Using seasonal genomic changes to understand historical adaptation: parallel selection on stickleback in highly-variable estuaries

*Alan Garcia-Elfring, *[¶]Antoine Paccard, *[‡]Timothy J. Thurman, †Ben A. Wasserman, †Eric P. Palkovacs, *Andrew P. Hendry, and *Rowan D. H. Barrett

*Redpath Museum and Department of Biology, McGill University, Montreal, QC, Canada

[¶]McGill University Genome Center, McGill University, Montreal, QC, Canada

†Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Santa Cruz, CA, USA

[‡]Current address: Division of Biological Sciences, University of Montana, Missoula, MT, USA.

The corresponding author's email address: alan.garcia-elfring@mail.mcgill.ca

18

19

20

Abstract

Parallel evolution is considered strong evidence for natural selection. However, few studies have investigated the process of parallel selection as it plays out in real time. The common approach is to study historical signatures of selection in populations already well adapted to different environments. Here, to document selection in action under natural conditions, we study six populations of threespine stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*) inhabiting bar-built estuaries that undergo seasonal cycles of environmental changes. Estuaries are periodically isolated from the ocean due to sandbar formation during dry summer months, with concurrent environmental shifts that resemble the long-term changes associated with postglacial colonization of freshwater habitats by marine populations. We used pooled whole-genome sequencing (Pool-WGS) to track seasonal allele frequency changes in these populations and search for signatures of natural selection. We found consistent changes in allele frequency across estuaries, suggesting a potential role for parallel selection. Functional enrichment among candidate genes included transmembrane ion transport and calcium binding, which are important for osmoregulation and ion balance. The genomic changes that occur in threespine stickleback from bar-built estuaries could provide a glimpse into the early stages of adaptation that have occurred in many historical marine to freshwater transitions.

Introduction

Knowledge of the genomic targets of natural selection is central to understanding the mechanisms responsible for adaptive evolution at the molecular level. Generating this

knowledge often involves comparing patterns of genomic differentiation (e.g., F_{ST}) between populations adapted to distinct ecological conditions (e.g. Hoekstra et al. 2006; Ilardo et al. 2018). In such studies, natural selection is considered a strong candidate for the mechanism driving phenotypic diversification when multiple closely related but independently-evolved populations use the same genetic pathways to reach a shared adaptive solution to an environmental challenge. Here, we refer to this phenomenon as parallel evolution (Elmer and Meyer 2011). In vertebrates, studies of parallel evolution have provided insights into the genetic mechanisms underlying adaptation to freshwater (Colosimo et al. 2005; Barrett et al. 2008; Schluter et al. 2010; Hohenlohe et al. 2010; Kitano et al. 2010; Lescak et al. 2015; Rudman et al. 2019; Fang et al. 2020), novel pathogens (Alves et al. 2019), low oxygen availability (McCracken et al. 2009; Foll et al. 2014; Wang et al. 2014; Graham and McCracken 2019; Lim et al. 2019), crypsis (Comeault et al. 2016; Jones et al. 2018; Barrett et al. 2019), nutrient-limited environments (Riddle et al. 2018), and dissolved ion (H^+) profiles (Haenel et al. 2019). However, nearly all studies of parallel evolution are retrospective in the sense that they investigate reasonably well adapted populations that are no longer experiencing the strong selection associated with an environmental change.

Retrospective approaches thus have difficulty detecting the specific genetic changes that were under natural selection during the initial habitat shift amongst the noise from local effects and stochastic processes that accumulates afterward (Elmer and Meyer 2011). A valuable addition to the inferential toolbox, then, is to study natural selection that takes place *during* parallel habitat shifts. Most studies adopting this selection-based approach have used artificial perturbations of genotypes or environments, which have revealed genomic targets of

strong selection (e.g. Anderson et al. 2014; Soria-Carrasco et al. 2014; Nosil et al. 2018; Barrett et al. 2019). However, the manipulations involved in such tests leaves uncertain the extent to which similar selection would attend natural habitat shifts. One solution is to take advantage of serendipitous occurrences, such as extreme weather events like droughts (Grant et al. 2017), hurricanes (Donihue et al. 2018), heat waves (Coleman et al. 2020; Gurgel et al. 2020) and cold snaps (Campbell-Staton et al. 2017; Card et al. 2018). However, the location and timing of extreme events like these are unpredictable by nature, limiting the study of how natural populations respond to such events. An alternative strategy, then, might be to study selection as it occurs in natural populations experiencing large, yet predictable, shifts between alternative environments, like those that occur during seasonal changes (e.g. Behrman et al. 2018; Tourneur et al. 2020). Here, we search for the signature of natural selection in a set of populations that experience parallel seasonal changes in local conditions that likely resemble the early phase of a classic habitat transition. Specifically, we study allele frequency changes in stickleback populations in environments that alternate between marine-like (brackish) and freshwater conditions.

Study system

The threespine stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*, ‘stickleback’ hereafter) is a classic model system for studying parallel evolution (Boughman et al. 2005; Colosimo et al. 2005; Jones et al. 2012a, 2012b; Deagle et al. 2013; Hendry et al. 2009, 2013; Lescak et al. 2015; Paccard et al. 2018; Haenel et al. 2019; Smith et al. 2020). Over the past approximately 12,000 years, marine

stickleback have repeatedly colonized and become adapted to freshwater environments, often through parallel phenotypic changes (Reimchen 1983; Colosimo et al. 2005) linked to predator defence (Reimchen 2000; Marchinko 2009; Miller et al. 2019; Wasserman et al. 2020) and ion regulation (Gibbons et al. 2016, 2017; Hasan et al. 2017). The genomic basis of such adaptation is partly known. For instance, researchers have identified genes of large effect underlying differences in the number of bony armour plates (e.g. *Eda* gene, e.g. Colosimo et al. 2005), pelvic spines (e.g. *Pitx1* gene, Chan et al. 2010), and the ability to osmoregulate (e.g. *Kcnh4* gene, Jones et al. 2012a; *Atp1a1a* gene, McCairns and Bernatchez 2010; Jones et al. 2012b; Hasan et al. 2017). These genes have been found primarily through a retrospective approach of studying signatures of selection millennia after the initial colonization.

Stickleback populations in bar-built estuaries along the coast of California represent a natural system for studying parallel selection over seasonal timescales. These populations experience repeated bouts of strong and abrupt temporal changes driven by wet winters and dry summers. With heavy winter rains, increased water flow breaches the wall of sediment (i.e., 'sandbar') that, during the summer, typically isolates estuaries from the ocean. When rains subside, sandbars are re-built by wave action and sand deposition in the spring or summer, isolating estuaries from the ocean and creating coastal lagoons (Behrens et al. 2009; Behrens et al. 2013; Rich and Keller 2013). The changes in precipitation that lead to the build-up of sandbars and the subsequent breaching can result in drastic environmental shifts in, for example, predator abundance (Becker and Reining 2008), salinity (Williams 2014), and habitat structure (Heady et al. 2015). For example, in between breaching events when the estuaries are closed to the ocean, salinity levels diminish as a surface freshwater layer progressively increases

in thickness (Williams 2014) and a shift takes place from lotic (i.e. moving) brackish water to lentic (i.e. pond-like) freshwater (Heady et al. 2015; Des Roches et al. 2020). These seasonal habitat shifts may be analogous to the environmental changes experienced by stickleback populations during postglacial marine-to-freshwater colonization events and are replicated both spatially (in different estuaries) and temporally (with seasonal changes in precipitation).

To study natural selection in action, we sampled stickleback from six bar-built estuaries at two time points between breaching events, when the estuaries were isolated from the ocean. Using a whole-genome SNP dataset, we characterized the extent of allele frequency change between the sampling times, which should reflect, at least in part, natural selection taking place during that interval. Then, to evaluate evidence of parallel natural selection, we ask several questions. (1) What genomic regions show relatively large changes in allele frequency across time in multiple estuaries? (2) For these regions, do the changes in allele frequency occur in parallel across estuaries? (3) Do genes putatively under parallel selection show enrichment of genetic functions consistent with the changes in the environment? By obtaining this information over a seasonal timescale in multiple estuaries, we hope to gain insight into the genetic changes driven by selection that may have occurred when postglacial stickleback populations first colonized freshwater environments from the ocean.

Methods

Field sampling and DNA extraction

In 2016, we sampled stickleback from six bar-built estuaries (Figure 1), three from small coastal watersheds (< 7 km²; Old Dairy, Lombardi, and Younger) and three that are relatively large watersheds (> 22 km²; Laguna, Scott, and Waddell; see Table S1 for full estuary names and size metrics). We sampled in the spring at the end of the breaching season upon completion of the sandbar (after winter rain), and again in the fall before the breaching season (before the winter rain, Figure S1). Thus, we are testing for selection during the part of the year that estuaries are isolated from the ocean, which provides a single-season analogue of the marine to freshwater transition that is a classic theme in stickleback research (e.g. Colosimo et al. 2005; Bassham et al. 2018; reviewed by Hohenlohe and Magalhaes 2019). At each time point in each estuary, we collected 40 adult stickleback (> 30 mm in length) by means of minnow traps and beach seines. Although sampling time is less than one generation (~6 months), some stickleback may have given birth shortly after our first sample, with progeny growing large enough to be sampled as adults in our second sample. Selection during our sampling period therefore reflects both differential mortality and reproduction. Fish were euthanized with tricaine methanesulphonate (MS-222) and tissue samples (pectoral fin) were stored in 95% ethanol prior to DNA extraction. Collections were made in accordance with California Scientific Collector's Permit SC-12752. Animal handling protocols were approved by the University of California, Santa Cruz IACUC under protocols Palke-1306 and Palke-1310. We extracted DNA following a standard phenol-chloroform procedure. Briefly, tissue samples were placed in digestion buffer containing proteinase K and incubated at 55 °C. We then isolated DNA using an isoamyl-phenol-chloroform solution, followed with ethanol precipitation.

Sequencing

We quantified all samples using a Picogreen® ds DNA assay (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, USA) on an Infinite® 200 Nanoquant (Tecan Group Ltd. Männedorf, Switzerland). Samples were normalized to a dsDNA concentration of 15ng/μl, re-quantified, and pooled according to sampling location and time of sampling. Thus, we created 12 pools of 40 individuals each (i.e. six estuaries sampled at two time points). Whole-genome libraries of each pool were prepared at the McGill University and Genome Quebec Innovation Center, Montreal, Canada, and sequenced across five lanes of Illumina HiSeq2500 with paired-end, 125bp reads.

Bioinformatics

We filtered raw reads based on quality (--quality-threshold 20) and length (--min-length 50) with the *trim-fastq.pl* script of *Popoolation* (Kofler et al. 2011a). The resulting reads were mapped to the stickleback reference genome (BROADS S1) using *BWA mem* v. 0.7.13 (Li and Durbin 2009). We then used *SAMtools* (Li et al. 2009) to convert SAM files to BAM format and remove reads with mapping quality below 20 (*samtools view -q 20*). We then generated a mpileup file (*samtools mpileup -B*) and filtered for a minimum depth of coverage of 5X. We converted the mpileup file to the synchronized (sync) format using *Popoolation2* (Kofler et al. 2011b) for downstream analysis.

Analysis of repeated genomic differentiation

In this study we use F_{ST} to measure changes in allele frequency within a lineage across time points (rather than differentiation between two lineages, Burri 2017). First, within each estuary, we calculated F_{ST} at the SNP level (Hartl and Clark 1997) to identify variants showing relatively large changes in allele frequency (i.e. outliers) between the two time points. We then

We identified SNPs showing consistent directional changes in allele frequency across our estuaries using the program *PoolFreqDiff* (Wiberg et al. 2017). *PoolFreqDiff* uses a generalized linear model with a quasibinomial error distribution (qGLM). Wiberg et al. (2017) showed that the qGLM has a substantially lower false positive rate than the Cochran-Mantel-Haenszel test, a method commonly used in pool-seq studies to identify consistent changes in allele frequency across replicates. We used the same flags (e.g. minimum read count and coverage settings) in the *PoolFreqDiff* program as in our F_{ST} analysis. The qGLM test implemented in *PoolFreqDiff* has the potential to identify parallel selection reflected as subtle, but consistent, changes in allele frequency in multiple estuaries. Such small changes in allele frequency are unlikely to be identified as F_{ST} outliers in individual estuaries. We used the ‘no rescaling’ option of *PoolFreqDiff* (re-scaling allele counts relative to the effective sample size gave similar results). We corrected for population structure using the empirical null-hypothesis approach (Caye et al. 2016; François et al. 2016). Visual inspection of the histogram of corrected P-values confirmed a uniform distribution under the null-hypothesis, indicating that confounders were controlled (Figure S2). Next, we corrected for multiple hypothesis testing using the false discovery rate (FDR) procedure implemented in the R package *qvalue* V2.14 (Storey et al. 2018). We analyzed three sets of outliers to study potential targets of selection. First, to look for strong and parallel changes in allele frequency, we categorized ‘ F_{ST} -qGLM outliers’ as SNPs that are an F_{ST} outlier in at least three estuaries and also significant (FDR = 1%) under the qGLM model. Second, we identified outliers from each of the two distinct approaches (F_{ST} and qGLM) but with more conservative thresholds than those used in the overlapping F_{ST} -qGLM outlier set. For ‘ F_{ST} candidates’, we identified F_{ST} outliers (SNPs in the top 5% of the F_{ST} distribution in a single

estuary) that were shared across at least four of six estuaries (as opposed to the three estuaries minimum requirement in the F_{ST} -qGLM outlier set). Note that the frequency changes across these estuaries may not be parallel and thus this outlier set accounts for potential causes of selection that may differ in direction among estuaries. We also tested whether estuary size may influence the likelihood of shared targets of selection (F_{ST} outliers; see supplemental information). Finally, 'qGLM outliers' are SNPs identified as highly significant using the quasibinomial GLM test for parallel changes in allele frequency, here using an FDR = 0.01% as opposed to the less conservative FDR = 1% used for the F_{ST} -qGLM outlier set. We obtained estimates of allele frequency change across time points for F_{ST} -qGLM outliers and putatively neutral loci with respect to F_{ST} (not in top 5% F_{ST} distribution) using the *snp-frequency-diff.pl* script of *Popoolation2*.

Identification of candidate genes and analysis of molecular function

To identify genes putatively under parallel selection, we used a custom bash script to map outliers (i.e. F_{ST} -qGLM outliers, F_{ST} candidates, and qGLM outliers) to protein-coding genes in the reference genome. We limited our search to a set of 14,252 protein-coding gene annotations with attributes "ID=gene" and "biotype=protein_coding". To gain insights into the traits under selection, we analyzed candidate genes for enrichment of molecular functions. To do this, we obtained gene names and gene ontology (GO) information from the stickleback reference genome on *Ensembl* using the R package *biomaRt* (Smedley et al. 2009). We compared the three lists of candidate genes with the reference set of 14,252 genes ('gene universe') and tested for functional enrichment using the package *TopGO* 2.34.0 (Rahnenfuhrer

2018) and the Fisher’s exact test. To reduce false positives, we pruned the GO hierarchy by requiring that each GO term have at least 10 annotated genes in our reference list (“nodeSize = 10”).

Results

Data processing and F_{ST} estimates in response to seasonal sandbar formation

Our sequencing efforts led to an average of 23,914,973,875 bases sequenced per pool (SD: 1,760,685,042). After filtering data, we obtained 101,911,501 bases for variable sites, providing F_{ST} estimates for 4,024,542 SNPs distributed across 21 stickleback chromosomes. The average minimum coverage per SNP was 25.32 (SD = 6.96, range: 5 – 84, Figure S3) among pools. Overall, allele frequency changed relatively little within estuaries, showing a mean ‘neutral’ F_{ST} of 0.0253 across time points (Waddell = 0.0224; Lombardi = 0.0230; Old Dairy = 0.0216; Younger = 0.0243; Scott = 0.0236; Laguna = 0.0369).

Consistent changes in allele frequency and the signature of parallel selection

To identify candidates under temporally varying parallel selection, we looked for an overlap among estuaries of SNPs that fall in the top 5% of the F_{ST} distribution. As expected, most SNPs found in the top 5% of the distribution in an estuary only reach this threshold in a single estuary (Figure 2). Yet, we find 22,111 SNPs in the top 5% in three or more estuaries. The majority of these SNPs, 19,390 SNPs (87.7%), are confined to exactly three estuaries, with 2,721 ‘ F_{ST} candidates’ found in four or more estuaries. At a FDR of 1%, we identified 37,687 SNPs using *PoolFreqDiff*, 705 of which overlapped with the SNPs that were F_{ST} outliers in at least three

estuaries (' F_{ST} -qGLM outliers'; Figure 3 and Figure 4). We also identified 2,411 SNPs with a FDR of 0.01% ('qGLM outliers').

Candidate genes and analysis of molecular function

We mapped outlier SNPs to genes and found 710 genic F_{ST} candidates in 579 different genes (Table S3), 704 qGLM outliers in 569 genes (Table S4), and 190 F_{ST} -qGLM outliers in 169 different genes (Table S5). All three sets of outliers have candidate genes associated with ion transfer, including *Wnk4* (Table S3 and Table S4) and *Nalcn* (Table S4 and Table S5). We find consistent changes in allele frequency in ATPase genes that code for proteins that transport, for example, sodium and potassium (e.g. *Atp1b1a*, Table S3) and phospholipids (*Atp8b5a*, Table S3 and Table S5). Potassium transport channels are also found among our candidate genes (e.g. *Kcnma1a*, Table S4 and Table S5; *Kcnn1a*, Table S3) as well as genes involved in calcium binding or transport, like the calcitonin receptor (*Calcr*, Table S3 and Table S4), calmodulin (*Calm1b*, Table S3) and the calcium channel *Cacna1d* (Table S5). Yet others code for various mitogen-activated protein kinases (e.g. *Map3k12*, Table S4; *Mapkbp1*, Table S5). We also found an F_{ST} outlier mapping to *Ccny*, a gene involved in the cell cycle (Table S3).

GO analysis

For an overall assessment of the gene functions that are most represented among our three sets of candidate genes, we tested for enrichment of molecular function. We find that the candidate genes from all three outlier sets have in their top ten most significant GO terms molecular functions related to ion channel activity. For example, F_{ST} candidates show enriched GO functions related to calcium ion binding (Table S6). Among the most enriched molecular

functions among qGLM candidate genes are metal ion transmembrane transporter activity and calcium ion transmembrane transporter activity (Table S7). Similarly, F_{ST} -qGLM outlier genes are enriched for ion transmembrane transporter activity and ligand-gated ion channel activity (Table S8). We also found extracellular matrix structural constituent (Table S6) among the significant molecular functions (see Discussion).

Discussion

To document natural selection, we studied stickleback populations from estuaries experiencing seasonal fluctuations in environmental conditions. We found evidence of parallel selection on genes linked to ion transport and salinity adaptation. Consistent with a change in the ionic environment, we found that the most statistically significant functions were related to ionic homeostasis. Our findings suggest that intermittent connectivity with the ocean results in episodic shifts in selection regime, a change that may resemble the initial phase of freshwater colonization that occurred during the marine-freshwater transitions of postglacial stickleback populations. More generally, our study adds to a growing literature that collectively shows that natural selection can drive genetic change over very short timespans.

Parallel selection over a seasonal timescale

We found evidence of natural selection in the form of consistent changes in allele frequency in stickleback populations from different bar-built estuaries. Our results showed changes in allele

frequency on genes with functions related to ion balance. This suggests that seasonal fluctuations of environmental conditions shift the selection regime within bar-built estuaries. The time scale involved in the overall subtle but consistent changes in allele frequency detected here conforms with studies that show selection for freshwater adaptation can be detected within a single year rather to decades (Bell 2001; Kristjánsson et al. 2002; Bell et al. 2004; Lescak et al. 2015; Marques et al 2018). These results are also consistent with the idea that adaptation to a particular environment, like freshwater, likely happens in the first few generations after colonization (e.g. reviewed by Reimchen et al. 2013). Importantly, our results set a new bar for how quickly selection can result in genetic adaptation during freshwater colonization by stickleback.

Seasonal allele frequency changes in genes involved in ion balance

Over the last 10,000 years, post-glacial stickleback populations have adapted to the different osmotic conditions found in freshwater (Spence et al. 2012). In this study, we found that seasonal isolation from the ocean led to repeated changes in allele frequency in many genes linked to ion balance. For example, genes such as *Nalcl* and *Wnk4* show signs of potential selection as shared outliers across multiple estuaries. *Nalcn* is a salt-sensing gene that was recently found to be rapidly evolving in saline-alkaline lake-dwelling fish (Tong and Li 2020). Similarly, *Wnk4* codes for an intracellular chloride sensor (Chen et al. 2019) implicated in salinity-tolerance in stickleback (Wang et al. 2014). Additionally, we found evidence of parallel selection on the gene *Ccny*. A recent epigenomic study linked *Ccny* to salinity adaptation,

showing that *Ccny* is differentially methylated in stickleback populations along a gradient of decreasing salinity (Heckwolf et al. 2020). We also found evidence of selection on genes from the *Mapk* family. These genes are differentially expressed in fish in response to many environmental stressors (Mateus et al. 2017), including osmotic stress (Tse et al. 2011; Tian et al. 2019; reviewed by Kültz 2012).

We also found evidence of selection on genes for calcium balance, for example, the calcium sensing gene calmodulin (*calm1b*, Chin and Means 2000). Another gene we found to be putatively under seasonal parallel selection is the calcitonin receptor (*Calcr*), part of a family of genes known to regulate calcium homeostasis (Naot et al. 2019). Indeed, a gene from the same family, the calcitonin gene-related peptide type 1 receptor (*Calcr1*), has been implicated in salinity tolerance or osmoregulatory adaptation in postglacial stickleback populations (Kusakabe et al. 2017). These findings suggest a potential role for selection on these loci. However, to avoid false conclusions based on selective assessment of particular genes we analyzed the overall genetic functions of candidate genes.

Temporal changes in bar-built estuaries likely select for ionic homeostasis

We focused on the top ten most significant GO terms in each outlier set and found functions related to ion transmembrane transport among candidate genes. Our findings are consistent with previous studies on freshwater adaptation that have documented divergence in genes linked to ion channels (e.g. sodium/potassium channels) during parallel adaptation to freshwater (DeFaveri et al. 2011; Jones et al. 2012a; Jones et al. 2012b; Gibbons et al. 2016;

Gibbons et al. 2017; Hasan et al. 2017; Rudman et al. 2019; Heckwolf et al. 2020). Freshwater adaptation has occurred independently in a wide range of taxa through selection on genes involved in osmoregulation. For instance, annelids (Horn et al. 2019), arthropods (Lee et al. 2011), and fish (Velotta et al. 2016), including sculpin (Dennenmoser et al. 2016) and stickleback (Jones et al. 2012b; Kusakabe et al. 2016; Hasan et al. 2017), have all shown genetic changes in ion channel genes following colonization of freshwater habitats. Our findings are also in line with a recent study (Tong and Li 2020) on adaptation of *Gymnocypris przewalskii* to a saline-alkaline lake, which showed that rapidly evolving genes, those with an elevated rate of non-synonymous substitutions, are overwhelmingly involved in ion transport. Our findings of gene functions related to transmembrane ion transport could also be in part driven by changes in temperature over the time period sampled (during the summer months). Increases in temperature may disrupt osmoregulation. A study on estuary fish from California showed that experimentally exposing fish to higher temperature results in differential expression of some of the same genetic functions we found overrepresented among our candidate genes, including ion channel activity and extracellular matrix structural constituent (Jeffries et al. 2016). Thus, changes in temperature could amplify the osmoregulatory challenges experienced by populations responding to changes in salinity.

Freshwater adaptation in stickleback also could involve genetic changes to maintain calcium homeostasis (Gibbons et al. 2016). Calcium binding proteins play an important physiological role in maintaining calcium balance in fish (Evans et al. 2005). Calcium must be continuously absorbed from freshwater, which is hypoosmotic relative to fish plasma (Liem et al. 2001; reviewed by Evans et al. 2005). Fittingly, not only did we find consistent changes in

allele frequency in genes relevant for calcium homeostasis, but we also found an overall enrichment of gene functions related to calcium ion binding. This provides additional evidence that genes for ion regulation are targets of selection during freshwater transitions that last from months to millennia.

Conclusion

We found evidence of natural selection for osmoregulatory adaptation, likely brought into operation by seasonal changes in the ionic environment within estuaries. Repeated changes in allele frequency across estuaries suggests parallel selection is occurring, and the molecular functions targeted by selection have also been identified in retrospective studies of divergence between long-established marine and freshwater populations, highlighting the utility of this approach for making inferences about historical instances of adaptation. Our results are consistent with the idea that cyclical isolation and exposure to the ocean results in seasonally oscillating selection, although time-series data over multiple instances of sandbar formation is needed for confirmation. The threespine stickleback found in bar-built estuaries along coastal California thus provide the rare opportunity to study parallel selection in real-time, *in natura*.

Acknowledgments

APH and RDHB were supported by NSERC Discovery Grants and Canada Research Chairs. Partial support for EPP was provided by the NOAA Cooperative Institute for Marine Ecosystems and Climate.

References

- Alves JM, Carneiro M, Cheng JY, de Matos AL, Rahman MM, Loog L, Campos PF, Wales N, Eriksson A, Manica A, Strive T. Parallel adaptation of rabbit populations to myxoma virus. *Science*. 2019 Mar 22;363(6433):1319-26.
- Anderson JT, Lee CR, Mitchell-Olds T. Strong selection genome-wide enhances fitness trade-offs across environments and episodes of selection. *Evolution*. 2014 Jan;68(1):16-31.
- Barrett RDH. Adaptive evolution of lateral plates in three-spined stickleback *Gasterosteus aculeatus*: a case study in functional analysis of natural variation. *Journal of Fish Biology*. 2010 Aug;77(2):311-28.
- Barrett RDH, Rogers SM, Schluter D. Natural selection on a major armor gene in threespine stickleback. *Science*. 2008 Oct 10;322(5899):255-7.
- Barrett RDH, Laurent S, Mallarino R, Pfeifer SP, Xu CC, Foll M, Wakamatsu K, Duke-Cohan JS, Jensen JD, Hoekstra HE. Linking a mutation to survival in wild mice. *Science*. 2019 Feb 1;363(6426):499-504.
- Bassham S, Catchen J, Lescak E, von Hippel FA, Cresko WA. Repeated selection of alternatively adapted haplotypes creates sweeping genomic remodeling in stickleback. *Genetics*. 2018 Jul 1;209(3):921-39.
- Batista PD, Janes JK, Boone CK, Murray BW, Sperling FA. Adaptive and neutral markers both show continent-wide population structure of mountain pine beetle (*Dendroctonus ponderosae*). *Ecology and evolution*. 2016 Sep;6(17):6292-6300.
- Becker, G.S. & Reining, I.J. 2008. Steelhead/Rainbow Trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Resources South of the Golden Gate, California. Center for Ecosystem Restoration and Management, Oakland, CA.
- Behrens DK, Bombardelli FA, Largier JL, Twohy E. Characterization of time and spatial scales of a migrating rivermouth. *Geophysical Research Letters*. 2009 May;36(9).

408 Behrens DK, Bombardelli FA, Largier JL, Twohy E. Episodic closure of the tidal inlet at the
409 mouth of the Russian River—A small bar-built estuary in California. *Geomorphology*.
410 2013 May 1;189:66-80.

411 Behrman EL, Howick VM, Kapun M, Staubach F, Bergland AO, Petrov DA, Lazzaro BP, Schmidt
412 PS. Rapid seasonal evolution in innate immunity of wild *Drosophila melanogaster*.
413 *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*. 2018 Jan
414 10;285(1870):20172599.

415 Bell G. Fluctuating selection: the perpetual renewal of adaptation in variable environments.
416 *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*. 2010 Jan
417 12;365(1537):87-97.

418 Bell MA. Lateral plate evolution in the threespine stickleback: getting nowhere fast.
419 *In* *Microevolution Rate, Pattern, Process* 2001 (pp. 445-461). Springer, Dordrecht.

420 Bell MA, Aguirre WE, Buck NJ. Twelve years of contemporary armor evolution in a threespine
421 stickleback population. *Evolution*. 2004 Apr;58(4):814-24.

422 Boughman JW, Rundle HD, Schluter D. Parallel evolution of sexual isolation in sticklebacks.
423 *Evolution*. 2005 Feb;59(2):361-73.

424 Burri R. Interpreting differentiation landscapes in the light of long-term linked selection.
425 *Evolution Letters*. 2017 Aug;1(3):118-31.

426 Campbell-Staton SC, Cheviron ZA, Rochette N, Catchen J, Losos JB, Edwards SV. Winter
427 storms drive rapid phenotypic, regulatory, and genomic shifts in the green anole
428 lizard. *Science*. 2017 Aug 4;357(6350):495-8.

429 Card DC, Perry BW, Adams RH, Schield DR, Young AS, Andrew AL, Jezkova T, Pasquesi GI,
430 Hales NR, Walsh MR, Rochford MR. Novel ecological and climatic conditions drive
431 rapid adaptation in invasive Florida Burmese pythons. *Molecular ecology*. 2018
432 Dec;27(23):4744-57.

433 Chan YF, Marks ME, Jones FC, Villarreal G, Shapiro MD, Brady SD, Southwick AM, Absher DM,
434 Grimwood J, Schmutz J, Myers RM. Adaptive evolution of pelvic reduction in
435 sticklebacks by recurrent deletion of a *Pitx1* enhancer. *science*. 2010 Jan
436 15;327(5963):302-5.

437 Chen JC, Lo YF, Lin YW, Lin SH, Huang CL, Cheng CJ. WNK4 kinase is a physiological
438 intracellular chloride sensor. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. 2019
439 Mar 5;116(10):4502-7.

440 Chin D, Means AR. Calmodulin: a prototypical calcium sensor. *Trends in cell biology*. 2000
441 Aug 1;10(8):322-8.

442 Coleman MA, Minne AJ, Vranken S, Wernberg T. Genetic tropicalisation following a marine
443 heatwave. *Scientific reports*. 2020 Jul 29;10(1):1-1.

Colosimo PF, Hosemann KE, Balabhadra S, Villarreal G, Dickson M, Grimwood J, Schmutz J, Myers RM, Schluter D, Kingsley DM. Widespread parallel evolution in sticklebacks by repeated fixation of ectodysplasin alleles. *science*. 2005 Mar 25;307(5717):1928-33.

Comeault AA, Carvalho CF, Dennis S, Soria-Carrasco V, Nosil P. Color phenotypes are under similar genetic control in two distantly related species of *Timema* stick insect. *Evolution*. 2016 Jun;70(6):1283-96.

Davidson G, Shen J, Huang YL, Su Y, Karaulanov E, Bartscherer K, Hassler C, Stannek P, Boutros M, Niehrs C. Cell cycle control of wnt receptor activation. *Developmental cell*. 2009 Dec 15;17(6):788-99.

Des Roches S, Bell MA, Palkovacs EP. Climate-driven habitat change causes evolution in Threespine Stickleback. *Global Change Biology*. 2020 Feb;26(2):597-606.

Deagle BE, Jones FC, Absher DM, Kingsley DM, Reimchen TE. Phylogeography and adaptation genetics of stickleback from the Haida Gwaii archipelago revealed using genome-wide single nucleotide polymorphism genotyping. *Molecular ecology*. 2013 Apr;22(7):1917-32.

DeFaveri J, Shikano T, Shimada Y, Goto A, Merilä J. Global analysis of genes involved in freshwater adaptation in threespine sticklebacks (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*). *Evolution: International Journal of Organic Evolution*. 2011 Jun;65(6):1800-7.

Dennenmoser S, Vamosi SM, Nolte AW, Rogers SM. Adaptive genomic divergence under high gene flow between freshwater and brackish-water ecotypes of prickly sculpin (*Cottus asper*) revealed by Pool-Seq. *Molecular ecology*. 2017 Jan;26(1):25-42.

Donihue CM, Herrel A, Fabre AC, Kamath A, Geneva AJ, Schoener TW, Kolbe JJ, Losos JB. Hurricane-induced selection on the morphology of an island lizard. *Nature*. 2018 Aug;560(7716):88-91.

Elmer KR, Meyer A. Adaptation in the age of ecological genomics: insights from parallelism and convergence. *Trends in ecology & evolution*. 2011 Jun 1;26(6):298-306.

Evans DH, Piermarini PM, Choe KP. The multifunctional fish gill: dominant site of gas exchange, osmoregulation, acid-base regulation, and excretion of nitrogenous waste. *Physiological reviews*. 2005 Jan;85(1):97-177.

Estes S, Arnold SJ. Resolving the paradox of stasis: models with stabilizing selection explain evolutionary divergence on all timescales. *The American Naturalist*. 2007 Jan 4;169(2):227-44.

Fang B, Kemppainen P, Momigliano P, Feng X, Merilä J. On the causes of geographically heterogeneous parallel evolution in sticklebacks. *Nature Ecology & Evolution*. 2020 Aug;4(8):1105-15.

479 Foll M, Gaggiotti OE, Daub JT, Vatsiou A, Excoffier L. Widespread signals of convergent
480 adaptation to high altitude in Asia and America. *The American Journal of Human*
481 *Genetics*. 2014 Oct 2;95(4):394-407.

482 Garcia-Elfring A, Paccard A, Thurman TJ, Wasserman BA, Palkovacs EP, Hendry AP, Barrett
483 RD. Seasonal genomic changes in stickleback from highly-variable bar-built estuaries
484 parallel marine to freshwater transition. *Data*. 2020. <https://doi.org>

485 Gibbons TC, Rudman SM, Schulte PM. Low temperature and low salinity drive putatively
486 adaptive growth differences in populations of threespine stickleback. *Scientific reports*.
487 2017 Dec 1;7(1):16766.

488 Gibbons TC, Rudman SM, Schulte PM. Responses to simulated winter conditions differ
489 between threespine stickleback ecotypes. *Molecular ecology*. 2016 Feb;25(3):764-75.

490 Grant PR, Grant BR, Huey RB, Johnson MT, Knoll AH, Schmitt J. Evolution caused by extreme
491 events. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*. 2017
492 Jun 19;372(1723):20160146.

493 Graham AM, McCracken KG. Convergent evolution on the hypoxia-inducible factor (HIF)
494 pathway genes EGLN1 and EPAS1 in high-altitude ducks. *Heredity*. 2019 Jan 10:1.

495 Griffiths SP, West RJ. Preliminary assessment of shallow water fish in three small
496 intermittently open estuaries in southeastern Australia. *Fisheries Management and*
497 *Ecology*. 1999 Aug;6(4):311-21.

498 Gurgel CF, Camacho O, Minne AJ, Wernberg T, Coleman MA. Marine heatwave drives cryptic
499 loss of genetic diversity in underwater forests. *Current Biology*. 2020 Feb 27.

500 Haenel Q, Roesti M, Moser D, MacColl AD, Berner D. Predictable genome-wide sorting of
501 standing genetic variation during parallel adaptation to basic versus acidic
502 environments in stickleback fish. *Evolution letters*. 2019 Feb;3(1):28-42.

503 Hartl DL, Clark AG, Clark AG. *Principles of population genetics*. Sunderland, MA: Sinauer
504 associates; 1997 Jan.

505 Hasan MM, DeFaveri J, Kuure S, Dash SN, Lehtonen S, Merilä J, McCairns RS. Sticklebacks
506 adapted to divergent osmotic environments show differences in plasticity for kidney
507 morphology and candidate gene expression. *Journal of Experimental Biology*. 2017
508 Jun 15;220(12):2175-86.

509 Heckwolf MJ, Meyer BS, Häsler R, Höppner MP, Eizaguirre C, Reusch TB. Two different
510 epigenetic pathways detected in wild three-spined sticklebacks are involved in salinity
511 adaptation. *bioRxiv*. 2019 Jan 1:649574.

512 Hendry AP, Bolnick DI, Berner D, Peichel CL. Along the speciation continuum in sticklebacks.
513 *Journal of fish biology*. 2009 Nov;75(8):2000-36.

514 Hendry AP, Peichel CL, Matthews B, Boughman JW, Nosil P. Stickleback research: the now
515 and the next. *Evolutionary Ecology Research*. 2013;15(2):111-41.

516 Hoekstra HE, Hirschmann RJ, Bunday RA, Insel PA, Crossland JP. A single amino acid mutation
517 contributes to adaptive beach mouse color pattern. *Science*. 2006 Jul
518 7;313(5783):101-4.

519 Hohenlohe PA, Magalhaes IS. The Population Genomics of Parallel Adaptation: Lessons from
520 Threespine Stickleback. In: Oleksiak M., Rajora O. (eds) *Population Genomics: Marine*
521 *Organisms*. Population Genomics. 2019 Springer, Cham

522 Horn KM, Williams BW, Erséus C, Halanych KM, Santos SR, Creuzé des Châtelliers M, Anderson
523 FE. Na⁺/K⁺-ATPase gene duplications in clitellate annelids are associated with
524 freshwater colonization. *Journal of evolutionary biology*. 2019 Mar 12.

525 Jeffries KM, Cannon RE, Davis BE, Komoroske LM, Britton MT, Sommer T, Todgham AE, Fangué
526 NA. Effects of high temperatures on threatened estuarine fishes during periods of
527 extreme drought. *Journal of Experimental Biology*. 2016 Jun 1;219(11):1705-16.

528 Jones FC, Grabherr MG, Chan YF, Russell P, Mauceli E, Johnson J, Swofford R, Pirun M, Zody
529 MC, White S, Birney E. The genomic basis of adaptive evolution in threespine
530 sticklebacks. *Nature*. 2012a Apr;484(7392):55.

531 Jones FC, Chan YF, Schmutz J, Grimwood J, Brady SD, Southwick AM, Absher DM, Myers RM,
532 Reimchen TE, Deagle BE, Schluter D. A genome-wide SNP genotyping array reveals
533 patterns of global and repeated species-pair divergence in sticklebacks. *Current*
534 *biology*. 2012b Jan 10;22(1):83-90.

535 Jones MR, Mills LS, Alves PC, Callahan CM, Alves JM, Lafferty DJ, Jiggins FM, Jensen JD, Melo-
536 Ferreira J, Good JM. Adaptive introgression underlies polymorphic seasonal
537 camouflage in snowshoe hares. *Science*. 2018 Jun 22;360(6395):1355-8.

538 Kitano J, Lema SC, Luckenbach JA, Mori S, Kawagishi Y, Kusakabe M, Swanson P, Peichel CL.
539 Adaptive divergence in the thyroid hormone signaling pathway in the stickleback
540 radiation. *Current Biology*. 2010 Dec 7;20(23):2124-30.

541 Kofler R, Orozco-terWengel P, De Maio N, Pandey RV, Nolte V, Futschik A, Kosiol C,
542 Schlötterer C. PoPoolation: a toolbox for population genetic analysis of next
543 generation sequencing data from pooled individuals. *PloS one*. 2011a Jan
544 6;6(1):e15925.

545 Kofler R, Pandey RV, Schlötterer C. PoPoolation2: identifying differentiation between
546 populations using sequencing of pooled DNA samples (Pool-Seq). *Bioinformatics*.
547 2011b Oct 23;27(24):3435-6.

548 Kristjánsson BK, Skúlason S, Noakes DL. Rapid divergence in a recently isolated population of
549 threespine stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus* L.). *Evolutionary Ecology Research*.
550 2002;4(5):659-72.

551 Kültz D. The combinatorial nature of osmosensing in fishes. *Physiology*. 2012 Aug;27(4):259-
552 75.

553 Kusakabe M, Ishikawa A, Ravinet M, Yoshida K, Makino T, Toyoda A, Fujiyama A, Kitano J.
554 Genetic basis for variation in salinity tolerance between stickleback ecotypes.
555 *Molecular ecology*. 2017 Jan;26(1):304-19.

556 Lee CE, Kiergaard M, Gelembiuk GW, Eads BD, Posavi M. Pumping ions: rapid parallel
557 evolution of ionic regulation following habitat invasions. *Evolution: International*
558 *Journal of Organic Evolution*. 2011 Aug;65(8):2229-44.

559 Lescak EA, Bassham SL, Catchen J, Gelmond O, Sherbick ML, von Hippel FA, Cresko WA.
560 Evolution of stickleback in 50 years on earthquake-uplifted islands. *Proceedings of the*
561 *National Academy of Sciences*. 2015 Dec 29;112(52):E7204-12.

562 Li H, Durbin R. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows–Wheeler transform.
563 *bioinformatics*. 2009 Jul 15;25(14):1754-60.

564 Li, H., Handsaker, B., Wysoker, A., Fennell, T., Ruan, J., Homer, N., Marth, G., Abecasis, G.
565 and Durbin, R., 2009. The sequence alignment/map format and SAMtools.
566 *Bioinformatics*, 25(16), pp.2078-2079.

567 Liem KF, Bemis WE, Walker WF, Grande L. Functional anatomy of the vertebrates: an
568 evolutionary perspective.

569 Ilardo MA, Moltke I, Korneliussen TS, Cheng J, Stern AJ, Racimo F, de Barros Damgaard P,
570 Sikora M, Seguin-Orlando A, Rasmussen S, van den Munckhof IC. Physiological and
571 genetic adaptations to diving in sea nomads. *Cell*. 2018 Apr 19;173(3):569-80.

572 Lim MC, Witt CC, Graham CH, Dávalos LM. Parallel molecular evolution in pathways, genes,
573 and sites in high-elevation hummingbirds revealed by comparative transcriptomics.
574 *Genome biology and evolution*. 2019 May 22.

575 Marchinko KB. Predation's role in repeated phenotypic and genetic divergence of armor in
576 threespine stickleback. *Evolution: International Journal of Organic Evolution*. 2009
577 Jan;63(1):127-38.

578 Marques DA, Jones FC, Di Palma F, Kingsley DM, Reimchen TE. Experimental evidence for
579 rapid genomic adaptation to a new niche in an adaptive radiation. *Nature ecology &*
580 *evolution*. 2018 Jul;2(7):1128.

581 Mateus AP, Power DM, Canário AV. Stress and disease in fish. In *Fish Diseases*. 2017 Jan 1
582 (pp. 187-220). Academic Press.

583 McCairns RS, Bernatchez L. Adaptive divergence between freshwater and marine
584 sticklebacks: insights into the role of phenotypic plasticity from an integrated analysis
585 of candidate gene expression. *Evolution: International Journal of Organic Evolution*.
586 2010 Apr;64(4):1029-47.

587 McCracken KG, Barger CP, Bulgarella M, Johnson KP, Sonsthagen SA, Trucco J, Valqui TH,
588 Wilson RE, Winker K, Sorenson MD. Parallel evolution in the major haemoglobin
589 genes of eight species of Andean waterfowl. *Molecular ecology*. 2009
590 Oct;18(19):3992-4005.

591 Miller SE, Roesti M, Schluter D. A Single Interacting Species Leads to Widespread Parallel
592 Evolution of the Stickleback Genome. *Current Biology*. 2019 Jan 24.

593 Naot D, Musson DS, Cornish J. The activity of peptides of the calcitonin family in bone.
594 *Physiological reviews*. 2019 Jan 1;99(1):781-805.

595 Nilsen TO, Ebbesson LO, Madsen SS, McCormick SD, Andersson E, Björnsson BT, Prunet P,
596 Stefansson SO. Differential expression of gill Na⁺, K⁺-ATPase α - and β -subunits, Na⁺,
597 K⁺, 2Cl⁻-cotransporter and CFTR anion channel in juvenile anadromous and landlocked
598 Atlantic salmon *Salmo salar*. *Journal of Experimental Biology*. 2007 Aug
599 15;210(16):2885-96.

600 Nosil P, Villoutreix R, de Carvalho CF, Farkas TE, Soria-Carrasco V, Feder JL, Crespi BJ,
601 Gompert Z. Natural selection and the predictability of evolution in *Timema* stick
602 insects. *Science*. 2018 Feb 16;359(6377):765-70.

603 O'Brown NM, Summers BR, Jones FC, Brady SD, Kingsley DM. A recurrent regulatory change
604 underlying altered expression and Wnt response of the stickleback armor plates gene
605 EDA. *Elife*. 2015 Jan 28;4:e05290.

606 Paccard A, Wasserman BA, Hanson D, Astorg L, Durston D, Kurland S, Apgar TM, El-Sabaawi
607 RW, Palkovacs EP, Hendry AP, Barrett RD. Adaptation in temporally variable
608 environments: stickleback armor in periodically breaching bar-built estuaries. *Journal*
609 *of evolutionary biology*. 2018 May;31(5):735-52.

610 Peterson BZ, DeMaria CD, Yue DT. Calmodulin is the Ca²⁺ sensor for Ca²⁺-dependent
611 inactivation of L-type calcium channels. *Neuron*. 1999 Mar 1;22(3):549-58.

612 Rahnenfuhrer AAJ. topGO: Enrichment analysis for Gene Ontology 2018. R package version
613 2.34.

614 Reimchen TE. Structural relationships between spines and lateral plates in threespine
615 stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*). *Evolution*. 1983 Sep;37(5):931-46.

616 Reimchen TE. Predator handling failures of lateral plate morphs in *Gasterosteus aculeatus*:
617 functional implications for the ancestral plate condition. *Behaviour*. 2000 Jul
618 1;137(7):1081-96.

619 Reimchen TE, Bergstrom C, Nosil P. Natural selection and the adaptive radiation of Haida
620 Gwaii stickleback. *Evol. Ecol. Res.* 2013 Mar 1;15:241-69.

621 Rich A, Keller EA. A hydrologic and geomorphic model of estuary breaching and closure.
622 *Geomorphology.* 2013 Jun 1;191:64-74.

623 Riddle MR, Aspiras AC, Gaudenz K, Peuß R, Sung JY, Martineau B, Peavey M, Box AC, Tabin
624 JA, McGaugh S, Borowsky R. Insulin resistance in cavefish as an adaptation to a
625 nutrient-limited environment. *Nature.* 2018 Mar;555(7698):647-51.

626 Rudman SM, Goos JM, Burant JB, Brix KV, Gibbons TC, Brauner CJ, Jeyasingh PD. Ionome and
627 elemental transport kinetics shaped by parallel evolution in threespine stickleback.
628 *Ecology letters.* 2019 Apr;22(4):645-53.

629 Schluter D, Marchinko KB, Barrett RD, Rogers SM. Natural selection and the genetics of
630 adaptation in threespine stickleback. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*
631 *B: Biological Sciences.* 2010 Aug 27;365(1552):2479-86.

632 Shapiro MD, Marks ME, Peichel CL, Blackman BK, Nereng KS, Jónsson B, Schluter D, Kingsley
633 DM. Genetic and developmental basis of evolutionary pelvic reduction in threespine
634 sticklebacks. *Nature.* 2004 Apr;428(6984):717-23.

635 Shapiro MD, Bell MA, Kingsley DM. Parallel genetic origins of pelvic reduction in vertebrates.
636 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences.* 2006 Sep 12;103(37):13753-8.

637 Smedley D, Haider S, Ballester B, Holland R, London D, Thorisson G, Kasprzyk A. BioMart—
638 biological queries made easy. *BMC genomics.* 2009 Dec;10(1):22.

639 Smith C, Zięba G, Spence R, Klepaker T, Przybylski M. Three-spined stickleback armour
640 predicted by body size, minimum winter temperature and pH. *Journal of Zoology.*
641 2020 Jan 8.

642 Soria-Carrasco V, Gompert Z, Comeault AA, Farkas TE, Parchman TL, Johnston JS, Buerkle CA,
643 Feder JL, Bast J, Schwander T, Egan SP. Stick insect genomes reveal natural selection's
644 role in parallel speciation. *Science.* 2014 May 16;344(6185):738-42.

645 Spence R, Wootton RJ, Przybylski M, Zięba G, Macdonald K, Smith C. Calcium and salinity as
646 selective factors in plate morph evolution of the three-spined stickleback (*G*
647 *asterosteus aculeatus*). *Journal of evolutionary biology.* 2012 Oct;25(10):1965-74.

648 Storey JD, Bass AJ, Dabney A, Robinson D (2018) qvalue: Q-value estimation for false
649 discovery rate control. R package version 2.14.0. <http://github.com/jdstorey/qvalue>

650 Tong C, Li M. Genomic signature of accelerated evolution in a saline-alkaline lake-dwelling
651 Schizothoracine fish. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules.* 2020 Apr
652 15;149:341-7.

- Tian Y, Wen H, Qi X, Zhang X, Li Y. Identification of mapk gene family in *Lateolabrax maculatus* and their expression profiles in response to hypoxia and salinity challenges. *Gene*. 2019 Feb 5;684:20-9.
- Tse WKF, Lai KP, Takei Y. Medaka osmotic stress transcription factor 1b (Ostf1b/TSC22D3-2) triggers hyperosmotic responses of different ion transporters in medaka gill and human embryonic kidney cells via the JNK signalling pathway. *The international journal of biochemistry & cell biology*. 2011 Dec 1;43(12):1764-75.
- Velotta JP, Wegrzyn JL, Ginzburg S, Kang L, Czesny S, O'Neill RJ, McCormick SD, Michalak P, Schultz ET. Transcriptomic imprints of adaptation to fresh water: parallel evolution of osmoregulatory gene expression in the Alewife. *Molecular ecology*. 2017 Feb;26(3):831-48.
- Wang GD, Fan RX, Zhai W, Liu F, Wang L, Zhong L, Wu H, Yang HC, Wu SF, Zhu CL, Li Y. Genetic convergence in the adaptation of dogs and humans to the high-altitude environment of the Tibetan plateau. *Genome biology and evolution*. 2014 Apr 4;6(8):2122-8.
- Wang G, Yang E, Smith KJ, Zeng Y, Ji G, Connon R, Fangue NA, Cai JJ. Gene expression responses of threespine stickleback to salinity: implications for salt-sensitive hypertension. *Frontiers in genetics*. 2014 Sep 11;5:312.
- Wasserman BA, Paccard A, Apgar TM, Des Roches S, Barrett RD, Hendry AP, Palkovacs EP. Ecosystem size shapes antipredator trait evolution in estuarine threespine stickleback. *Oikos*. 2020 Sep.
- Wiberg RA, Gaggiotti OE, Morrissey MB, Ritchie MG. Identifying consistent allele frequency differences in studies of stratified populations. *Methods in ecology and evolution*. 2017 Dec;8(12):1899-909.
- Williams M. Hydrodynamics and salt dispersion in intermittently closed bar-built estuaries (Doctoral dissertation, UC Berkeley).

Data accessibility

The data that support the findings of this manuscript will be uploaded to a publically accessible repository such as Sequence Read Archive (SRA) or Dryad. The custom bash scripts are available at <https://github.com/garfring/scripts>.

684

685 **Contributions**

686 AP, EPP, APH, and RDHB conceived the study. AGE, AP, APH, and RDHB designed the
687 methodological approach. BAW collected samples. AP performed the molecular work. AGE and
688 AP performed the bioinformatics. AGE analyzed the data and created figures with assistance
689 from TJT. AGE wrote the manuscript with input from all authors.

690

Figure 1. Locations of six bar-built estuaries sampled along the coast of California USA.

Figure 2. Extent of overlap of F_{ST} outlier loci across six estuaries.

Figure 3. Result of qGLM test (*PoolFreqDiff*) for parallel changes in allele frequency. Each dot represents a single SNP (MT chromosome and unplaced scaffolds excluded). The 705 loci identified by F_{ST} analysis as candidates in at least three estuaries and by the qGLM test as significant (FDR = 1%) are shown in red (' F_{ST} -qGLM outliers'). Black line demarks the 1% false discovery rate.

Figure 4. Distribution of allele frequency change in genome-wide SNPs and F_{st}-qGLM outliers.