Wall et al., *submitted*

Shifting Baselines: Physiological legacies contribute to the response of reef coral to frequent heat waves

Christopher B. Wall^{1,2*}, Contessa A. Ricci³, Alexandra D. Wen^{1,4}, Bren E. Ledbetter³, Delania E. Klinger³, Laura D. Mydlarz³, Ruth D. Gates¹, Hollie M. Putnam⁵

¹University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa, Hawai‘i Institute of Marine Biology, PO Box 1346, Kāne‘ohe, HI 96744, USA

²Pacific Biosciences Research Center, University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa, 1933 East West Road, Honolulu, HI 96816, USA

³University of Texas at Arlington, Department of Biology, Arlington, TX 76019, USA

⁴University of Miami, Rosenstiel School of Marine and Atmospheric Science, Miami, FL 33149, USA

⁵University of Rhode Island, Department of Biological Sciences, Kingston, RI USA

*corresponding author: chris.wall@hawaii.edu

Key words: immunity, physiology, El Niño, bleaching, Symbiodiniaceae

Abstract

1. Global climate change is altering coral reef ecosystems. Notably, marine heat waves are producing widespread coral bleaching events that are increasing in frequency, with projections for annual bleaching events on reefs worldwide by mid-century.
2. The response of corals to elevated seawater temperatures can be modulated by abiotic factors at site of origin and dominant endosymbiont type, which can result in a shift in multiple coral traits and drive physiological legacy effects that influence the trajectory of reef corals under subsequent thermal stress events. It is critical, therefore, to evaluate the potential for shifting physiological and cellular baselines driven by these factors in *in situ* bleaching (and recovery) events. Here, we use the back-to-back regional bleaching events of 2014 and 2015 in the Hawaiian Islands and subsequent recovery periods to test the hypothesis that coral multivariate trait space (here termed physiotype, sensu (Van Straalen, 2003) shift in multiple bleaching events, modulated by both environmental histories and symbiotic partnerships (Symbiodiniaceae).
3. Despite fewer degree heating weeks in the first-bleaching event relative to the second (7 vs. 10), bleaching severity in a dominant reef building coral on Hawaiian reefs, *Montipora capitata*, was greater (~70% vs. 50% bleached cover) and differences due to environmental history (reef site) were more pronounced. Melanin, an immune cytotoxic response, provided an initial defense during the first event, potentially priming antioxidant activity, which peaked in the second-bleaching event (i.e., a legacy effect). While magnitude of bleaching differed, immune response patterns were shared among corals harboring heat-sensitive and heat-tolerant Symbiodiniaceae. This supports a pattern of increased constitutive immunity in corals resulting from repeat bleaching

events, with greater specialized enzymes (catalase, peroxidase, superoxide dismutase) and attenuated melanin synthesis.

4. This study demonstrates bleaching events have implications for reef corals beyond shaping their ecological assemblages. These events can change the magnitude and/or identity of response variables contributing to physiotype, thus generating physiological legacies carried over into the future. Quantifying baseline coral physiotypes and tracking their shifts will be critical to understanding and forecasting the effects of increased bleaching frequency on coral biology and ecology in the Anthropocene.

1. Introduction

Environmental change at local and global scales is degrading coral reef ecosystems. Notably, long-term trends in ocean warming and punctuated marine heat waves are destabilizing the symbiosis between corals and their endosymbiont algae (Symbiodiniaceae) and increasing coral bleaching events (Hughes et al., 2018a). The cumulative impacts of these episodic heat waves not only shift ecological and functional baselines (Hughes et al., 2019; McWilliam, Pratchett, Hoogenboom, & Hughes, 2020), but may also have legacy effects on coral biology, such that responses to bleaching events can be modulated by prior exposure (e.g., Brown, Dunne, Goodson, & Douglas, 2000). It is growing increasingly clear that susceptibility to bleaching in reef corals is based on the interaction of environmental histories (Brown et al., 2000; Safaie et al., 2018) and holobiont traits, including endosymbiont communities and genetics and physiology of the coral host (Barshis et al., 2013; Palmer, Bythell, & Willis, 2010; Palumbi, Barshis, Traylor-Knowles, & Bay, 2014; Sampayo, Ridgway, Bongaerts, & Hoegh-Guldberg, 2008).

Thermotolerant Symbiodiniaceae can confer bleaching resistance in some corals (Sampayo et al., 2008), and the Hawaiian coral *Montipora capitata* exhibits reduced bleaching when dominated by *Durusdinium* as opposed to *Cladocopium* Symbiodiniaceae (Cunning, Ritson-Williams, & Gates, 2016). However, corals are metaorganisms, and host properties such as constitutive immunity (Palmer, 2018a) and antioxidant capacity (Barshis et al., 2013) are also central to maintaining cellular homeostasis and preventing bleaching mortality (Palmer et al., 2010). As such, immunological processes are implicated as targets for natural selection and are integral to the future of reef-building corals in the face of climate change (Mydlarz, McGinty, & Harvell,

2010; Palmer, 2018a; Pinzón, Beach-Letendre, Weil, & Mydlarz, 2014). The nexus of these influential properties of coral stress responses – symbiont community and host immunity – and their role in repetitive natural bleaching and recovery events remains to be fully understood, especially with respect to the role of environmental history (Palumbi et al., 2014; Safaie et al., 2018). As global climate change increases the frequency and severity of coral bleaching events (Hughes et al., 2018), understanding the symbiotic, immune, and antioxidant responses of corals will be central to understanding the cumulative and latent effects of bleaching on the function of reef corals through time and enhancing our capacity to project community responses to thermal stress events.

The widely documented recent major bleaching of the Great Barrier Reef (2016-2017) reduced coral cover by >50% (Stuart-Smith, Brown, Ceccarelli, & Edgar, 2018), altered coral (Hughes et al., 2018b) and fish (Robinson, Wilson, Jennings, & Graham, 2019) assemblages, and disturbed the stock-recruitment capacity of reef corals (Hughes et al., 2019). As climate change continues to intensify, it is now critical to track shifts in the biology and function of corals through examination of multivariate trait-space, defined as ‘physiotypes’ by Van Straalen (2003; e.g., Figure 1a), the term which we use throughout this manuscript. Trait-space approaches have recently been applied to track changes in reef coral communities and their representative trait diversity following bleaching (Hughes et al., 2018b; McWilliam et al., 2020), and the generation of physiotype time series data will provide a critical match to further understand and interpret the growing collection of coral reef ecological time series datasets (De’ath, Fabricius, Sweatman, & Puotinen, 2012; Edmunds et al., 2014; Edmunds et al., 2014; McClanahan, Ateweberhan, & Omukoto, 2007). Together, these timeseries will allow us to integrate across cellular, ecological

and evolutionary scales and improve our mechanistic understanding of these scale linkages. Importantly, tracking of multiple, interactive coral physiological traits provides the opportunity to reveal the potential for beneficial acclimatization or negative legacy effects that may underlie shifts in physiotype (e.g., Figure 1a) and testable mechanistic hypotheses underpinning resistance or susceptibility to repeated stress (Figure 1b).

This integrative multivariate approach to tracking coral performance was utilized to test specific hypotheses regarding targeted response variables and the linkage between environmentally-driven physiological, symbiotic, and cellular (i.e., antioxidants, immunity) legacies as mechanisms underpinning bleaching outcomes (Palmer et al., 2010; Palmer & Traylor-Knowles, 2012; Venn, Loram, & Douglas, 2008). Both the host and symbiont have enzymatic defenses to mitigate oxidative stress (e.g., peroxidase, catalase, superoxide dismutase) (Venn et al., 2008) caused by host (e.g., heat-damaged mitochondrial membranes, Dunn et al., 2012) and symbiont (e.g., damage to the D1 protein of photosystem II (PSII)) (Jones, Hoegh-Guldberg, Larkum, & Schreiber, 1998; Lesser, 1997) sources, ultimately leading to apoptosis and dysbiosis when severe enough (Weis, 2008) (Figure 1b). Thermal stress also triggers host immune responses (Mydlarz, Couch, Weil, Smith, & Harvell, 2009; Mydlarz et al., 2010; Pinzón et al., 2015), and higher constitutive immunity (i.e., immune activity necessary for cellular homeostasis) reduces coral thermal sensitivity and disease susceptibility (Palmer et al., 2010). In addition, the melanin-synthesis pathway is an important component of host immunity that is active in wound healing and pathogen invasion while also serving as a photoprotectant that may mitigate bleaching stress (Mydlarz & Palmer, 2011; Palmer et al., 2010) (Figure 1b). However, corals may mount different cellular mechanisms to combat bleaching due to energetic requirements

(Fuess, Mann, Jinks, Brinkhuis, & Mydlarz, 2018; Palmer, 2018b; Pinzón et al., 2015), stress frequency (i.e, acute, chronic, repeated stress) (Ainsworth et al., 2016; Schoepf et al., 2015), or as a function of histories of biotic and abiotic challenges that modulate constitutive immunity (Mydlarz et al., 2009; Palmer, 2018b; Wall et al., 2018). For instance, there is evidence corals may rely on different antioxidant and immunity mechanisms based on their environmental histories, as lower melanin synthesis and higher antioxidant activity was observed in heat-stressed corals from a reef with high pCO₂-variability compared to low pCO₂-variability (Wall et al., 2018). Thus, pairing the measurement of bleaching metrics like cell density and chlorophyll concentrations with immune and antioxidants provides a powerful and tractable approach within a multivariate integrative framework.

The Hawaiian Islands, once thought to be a bleaching refuge for corals (Jokiel & Brown, 2004), experienced severe bleaching in 2014 and 2015 across the populated Main and remote Northwestern Hawaiian Islands (Bahr, Rodgers, & Jokiel, 2017; Couch et al., 2017). In Kāneʻohe Bay, Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi, 7.1 degree heating weeks (DHW) were observed in 2014 and 10.2 DHW in 2015, beginning in August and July, respectively (*see* Methods), resulting in $45 \pm 2\%$ (mean $\pm$ SE) bleaching in the first event and $30 \pm 4\%$ bleaching in the second (Bahr et al., 2017). An ecologically dominant reef coral, *Montipora capitata* (Dana 1846), showed significant bleaching in both events (Figure 2a), with differences in bleaching responses observed at the site and event level.

Using the opportunity presented by these natural bleaching events (Figure 2), we tracked coral percent bleaching and phenotypes using a multivariate trait-space approach. We quantified the

response of *M. capitata* in Kāneʻohe Bay to the back-to-back bleaching events of 2014 and 2015 (i.e., bleaching in October 2014, recovery in February 2015, bleaching in October 2015, and recovery in February 2016) at two Kāneʻohe Bay reefs (Lilipuna and Reef 14) with contrasting environmental histories relating to seawater residence (10 – 20 d vs. >30 d), pCO₂ variability (ca. 300 vs. 600 μ atm pCO₂ diel flux), and proximity to shore (Drupp, De Carlo, Mackenzie, Bienfang, & Sabine, 2011; Drupp et al., 2013; Lowe, Falter, Monismith, & Atkinson, 2009). We predicted that: (H1) immunity and antioxidant contributions to bleaching responses will be influenced by site environmental histories and symbiont communities such that greater bleaching prevalence and attenuated immune responses will be observed in corals from the high variable-pCO₂ site (Reef 14) and those association with thermally sensitive Symbiodiniaceae. We also expected (H2) immunity and antioxidant activity would not occur with the same magnitude or trajectory after repeated bleaching events due to legacy effects shaping acclimatory or stress response pathways over time. Considering the wide-ranging functions of melanin in host immunity (Palmer et al., 2008, 2010), we expected melanin synthesis to act as an acute and broad-spectrum defense in physiologically stressed corals, with antioxidants having a more specialized response after chronic or repeat bleaching stress. Finally, while the thermal tolerance of symbiont communities is vital to coral bleaching sensitivity, evidence for differential immunity or antioxidant capacities in coral holobionts associated with thermally tolerant symbiont species is lacking. Given that the coral *M. capitata* is known to be dominated by two genetically and physiologically contrasting Symbiodiniaceae, *Cladocopium* sp. and *Durisdinium glynnii* (Cunning et al., 2016; Wall, Kaluhiokalani, Popp, Donahue, & Gates, 2020), we predicted (H3) that holobionts harboring heat-tolerant *D. glynnii* would show higher immune and antioxidant responses linked to greater bleaching resistance. To test these hypotheses, we

measured bleaching severity and recovery at each location using benthic surveys and measured coral traits in coral fragments, including: physiological measurements of cellular bleaching magnitude (symbiont density, areal- and cell-specific chlorophyll *a*, holobiont total protein and total biomass), and completed enzymatic assays for mechanisms contributing to bleaching resistance through coral host antioxidant capacity (peroxidase, catalase, superoxide dismutase), and the host immune response of the melanin cascade (prophenoloxidase, melanin). This approach allows for a more holistic description of coral physiotype that we tracked through two bleaching and recovery periods.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1 Site description

Coral bleaching and recovery at two reef systems: a fringing reef (hereafter, ‘Lilipuna’ [21°25’36.8’’N, 157°47’24.0’’W]) in southern Kāne‘ohe Bay adjacent to the Hawai‘i Institute of Marine Biology (HIMB) on Moku o Lo‘e, and an inshore patch reef (hereafter, ‘Reef 14’ [21°27’08.6’’N, 157°48’04.7’’W]) in central Kāne‘ohe Bay. These reefs sites were chosen due to their unique environmental history of seawater pCO₂ and hydrodynamics (Drupp et al., 2013; Wall et al., 2018). Seawater pCO₂ adjacent to the both locations (fringing reef at Lilipuna and the patch reef Reef 14) is comparable (ca. 450 μatm), however, diel pCO₂ flux is significantly higher (196 – 976 μatm pCO₂) in central Kāne‘ohe Bay near Reef 14 relative to the Bay’s southern basin proximate to Lilipuna (225 – 671 μatm) (P. Drupp et al., 2011; Drupp et al., 2013).

2.2 Environmental monitoring

Temperature (Hobo pendants, ± 0.53 °C accuracy, 0.14 °C resolution, Onset Computer Corp., Bourne, MA) and photosynthetic active radiation (PAR) loggers (Odyssey, Dataflow Systems Limited, Christchurch, New Zealand) were placed at Lilipuna and Reef 14 at a depth of 1 m. Loggers were periodically removed from the reef, cleaned, and replaced monthly. Temperature and PAR were recorded continuously at 15 min intervals from October 2014 – February 2016, however, gaps in environmental data do exist as a consequence of instrument failure and loss. Gaps in logger temperature data were supplemented with NOAA temperature data from the Moku o Lo'e station at HIMB (NOAA, 2019). PAR loggers were calibrated against a LI-1400 quantum meter (Li-Cor, Lincoln, Nebraska, USA) attached to a cosine LI-192 underwater quantum sensor. Temperature loggers were calibrated with a certified digital thermometer (5-077-8, ± 0.05 °C accuracy, Control Company, USA) and cross-calibrated against each other for standardization. Degree heating weeks (DHW) for the southern portion of Kāne'ohe Bay where our corals were collected were calculated in R using *in situ* Moku o Lo'e temperature data (NOAA, 2019), with the difference between mean half-week temperatures (i.e., mean hourly temp over 3.5 d) and the maximum monthly mean temperature of 27.7 °C, (Jokiel & Brown, 2004)] to determine 'hotspots'. DHW were determined as the number of hotspots >1 across a rolling 12 weeks window (i.e., 24 half-weeks) (NOAA, 2020). DHW for windward O'ahu and the Hawaiian Islands during the 2014 and 2015 bleaching events have been previously reported (Bahr et al., 2017; Sale, Marko, Oliver, & Hunter, 2019). The purpose of our calculations are to quantify the incurred heat stress using empirical calculation of DHW from temperature data collected proximate to our two reef locations.

2.3 Benthic surveys and coral collections

Four sampling periods were identified as corresponding to a ‘bleaching period’ following the point of maximum thermal stress (10 October 2014 and 12 October 2015) and a post-bleaching ‘recovery period’ approximately 4 months after peak seawater warming (11 February 2015 and 26 February 2016). In each time period, benthic surveys were conducted at each reef site using a 20 m transect and a line-point-intersect at 1 m intervals. Transects were positioned parallel to natural contours of the reef, being the north-south axis of the fringing reef (Lilipuna) and the east-west axis of patch reef (Reef 14). At each reef, transects ($n = 2$) were placed along the reef crest (1 – 2 m), and benthic community cover was recorded at the species level for reef corals (*Montipora capitata*, *Pocillopora* spp. [*P. acuta*, *P. damicornis*], *Porites compressa*), and either crustose coralline algae (CCA), macroalgae, or sand/bare/turf. For corals, bleaching state was quantified categorically, being either non-bleached (i.e., appearing fully pigmented), or bleached (i.e., exhibiting degrees of tissue paling/pigment variegation or being wholly white). *M. capitata* cover was calculated as the proportion of total benthic cover, and *M. capitata* bleaching extent was calculated as proportion of total *M. capitata* colonies bleached. The relative position of transects at each reef was recorded to allow for repeat surveys within the same general location at each reef across survey periods.

In each sampling period, coral branch tips (<4 cm length) were collected from forty *M. capitata* coral colonies ($n = 1$ fragment colony⁻¹) along the reef crest at each reef site at a depth of ca. 1 m (State of Hawai‘i Department of Land and Natural Resources, Special Activity Permit 2015-17 and 2016-69). Immediately post collection, corals were snap-frozen in liquid nitrogen and returned to HIMB and stored at -80 °C. While remaining frozen, each colony was split in half along its longitudinal axis. One-half of each coral fragment was stored at HIMB (-80 °C) until

processing for physiological assays and qPCR. The corresponding fragment-halves were used for immunological assays and were shipped to the University of Texas at Arlington using a dry-shipper charged with liquid nitrogen.

2.4 DNA extraction and symbiont community analysis

Symbiodiniaceae DNA was extracted by adding an isolate of coral tissue (500 μ l) to 500 μ l DNA buffer (0.4 M NaCl, 0.05 M EDTA) with 2% (w/v) sodium dodecyl sulfate, following a modified CTAB-chloroform protocol (Cunning et al., 2016) ([dx.doi.org/10.17504/protocols.io.dyq7vv](https://doi.org/10.17504/protocols.io.dyq7vv)). To determine the dominant genera of Symbiodiniaceae hosted by each *M. capitata* fragment, a quantitative PCR (qPCR) (Cunning et al., 2016) was used to amplify Symbiodiniaceae actin gene loci, with the corresponding number of actin gene copies in the Symbiodiniaceae genera *Cladocopium* and *Durisdinium* (namely, ITS2 types C31, with C17 and C21 and D1-4-6 [*Durisdinium glynnii* (Wham, Ning, & LaJeunesse, 2017)]) known to be numerically dominant in Kāneʻohe Bay *M. capitata* (Cunning et al., 2016). Specificity of genus-level primers have been previously validated using a combination of Symbiodiniaceae internal transcribed spacer (ITS2) region of rDNA and actin gene sequencing (Cunning & Baker, 2013). Duplicate qPCR reactions (10 μ l) were run for each coral sample using a StepOnePlus platform (Applied Biosystems) set to 40 cycles, a relative fluorescence (ΔR_n) threshold of 0.01, and internal cycle baseline of 3 – 15. Symbiont genera detected in only one technical replicate were considered absent. The relative abundance of *Cladocopium* and *Durisdinium* symbionts (i.e., C:D ratio) in each sample was determined from the ratio of amplification threshold cycles (C_T) for *Cladocopium* and *Durisdinium* (i.e., C_T^C , C_T^D) using the formula $C:D = 2^{(C_T^C - C_T^D)}$, where genus-specific C_T values are normalized according to gene locus copy number and fluorescence

intensity (Cunning et al., 2016). Coral colonies were determined to be *Cladocopium*- or *Durusdinium*-dominated based on numerical abundance (>0.5 proportion) of each genus from qPCR analysis (Innis, Cunning, Ritson-Williams, Wall, & Gates, 2018).

2.5 Physiological metrics

The extraction and processing of coral and symbiont tissues was performed following established methods (summarized in Wall et al., 2018). Briefly, coral tissue was removed from the skeleton using an airbrush filled with 0.2 μ m filtered seawater, yielding ~10 – 30 ml of tissue slurry. Extracted tissues were briefly homogenized and subsampled for the following physiological metrics: symbiont cell densities, chlorophyll *a* concentrations, protein biomass, and the total organic biomass determined from the ash-free dry weight (AFDW) of coral + algae tissues. Coral tissue slurries were stored at -20 °C.

All physiological metrics were normalized to the surface area (cm²) of coral skeleton using the paraffin wax-dipping technique (Stimson & Kinzie, 1991). Symbiont cell counts were measured by replicate cell counts ($n = 6 - 10$) on a haemocytometer, and expressed as symbiont cells cm⁻². Chlorophyll *a* was quantified by concentrating algal cells through centrifugation (3,000 $\times g$ for 3 min) and extracting pigments in the algal pellet in 100% acetone for 36 h in darkness at -20 °C. Spectrometric absorbance were measured ($\lambda = 630$ and 663 nm) using a 96-well quartz plate with two technical replicates; chlorophyll concentrations quantified using the equations for dinoflagellates (Jeffrey & Humphrey, 1975), normalized for path length and expressed as μ g chlorophyll *a* cm⁻² and pg chlorophyll *a* symbiont cell⁻¹. Total protein concentration (soluble + insoluble in the holobiont) was quantified using the Pierce BCA (bicinchoninic acid) Protein

Assay Kit (Pierce Biotechnology, Waltham, MA). Protein solubilization was achieved by adding 1 M NaOH and heating (90 °C) for 60 min, followed by the neutralizing to ca. pH 7.5 with 1 N HCl. Protein was measured spectrophotometrically ($\lambda = 562$ nm) in a 96-well plate with three technical replicates against a bovine serum albumin standard and expressed as mg protein cm⁻². Total fraction of organic biomass was measured by drying a subsample of coral tissue at 60 °C (48 h) in pre-burned aluminum pans followed by burning in a muffle furnace (450 °C) for 4 h. The difference between the dried and burned masses is the AFDW and expressed as mg cm⁻².

2.6 Immunity and oxidative stress metrics

Immunology and oxidative stress metrics were determined using previously published protocols for coral host tissues (Mydlarz et al., 2009; Mydlarz & Palmer, 2011; Palmer et al., 2011; Wall et al., 2018). A 3 – 4 ml aliquot of coral tissue slurry was obtained by airbrushing with our coral extraction buffer at pH 7.0 (100 mM TRIS buffer + 0.05 mM dithiothreitol). Tissue was homogenized for 1 min on ice (hand held homogenizer, Powergen 125, Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA), and 1 ml of the resulting slurry was freeze-dried for 24 h (VirTis BTK freeze-dryer, SP Scientific, Warminster, PA) and used for melanin concentration estimates. The remaining slurry was centrifuged at 4 °C at 2,500 × g (Eppendorf 5810 R centrifuge, Hamburg, Germany) for 5 min to remove cellular debris and most Symbiodiniaceae cells to achieve a host-enriched cell-free extract. All colorimetric measurements were calculated using a Synergy 2 multi-Detection microplate reader with Gen5 software (BioTek, Winooski, VT, USA). All assays were run in duplicate or triplicate on separate 96-well microtiter plates. Total protein concentration of each coral cell-free extract was determined using the RED660 protein assay (G Biosciences, Saint Louis, MO) with a bovine serum albumin standard curve.

To determine the concentration of melanin within each sample, the freeze-dried aliquots of weighed and dried tissue were gently vortexed with 400 μ l of 10 M sodium hydroxide (NaOH) and left to extract for 48 h. Samples were bead-beaten with 1 mm glass beads and then vortexed for 10 s and then centrifuged at $7,000 \times g$ for 5min. For each sample, 65 μ l of supernatant were aliquoted in duplicate into a 96-well g-area microtiter plate (Greiner Bioone, Monroe, NC, USA). The plates were read at an absorbance of 490 nm and the concentration of melanin was determined using a standard curve (0 – 2 mg) of commercial melanin (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO) dissolved in 10 M NaOH for 48 h and treated the same as the samples on each microtiter plate. Data presented are converted to mg melanin normalized to mg of tissue (Fuess et al., 2018).

PPO activity was determined for each sample using duplicate 20 μ l aliquots of coral cell-free extract in clear 96-well microtiter plates, with 50 μ l of 10 mM phosphate buffered saline at pH 7.0. To each well, 20 μ l of trypsin (0.2 mg ml^{-1} concentration in deionized filtered water) was added to activate PPO and the reaction was initiated by the addition of 20 μ l of 25 mM L-1,3-dihydroxyphenylalanine (L-DOPA; Sigma-Aldrich). The absorbance at 490 nm was measured over 25 min and the change in absorbance during the linear portion of the reaction (typically 10 – 15 min) was normalized to mg protein and time for each sample ($\Delta\text{Abs}_{490 \text{ nm}} \text{ mg protein}^{-1} \text{ min}^{-1}$) (Mydlarz & Palmer, 2011; Fuess et al., 2018).

Coral host oxidative stress was determined by measuring the scavenging activity of the coral cell-free extracts to different substrates comparable to the antioxidants: peroxidase (POX),

catalase (CAT), and superoxide dismutase (SOD). Peroxidase activity (EC 1.11.1.7) was determined for each sample using 10 μ l aliquots of coral cell-free extract, in duplicate within 96-well microtiter plates, diluted with 50 μ l phosphate buffer (pH6.0). To each well, of 25 μ l of 25 mM guaiacol in 10 mM PBS (pH 6.0) was added and the reaction was initiated with the addition of 12.5 μ l of 25 mM H₂O₂ high purity 30% hydrogen peroxide (H₂O₂; Sigma Aldrich). Guaiacol is a phenolic compound with scavenging properties that is commonly used as a substrate for peroxidase activity (Mydlarz & Harvell, 2007). The absorbance was read at 470 nm every min for 15 min and the change over time was calculated for the linear part of the reaction (0 – 10 min) and normalized to mg protein in each sample the units for peroxidase activity are (Δ Abs₄₇₀ nm mg protein⁻¹ min⁻¹) (Mydlarz & Harvell, 2008).

Catalase activity (EC 1.11.1.6) was determined using the H₂O₂ depletion assay using 10 μ l coral cell free extract and 50 μ l of 10 mM of pH 6.0 phosphate buffered saline (PBS) in duplicate wells of a UV-transparent 96-well microtiter plate. The assay was activated by the addition of 10 μ l 25 mM H₂O₂. The absorbance was measured at 240 nm over 15 min and the change in absorbance over time (e.g., initial - final) was calculated for the linear part of the reaction (typically 0 – 8 min) and converted to μ mol H₂O₂ using a standard curve of known concentrations, normalized per mg protein. CAT activity is presented as μ mol H₂O₂ scavenged mg protein⁻¹ min⁻¹ (Palmer et al., 2011).

Superoxide dismutase (EC 1.15.1.1) activity was calculated using the SOD Assay Determination Kit-WST (Fluka, Switzerland) which includes Dojindo's highly water-soluble tetrazolium salt, WST-1(2-(4-iodophenyl)-3-(4-nitrophenyl)-5-(2,4-disulfophenyl)-2H-tetrazolium, monosodium

salt), that produces a water-soluble formazan dye with an absorbance peak at 450 nm upon reduction with superoxide anion. 10 μ L of extract was incubated with WST-1 and xanthine oxidase, which produces superoxide anion. Inhibition of absorbance at 450 nm (scavenging of the superoxide anion) was monitored in wells containing coral extracts and SOD standards and compared to untreated samples. One SOD unit of activity (U) equates to 50% inhibition of superoxide anion, and data are presented as SOD U mg protein⁻¹ (Krueger et al., 2015).

2.7 Statistical analysis

Permutation analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) and non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) were performed using a balanced matrix of all physiology and immunity/antioxidant responses ($n = 10$ responses) in the package *vegan* (Oksanen et al., 2019). PERMANOVA used a scaled and centered matrix with Euclidean calculations of pairwise distances using *adonis2*. The NMDS data matrix was double standardized using a Wisconsin and square root transformation with a euclidean distance using *metaMDS*. Response variables showing significant correlations ($p < 0.05$) with NMDS axes were plotted as vectors using *envfit* command in *vegan*. Coral ‘physiotypes’ were defined by convex hulls, with borders defined by the range of points in the multivariate trait space (i.e., NMDS1 and NMDS2). Physiotypes were grouped categorically by periods, or the interactions of Site, Symbiont, and Period. Physiotype centroids used in trajectory plots were calculated as the mean of NMDS1 and NMD2 for each category.

Ecological benthic data (*M. capitata* total cover and bleached cover) were tested in a linear model with Periods (two bleaching and two recovery events) and Sites (Lilipuna, Reef 14) as fixed effects. Physiology, antioxidant, and immunity response variables were analyzed using a

linear model with Periods, Sites, and Symbiont community composition (*Cladocopium*- or *Durusdinium*-dominated) as fixed effects. Normal distribution and equal variance assumptions of ANOVA were examined by graphical representation of residuals and quantile:quantile plots. Where assumptions were not met, Box-Cox tests were performed (Box & Cox, 1964) and data transformations applied in the package *MASS* (Venable & Ripley, 2002). Analysis of variance tables for linear models were generated using type-II sum of squares with multiple comparisons using the package *emmeans* (Lenth, 2019). All analyses were performed in *R* version 3.6.1 (R Core Team, 2019). All data and code to generate figures and perform analyses are archived and openly available at Github (<https://github.com/cbwall/Gates-Mydlarz-bleaching-recovery/releases/tag/v4>).

3. Results

Coral cover at the two sites ranged from (mean $\pm$ SD) $63 \pm 11\%$ to $93 \pm 11\%$ from 2014-2016. Greater total bleached coral cover was observed in the first bleaching event ($62 - 75 \pm 9\%$) relative to the second ($43 - 55 \pm 16\%$) (i.e., during thermal stress) (Figure 2). Mean *M. capitata* cover was stable across time at Lilipuna ($\sim 40\%$) but was much more variable at Reef 14, falling from $91 \pm 4\%$ in October 2014 to $51 \pm 7\%$ in February 2016. In the two bleaching events (October 2014 and 2015) greater bleaching of *M. capitata* corals was observed at Reef 14, compared to Lilipuna ($p=0.020$).

PERMANOVA results testing effects of Period (bleaching event), Site (Lilipuna vs. Reef 14) and dominant Symbiodiniaceae species (*Cladocopium* sp. or *D. glynnii*) revealed significant differences of all main effects ($p<0.001$) and the interaction of Period-by-Site ($p<0.001$) and

Period-by-Symbiont community ($p < 0.001$) (Figure 3 and 4, Table 1). In each of the four periods, coral physiotypes occupied unique positions in multidimensional trait space (Figure 2), with the location and trajectories of coral physiotypes in each period principally being a function of symbiont community, and to a lesser extent, site of collection (i.e., environmental history and physiological legacy) (Figure 3, 4).

Physiotypes of bleached corals relative to recovered corals showed stronger separation in 2014-2015, which was apparent at both reef sites (Figure 3, top row) and paralleled patterns of greater bleaching prevalence in the first-bleaching event (Figure 2c). Similarly, site effects on coral physiotypes were most pronounced in the first bleaching event (Table 1, Figure 4). Despite greater bleaching at Reef 14 in October 2014 (Figure 2b), shifts in bleaching and recovery performance envelopes were most distinct at Lilipuna (Figure 4). At the physiological level, separation of physiotypes during and after thermal stress was driven by bleaching sensitivity and symbiont cells/chlorophyll concentrations ($p < 0.001$, Figure 4 & S2, Table S1). “Bleached” physiotypes observed in periods of temperature stress (October 2014 and 2015) generally aligned with colonies hosting the more thermally sensitive *Cladocopium* sp., although in the first event coral physiotypes at Reef 14 symbiont communities did not separate according to symbiont communities (Figure 4). Nevertheless, across all sampling periods *M. capitata* colonies dominated by *Durusdinium* symbionts had higher symbiont cell densities, less variable areal chlorophyll concentrations, and lower chlorophyll per symbiont cell (i.e., pg chlorophyll cell⁻¹) compared to colonies dominated by *Cladocopium* symbionts ($p < 0.001$, Figure S2). While *Cladocopium* chlorophyll cell⁻¹ oscillated across bleaching-and recovery periods, *Durusdinium* pg chlorophyll cell⁻¹ remained stable ($p = 0.010$) and was also slightly higher at Reef 14 relative to Lilipuna across all timepoints ($p = 0.001$, Table S1). Coral protein and total biomass was variable

across the study, but each showed positive correlations with *Durussinium*-dominated
physiotypes from Lilipuna in bleaching and recovery periods (Figure 4). Overall, protein was
9% higher in *Durussinium*-dominated colonies ($p=0.031$) and 32% higher in Lilipuna corals
during first bleaching (October 2014) but equivalent at all sampling points thereafter ($p=0.002$).
Total biomass was lower during recovery periods ($p<0.001$) in addition to being 20 – 40% higher
at Lilipuna compared to Reef 14 in all periods (except in February 2015 recovery) ($p<0.001$) and
~30% higher in *Durussinium*-dominated colonies during the second bleaching, but equivalent
across all colonies in other periods ($p=0.012$) (Figure S2).

Immunity and antioxidant metrics (i.e., MEL, PPO, POX, CAT, SOD) differed through time in
response to repeat bleaching and recovery (Figure 3, Figure 4) ($p<0.001$), while the
environmental influence from the Sit and Symbiont communities were less pronounced (Figure
S2, S3, and Table S1, S2). In the first event, corals responded to thermal stress by increasing
melanin synthesis ($p<0.001$) (with corresponding declines in PPO precursors) and increasing
catalase ($p<0.001$). During recovery, prophenoloxidase (*post-hoc*: $p<0.001$) and superoxide
dismutase increased (*post-hoc*: $p<0.001$) as melanin and catalase declined (Figure 4, 5, S2, & S3,
Table S1, S2). Notably, the melanin pathway increased in all corals in the 2014-bleaching event
regardless of bleaching sensitivity (i.e., loss or retention of symbionts/chlorophyll), or symbiont
community, and was a significant cellular response that shaped coral physiotypes in the first
bleaching event (Figure 5, first row). Corals in the second bleaching experienced a 6-fold
increase in melanin (October 2015 vs. February 2015) along with corresponding reductions in
prophenoloxidase, however, melanin activity was significantly less compared to the high
melanin activity observed in the first bleaching period (0.015 vs. 0.003 mg melanin mg tissue⁻¹ in
first- versus second-bleaching period). Conversely to lower melanin in the second bleaching was

a peak in catalase activity, which reached its highest level in 2015 bleaching (*post-hoc*, $p < 0.001$) and was most pronounced in corals from Lilipuna compared to Reef 14 (*post-hoc*, $p < 0.001$) (Table S2). The peak in catalase during 2015 bleaching corresponded with the lowest observed peroxidase activity, particularly for *Cladocopium*-dominated colonies (*post-hoc*, $p = 0.007$). Subsequently in the 2016 recovery period, catalase declined by ~70% and peroxidase activity doubled, reaching peak activity similar to those observed in time periods. In contrast to other immunity and antioxidant responses, superoxide dismutase showed a unique trajectory, increasing progressively through time with each sampling period, being at its highest constitutive activity after repeat bleaching in the 2016 recovery, which was double that observed in the first bleaching period (October 2014) ($p < 0.001$). Similar to catalase, superoxide dismutase was also slightly higher in corals from Lilipuna compared to those at Reef 14 ($p = 0.028$).

4. Discussion

Ocean thermal anomalies are reshaping the structure and function of coral reefs the world over. Three mass bleaching events occurred since 2014 (Hughes et al., 2017), and climate models predict that by mid-century bleaching will be an annual phenomena (van Hooidonk, Maynard, & Planes, 2013). The stress responses of corals to ocean warming is based on a network of dynamic interactions at biological and environmental levels, that can influence how they respond to the physiological challenges posed by a warming planet (Suggett & Smith, 2019). Accordingly, there is a need for holistic measures of coral response that incorporate the influence of and environmental history (Palumbi et al., 2014) on physiological legacy effects. For example assessment of symbiont community (Suggett, Warner, & Leggat, 2017) and cellular memory (Brown, Dunne, Edwards, Sweet, & Phongsuwan, 2015) in the coral holobiont during and after thermal stress, to test for shifting physiological status that may ameliorate or exacerbate coral

bleaching. Thus, physiotype tracking – or multivariate physiological and molecular time series data – provide the capacity for identification of the cellular mechanisms that contribute to resilience, acclimatization, and/or resistance that can allow for better predictions of coral ecological responses to intensifying climate change and other regional disturbances (Vercelloni et al., 2020).

Symbiosis – via differential performance of genera and types (Sampayo et al., 2008; Stat et al., 2008) and the potential for switching and shuffling (Buddemeier & Fautin 1993; Baker et al., 2003) – provide one clear example of how environmental history can shift performance baselines. In this study, the role of dominant Symbiodiniaceae on holobiont physiotype was present, but the symbiont community effects were often Period- or Site-dependent. The high symbiont and chlorophyll *a* densities in *M. capitata* colonies dominated by *D. glynnii* across Periods aligns with the paradigm of high thermotolerance within the genus *Durusdinium* (Cunning et al., 2016; Lesser, Stat, & Gates, 2013; Silverstein, Cunning, & Baker, 2017; Wham et al., 2017). However, antioxidant and immunity metrics were equivalent in colonies differing in dominant symbiont partner, demonstrating negligible effects on antioxidant and immune traits counter to the expectation that these would be modulated by symbiont-derived bleaching resistance. In fact, this similarity was despite a greater loss of symbiont cells and photopigmentation in colonies dominated by *Cladocopium* relative to *Durusdinium*. Symbiont PSII photodamage is thought to lead the cascade of cellular events that culminate in bleaching (Weis, 2008). However, some Symbiodiniaceae (*Symbiodinium* sp., *Durusdinium trenchii*) have been shown to resist expulsion from the host despite incurring photodamage (Kemp et al., 2011; Silverstein et al., 2017). Therefore, host mechanisms regulating redox status may be equally important in coral thermal stress responses and decoupled from symbiont photophysiological

function (Krueger et al., 2015). In our study, the similarities observed between the antioxidant and immune responses of *Cladocopium*- and *Durisdinium*-dominated *M. capitata* colonies during both bleaching and recovery periods implicate an integral role of host mechanisms in coral responses to bleaching and recovery despite the presence of functionally distinct symbiont communities.

Shifts in physiotypes across bleaching and recovery periods were influenced by symbiont communities and the physical environment at each site, however, the significance of these predictors were not uniform across time and varied during first- and second-bleaching events. For instance, the effects of reef site were clear in the first event, possibly relating to greater bleaching in 2014, which reduced symbiont cells in both corals dominated by *Cladocopium* sp. and thermotolerant *D. glynii* at Reef 14. In the context of previous works, our data agrees with findings that DHW in Kāneʻohe Bay were lower in the first bleaching event relative to the second (5 – 7 DHW [2014] vs. 10 – 12 DHW [2015]) (Bahr et al., 2017), while the percentage of bleached coral cover was higher in 2014 at our study sites (70% [2014] vs. 50% [2015]) and in Kāneʻohe Bay as a whole (45 – 77% [2014] vs. 30 – 55% [2015]) (Bahr et al., 2017; Ritson-Williams & Gates, 2020) possibly due to greater cumulative temperature stress in 2014 (Bahr et al., 2017; Ritson-Williams & Gates, 2020). While this study and others agree that lower bleaching prevalence was observed in Kāneʻohe Bay during the second bleaching event, we show this corresponded with attenuated Site × Symbiont effects on coral physiotypes (Figure 4 *bottom row*), suggesting a positive feedback between this interaction and bleaching severity. Therefore, the symbiont community harbored by corals is integral to bleaching responses and coral physiotypes (Suggett et al., 2017), but the relative importance of symbiont effects are also tempered by present environmental conditions and site-specific environmental histories.

Environmental conditions between Lilipuna and Reef 14 did not differ in terms of light availability, seawater temperature, or DHW (Figures 2 & S1). Nevertheless, the hydrodynamics between these reefs are substantial, producing considerable differences in seawater residence and pCO₂ variability (Drupp et al. 2011, 2013). In addition, the fringing reef habitat of Lilipuna with a close proximity to shore and silt-dominated backreef benthos is in stark contrast to Reef 14, which is patch reef pinnacle in the middle of the Kāneʻohe Bay lagoon. Together, the persistence of long-term hydrodynamic and biogeochemistry conditions between these reefs have manifested as physiological legacies in resident *M. capitata*, which we demonstrate influence the response of corals to regional bleaching events. In the laboratory, we showed *M. capitata* from Reef 14 exhibited greater antioxidant activity and F_v/F_m but lower melanin compared to Lilipuna colonies (Wall et al., 2018). We hypothesize these patterns observed in laboratory and field studies may be underpinned by energetic limitations due to pCO₂ histories. Immunity is energetically expensive (Palmer et al. 2018b) and studies show corals exposed to high-pCO₂ upregulate genes for energy reserve metabolism (Vidal-Dupiol et al., 2013) and can have lower lipid biomass compared to corals at ambient-pCO₂ (Wall, Mason, Ellis, Cunning, & Gates, 2017). In this case flow and pCO₂-history may be an important factor in the physiological legacies of Kāneʻohe Bay *M. capitata*, which had a greater impact on during the first bleaching event relative to the second.

Coral physiotypes are influenced by the physiological state and integrity of the coral-Symbiodiniaceae symbiosis, which includes (but is not limited to) pigmentation and symbiont densities. As expected, we observed symbiont loss/repopulation to drive changes in coral physiotypes between bleaching and recovery periods, and in support of our hypothesis, prior events had cumulative impacts on physiotype trajectories. Notably, coral physiotypes occupied

distinct spaces in each sampling period and showed changing trajectory through time (2014-2016) with the terminus of the trajectory in 2016-recovery resulting in a coral trait space intermediate between prior bleaching and recovery periods (Figure 1). These trajectories may be driven by those responses active in either the first or second bleaching-recovery periods (such as melanin), or by changes in constitutive immune activity that are cyclical (e.g., PPO and CAT), or continuously increasing through time (e.g., SOD). For instance, changes in total biomass generally declined in the aftermath of bleaching, being lower in recovery periods, but did not follow patterns in symbiont or photopigment concentrations. Coral tissue biomass also increased through time and was highest in the second year (on average pooled across all samples). The progressive increases in constitutive antioxidant activity exemplified by superoxide dismutase, may also have contributed to maintenance of biomass and therefore enhanced the potential for overall coral colony survival (Thornhill et al., 2011). Therefore, the moderate increase in tissue biomass through time, despite repeat stress events, may be a result of greater resilience in corals surviving repeat bleaching events, in addition to seasonal and stress-dependent fluctuations in coral tissue (Fitt, McFarland, Warner, & Chilcoat, 2000; Wall, Ritson-Williams, Popp, & Gates, 2019).

The observed differences in antioxidant and immune activity in corals during repeat bleaching and recovery reveal that shifts in cellular priorities and mechanisms for dealing with bleaching stress exist, which ultimately shapes coral physiotypes and their trajectories through time and between stress states (Figure 5). In this case, increased catalase activity during bleaching may be linked to reactive oxygen and nitrogen species and increased host apoptosis-like pathways (Hawkins, Krueger, Becker, Fisher, & Davy, 2014; Krueger et al., 2015). Conversely, the accumulation of superoxide dismutase is decoupled from the onset and subsidence of thermal

stress seen in catalase. This response may reflect the “cellular memory” of corals to thermal stress, acting as a buffer to future oxidative stress (Barshis et al., 2013; Brown et al., 2015) to reduce bleaching effects while also contributing to greater tissue retention and post-bleaching survival. Both corals and Symbiodiniaceae have a broad array of superoxide dismutase isoforms (Krueger et al., 2015; Richier, Sabourault, & Courtiade, 2006), which can be used to combat reactive oxygen species originating from damage to photomachinery and host mitochondria that together can trigger apoptosis (Dunn et al., 2012). The persistent increase of superoxide dismutase through time thus suggests antioxidant “frontloading” (Barshis et al., 2013) is an important strategy used by corals during repetitive thermal stress to reduce damage.

Engagement of the melanin pathway (collectively here as the prophenoloxidase reservoir and the melanin product) is known to be an important generalized stress response for mitigating disease and thermal stress effects in corals (Mydlarz, Holthouse, Peters, & Harvell, 2008; Palmer et al., 2010; Wall et al., 2018). Likewise, exposure to thermal stress increases antioxidant activity in corals and Symbiodiniaceae (Gardner et al., 2017). In the first-bleaching event, the melanin pathway was observed as the primary cellular response to warming in all corals, regardless of bleaching sensitivity or symbiont community. This initial peak in melanin synthesis further supports the central role of this pathway as a generalized cellular response to periodic stress, including wound repair, disease, photodamage, and bleaching, and/or a photoprotective role to reduce excess excitation energy (Mydlarz et al., 2008; Palmer, Traylor-Knowles, Willis, & Bythell, 2011; Palmer et al., 2010; Wall et al., 2018). Its subsequent decline suggests the melanin cascade may i) prime the antioxidant response and no longer is required to act as a primary stress response role, or ii) had its capacity overwhelmed in the second-bleaching, resulting in corals primarily using antioxidant stress response mechanisms. Our findings are

more in line with the former. Under this thermal-priming hypothesis, sublethal thermal stress and high variable temperature regimes can contribute to protective mechanisms in the coral holobiont and bleaching resistance (Ainsworth et al., 2016; Barshis et al., 2013; Bellantuono, Granados-Cifuentes, Miller, Hoegh-Guldberg, & Rodriguez-Lanetty, 2012; Safaie et al., 2018). However, an increased frequency or magnitude of thermal stress may overcome acquired cellular responses (or symbiont partnerships) that support coral resistance to bleaching and mortality (Ainsworth et al., 2016).

In our study, the hierarchy of cellular stress responses shifts away from melanin-synthesis in favor of antioxidant activity (Figure 5), which may reflect the specialized nature of antioxidants in mitigating cellular damage and maintaining coral holobiont homeostasis (Murphy, Collier, & Richmond, 2019). Antioxidant proteins are central to cellular stress response network (Scandalios, 2002) and in corals there is clear evidence that antioxidant enzymes have a stress inducible role, driven by both environmental stress and pathogen elicitors (Mydlarz & Harvell, 2007; Mydlarz et al., 2008; Palmer et al., 2011). Indeed, *M. capitata* exposed to thermal stress showed greater antioxidant activity but lower melanin when primed by a history of high pCO₂-variability (Wall et al., 2018). The increasing role of catalase, peroxidase, and superoxide dismutase activity through time and in the second-bleaching event, compared to attenuated melanin-synthesis pathway (Figure 5, S1, S2), further demonstrates that specialized antioxidative enzymes are important for coping with chronic or persistent stress, as often reported in thermally stressed corals (Gardner et al., 2017; Lesser, 1997). Such constitutive upregulation of cellular defenses have also been observed in corals from areas of high thermal variance (Barshis et al., 2013) and those acclimatized to warmer conditions before the onset of bleaching stress (Bellantuono et al., 2012). In particular, the continued increases in superoxide dismutase and the

persistence of high levels of peroxidase in the final 2016-recovery period indicate that increasing constitutive levels of select antioxidants is key to maintaining cellular homeostasis after repeated or chronic thermal perturbations (Figure 5, S2). Such shifts in homeostatic mechanisms through strategies like gene plasticity (Kenkel & Matz, 2016) or constitutive frontloading (Barshis et al., 2013) reveal the important role of immunity, antioxidants, and their interplay in shaping ecological and evolutionary trajectories of reef corals and the future of coral reefs.

In conclusion, we show coral physiotypes were distinct during each period of bleaching and recovery from 2014-2016, and this indicates physiological legacy effects driven by chronic stress or beneficial acclimation influence both bleaching and recovery trajectories. Bleaching was strongly related to symbiont communities and their sensitivity to thermal stress, which was influenced by site environmental history. However, physiotypes were shaped by the cascade of immune and antioxidant activity in the bleaching and recovery periods irrespective of symbiont communities, providing a mechanistic hypothesis for the shifting coral physiotype baseline. Specifically, we observed changes in constitutive immunity from one year to the next in response to extreme stress events, indicating a fundamental change in the homeostatic mechanisms employed by corals. In an era of increasing frequency and magnitude of thermal stress, the ongoing study of mechanisms such as frontloading of genes like heat shock proteins and antioxidants to attenuate bleaching effects and support thermal resilience (Barshis et al., 2013) is of great importance. Additionally, the examination of acclimatization of populations to environmental stress that may be gained through gene expression plasticity (Kenkel & Matz, 2016), or epigenetic mechanisms (Durante, Baums, Williams, Vohsen, & Kemp, 2019; Eirin-Lopez & Putnam, 2019; Liew et al., 2018) will be critical. Our study provides details of cellular and physiological legacy effects in corals and evidence that environmental memory shapes the

homeostatic strategies of corals, which ultimately dictates a coral's ability to respond to future stress events.

Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge funding support from an Environmental Protection Agency STAR Fellowship Assistance Agreement (FP-91779401-1) to C.B.W and NSF 1756623 (Biological Oceanography, Integrative and Ecological Physiology, and EPSCoR) to H.M.P. The views expressed in this publication have not been reviewed or endorsed by the EPA and are solely those of the authors. We also thank P.J. Edmunds for insightful comments on an earlier manuscript draft. This is SOEST contribution number xxx and HIMB contribution number xxx.

Author contributions

C.B.W., C.A.R., L.D.M., R.D.G., and H.M.P. designed the project. C.B.W., C.A.R., L.D.M., and H.M.P. wrote the manuscript, and C.B.W. statistically analyzed the data. Coral collections were performed by C.B.W. and A.D.W. Laboratory analyses were performed by C.B.W., C.A.R., A.D.W., B.E.L., and D.E.K.

Competing interests

The authors declare they have no competing interests.

Data availability

All data and code to generate figures and perform analyses are archived and openly available at Github (<https://github.com/cbwall/Gates-Mydlarz-bleaching-recovery/releases/tag/v4>).

Tables

Table 1. Results of PERMANOVA testing the effects of repeated bleaching and recovery periods on *Montipora capitata* corals hosting two distinct symbiont communities at two reef locations.

<i>Factor</i>	<i>df</i>	<i>SS</i>	<i>R</i> ²	<i>F</i>	<i>p</i>
Period	3	855.740	0.297	48.491	<0.001
Site	1	60.996	0.021	10.369	<0.001
Symbiont	1	202.349	0.070	34.399	<0.001
Period × Site	3	69.003	0.024	3.910	<0.001
Period × Symbiont	3	60.101	0.021	3.406	<0.001
Site × Symbiont	1	6.861	0.002	1.166	0.293
Period × Site × Symbiont	3	19.048	0.007	1.079	0.360
Residual	273	1605.902	0.558		
Total	288	2880.000	1.000		

Period = sequential bleaching and recovery events from October 2014 – February 2016, *Site* = Lilipuna or Reef 14, *Symbiont* = *Cladocopium* sp. or *Durisdinium glynnii* dominated symbiont community. *SS* = sum of squares; *df* = degrees of freedom; bold *p* values represent significant effects ($p < 0.05$).

Figures

Figure 1. (a) Multivariate analyses identify changes in organism physiotype through space and time by accounting for the variation in multiple traits (Van Straalen, 2003). Transitions of organisms from initial (α^0) to stressed states (β^1), such as during bleaching in response to a heat wave, and their recovery to initial (α^0) (i.e., physiological resilience) or altered states (α^1). Alternatively the absence of physiotype shifts may be observed in stress resistant individuals (i.e., maintained at α^0). (b) Conceptual model of melanin and antioxidant activity in coral and Symbiodiniaceae under heat stress (indicated by lightning bolts). Reactive oxygen species (ROS), oxygen singlets (1O_2) and superoxide (O_2^-), generated by symbiont photochemical dysfunction and host mitochondria membrane damage, are neutralized by a combination of antioxidant scavenger enzymes (e.g., superoxide dismutase [SOD], catalase [CAT], and peroxidase [POX]). Host immunity via the melanin-synthesis pathway can also scavenge ROS during intermediate steps that lead to the synthesis of melanin (MEL). Oxidative bursts during the melanin-synthesis pathway can also create ROS that act as antimicrobials, which may also lead to priming, or antioxidant enzymes up-regulation (shown in bold letters and dark lines).

Figure 2. *Montipora capitata* cover and bleaching patterns at two reefs in relation to thermal regimes. (a) A bleached *M. capitata* colony and (b) benthic surveys of absolute *M. capitata* at two sites (Lilipuna and Reef 14) during and after thermal stress in 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. (c) The proportion of bleached *M. capitata* colonies scored during (October) and after (February) thermal stress (values are mean $\pm$ SD, n = duplicate transects). Symbols indicate differences among sites within a period (*) and among sites (†). (d) Overlay of mean daily temperatures at Lilipuna and Reef 14 and the NOAA-HIMB Moku o Lo'e buoy from January 2014 - January 2016 and (e) a comparison of temperature ramping and cooling between the first and second bleaching events relative to our collection dates. Vertical dashed lines indicate coral collections during bleaching and recovery periods in the first (black, 2014-2015) and second (gray, 2015-2016) events.

Figure 3. Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) analyses of coral performance envelopes during bleaching stress and post-bleaching recovery. *Montipora capitata* corals dominated by *Cladocopium* sp. (red) or *Durusdinium glynnii* (blue) symbionts from two sites (solid lines Lilipuna, dashed lines Reef 14). Convex hulls represent the coral physiotype (i.e., NMDS point clusters) of all corals in each time period, with points indicating mean centroids of physiotype polygon for each group. Lines show trajectories of mean centroids for each group across the four periods (Bleaching 2014, Recovery 2015, Bleaching 2015, Recovery 2016) and triangle arrowheads indicate trajectory termini.

Figure 4. Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) analyses identify coral physiotypes separated by dominant symbiont type (colors), bleaching-recovery periods (lighter and darker shades), sites (columns), and events (rows). *Montipora capitata* corals dominated by *Cladocopium* sp. or *Durussdinium glynnii* symbionts from Lilipuna (left panel) and Reef 14 (right panel) during bleaching (Bleach) and recovery (Recov) periods. Biplot vectors (black arrows) represent significant physiology and immunity responses ($p < 0.05$) according to squared correlation coefficients (r^2). AFDW = ash-free dry weight biomass (mg gdw^{-1}), CAT = catalase, MEL = melanin, POX = peroxidase, PPO = prophenoloxidase, SOD = superoxide dismutase, chla = chlorophyll *a* $\mu\text{g cm}^{-2}$, chla cell = chlorophyll *a* per symbiont cell, prot = protein mg cm^{-2} , symb cells = symbionts cm^{-2} .

Figure 5. Schematic of mechanistic coral responses to repeat bleaching and recovery leading to shifted phenotypes. In the first event (*top row*) thermal stress leads to a substantial increase in MEL along with modest spikes in CAT and SOD. Corals in the first recovery showed increases in PPO (as the precursor to the melanin-pathway) as well as SOD and POX, while CAT activity declined. In the second event (*bottom row*), CAT and SOD spike with modest contributions of MEL and a general decline in POX. Corals in the second recovery had the highest levels of SOD across all time points, an increase in POX and a sharp decline in CAT (see Figure 4 for abbreviations).

References

- Ainsworth, T. D., Heron, S. F., Ortiz, J. C., Mumby, P. J., Grech, A., Ogawa, D., ... Leggat, W. (2016). Climate change disables coral bleaching protection on the Great Barrier Reef. *Science*, 352(6283), 338–342. doi: 10.1126/science.aac7125
- Bahr, K. D., Rodgers, K. S., & Jokieli, P. L. (2017). Impact of Three Bleaching Events on the Reef Resiliency of Kāneʻohe Bay, Hawaiʻi. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 4, 435. doi: 10.3389/fmars.2017.00398
- Baker, A. C. (2003). Flexibility and Specificity in Coral-Algal Symbiosis: Diversity, Ecology, and Biogeography of *Symbiodinium*. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, 34, 661–689.
- Barshis, D. J., Ladner, J. T., Oliver, T. A., Seneca, F. O., Traylor-Knowles, N., & Palumbi, S. R. (2013). Genomic basis for coral resilience to climate change. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 110(4), 1387–1392. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1210224110
- Bellantuono, A. J., Granados-Cifuentes, C., Miller, D. J., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., & Rodriguez-Lanetty, M. (2012). Coral Thermal Tolerance: Tuning Gene Expression to Resist Thermal Stress. *PLoS One*, 7(11), e50685–14. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0050685
- Box, G. E. P., & Cox, D. R. (1964). An Analysis of Transformations. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series B, Statistical Methodology*, 26(2), 211–243. doi: 10.1111/j.2517-6161.1964.tb00553.x
- Brown, B. E., Dunne, R. P., Edwards, A. J., Sweet, M. J., & Phongsuwan, N. (2015). Decadal environmental “memory” in a reef coral? *Marine Biology*, 162(2), 479–483. <http://link.springer.com/10.1007/s00227-014-2596-2>

- 827 Brown, B. E., Dunne, R. P., Goodson, M. S., & Douglas, A. E. (2000). Bleaching patterns in reef
828 corals. *Nature*, 404(6774), 142–143. doi: 10.1038/35004657
- 829 Buddemeier, R. W., & Fautin, D. G. (1993). Coral bleaching as an adaptive mechanism.
830 *Bioscience*, 43(5), 320–326.
- 831 Couch, C. S., Burns, J. H. R., Liu, G., Steward, K., Gutlay, T. N., Kenyon, J., ... Kosaki, R. K.
832 (2017). Mass coral bleaching due to unprecedented marine heatwave in
833 Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands). *PloS*
834 *One*, 12(9), e0185121. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0185121
- 835 Cunning, R., & Baker, A. C. (2013). Excess algal symbionts increase the susceptibility of reef
836 corals to bleaching. *Nature Climate Change*, 3, 259–262. doi: 10.1038/nclimate1711
- 837 Cunning, R., Ritson-Williams, R., & Gates, R. D. (2016). Patterns of bleaching and recovery of
838 *Montipora capitata* in Kāne ‘ohe Bay, Hawai ‘i, USA. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*,
839 551, 131–139. <http://www.int-res.com/abstracts/meps/v551/p131-139/>
- 840 De’ath, G., Fabricius, K. E., Sweatman, H., & Puotinen, M. (2012). The 27-year decline of coral
841 cover on the Great Barrier Reef and its causes. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*
842 *Sciences of the United States of America*, 109(44), 17995–17999. doi:
843 10.1073/pnas.1208909109
- 844 Drupp, P. S., De Carlo, E. H., Mackenzie, F. T., Sabine, C. L., Feely, R. A., & Shamberger, K. E.
845 (2013). Comparison of CO₂ Dynamics and Air–Sea Gas Exchange in Differing Tropical
846 Reef Environments. *Aquatic Geochemistry*, 19(5-6), 371–397. doi: 10.1007/s10498-013-
847 9214-7
- 848 Drupp, P., De Carlo, E. H., Mackenzie, F. T., Bienfang, P., & Sabine, C. L. (2011). Nutrient
849 Inputs, Phytoplankton Response, and CO₂ Variations in a Semi-Enclosed Subtropical

850 Embayment, Kaneohe Bay, Hawaii. *Aquatic Geochemistry*, 17(4), 473–498. doi:
851 10.1007/s10498-010-9115-y

852 Dunn, S. R., Pernice, M., Green, K., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., & Dove, S. G. (2012). Thermal stress
853 promotes host mitochondrial degradation in symbiotic cnidarians: are the batteries of the
854 reef going to run out? *PloS One*, 7(7), e39024. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0039024

855 Durante, M. K., Baums, I. B., Williams, D. E., Vohsen, S., & Kemp, D. W. (2019). What drives
856 phenotypic divergence among coral clonemates of *Acropora palmata*? *Molecular Ecology*,
857 28(13), 3208–3224. doi: 10.1111/mec.15140

858 Edmunds, P. J., Adjeroud, M., Baskett, M. L., Baums, I. B., Budd, A. F., Carpenter, R. C., ...
859 Gates, R. D. (2014). Persistence and Change in Community Composition of Reef Corals
860 through Present, Past, and Future Climates. *PloS One*, 9(10), e107525.
861 <http://dx.plos.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0107525.s001>

862 Edmunds, P. J., Pochon, X., Levitan, D. R., Yost, D. M., Belcaid, M., Putnam, H. M., & Gates,
863 R. D. (2014). Long-term changes in *Symbiodinium* communities in *Orbicella annularis* in
864 St. John, US Virgin Islands. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 506, 129–144. doi:
865 10.3354/meps10808

866 Eirin-Lopez, J. M., & Putnam, H. M. (2019). Marine Environmental Epigenetics. *Annual Review*
867 *of Marine Science*, 11, 335–368. doi: 10.1146/annurev-marine-010318-095114

868 Fitt, W. K., McFarland, F. K., Warner, M. E., & Chilcoat, G. C. (2000). Seasonal patterns of
869 tissue biomass and densities of symbiotic dinoflagellates in reef corals and relation to coral
870 bleaching. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 45(3), 677–685. doi: 10.4319/lo.2000.45.3.0677

871 Fuess, L. E., Mann, W. T., Jinks, L. R., Brinkhuis, V., & Mydlarz, L. D. (2018). Transcriptional
872 analyses provide new insight into the late-stage immune response of a diseased Caribbean

873 coral. *Royal Society Open Science*, 5(5), 172062. doi: 10.1098/rsos.172062

874 Gardner, S. G., Raina, J.-B., Nitschke, M. R., Nielsen, D. A., Stat, M., Motti, C. A., ... Petrou,

875 K. (2017). A multi-trait systems approach reveals a response cascade to bleaching in corals.

876 *BMC Biology*, 15(1), 117. doi: 10.1186/s12915-017-0459-2

877 Hawkins, T. D., Krueger, T., Becker, S., Fisher, P. L., & Davy, S. K. (2014). Differential nitric

878 oxide synthesis and host apoptotic events correlate with bleaching susceptibility in reef

879 corals. *Coral Reefs*, 33(1), 141–153. doi: [10.1007/s00338-013-1103-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-013-1103-4)

880 Hughes, T. P., Anderson, K. D., Connolly, S. R., Heron, S. F., Kerry, J. T., Lough, J. M., ...

881 Wilson, S. K. (2018a). Spatial and temporal patterns of mass bleaching of corals in the

882 Anthropocene. *Science*, 359(6371), 80–83. doi: 10.1126/science.aan8048

883 Hughes, T. P., Kerry, J. T., Álvarez-Noriega, M., Álvarez-Romero, J. G., Anderson, K. D.,

884 Baird, A. H., ... Wilson, S. K. (2017). Global warming and recurrent mass bleaching of

885 corals. *Nature*, 543(7645), 373–377. doi: 10.1038/nature21707

886 Hughes, T. P., Kerry, J. T., Baird, A. H., Connolly, S. R., Chase, T. J., Dietzel, A., ... Woods, R.

887 M. (2019). Global warming impairs stock–recruitment dynamics of corals. *Nature*,

888 568(7752), 387–390. doi: 10.1038/s41586-019-1081-y

889 Hughes, T. P., Kerry, J. T., Baird, A. H., Connolly, S. R., Dietzel, A., Eakin, C. M., ... Torda, G.

890 (2018b). Global warming transforms coral reef assemblages. *Nature*, 556(7702), 492–496.

891 doi: 10.1038/s41586-018-0041-2

892 Innis, T., Cuning, R., Ritson-Williams, R., Wall, C. B., & Gates, R. D. (2018). Coral color and

893 depth drive symbiosis ecology of *Montipora capitata* in Kāneʻohe Bay, Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi.

894 *Coral Reefs*, 37(2), 423–430. doi: 10.1007/s00338-018-1667-0

895 Jeffrey, S. W., & Humphrey, G. F. (1975). New spectrophotometric equations for determining

chlorophylls a, b, c1 and c2 in higher plants, algae and natural phytoplankton. *Biochemie Und Physiologie Der Pflanzen: BPP*, 167(2), 191–194. doi: 10.1016/S0015-3796(17)30778-3

Jokiel, P. L., & Brown, E. K. (2004). Global warming, regional trends and inshore environmental conditions influence coral bleaching in Hawaii. *Global Change Biology*, 10(10), 1627–1641. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2004.00836.x

Jones, R. J., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Larkum, A. W. D., & Schreiber, U. (1998). Temperature-induced bleaching of corals begins with impairment of the CO₂ fixation mechanism in zooxanthellae. *Plant, Cell & Environment*, 21(12), 1219–1230.

Kenkel, C. D., & Matz, M. V. (2016). Gene expression plasticity as a mechanism of coral adaptation to a variable environment. *Nature Ecology & Evolution*, 1(1), 14. doi: 10.1038/s41559-016-0014

Krueger, T., Fisher, P. L., Becker, S., Pontasch, S., Dove, S., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., ... Davy, S. K. (2015). Transcriptomic characterization of the enzymatic antioxidants FeSOD, MnSOD, APX and KatG in the dinoflagellate genus *Symbiodinium*. *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, 15, 48. doi: 10.1186/s12862-015-0326-0

Krueger, T., Hawkins, T. D., Becker, S., Pontasch, S., Dove, S., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., ... Davy, S. K. (2015). Differential coral bleaching—Contrasting the activity and response of enzymatic antioxidants in symbiotic partners under thermal stress. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology, Part A*, 190(C), 15–25. doi: 10.1016/j.cbpa.2015.08.012

Lenth, R. V. (2019). Russell Lenth (2019). emmeans: Estimated Marginal Means, aka Least-Squares Means. R package version 1.3.5. <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=emmeans>. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 69(1), 1–33. <https://CRAN.R->

project.org/package=emmeans

Lesser, M. P. (1997). Oxidative stress causes coral bleaching during exposure to elevated temperatures. *Coral Reefs*, 16(3), 187–192. doi: 10.1007/s003380050073

Lesser, M. P., Stat, M., & Gates, R. D. (2013). The endosymbiotic dinoflagellates (*Symbiodinium* sp.) of corals are parasites and mutualists. *Coral Reefs*, 32(3), 603–611. doi: 10.1007/s00338-013-1051-z

Liew, Y. J., Zoccola, D., Li, Y., Tambutté, E., Venn, A. A., Michell, C. T., ... Aranda, M. (2018). Epigenome-associated phenotypic acclimatization to ocean acidification in a reef-building coral. *Science Advances*, 4(6), eaar8028. doi: 10.1126/sciadv.aar8028

Lowe, R. J., Falter, J. L., Monismith, S. G., & Atkinson, M. J. (2009). A numerical study of circulation in a coastal reef-lagoon system. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 114(C6), 997. doi: 10.1029/2008JC005081

McClanahan, T. R., Ateweberhan, M., & Omukoto, J. (2007). Long-term changes in coral colony size distributions on Kenyan reefs under different management regimes and across the 1998 bleaching event. *Marine Biology*, 153(5), 755–768. doi: [10.1007/s00227-007-0844-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-007-0844-4)

McWilliam, M., Pratchett, M. S., Hoogenboom, M. O., & Hughes, T. P. (2020). Deficits in functional trait diversity following recovery on coral reefs. *Proceedings. Biological Sciences / The Royal Society*, 287(1918), 20192628. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2019.2628

Murphy, J. W. A., Collier, A. C., & Richmond, R. H. (2019). Antioxidant enzyme cycling over reproductive lunar cycles in *Pocillopora damicornis*. *PeerJ*, 7, e7020. doi: 10.7717/peerj.7020

Mydlarz, L. D., & Harvell, C. D. (2007). Peroxidase activity and inducibility in the sea fan coral exposed to a fungal pathogen. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology. Part A*,

942 *Molecular & Integrative Physiology*, 146(1), 54–62. doi: 10.1016/j.cbpa.2006.09.005

943 Mydlarz, L. D., & Palmer, C. V. (2011). The presence of multiple phenoloxidases in Caribbean

944 reef-building corals. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology. Part A, Molecular &*

945 *Integrative Physiology*, 159(4), 372–378. doi: 10.1016/j.cbpa.2011.03.029

946 Mydlarz, L. D., Couch, C. S., Weil, E., Smith, G., & Harvell, C. D. (2009). Immune defenses of

947 healthy, bleached and diseased *Montastraea faveolata* during a natural bleaching event.

948 *Diseases of Aquatic Organisms*, 87(1-2), 67–78. doi: 10.3354/dao02088

949 Mydlarz, L. D., Holthouse, S. F., Peters, E. C., & Harvell, C. D. (2008). Cellular Responses in

950 Sea Fan Corals: Granular Amoebocytes React to Pathogen and Climate Stressors. *PloS One*,

951 3(3), e1811–e1819. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0001811

952 Mydlarz, L. D., McGinty, E. S., & Harvell, C. D. (2010). What are the physiological and

953 immunological responses of coral to climate warming and disease? *The Journal of*

954 *Experimental Biology*, 213(6), 934–945. doi: 10.1242/jeb.037580

955 NOAA. (2019, August 14). Retrieved August 14, 2019, from National Data Buoy Center, Station

956 MOKH1 - 1612480 - Mokuoloe, HI website:

957 https://www.ndbc.noaa.gov/station_page.php?station=mokh1

958 NOAA. (2020, April 20). Coral Reef Watch, NOAA Satellite and Information Services,

959 <https://coralreefwatch.noaa.gov/satellite/methodology/methodology.php>

960 Oksanen, J., Guillaume, F. B., Friendly, M., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., McGlinn, D., ... Wagner,

961 H. (2019). *vegan: Community Ecology Package*. 631–637. [https://cran.r-](https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/vegan/index.html)

962 [project.org/web/packages/vegan/index.html](https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/vegan/index.html)

963 Palmer, C. V. (2018a). Immunity and the coral crisis. *Communications Biology*, 1, 91. doi:

964 10.1038/s42003-018-0097-4

- 965 Palmer, C. V. (2018b). Warmer Water Affects Immunity of a Tolerant Reef Coral. *Frontiers in*
966 *Marine Science*, 5, 253. doi: 10.3389/fmars.2018.00253
- 967 Palmer, C. V., & Traylor-Knowles, N. (2012). Towards an integrated network of coral immune
968 mechanisms. *Proceedings. Biological Sciences / The Royal Society*, 279(1745), 4106–4114.
969 doi: 10.1098/rspb.2012.1477
- 970 Palmer, C. V., Bythell, J. C., & Willis, B. L. (2010). Levels of immunity parameters underpin
971 bleaching and disease susceptibility of reef corals. *FASEB Journal: Official Publication of*
972 *the Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology*, 24(6), 1935–1946. doi:
973 10.1096/fj.09-152447
- 974 Palmer, C. V., McGinty, E. S., Cummings, D. J., Smith, S. M., Bartels, E., & Mydlarz, L. D.
975 (2011). Patterns of coral ecological immunology: variation in the responses of Caribbean
976 corals to elevated temperature and a pathogen elicitor. *The Journal of Experimental*
977 *Biology*, 214(Pt 24), 4240–4249. doi: 10.1242/jeb.061267
- 978 Palmer, C. V., Traylor-Knowles, N. G., Willis, B. L., & Bythell, J. C. (2011). Corals Use Similar
979 Immune Cells and Wound-Healing Processes as Those of Higher Organisms. *PloS One*,
980 6(8), e23992–11. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0023992
- 981 Palumbi, S. R., Barshis, D. J., Traylor-Knowles, N., & Bay, R. A. (2014). Mechanisms of reef
982 coral resistance to future climate change. *Science*, 344(6186), 895–898. doi:
983 10.1126/science.1251336
- 984 Pinzón C, J. H., Beach-Letendre, J., Weil, E., & Mydlarz, L. D. (2014). Relationship between
985 Phylogeny and Immunity Suggests Older Caribbean Coral Lineages Are More Resistant to
986 Disease. *PloS One*, 9(8), e104787. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0104787
- 987 Pinzón, J. H., Kamel, B., Burge, C. A., Harvell, C. D., Medina, M., Weil, E., & Mydlarz, L. D.

988 (2015). Whole transcriptome analysis reveals changes in expression of immune-related
 989 genes during and after bleaching in a reef-building coral. *Royal Society Open Science*, 2(4),
 990 140214. doi: 10.1098/rsos.140214

991 R Core Team. (2020). *R: A language and environment for statistical computing*. [https://www.R-](https://www.R-project.org)
 992 [project.org](https://www.R-project.org)

993 Richier, S., Sabourault, C., Courtiade, J., Zucchini, N., Allemand, D., & Furla, P. (2006).
 994 Oxidative stress and apoptotic events during thermal stress in the symbiotic sea anemone,
 995 *Anemonia viridis*. *The FEBS Journal*, 273(18), 4186–4198. doi: 10.1111/j.1742-
 996 4658.2006.05414.x

997 Ritson-Williams, R., & Gates, R. D. (2020). Coral community resilience to successive years of
 998 bleaching in Kāne‘ohe Bay, Hawai‘i. *Coral Reefs*. doi: 10.1007/s00338-020-01944-4

999 Robinson, J. P. W., Wilson, S. K., Jennings, S., & Graham, N. A. J. (2019). Thermal stress
 1000 induces persistently altered coral reef fish assemblages. *Global Change Biology*, 25(8),
 1001 2739–2750. doi: 10.1111/gcb.14704

1002 Safaie, A., Silbiger, N. J., McClanahan, T. R., Pawlak, G., Barshis, D. J., Hench, J. L., ... Davis,
 1003 K. A. (2018). High frequency temperature variability reduces the risk of coral bleaching.
 1004 *Nature Communications*, 9(1), 1671. doi: 10.1038/s41467-018-04074-2

1005 Sale, T. L., Marko, P. B., Oliver, T. A., & Hunter, C. L. (2019). Assessment of acclimatization
 1006 and subsequent survival of corals during repeated natural thermal stress events in Hawai‘i.
 1007 *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 624, 65–76. doi: 10.3354/meps13031

1008 Sampayo, E. M., Ridgway, T., Bongaerts, P., & Hoegh-Guldberg, O. (2008). Bleaching
 1009 susceptibility and mortality of corals are determined by fine-scale differences in symbiont
 1010 type. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*,

- 1011 *105*(30), 10444–10449. doi: 10.1073/pnas.0708049105
- 1012 Scandalios, J. G. (2002). Oxidative stress responses--what have genome-scale studies taught us?
- 1013 *Genome Biology*, 3(7), REVIEWS1019. doi: 10.1186/gb-2002-3-7-reviews1019
- 1014 Schoepf, V., Grottoli, A. G., Levas, S. J., Aschaffenburg, M. D., Baumann, J. H., Matsui, Y., &
- 1015 Warner, M. E. (2015). Annual coral bleaching and the long-term recovery capacity of coral.
- 1016 *Proceedings. Biological Sciences / The Royal Society*, 282(1819), 20151887. doi:
- 1017 10.1098/rspb.2015.1887
- 1018 Silverstein, R. N., Cunning, R., & Baker, A. C. (2017). Tenacious D: *Symbiodinium* in clade D
- 1019 remain in reef corals at both high and low temperature extremes despite impairment. *The*
- 1020 *Journal of Experimental Biology*, 220(Pt 7), 1192–1196. doi: 10.1242/jeb.148239
- 1021 Stat, M., Morris, E., & Gates, R. D. (2008). Functional diversity in coral–dinoflagellate
- 1022 symbiosis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of*
- 1023 *America*, 105(27), 9256–9261.
- 1024 Stimson, J., & Kinzie, R. A. (1991). The temporal pattern and rate of release of zooxanthellae
- 1025 from the reef coral *Pocillopora damicornis* (Linnaeus) under nitrogen-enrichment and
- 1026 control conditions. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 153(1), 63–74.
- 1027 doi: 10.1016/S0022-0981(05)80006-1
- 1028 Stuart-Smith, R. D., Brown, C. J., Ceccarelli, D. M., & Edgar, G. J. (2018). Ecosystem
- 1029 restructuring along the Great Barrier Reef following mass coral bleaching. *Nature*,
- 1030 560(7716), 92–96. doi: 10.1038/s41586-018-0359-9
- 1031 Suggett, D. J., & Smith, D. J. (2019). Coral bleaching patterns are the outcome of complex
- 1032 biological and environmental networking. *Global Change Biology*. doi: 10.1111/gcb.14871
- 1033 Suggett, D. J., Warner, M. E., & Leggat, W. (2017). Symbiotic Dinoflagellate Functional

- 1034 Diversity Mediates Coral Survival under Ecological Crisis. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*,
1035 1–11. doi: 10.1016/j.tree.2017.07.013
- 1036 Thornhill, D. J., Rotjan, R. D., Todd, B. D., Chilcoat, G. C., Iglesias-Prieto, R., Kemp, D. W., ...
1037 Fitt, W. K. (2011). A Connection between Colony Biomass and Death in Caribbean Reef-
1038 Building Corals. *PloS One*, 6(12), e29535. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0029535
- 1039 van Hooidonk, R., Maynard, J. A., & Planes, S. (2013). Temporary refugia for coral reefs in a
1040 warming world. *Nature Climate Change*, 3(5), 508–511. doi: 10.1038/nclimate1829
- 1041 Van Straalen, N. M. (2003). Ecotoxicology becomes stress ecology. *Environmental Science &*
1042 *Technology*, 37(17), 324A – 330A. doi: 10.1021/es0325720
- 1043 Venable, W. N., & Ripley, B. D. (2002). Modern Applied Statistics with S. Springer. *New York*.
- 1044 Venn, A. A., Loram, J. E., & Douglas, A. E. (2008). Photosynthetic symbioses in animals.
1045 *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 59(5), 1069–1080.
- 1046 Vercelloni, J., Liqueur, B., Kennedy, E. V., González-Rivero, M., Caley, M. J., Peterson, E. E., ...
1047 Mengersen, K. (2020). Forecasting intensifying disturbance effects on coral reefs. *Global*
1048 *Change Biology*. doi: 10.1111/gcb.15059
- 1049 Vidal-Dupiol, J., Zoccola, D., Tambutté, E., Grunau, C., Cosseau, C., Smith, K. M., ...
1050 Tambutté, S. (2013). Genes related to ion-transport and energy production are upregulated
1051 in response to CO₂-driven pH decrease in corals: new insights from transcriptome analysis.
1052 *PloS One*, 8(3), e58652. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0058652
- 1053 Wall, C. B., Kaluhiokalani, M., Popp, B. N., Donahue, M. J., & Gates, R. D. (2020). Divergent
1054 symbiont communities determine the physiology and nutrition of a reef coral across a light-
1055 availability gradient. *The ISME Journal*. doi: 10.1038/s41396-019-0570-1
- 1056 Wall, C. B., Mason, R. A. B., Ellis, W. R., Cunning, R., & Gates, R. D. (2017). Elevated pCO₂

Wall et al., *submitted*

- 1057 affects tissue biomass composition, but not calcification, in a reef coral under two light
1058 regimes. *Royal Society Open Science*, 4(11), 170683. doi: 10.1098/rsos.170683
- 1059 Wall, C. B., Ricci, C. A., Foulds, G. E., Mydlarz, L. D., Gates, R. D., & Putnam, H. M. (2018).
1060 The effects of environmental history and thermal stress on coral physiology and immunity.
1061 *Marine Biology*, Vol. 165. doi: 10.1007/s00227-018-3317-z
- 1062 Wall, C. B., Ritson-Williams, R., Popp, B. N., & Gates, R. D. (2019). Spatial variation in the
1063 biochemical and isotopic composition of corals during bleaching and recovery. *Limnology*
1064 *and Oceanography*, 64(5), 2011–2028. doi: 10.1002/lno.11166
- 1065 Weis, V. M. (2008). Cellular mechanisms of Cnidarian bleaching: stress causes the collapse of
1066 symbiosis. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 211(Pt 19), 3059–3066. doi:
1067 10.1242/jeb.009597
- 1068 Wham, D. C., Ning, G., & LaJeunesse, T. C. (2017). *Symbiodinium glynnii* sp. nov., a species of
1069 stress-tolerant symbiotic dinoflagellates from pocilloporid and montiporid corals in the
1070 Pacific Ocean. *Phycologia*, 56, 396–409. doi: 10.2216/16-86.1

1071