* **97**:13-20 (2016).
692 69 Hirpara DG, Gajera HP, Hirapara JG and Golakiya BA, Inhibition coefficient and molecular
693   diversity of multi stress tolerant *Trichoderma* as potential biocontrol agent against
694   *Sclerotium rolfsii* Sacc. *Infect Genet Evol* **55**:75-92 (2017).

70 Berger H, Yacoub A, Gerbore J, Grizard D, Rey P, Sessitsch A and Compant S, Draft Genome Sequence of Biocontrol Agent *Pythium oligandrum* Strain Po37, an Oomycota. *Genome Announc* **4**:e00215-16 (2016).

71 Yacoub A, Gerbore J, Magnin N, Haidar R, Compant S and Rey P, Transcriptional analysis of the interaction between the oomycete biocontrol agent, *Pythium oligandrum*, and the roots of *Vitis vinifera* L. *Biol Control* **120**:26-35 (2018).

72 González-García S, Álvarez-Pérez JM, Sáenz de Miera LE, Cobos R, Ibáñez A, Díez-Galán A, Garzón-Jimeno E and Coque JJR, Developing tools for evaluating inoculation methods of biocontrol *Streptomyces* sp. strains into grapevine plants. *PLoS ONE* **14**:e0211225 (2019).

73 Van Jaarsveld W, Stempien E, Pierron R, Hallen F and Mostert L, An overview of lessons learnt in the application of *Trichoderma* products in grapevine nurseries. *Phytopathol Mediterr* **58**:423. (2019).

74 Halleen F, Fourie PH and Crous PW, Control of black foot disease in grapevine nurseries. *Plant Pathol* **56**:637-645 (2007).

75 Kaur T, Rani R and Manhas RK, Biocontrol and plant growth promoting potential of phylogenetically new *Streptomyces* sp. MR14 of rhizospheric origin. *AMB Express* **9**:125 (2019).

76 Suárez-Moreno ZR, Vinchira-Villarraga DM, Vergara-Morales DI, Castellanos L, Ramos FA, Guarnaccia C, Degrassi G, Venturi V and Moreno-Sarmiento N, Plant-Growth Promotion and Biocontrol Properties of Three *Streptomyces* spp. Isolates to Control Bacterial Rice Pathogens. *Front Microbiol* **10**:290 (2019).

77 Benitez T, Rincon AM, Limon MC and Codon AC, Biocontrol mechanisms of *Trichoderma* strains. *Int Microbiol* **7**:249-260 (2004).

78 Harman GE, Howell CR, Viterbo A, Chet I and Lorito M, *Trichoderma* species-opportunistic, a virulent plant symbionts. *Nat Rev* **2**:43-56 (2004).

Table 1. Effects of variables on disease incidence (DI) and disease severity (DS) in roots and basal ends of rootstock of grapevine grafted plants.

Petri disease	2-year-old plants					3-year-old plants				
	DI (%)			DS (%)		DI (%)			DS (%)	
Variables	df[a]	MS[b]	P value[c]	MS	P value	df	MS	P value	MS	P value
Roots										
Block	3	0.0034	0.9920	0.0129	0.8115	3	0.0036	0.5770	0.0332	0.9112
Treatment	5	0.0162	0.0003	0.0196	0.2107	5	0.0202	0.0010	0.0708	0.0418
Error	63	0.0029		0.0133		63	0.0042		2.1901	
Basal ends										
Block	3	0.03102	0.7304	0.01033	0.9031	3	0.03008	0.4951	0.02974	0.9954
Treatment	5	0.03810	0.0411	0.00806	0.0397	5	0.03400	0.0433	0.01761	0.0462
Error	63	0.01686		0.01890		63	0.01770		0.02023	
Black-foot disease	2-year-old plants					3-year-old plants				
	DI (%)			DS (%)		DI (%)			DS (%)	
Variables	df	MS	P value	MS	P value	df	MS	P value	MS	P value
Roots										
Block	3	0.0141	0.9945	0.0071	0.9110	3	0.1212	0.9932	0.0448	0.8234
Treatment	5	0.0024	0.9973	0.0121	0.7817	5	0.0082	0.9162	0.0044	0.0526
Error	63	0.0393		0.0247		63	0.0282		0.0467	
Basal ends										
Block	3	0.0076	0.8712	0.0081	0.7883	3	0.0135	0.9003	0.0328	0.9991
Treatment	5	0.0282	0.0413	0.0328	0.0417	5	0.0167	0.0389	0.0151	0.9404
Error	63	0.0136		0.0501		63	0.0233		0.0613	

[a] df = degrees of freedom.

[b] MS = mean square.

[c] Significance level $P < 0.05$.

Table 2. Mean disease incidence (DI) and severity (DS) of Petri disease pathogens isolated from the roots and basal ends of the rootstock of 2-year-old and 3-year-old grafted plants subjected to various treatments prior to planting in two fields in Logroño (La Rioja).

Cadophora luteo-olivacea								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)[a]		DS (%)[a]		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	8.1 a	24.4 ab	20.4 a	26.7 a	6.9 a	25.6 a	19.4 a	31.3 a
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	5.6 ab	34.4 a	20.4 a	24.5 a	5.6 a	34.4 a	19.6 a	28.4 a
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	6.9 ab	20.6 b	21.0 a	30.3 a	5.0 a	28.1 a	19.2 a	27.6 a
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	6.3 ab	31.3 ab	22.3 a	30.7 a	6.3 a	31.3 a	20.4 a	35.0 a
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	3.8 b	31.9 ab	21.3 a	30.3 a	5.0 a	31.9 a	17.5 a	31.0 a
Control (C)	7.5 a	38.1 a	25.2 a	33.8 a	7.5 a	36.9 a	22.3 a	33.4 a
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	2.7	8.2	7.5	7.7	2.5	7.8	7.0	7.5
Phaeomoniella chlamydospora								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)		DS (%)		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	6.3 a	11.3 a	10.0 ab	27.6 a	7.5 a	15.6 a	9.2 a	28.2 ab
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	6.3 a	18.8 a	10.6 ab	25.0 a	8.1 a	18.8 a	14.2 a	35.0 a
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	7.5 a	14.4 a	14.8 ab	29.8 a	8.1 a	6.3 b	15.8 a	15.0 b
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	6.3 a	17.5 a	13.3 ab	28.5 a	7.5 a	17.5 a	11.7 a	38.7 a
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	1.9 b	22.5 a	7.5 b	20.9 a	0.6 b	22.5 a	12.5 a	31.0 a
Control (C)	9.4 a	20.6 a	15.4 a	28.3 a	9.4 a	20.6 a	10.6 a	34.6 a
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	3.1	5.5	3.6	7.4	3.3	3.8	3.8	7.1
Phaeoacremonium minimum								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)		DS (%)		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	4.4 ab	11.3 a	16.3 a	15.1 a	4.0 a	15.0 a	13.8 a	21.0 a
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	3.1 b	16.9 a	18.8 a	13.6 a	4.1 a	16.5 a	2.5 b	9.5 b
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	5.0 ab	11.3 a	7.1 b	11.8 a	3.9 a	14.7 a	3.8 b	22.4 a
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	3.1 b	17.5 a	23.8 a	12.8 a	4.3 a	15.1 a	15.0 a	17.7 ab
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	3.8 ab	16.9 a	16.3 a	10.3 a	4.0 a	15.8 a	12.5 a	18.3 ab
Control (C)	5.6 a	16.9 a	21.7 a	17.0 a	4.0 a	17.2 a	12.5 a	19.9 ab
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	2.3	3.6	3.5	3.3	2.7	3.1	3.6	3.5

[a] At each plant part, percentages of disease incidence (DI) and disease severity (DS) are the mean of 160 plants analyzed (40 plants per replicate). Values in the same column followed by the same letter do not differ significantly (*P*=0.05).

Table 3. Mean disease incidence (DI) and severity (DS) of the most prevalent black-foot disease pathogens isolated from the roots and basal ends of rootstock of 2-year-old and 3-year-old grafted plants subjected to various treatments prior to planting in two fields in Logroño (La Rioja).

Dactylonectria torresensis								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)[a]		DS (%)[a]		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	31.3 a	6.3 b	20.5 a	3.8 b	21.3 a	1.3 b	12.3 a	20.0 a
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	30.0 a	6.3 b	15.3 a	22.1 a	26.9 a	10.0 a	13.5 a	19.7 a
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	25.0 a	5.0 b	23.0 a	17.5 a	21.9 a	14.4 a	13.8 a	16.7 a
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	31.3 a	4.4 b	18.5 a	22.5 a	26.9 a	10.0 a	10.8 a	18.3 a
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	25.0 a	3.8 b	17.6 a	28.3 a	30.6 a	12.5 a	10.0 a	20.5 a
Control (C)	25.0 a	14.4 a	20.6 a	18.1 a	20.6 a	11.9 a	11.5 a	19.9 a
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	6.6	6.2	6.0	6.5	5.8	3.8	3.2	3.5
Dactylonectria macrodidyma								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)		DS (%)		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	8.8 b	2.5 b	16.3 a	0 b	3.6 b	3.8 a	5.8 a	0 b
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	9.4 ab	3.1 b	17.8 a	3.8 ab	10.6 a	3.1 a	4.8 a	3.3 ab
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	11.3 ab	1.3 b	18.8 a	2.5 ab	7.5 a	3.8 a	4.1 a	0 b
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	13.8 ab	1.3 b	18.5 a	2.5 ab	10.0 a	4.4 a	5.1 a	2.5 ab
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	16.9 ab	3.8 b	11.8 a	1.7 ab	9.4 a	3.1 a	4.2 a	5.0 ab
Control (C)	16.3 a	10.0 a	14.8 a	6.1 a	8.8 a	3.8 a	4.0 a	6.3 a
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	3.6	3.3	3.7	2.3	3.0	2.5	2.6	2.3
Ilyonectria liriodendri								
	2-year-old plants				3-year-old plants			
	DI (%)		DS (%)		DI (%)		DS (%)	
	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends	Roots	Basal ends
T1. *Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	3.8 a	0.6 a	11.7 a	0 b	3.8 a	0.6 a	30.8 a	5.0 a
T2. *Trichoderma koningii* TK7	2.5 a	1.9 a	12.5 a	6.3 ab	3.1 a	0.6 a	32.5 a	2.5 a
T3. *Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	4.4 a	1.9 a	12.5 a	7.5 a	3.8 a	0.6 a	30.0 a	5.0 a
T4. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* + *Bacillus atrophaeus*	2.5 a	0.6 a	16.3 a	2.5 ab	3.1 a	1.3 a	36.3 a	5.0 a
T5. *Pythium oligandrum* Po37	2.5 a	1.3 a	12.5 a	7.5 a	3.1 a	0.6 a	28.8 a	5.0 a
Control (C)	3.8 a	0.6 a	10.0 a	2.5 ab	2.5 a	0.6 a	30.0 a	5.0 a
LSD (*P* = 0.05)	2.5	2.4	3.1	2.9	2.5	2.2	7.1	2.5

[a] At each plant part, percentages of disease incidence (DI) and disease severity (DS) are the mean of 160 plants analyzed (40 plants per replicate). Values in the same column followed by the same letter do not differ significantly (*P*=0.05).

Table 4. Pathogen reduction achieved by BCA treatments in the 3-year-old plants, associated with Petri and black-foot disease.

Petri disease			
Plant part	Biocontrol agent	Pathogen	Reduction[a]
Roots	*Pythium oligandrum* Po37	*Pa. chlamydospora*	93.6% (DI[b])
	Trichoderma koningii TK7	*Pm. minimum*	80% (DS[c])
	Trichoderma atroviride SC1	*Pm. minimum*	69.6% (DS)
Basal ends	*Trichoderma atroviride* SC1	*Pa. chlamydospora*	69.4% (DI) 56.6% (DS)
	Trichoderma koningii TK7	*Pm. minimum*	52.3% (DS)
Black-foot disease			
Basal ends	*Streptomyces* sp. E1 + R4	*D. torresensis*	89.1% (DI)
	Streptomyces sp. E1 + R4	*D. macrodidyma*	100% (DS)
	Trichoderma atroviride SC1	*D. macrodidyma*	100% (DS)

[a] The percentage of reduction (PR) of the pathogen detection at each plant part was calculated as $PR = 100(PC - PT)/PC$, where PC is the mean pathogen incidence or severity in the control and PT is the mean pathogen incidence or severity in the biocontrol agent treatment.
[b] Disease incidence
[c] Disease severity