**Title: Temperature and O₂, but not CO₂, interact to affect aerobic performance
of European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*)**

Running title: Temperature & O₂, not CO₂, affect bass

Daniel W. Montgomery^{a*}, Stephen D. Simpson^a, William Davison^a, Harriet R.
Goodrich^{ab}, Georg H. Engelhard^{cd}, Silvana N.R. Birchenough^c, Rod W. Wilson^{a*}

*co-corresponding authors – danwmont@gmail.com (+44 (0)7939598464),
R.W.Wilson@exeter.ac.uk (+44 (0) 1392 724652)

^a Biosciences Department, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of
Exeter, EX4 4QD, UK

^b School of Biological Sciences, The University of Queensland, Brisbane, Qld 4072,
Australia

^c Centre for Environment, Fisheries & Aquaculture Science (Cefas), Pakefield Road,
Lowestoft, NR33 0HT, UK

^d School of Environmental Sciences, University of East Anglia, Norwich, NR4 7TJ,
UK

Abstract

Climate change causes warming, decreased O₂, and increased CO₂ in marine systems and responses of organisms will depend on interactive effects between these factors. We provide the first experimental assessment of the interactive effects of warming (14 to 22°C), reduced O₂ (~3 – 21 kPa O₂), and increased CO₂ (~400 or ~1000 µatm ambient CO₂) on four indicators of aerobic performance (standard metabolic rate, SMR, maximum metabolic rate, MMR, aerobic scope, and hypoxia tolerance, O_{2crit}), blood chemistry, and O₂ transport (P₅₀) of a marine fish, the European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). Warming increased SMR and O_{2crit} (i.e. reduced hypoxia tolerance) as well as MMR in normoxia but there was an interactive effect with O₂ so that hypoxia caused larger reductions in MMR and aerobic scope at higher temperatures. Increasing CO₂ had minimal effects on SMR, MMR and O_{2crit} and did not show interactive effects with temperature or O₂ for any measured variables. Aerobic performance was not linked to changes in blood chemistry or P₅₀. Despite lack of effects of CO₂ on aerobic performance, increased CO₂ induced 30% mortality of fish exercised in low O₂ at 22°C indicating important threshold effects independent of aerobic performance. Overall, our results show temperature and O₂, but not CO₂, interact to affect aerobic performance of sea bass, disagreeing with predictions of the oxygen- and capacity-limited thermal tolerance hypothesis.

1. Introduction

Atmospheric CO₂ levels are increasing and could reach ~1000 µatm by the end of the century (IPCC, 2014). Rising atmospheric greenhouse gases increase ocean temperatures (Bopp et al., 2013), which reduces oceanic O₂ content and exacerbates the frequency and severity of hypoxic (low O₂) events (Breitburg et al.,

2018; Diaz & Rosenberg, 2008). As atmospheric CO₂ levels continue to rise so too does the concentration of CO₂ in marine systems (Caldeira & Wickett, 2003). Therefore, responses of marine organisms to climate change will be a result of simultaneous changes in temperature, O₂, and CO₂.

Changes in temperature, O₂, and CO₂ can individually impact physiological performance of fish. Concern has been raised that interactions between these three may occur in a non-linear manner, so that their combined impact cannot be predicted from responses to an individual variable (Côté et al., 2016; Crain et al., 2008; McBryan et al., 2013; Todgham & Stillman, 2013). As such, we need to understand how temperature, O₂, and CO₂ interact to affect the physiology of fish to enable accurate predictions of how climate change will influence fish species (Hollowed et al., 2013; Pörtner & Peck, 2010; Wernberg et al., 2012). One approach is to examine how these environmental factors affect the fish's range of aerobic metabolism (aerobic scope), defined as the difference between an animal's maximum rate of O₂ consumption (maximum metabolic rate, MMR) and the minimum rate needed to meet basal energy demands (standard metabolic rate, SMR) (Fry, 1971).

It has been proposed that aerobic scope provides a single metric of whole-animal performance in a particular environment. Therefore, aerobic scope can be directly linked to processes such as growth and reproduction and in turn overall organism fitness, through the concept of oxygen- and capacity- limited thermal tolerance, OCLTT (Pörtner, 2012; Pörtner et al., 2017). The OCLTT hypothesis assumes that an organism's overall fitness is maximised at an optimal temperature at which aerobic scope peaks. As such, anything that reduces aerobic scope will also diminish fitness, potentially changing the distribution of populations (Pörtner & Farrell, 2008). Hypoxia affects aerobic scope by limiting environmental O₂ availability

and, therefore, the maximum O₂ uptake rate possible by fish. Increased CO₂ has been proposed to affect aerobic scope both by increasing the SMR of fish (e.g. through increased cost of acid-base regulation) and by decreasing MMR (potentially because subsequent changes in internal acid-base chemistry can reduce O₂ transport capacity of the blood or impair tissue functioning). The OCLTT hypothesis therefore predicts that reduced O₂ and increased CO₂ will interact to reduce aerobic scope across the thermal performance curve of a species. This would result in a lower optimal temperature (where peak aerobic scope occurs) and reduced thermal tolerance. While this concept has been successfully used to explain changes in habitat suitability and population distributions of some fish species (Cucco et al., 2012; Del Raye & Weng, 2015), the assertion that it represents a universal framework to predict effects of climate change on all fish populations (Farrell, 2016) has been challenged (Jutfelt et al., 2018; Lefevre, 2016).

The proposal of the OCLTT hypothesis has led to numerous studies examining how O₂ or CO₂ interact with temperature to affect aerobic performance (for examples see Chabot and Claireaux, 2008; Rummer et al., 2013; Grans et al., 2014). However, to date no experimental work has sought to investigate how combined changes in all three factors (temperature, O₂, and CO₂) interact to affect aerobic performance in fish. Combining all three environmental variables is vital to accurately assess potential interactive effects for three reasons. Firstly, meta-analysis of multi-factor studies indicates that the prevalence of non-linear effects doubles when moving from studies that combine two factors to three factors (Crain et al., 2008). Secondly, the role of CO₂ as a limiting factor of aerobic scope was originally suggested to occur primarily in combination with hypoxia (Fry, 1971). Thirdly, low O₂ conditions in the environment always co-occur with increased CO₂ (Melzner et al., 2013). As such,

experiments investigating effects of O₂ or CO₂ and temperature on aerobic performance may not accurately reflect interactive effects caused by all three environmental factors.

In this study we investigated how temperature, O₂, and CO₂ interact to affect aerobic performance of European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*), a species showing recent northward range expansions thought to be related to warming (Pawson et al., 2007). Two separate populations exist (Souche et al., 2015) and, although the physiological responses of this species to environmental change have been regularly examined, to date only one study has used fish from the Atlantic population. As such, our experiment had three aims:

- i. to assess how aerobic performance of sea bass from the Atlantic population will respond to predicted future environmental changes;
- ii. to determine whether combinations of hypoxia and increased CO₂ interact with temperature to affect aerobic scope, as predicted by the OCLTT hypothesis;
- iii. to determine whether changes in aerobic performance are linked to blood chemistry and O₂ transport capacity.

2. Results

2.1. Standard metabolic rate and hypoxia tolerance

The best supported model for SMR included both temperature and CO₂ as fixed effects (Linear Mixed-Effects Model, marginal R² = 0.70, conditional R² = 0.70, Table S6). Standard metabolic rate approximately doubled between 14 and 22°C, exhibiting a Q₁₀ temperature coefficient of 2.09 (Figure 1). The best model indicated

that CO₂ had a small effect on SMR - reducing SMR by 7.4 mgO₂ kg⁻¹ h⁻¹, ~10 % of the smallest SMR, (95 % CI = -1.65 to 16.43 mgO₂ kg⁻¹ h⁻¹) across all temperatures at ~1000 µatm CO₂ (Figure 1). However, the model including temperature but not CO₂ had a $\Delta AIC_c < 2$ indicating that including the effect of CO₂ in the best model did not lead to a large improvement in model fit (Table S5). There was no evidence of an interactive effect between increasing temperatures and increasing CO₂.

Figure 1: Impact of temperature and CO₂ on standard metabolic rates (SMR) of juvenile sea bass. The best supported model (marginal $R^2 = 0.70$, conditional $R^2 = 0.70$) to explain variation in SMR included temperature and CO₂ as explanatory variables but not their interaction. Points represent calculated SMR for individual fish, lines represented predicted SMR at two CO₂ levels (blue = present day ~400 µatm CO₂, orange = end of century ~ 1000 µatm CO₂) from the best supported model, and shaded areas represent bootstrapped 95 % CI of predictions (n = 1000).

The best supported model of O_{2crit} included the effects of temperature, CO_2 and SMR but no interactions (Linear Mixed-Effects Model, marginal $R^2 = 0.72$, conditional $R^2 = 0.77$, Table S7). A doubling in SMR from 60 to 120 $mgO_2 kg^{-1} h^{-1}$ is predicted to increase O_{2crit} by 2.16 kPa O_2 (95 % CI = 1.66 to 2.66 kPa O_2). Independent of their effects on SMR, both temperature and CO_2 were included in the best model of O_{2crit} . The effect of temperature meant that for a given value of SMR O_{2crit} would reduce as temperature increased. For instance, a fish at 14 °C is predicted to have an O_{2crit} 0.50 kPa O_2 (95 % CI = 0.13 to 0.87 kPa O_2) higher than a fish with the same SMR at 18 °C (Figure 2A). Combined the effects of SMR and temperature mean warming from 14 to 22 °C will increase O_{2crit} by 0.91 kPa O_2 (95 % CI = 0.53 to 1.29 kPa O_2 , Figure 2B). The additional effect of CO_2 is predicted to increase O_{2crit} . Despite this, when taking into account the effect of CO_2 on SMR from the best model of SMR (Figure 1), and the effect of SMR and temperature on O_{2crit} , the resulting effect of CO_2 causes an increase in O_{2crit} of only 0.04 kPa O_2 (95 % CI = -0.32 to 0.40 kPa O_2 , Figure 2B).

Figure 2: Combined impacts of SMR, temperature and CO₂ on hypoxia tolerance (O_{2crit}) of juvenile European sea bass. **A.** The best supported model (marginal $R^2 = 0.72$, conditional $R^2 = 0.77$) predicted a positive effect of increasing SMR on O_{2crit} with the effect of increased temperature resulting in lower O_{2crit} for a given value of SMR. **B.** Combined effects of SMR and temperature result in an increase in O_{2crit} between 14 °C and 22 °C. The predicted positive effect of increased CO₂ on O_{2crit} is small compared to changes in SMR and temperature. Points represent calculated O_{2crit} for individual fish, lines represented predicted O_{2crit} from the best supported model, and shaded areas represent bootstrapped 95 % CI of predictions ($n = 1000$).

2.2. Maximum metabolic rate and aerobic scope

Maximum metabolic rate of sea bass was affected by temperature, O₂, and CO₂ level. Warming from 14 to 22 °C, in normoxia combined with normocapnia, caused a

161 50 % increase in MMR from 293.5 ± 10.4 to 435.9 ± 18.9 $\text{mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$, with a Q_{10} of
162 1.64. In high CO_2 the temperature effect on MMR was very similar ($Q_{10} = 1.60$). The
163 best supported model predicted that O_2 had a non-linear quadratic effect on MMR,
164 so that a given reduction in O_2 caused a larger reduction in MMR at lower O_2 levels,
165 as well as interactive effects between O_2 and temperature (Figure 3; Linear Mixed
166 Model, marginal $R^2 = 0.91$, conditional $R^2 = 0.96$, Table S8). For example a 5 kPa
167 reduction in O_2 at 18 °C (in normal CO_2) from air saturated levels (~ 20 to ~15 kPa
168 O_2) results in a predicted decrease in MMR of $8.0 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$ (95 % CI = -7.2 to
169 $23.2 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$) whereas the same reduction in O_2 from 10 to 5 kPa resulted in a
170 15-fold larger predicted decrease in MMR of $123.8 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$ (95 % CI = 115.1 to
171 $132.5 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$). In addition, the non-linear O_2 effect interacted with the
172 temperature effect so that the same reduction in O_2 caused a larger reduction in
173 MMR as temperature increased (Figure 3A & B). This was particularly noticeable
174 between 15 and 10 kPa O_2 where fish at 22 °C (in normal CO_2) exhibited a predicted
175 decline in MMR that was 60 % larger than fish at 14 °C, $80.9 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$ (95 % CI
176 = 63.2 to $98.6 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$) versus $50.8 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$ (95 % CI = 35.9 to 65.7 mgO_2
177 $\text{kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$). Finally, environmental CO_2 level had a small, negative effect independent of
178 interactions between temperature and O_2 . As a result, an increase in CO_2 of 1000
179 μatm is predicted to reduce MMR by $8.5 \text{ mgO}_2 \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$ (95 % CI = -18.2 to 35.3 mgO_2
180 $\text{kg}^{-1} \text{ h}^{-1}$) irrespective of temperature and O_2 (Figure 3C, D, & E).

Figure 3: Effects of combinations of temperature, O₂, and CO₂ on the maximum metabolic rate (MMR) of European sea bass. There was a synergistic interactive effect of temperature and O₂ on MMR for sea bass exposed to both **A.** present day CO₂ conditions (present day CO₂ = 400 μatm at ~20 kPa O₂) and **B.** end of century CO₂ conditions (end of century CO₂ = 1000 μatm at ~ 20 kPa O₂). The additive effects of reduced O₂ and increased CO₂ levels are displayed for sea bass at **A.** 14 °C **B.** 18 °C and **C.** 22 °C. Points represent calculated MMR for individual fish, lines represent predicted MMR from the best supported model, and shaded areas represent bootstrapped 95 % confidence intervals (n = 1000).

We predicted the impacts of temperature, O₂, and CO₂ on aerobic scope from the best supported models fitted to measurements of SMR and MMR (Figure 4). At normoxia (~20 kPa O₂) aerobic scope is predicted to increase by 80.2 mgO₂ kg⁻¹ h⁻¹ (95 % CI = 24.8 to 135.7 mgO₂ kg⁻¹ h⁻¹) as temperature increases from 14 to 22 °C

independent of changes in CO₂ level (Figure 4A & B). Interactive effects between temperature and O₂ on MMR are reflected in predictions of aerobic scope (Figure 4A & B). As increasing CO₂ has the same direction of effect on both SMR and MMR the impact of CO₂ on aerobic scope is minimal (Figure 4C, D, & E).

Figure 4: Effects of combinations of temperature, O₂, and CO₂ on the aerobic scope (AS) of European sea bass. There was a non-linear interactive effect of temperature and O₂ on aerobic scope for sea bass exposed to both **A.** present day CO₂ conditions (present day CO₂ = 400 µatm at ~20 kPa O₂) and **B.** end of century CO₂ conditions (end of century CO₂ = 1000 µatm at ~20 kPa O₂). The additive effects of reduced O₂ and increased CO₂ levels are displayed for sea bass at **A.** 14 °C **B.** 18 °C and **C.** 22 °C. Points represent aerobic scope of individual fish derived from calculated RMR and MMR of that individual, lines represent predicted aerobic scope calculated by subtracting model predictions of RMR and MMR and shaded areas

represent 95 % confidence intervals calculated from bootstrapped standard errors of predicted RMR and MMR (n = 1000).

2.3. Blood chemistry & Hb-O₂ affinity

Increasing ambient CO₂ from ~400 to ~1000 μ atm increased plasma *p*CO₂ (Two-way ANOVA, *F* = 15.84, *df* = 1, *p* < 0.001) whereas warming from 14 to 22 °C did not (*F* = 0.772, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.468), and there was no interactive effect noted (*F* = 2.067, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.138). Despite the significant overall effect of increased CO₂ on plasma *p*CO₂ pairwise comparisons (Figure 5) only revealed a significant increase in plasma *p*CO₂ in bass at 18 °C exposed to ~1000 μ atm (0.53 ± 0.05 kPa *p*CO₂) compared to ambient conditions (0.29 ± 0.05 kPa *p*CO₂) (Pairwise comparisons of least square means, *t* = 3.688, *df* = 1, *p* = 0.008).

To compensate for increased plasma *p*CO₂ in ~1000 μ atm CO₂ treatments sea bass accumulated ~3 mM extra HCO₃⁻ (Two-way ANOVA, *F* = 44.34, *df* = 1, *p* < 0.001) (Figure 5), compared to fish in ambient CO₂ conditions at 14 and 18 °C. Fish exposed to ~1000 μ atm CO₂ at 22 °C showed a non-significant increase in HCO₃⁻ of just under 2 mM (95 % CI = 0.60 to 2.84 mM) when compared to fish at ~400 μ atm CO₂ (*t* = 2.66, *df* = 1, *p* = 0.103). There was no temperature effect on plasma HCO₃⁻ (*F* = 2.538, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.0903) and no interactive effect between temperature and CO₂ (*F* = 0.969, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.387).

As a result of compensatory accumulation of HCO₃⁻, blood extracellular pH (*p*H_e) was regulated in response to high CO₂ (*F* = 3.56, *df* = 1, *p* = 0.066) and sea bass did not show significant effects of temperature on *p*H_e (Two way ANOVA, *F* = 1.425, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.251). However, there was a significant interactive effect between temperature and CO₂ (*F* = 3.952, *df* = 2, *p* = 0.026). This interactive effect was

caused by a significant reduction in pH_e in sea bass exposed to $\sim 1000 \mu\text{atm CO}_2$ at 18°C (7.80 ± 0.03) when compared to fish at ambient CO_2 levels (7.97 ± 0.04) (pairwise comparisons of least square means, $t = 3.242$, $df = 1$, $p = 0.026$). We did not find significant differences between pH_e across all other treatment groups. Additionally, intracellular pH of red blood cells (pH_i) showed no significant differences between all treatments (Kruskal-Wallis test, $\chi^2 = 6.79$, $df = 5$, $p = 0.237$) (Figure 5).

There were no significant differences in plasma lactate levels across all treatments (Kruskal-Wallis, $\chi^2 = 6.40$, $df = 5$, $p = 0.269$), with mean lactate for all fish of $0.42 \pm 0.06 \text{ mM}$ ($\pm \text{S.E.}$). Plasma glucose levels (mean for all fish of $4.30 \pm 0.14 \text{ mM}$, $\pm \text{S.E.}$) were not significantly affected by temperature (Two-way ANOVA, $F = 0.864$, $df = 2$, $p = 0.429$), CO_2 ($F = 0.0138$, $df = 1$, $p = 0.907$) or the interaction between temperature and CO_2 ($F = 1.052$, $df = 2$, $p = 0.358$).

Figure 5: Impact of temperature and CO₂ on blood acid-base characteristics of European sea bass. Significant differences in pairwise comparisons of least square means between treatments are indicated by different letters (a,b,c). No significant differences between any treatments were noted for measurements of pH_i.

Our measurements of blood O₂ transport showed no consistent impacts of temperature or CO₂. Haemoglobin-O₂ binding affinity (P₅₀) (Kruskal-Wallis, $\chi^2 = 6.503$, df = 4, p = 0.165) and Hills' number (One-way ANOVA, F = 0.878, df = 4, p = 0.487) were not significantly different between any treatments (Figure S1). Haematocrit (Hct) was not affected by temperature (Two-way ANOVA, F = 0.832, df = 2, p = 0.442) or CO₂ (F = 2.945, df = 1, p = 0.093) and no interactive effects were evident (F = 0.069, df = 2, p = 0.934). Haemoglobin (Hb) levels were affected by temperature (Two-way ANOVA, F = 7.094, df = 2, p = 0.002) with fish sampled at 22 °C having Hb levels 0.20 and 0.24 mM higher than fish sampled at 18 and 14 °C

respectively. Haemoglobin levels were not affected by CO₂ ($F = 0.690$, $df = 1$, $p = 0.411$) and there were no interactive effects ($F = 3.067$, $df = 2$, $p = 0.057$) (Figure S2).

2.4. Mortality

Three fish (30 %) died ~1 hour post-chase after exposure to ~6 kPa O₂ at 22 °C in the high CO₂ treatment. No fish died post-chase in any other treatment combinations.

3. Discussion

Our results demonstrate, for the first time, the interactive effects of temperature, O₂, and CO₂ on aerobic performance of an active predatory marine fish. We show that temperature and O₂ have a non-linear interactive effect on aerobic performance of European sea bass but CO₂'s impact is minor and independent. Both SMR and MMR increased with temperature from 14 to 22 °C, but changes in MMR were greater leading to positive effects on absolute aerobic scope. These results suggest that European sea bass populations in the North-East Atlantic (typical temperatures are < 22 °C) could physiologically benefit from global warming. However, hypoxia tolerance reduced at higher temperatures, and hypoxia reduced MMR and aerobic scope by a greater amount at high temperatures, indicating that in warmer waters European sea bass will be more susceptible to hypoxia.

We confirm similar findings from previous research investigating effects of temperature and O₂ on European sea bass. For example, the increase in SMR with temperature we observed closely follows results from aquaculture sourced European sea bass (Claireaux & Lagardère, 1999). That is the Q₁₀ temperature coefficient dropped from 2.33 between 14 and 18 °C to 1.82 between 18 and 22 °C. This drop in

Q₁₀ as temperature increases provides further evidence that SMR does not increase exponentially after chronic vs acute exposure (Sandblom et al., 2014; Schulte et al., 2011). Responses of MMR to temperature showed similar Q₁₀'s indicating a linear increase in MMR between 14 and 22 °C. This also closely corresponds with observations from Claireaux and Lagardère (1999) who found that MMR increased approximately linearly between 14 and 22 °C, before peaking between 22 and 24 °C and declining at higher temperatures. Further work with sea bass from Mediterranean stock has shown that specific growth rate and feed conversion efficiency peak at ~25 °C and decline at higher temperatures (Person-Le Ruyet et al., 2004), similar to changes in metabolic scope shown by Claireaux and Lagardère (1999). Finally, aquaculture-produced sea bass display an Arrhenius break point of heart rate at ~21.5 °C and developed arrhythmia at ~26 °C (Crespel et al., 2019). The consistency in temperature of peak performance in sea bass from distinct sub-populations with vastly different environmental experiences supports the idea that fish face ceilings to physiological performance in the face of environmental change (Sandblom et al., 2016). Despite these similarities with previous research, SMR of fish in our study was higher at a given temperature than for fish from Mediterranean stocks (Claireaux & Lagardère, 1999). This may support the theory of metabolic cold adaptation, that basal energy demand in fish from warmer environments will be lower than in fish from cold environments when measured at the same temperature (Krogh, 1916). This has recently been supported by evidence from wild populations of three-spine stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*) (Pilakouta et al., 2020).

Declining O₂ caused a decrease in MMR along a limiting oxygen curve, similar to that seen previously in sea bass (Claireaux & Lagardère, 1999; Lagardère et al., 1998) and other fish species (Chabot & Claireaux, 2008; Claireaux et al., 2000;

Lefrancois & Claireaux, 2003; Mallekh & Lagardère, 2002). This result questions recent predictions made by Seibel and Deutsch (2020) that MMR of fish should decrease linearly from ~21 kPa O₂ to O_{2crit} values. The curved, rather than linear, response of MMR we observed may occur as a result of compensatory mechanisms (e.g. increased ventilation, cardiac output, gill lamellar perfusion and surface area, and haematocrit) to maintain O₂ delivery (Farrell & Richards, 2009). While these adjustments may limit reductions in MMR during mild to moderate hypoxia they may reach their performance limits as O₂ approaches critical levels, resulting in a steeper decline in MMR. For example, in moderate hypoxia rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) increase cardiac output via increased stroke volume but in severe hypoxia cardiac output cannot be increased further leading to bradycardia (Sandblom & Axelsson, 2005).

Temperature and O₂ interacted to affect metabolism of sea bass so that impacts of hypoxia on MMR increased with temperature (Figure 3). This result supports previous research by Claireaux & Lagardère (1999). However, sea bass in our study displayed higher MMR at similar temperature and pO₂ when compared to bass from Claireaux and Lagardère (1999). In addition, the O_{2crit} (the point at which SMR = MMR) of our sea bass increased between 14 °C and 22 °C (Figure 2) whereas results from previous work suggested that O_{2crit} increases or remains constant across this temperature range (Claireaux & Lagardère, 1999). The reduction in hypoxia tolerance of sea bass with warming was primarily a result of strong positive correlation between O_{2crit} and SMR (Figure 1). This relationship has been shown for numerous fish species, and most recently in work with black sea bass (*Centropristus striata*) (Slesinger et al., 2019). However, our results also indicate that temperature had a secondary effect which resulted in lower O_{2crit} at higher temperatures for a

given SMR. This suggests that temperature affects O_{2crit} via another mechanism (or mechanisms) independent of SMR. This is unlikely to be related to O_2 transport capacity of the blood as there were few consistent effects of temperature on Hct, Hb or P_{50} of sea bass (Figure 5, S1 and S2). It has previously been observed that improved hypoxia tolerance of fish after acclimation to increased temperature correlates to increased gill lamellar surface area (McBryan et al., 2016) or changes to heart structure (Anttila et al., 2015). Gomez Isaza *et al.* (2021) demonstrated that both of these cardiorespiratory responses can improve O_2 supply capacity. Combined, these results suggest that thermal acclimation can cause structural changes to the gills and the heart, improving performance in low O_2 conditions and mitigating the negative effect of temperature induced increases in SMR on hypoxia tolerance.

The independent effect of rising CO_2 reduced MMR. Previous research has not shown consistent effects of CO_2 on MMR or SMR of fish species, with the majority showing no effects of CO_2 (Lefevre, 2016, 2019). Interestingly the most recent research with European sea bass found that long term exposure to elevated CO_2 increased MMR. This may indicate that negative effects of short term exposures used in our study (i.e. weeks) can be overcome in the long term (i.e. years) (Crespel et al., 2019). As such, future work needs to determine whether interactions between CO_2 and temperature or O_2 occur over longer time scales. The effect of CO_2 on metabolic rate in our study was only identifiable by including the rise in CO_2 which co-occurs when environmental O_2 declines. Without the additional data from increased CO_2 exposures at lower O_2 levels the effect of ambient CO_2 on MMR at normoxia was not significant. Although the best model of SMR also included a negative effect of CO_2 this was predicted to be small with confidence intervals

overlapping zero (Figure 1). Additionally, removal of CO₂ as an explanatory variable from the model of SMR did not greatly impair model fit ($\Delta AIC_c < 2$) which indicates that the effect of CO₂ on SMR was not critically important for overall model performance.

As CO₂ increases in the environment when O₂ declines the negative effect of CO₂ has a greater impact on MMR at lower O₂ levels (Figure 3 C, D, and E). Decreased MMR when fish are exposed to acutely increased CO₂ is usually thought to be a result of an internal acidosis causing a decrease in Hb-O₂ binding affinity, reducing the capacity of O₂ transport in the blood (Heuer & Grosell, 2016). However, fish have well developed acid-base regulatory mechanisms and blood sampling showed that sea bass in normoxia had fully compensated for the effects of increased environmental CO₂ on blood pH by compensatory accumulation of extra HCO₃⁻, resulting in no changes in Hb-O₂ binding affinity (Figure 5 and S1). Additionally, we have recently shown that sea bass are able regulate blood pH when exposed to concurrent progressive hypercapnia during progressive hypoxia over the course of several hours and have higher Hb-O₂ binding affinity in these conditions when compared to fish exposed to progressive hypoxia with no concurrent hypercapnia (Montgomery et al., 2019). In addition, we did not see significant changes in Hb levels or Hct between CO₂ treatments (Figure 7). We conclude that the negative effect of increased CO₂ on MMR is unlikely to be related to changes in O₂ transport capacity in the blood. Whilst beyond the scope of the present study we can speculate that instead CO₂ may affect MMR via changes in mitochondrial metabolism (Leo et al., 2017; Strobel et al., 2012, 2013), cardiac performance (Crespel et al., 2019; Perry & Abdallah, 2012) or via shifts from aerobic to anaerobic metabolic pathways (Michaelidis et al., 2007). Indeed, recent results show that CO₂

impacts mitochondrial function of sea bass from the Atlantic population in combination with acute warming (Howald et al., 2019)

While the effect of CO₂ on MMR was part of the best supported model it is uncertain whether it would cause biologically relevant impacts. Previous research has linked declines in MMR caused by increased CO₂ with decreased swimming performance (Lefevre, 2019) but it is unknown if the relatively small changes in MMR shown in the present study would translate to other aspects of whole animal performance. This is especially the case as predictions of aerobic scope from the combined best supported models of MMR and SMR essentially show no effect of CO₂ on aerobic scope at O₂ levels >10 kPa (Figure 4 C, D, and E). This occurs because predicted effects of CO₂ act in the same direction for both SMR and MMR. As changes in aerobic scope typically predict environmental impacts on processes such as growth and reproduction (Clark et al., 2013; Pörtner et al., 2017) we would predict that climate change relevant CO₂ increases have negligible effects on these endpoints. However, the effect of CO₂ may have important consequences not reflected in changes in aerobic scope. In our most extreme treatment (22 °C, ~30 % air saturation, end of century CO₂) we observed 30 % mortality of sea bass after exhaustive exercise. Fish exercised at the same temperature and O₂ levels in ambient CO₂ conditions showed no mortality (and no mortality was observed in any other treatment combinations) – consequently it appears the elevated CO₂ during hypoxia in a future ocean scenario (which was approximately 1100 µatm higher than in the present day CO₂ scenario) may impair recovery from exercise when O₂ is limiting. Mortality in fish post-exercise has been theorised to result from intracellular acidosis generated during anaerobic respiration (Wood et al., 1983). Therefore, the greater increase in CO₂ during hypoxia in the future ocean CO₂ scenario may either

exacerbate the intracellular acidosis caused by anaerobic activity or impair the ability of fish to process anaerobic end products.

3.1. Evidence to support OCLTT?

The OCLTT hypothesis suggests climate change will affect fish because combined effects of reduced O₂ and increasing CO₂ will synergistically interact, lowering aerobic scope across its thermal performance curve (Pörtner & Peck, 2010), and that changes in aerobic scope can be used as a single metric for predicting whole animal performance (Pörtner, 2012). Our data provides some support for the OCLTT hypothesis as the observed interactions between increased temperature and reduced O₂ on aerobic scope would be expected to result in changes to the thermal performance curve as predicted by Pörtner and Farrell (2008). However, our highest temperature treatment did not decrease MMR or aerobic scope and so we cannot confirm whether interactive effects between temperature and hypoxia would follow predictions of the OCLTT above the optimum temperature of aerobic scope. In contrast to hypoxia, the effects of CO₂ did not follow predictions from the OCLTT as CO₂ did not interact with either temperature or hypoxia and had minimal impacts on aerobic scope.

The interactive effects of O₂ and temperature on the MMR of sea bass in this study closely resemble predictions of the metabolic niche framework which Ern (2019) proposed as an update to the OCLTT hypothesis. In particular the concept of aerobic scope isopleths (where aerobic scope remains constant across a range of temperatures as a result of changes in O₂ or vice versa) is supported by our data, showing that aerobic scope of sea bass would be expected to remain constant across an 8 °C temperature range at an O₂ level of ~6 kPa (Figure 3 A and B). As

such, we would support Ern's suggestion to experimentally assess how aerobic scope affects important processes, such as growth, independently of changes in temperature and O₂ by utilising these isopleths. Although increased aerobic scope has long been linked to improved individual fitness there is still a lack of evidence to confirm this relationship occurs – as such the assumption that peak physiological fitness occurs when aerobic scope peaks (central to the OCLTT) may be erroneous.

Alternatively, Deutsch *et al.* (2015) have suggested a framework which aims to predict impacts of climate change on the physiological suitability of a habitat for a species via a metabolic index, relating the ratio of O₂ supply to resting metabolic demand (i.e. SMR), rather than aerobic scope. This metabolic index appears to provide a tool for predicting the biogeographical distributions of species with the biogeographical distribution limits of many marine species corresponding to a metabolic index of ~2-5 (Deutsch *et al.*, 2015). This approach has been supported by experimental work with black sea bass, *Centropristis striata*, (Slesinger *et al.*, 2019) and Roman sea bream, *Chrysoblephus laticeps*, (Duncan *et al.*, 2020) which showed that the metabolic index can accurately predict changes in population distributions of these species. Applying the principle of the metabolic index to our data suggests that temperatures of 22 °C are close to the upper temperature limits of European sea bass from the North-East Atlantic sub-population (metabolic index at 22 °C and 20 kPa O₂ was ~5).

4. Conclusion

In summary, our research shows that aerobic scope of European sea bass will increase with expected warming in the North-East Atlantic, and that even extreme summer temperatures (~22 °C) at the end of the century will positively impact on the

absolute aerobic performance of sea bass. However, synergistic interactions between warming and reduced O₂ indicate that hypoxic conditions will have greater impacts on sea bass in future oceans. Increased CO₂ levels showed no interactions with either temperature or O₂ changes but were predicted to cause a small decline in MMR – although this had little impact on aerobic scope because increased CO₂ caused a trend for decreased SMR. Sea bass fully compensated blood pH for increased CO₂ levels and increases in SMR and reductions in MMR with temperature were not linked to changes in O₂ transport. Despite end of century CO₂ levels having minimal effects on aerobic scope, they did cause increased mortality of fish recovering from exercise in the more extreme hypoxic scenario (~30 % air saturation) at 22 °C. This effect would not have been observed without including expected increases in CO₂ as O₂ declines in hypoxia treatments. Thus, environmentally relevant changes in CO₂ during hypoxia may lead to important threshold effects which could be missed if experiments only consider changes in CO₂ related to atmospheric concentrations. Interactive effects of temperature and O₂ support predictions from the oxygen-and temperature-limited metabolic niche framework proposed as an update to the OCLTT hypothesis by Ern (2019), however the effect of CO₂ did not support predictions of the OCLTT (Pörtner & Farrell, 2008). Changes in the metabolic index proposed as a physiological constraint by Deutsch *et al.* (2015) suggest that despite increases in MMR and aerobic scope future climate change may result in conditions which will begin to constrain growth and reproduction of sea bass in areas where temperatures increase above 22 °C. However, there is a vital need for increased research to link changes in aerobic scope to population relevant metrics such as growth and reproduction to better

assess what environmental impacts on aerobic performance may mean for wider populations.

5. Materials & Methods

5.1. Animal Collection and Husbandry

We collected juvenile sea bass from estuaries and coastal lagoons on the south Dorset coast and Isle of Wight in June 2017. Fish were held in a marine recirculating aquaculture system (RAS) at the University of Exeter for 332 days before experimental work began (see water chemistry data in Table 1). Sea bass were fed a diet of commercial pellet (Horizon 80, Skretting) at a ration of ~1-2 % body mass three times per week and supplemented with ~1 % body mass of chopped mussel (*Mytilus edulis*) once per week. All experimental procedures were carried out under a UK Home Office licence (P88687E07) and approved by the University of Exeter's Animal Welfare and Ethical Review Board.

Table 1: Water chemistry parameters of the recirculating aquaculture system in which sea bass were held prior to experimental work beginning (means $\pm$ S.D. shown). Fish were initially held at 15 °C before stock systems were raised to 18 °C approximately 6 months prior to experimental work beginning. The temperature shown in the table represents the mean temperature for the entire time fish were held in the RAS prior to experimental trials beginning.

Time in system (days)	Temperature (°C)	pH (NBS scale)	Salinity	Total Alkalinity (µM)	pCO ₂ (µatm)
332	17.1 $\pm$ 1.4	8.02 $\pm$ 0.05	32.98 $\pm$	2072.0 $\pm$	534.0 $\pm$

0.65	130.2	60.2
------	-------	------

5.2. Treatment conditions

Sea bass were transferred to an experimental RAS, in a temperature-controlled room for a minimum of 14 days acclimation to treatment conditions (Figure 6). Six treatment conditions were used combining three temperatures and two CO₂ levels in a three x two factorial design (Table 2). Temperature treatments (14, 18 and 22 °C) were chosen to reflect temperature ranges in coastal UK waters from spring to autumn as well as potential future summer temperatures at the end of the century (IPCC, 2014; Tinker et al., 2020). CO₂ treatments (~400 & ~1000 µatm) were chosen to reflect annual average ambient atmospheric CO₂ levels currently and possible end-of-century ambient atmospheric levels according to an RCP 8.5 scenario (IPCC, 2014). Sea bass were transferred to the experimental RAS at 18 °C before temperatures were adjusted at a rate of 2 °C per day to reach treatment conditions (i.e. 14 or 22 °C). A header tank (~500 L) in the experimental RAS was used to adjust CO₂ to the desired level for each treatment before entering the treatment tank which contained the sea bass. For present day CO₂ treatments (~400 µatm) the header tank was aerated using CO₂ scrubbed air to remove excess CO₂ added to the RAS by the biological filters. For end of century CO₂ treatments (~1000 µatm) an Aqua Medic pH computer was used to adjust RAS water to an appropriate pH (7.8). Additionally, treatment tanks were aerated with a gas mix with the appropriate CO₂ content for each treatment.

Measurements of treatment tank pH (NBS scale), salinity, temperature, and a 12 mL water sample to measure Dissolved Inorganic Carbon (DIC) were taken every 2-

3 days. Seawater DIC analysis was conducted using a custom built system described in detail by Lewis *et al.* (2013). Data for pH, salinity, temperature and DIC were then input into the seawater carbon calculator programme, CO2SYS (Pierrot *et al.*, 2006) to calculate $p\text{CO}_2$ based on the equilibration constants refitted by Dickson and Millero (1987), and KSO_4 dissociation constants from Dickson (1990) (Table 2).

Table 2: Mean $\pm$ S.D. of water chemistry parameters in treatment tanks during treatments at 3 temperature (14, 18, and 22 °C) and 2 CO_2 levels (~400 and ~1000 μatm). Treatment order represents time course of treatments (i.e. treatment 1 was conducted first and treatment 6 last). Total Alkalinity (TA) varied somewhat over time as a result of biological activity and so was adjusted periodically by addition of 1.0 M NaHCO_3 to restore TA levels back to >2000 μM .

Parameter	Treatment					
	1	2	3	4	5	6
Temperature (°C)	17.9 $\pm$ 0.0	22.0 $\pm$ 0.0	13.9 $\pm$ 0.1	21.7 $\pm$ 0.5	13.9 $\pm$ 0.1	18.0 $\pm$ 0.1
$p\text{CO}_2$ (μatm)	460 $\pm$ 34	375 $\pm$ 28	333 $\pm$ 38	1065 $\pm$ 172	1057 $\pm$ 65	973 $\pm$ 114
pH (NBS)	8.06 $\pm$ 0.03	8.12 $\pm$ 0.02	8.14 $\pm$ 0.04	7.79 $\pm$ 0.03	7.81 $\pm$ 0.04	7.83 $\pm$ 0.05
Salinity	32.9 $\pm$ 0.6	32.5 $\pm$ 2.9	33.3 $\pm$ 0.3	32.6 $\pm$ 0.3	34.6 $\pm$ 0.5	33.8 $\pm$ 0.6
TA (μM)	1935 $\pm$ 93	1745 $\pm$ 26	1861 $\pm$ 88	2147 $\pm$ 292	2393 $\pm$ 188	2170 $\pm$ 20

5.3. Respirometry measurements (SMR, MMR, and O_{2crit})

Rates of oxygen consumption ($\dot{M}O_2$) were made as a proxy of metabolic rate using an intermittent-flow respirometer system, details of which can be found in Montgomery *et al.* (2019), set-up following recommendations by Svendsen *et al.* (2016). Sea bass were starved for 72 hours prior to the start of measurements to ensure that metabolism was not affected by the specific dynamic action of digestion (Chabot *et al.*, 2016). Individual sea bass were then transferred to respirometer chambers and left to acclimate for a minimum of 12 hours overnight before measurements of $\dot{M}O_2$ began. For each treatment all respirometry measurements were conducted in two groups (hereafter referred to as respirometry group), with five fish being measured simultaneously for each group. Following the 12 hour acclimation period we measured $\dot{M}O_2$ of each sea bass for ~3-4 hours (from ~6 am to ~10 am) before hypoxia tolerance was assessed using a critical O_2 tension (O_{2crit}) trial (Figure 6), following protocols set out in Montgomery *et al.* (2019). Carbon dioxide levels in the water were simultaneously increased as O_2 declined during O_{2crit} trials to reflect the natural rise in CO_2 during hypoxic events in aquatic systems (Melzner *et al.*, 2013; Montgomery *et al.*, 2019). During O_{2crit} trials water pH, temperature, salinity, and DIC were measured every hour to calculate water carbonate chemistry. Changes in system pCO_2 and pH during O_{2crit} trials for each treatment are given in supplementary materials (Table S1).

O_{2crit} trials were stopped once a minimum of three consecutive $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements showed a transition from an oxy-regulating to oxy-conforming state for each fish. Following completion of O_{2crit} trials the respirometer system was aerated with ambient air (CO_2 ~400 μatm) or a 0.1 % CO_2 in air gas mix (CO_2 ~1000 μatm) to rapidly restore O_2 levels to normoxia and CO_2 to the appropriate treatment

level. Sea bass were left to recover in respirometers, for a minimum of one hour post-trial, until O_2 levels reached ~ 21 kPa O_2 (~ 100 % air saturation) before removing the fish and measuring background respiration for a minimum of one hour (six measurement cycles) for all respirometers immediately post trial. Each sea bass was then placed in an individual ~ 10 L isolation tank which was subsequently fed by the respirometry system sump (at a rate of ~ 4 L min^{-1}) to maintain treatment conditions (with overflowing water from the isolation tanks recirculating back to the sump).

After fish had rested overnight in isolation tanks, MMR was measured for each fish (using an exhaustive chase protocol; Norin and Clark, 2016) on three consecutive days (with overnight recovery in between) at three different levels of O_2 (100, 60 and 30 % air saturation) with increasing CO_2 levels for each O_2 level as detailed for $O_{2\text{crit}}$ trials (Figure 6). The appropriate O_2 and CO_2 level was achieved by aerating isolation boxes with a mix of N_2 , O_2 and CO_2 (G400 Gas mixing system, Qubit Biology Inc.) at a rate of 5 L min^{-1} . Fish were exposed to the new O_2 and CO_2 conditions for ~ 2 hours before chase protocols were conducted. Chase protocols and subsequent respirometry measurements were conducted at the appropriate temperature, O_2 , and CO_2 conditions for each treatment. Measurements of water pH, temperature, salinity, and DIC were taken for each isolation tank, the chase tank (after all fish were chased) and the respirometer system (during $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements) to calculate water carbonate chemistry. Temperature, O_2 , and CO_2 conditions for all MMR trials are given in Table S2.

For all $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements dissolved O_2 concentration (% air saturation) was measured continuously (frequency ~ 1 Hz) in respirometer chambers using a fibre optic O_2 optode mounted in the recirculation loop of the respirometer chamber.

These optodes were linked to two Firesting Optical Oxygen Meters (Pyro Science, Aachen, Germany) which were connected to a PC running AquaResp 3 software which automatically logged all measurements.

$\dot{M}O_2$ was automatically calculated by the AquaResp3 software by fitting a linear regression to the O_2 versus time data for each measurement period. The slope (s) of this regression ($kPa\ O_2\ h^{-1}$) was then used to calculate $\dot{M}O_2$ ($mg\ O_2\ kg^{-1}\ h^{-1}$) using the equation outlined by Svendsen *et al.*(2016):

$$\dot{M}O_2 = sV_{resp}\alpha m^{-1}$$

where V_{resp} is the respirometer volume minus the volume of the fish (L), α is the solubility of O_2 in water ($mgO_2\ L^{-1}\ kPa^{-1}$) for the relevant salinity and temperature, and m is the mass of the fish (kg). For the purpose of establishing the impacts of reduced O_2 on MMR and determining O_{2crit} values, the O_2 level of each measurement period was defined as the mean dissolved O_2 measurement over the measurement period. The mean background respiration for each respirometer over the 1 hour post-trial measuring period (average was < 2 % of fish $\dot{M}O_2$) was subtracted from $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements. Background corrected $\dot{M}O_2$ was then scaled to an average individual mass of 120 g using a mass exponent of 0.89 prior to subsequent analysis (Jerde *et al.*, 2019).

We calculated SMR of each fish as the mean of the lowest 10 $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements from the ~3-4 hour period prior to O_{2crit} trials in which mean dissolved O_2 saturation was >80 % air saturation. The critical O_2 tension (O_{2crit}) of each individual fish was then calculated using $\dot{M}O_2$ measurements from O_{2crit} trials with

function 'calcO2crit' from package 'fishMO2' (Chabot *et al.* 2016) in R v.3.6.3 (R Core Team, 2020), using the estimated SMR of each individual, as detailed in the supplementary material of Claireaux & Chabot (2016). Finally, we defined MMR as the single highest measurement of $\dot{M}O_2$ in the one hour period immediately following exercise to exhaustion (Norin & Clark, 2016). This point usually occurred during the first measurement period immediately after each fish was moved to the respirometer chamber i.e. ~ 2-5 minutes after the cessation of the chase protocol. However, for some fish in normoxia spontaneous activity inside the respirometer chamber during SMR or O_{2crit} trials resulted in instantaneous measurements of $\dot{M}O_2$ higher than those noted following chase protocols. In these occasions this higher value of $\dot{M}O_2$ was used as the estimated MMR for that fish (n = 2 out of 65 fish).

5.4. Blood chemistry and Hb-O₂ affinity measurements

Following MMR measurements, sea bass were left overnight in the isolation boxes before blood samples were taken (Figure 6), following methods outlined in Montgomery *et al.* (2019), from each fish in normoxic conditions and at the relevant treatment temperature and CO₂ level (Table S3). We then measured extracellular pH (pH_e), haematocrit (Hct), TCO₂, haemoglobin content (Hb), plasma glucose, and plasma lactate and calculated pCO_2 and HCO_3^- following methods detailed in Montgomery *et al.* (2019). We also followed the freeze-and-thaw method to measure intracellular pH of RBCs (pH_i) as described by Zeidler and Kim (1977), and validated by Baker *et al.* (2009). All measurements or storage of blood for subsequent analysis occurred within 10 minutes of blood sampling. Finally, we measured Hb-O₂ affinity using a Blood Oxygen Binding System (BOBS, Loligo systems), detailed in general in Oellermann *et al.* (2014) and specifically for fish blood in Montgomery *et al.* (2019).

Figure 6: Summary of the timeline over which experimental end points were measured. Sea bass were acclimated for a minimum of 14 days to a temperature (14, 18, 22 °C) and CO₂ (~400 µatm or ~1000 µatm ambient CO₂) treatment before measurements of SMR/O_{2crit}, MMR (at ~21 kPa, ~12 kPa, and ~6 kPa O₂), and blood chemistry/Hb-O₂ affinity were obtained on consecutive days for each individual.

5.5. Statistical Analysis

5.5.1. Respirometry data analysis

We conducted all statistical analysis in R v3.6.3 (R Core Team, 2020). Results are reported as mean ± S.E unless otherwise stated. Sample sizes for respirometry data can be seen in Table S4. The effects of temperature, O₂, and CO₂ on individual physiological performance metrics (SMR, MMR, and O_{2crit}) were analysed using separate general linear mixed-effects models (GLMM) in package ‘lme4’ (Bates et al., 2015; Pinheiro et al., 2018). All models included respirometry group as a random intercept term to account for potential tank effects introduced during respirometry measurements. For each physiological metric the best supported model was determined as the model with the lowest corrected Akaike’s information criterion, AICc (Burnham & Anderson, 1998; Hurvich & Tsai, 1989). Residual diagnostic plots

of each GLMM were then assessed using package ‘DHARMA’ to confirm validity of model fit (Hartig, 2020). Once the best supported model for each physiological parameter was identified (see Table S5 for model comparisons) predictions were made across a range of temperatures, O₂ levels, and CO₂ levels to visualise combined effects of these variables on the physiology of seabass. We then used function bootMer from lme4 (Pinheiro et al., 2018) to calculate 95 % confidence intervals of model predictions.

5.5.2. Blood chemistry and Hb-O₂ affinity data analysis

Measurements of blood chemistry parameters (pH_e, pH_i, pCO₂, HCO₃⁻, P₅₀, Hills’ number, Hct, Hb, lactate, and glucose) were analysed using the ambient water temperature of the treatment and using a categorical CO₂ level of low (i.e. ~400 µatm treatment) or high (i.e. ~1000 µatm treatment). Measurements were analysed using a type III sum of squares two-way ANOVA (to account for unequal sample sizes). Post hoc-tests were then conducted on least-square means generated by package ‘emmeans’ (Lenth, 2020), with Tukey adjusted p-values for multiple comparisons. Model residuals from analysis of plasma lactate and glucose measurements did not meet the assumptions of normality or equal variances required by two-way ANOVA, as such this data was analysed using the alternative non-parametric Kruskal-wallis test.

Blood-oxygen binding parameters (P₅₀ and Hills’ number) could not be obtained for fish in the 14 °C and high CO₂ treatment as a result of an equipment failure. As such these data were analysed using a one-way ANOVA. If statistical assumptions of one-way ANOVA were not met then data were analysed using the non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis test. Sample sizes for blood chemistry data can be seen in Table S4.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by a NERC GW4+ Doctoral Training Partnership studentship from the Natural Environment Research Council [NE/L002434/1] with additional funding from CASE partner, The Centre of Fisheries and Aquaculture Science (Cefas) to D.W.M., and from the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BB/D005108/1 and BB/J00913X/1) and NERC (NE/H017402/1) to R.W.W. The authors would like to thank the Marine Management Organisation and Natural England for granting permits (Marine Management Organisation permit #030/17 & Natural England permit #OLD1002654) to collect wild sea bass for use in this study, and Simon Pengelly and the Southern Inshore Fisheries and Conservation Authority for assistance with fish collections. We would also like to thank the aquarium staff, particularly Steven Cooper, Alice Walpole and Rebecca Turner, of the Aquatic Resource Centre at the University of Exeter for assistance with fish husbandry and system water chemistry, and finally Dr Cosima Porteus for assistance with blood chemistry measurements.

Competing Interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Data availability

Data will be made publicly available via the University of Exeter's online repository if the manuscript is accepted: <https://ore.exeter.ac.uk/repository/>

References

Anttila, K., Lewis, M., Prokkola, J. M., Kanerva, M., Seppänen, E., Kolari, I., & Nikinmaa, M. (2015). Warm acclimation and oxygen depletion induce species-

specific responses in salmonids. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 218(10), 1471 LP – 1477. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.119115>

Baker, D. W., May, C., & Brauner, C. J. (2009). A validation of intracellular pH measurements in fish exposed to hypercarbia: the effect of duration of tissue storage and efficacy of the metabolic inhibitor tissue homogenate method. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 75(1), 268–275. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8649.2009.02261.x>

Bates, D., Mächler, M., Bolker, B., & Walker, S. (2015). Fitting Linear Mixed-Effects Models Using lme4. *Journal of Statistical Software; Vol 1, Issue 1 (2015)*.

Bopp, L., Resplandy, L., Orr, J. C., Doney, S. C., Dunne, J. P., Gehlen, M., Halloran, P., Heinze, C., Ilyina, T., Séférián, R., Tjiputra, J., & Vichi, M. (2013). Multiple stressors of ocean ecosystems in the 21st century: projections with CMIP5 models. *Biogeosciences*, 10(10), 6225–6245. <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-10-6225-2013>

Breitburg, D., Levin, L. A., Oschlies, A., Grégoire, M., Chavez, F. P., Conley, D. J., Garçon, V., Gilbert, D., Gutiérrez, D., Isensee, K., Jacinto, G. S., Limburg, K. E., Montes, I., Naqvi, S. W. A., Pitcher, G. C., Rabalais, N. N., Roman, M. R., Rose, K. A., Seibel, B. A., ... Zhang, J. (2018). Declining oxygen in the global ocean and coastal waters. *Science*, 359(6371). <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aam7240>

Burnham, K. P., & Anderson, D. R. (1998). Practical use of the information-theoretic approach. In *Model selection and inference* (pp. 75–117). Springer.

Caldeira, K., & Wickett, M. E. (2003). Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. *Nature*, 425, 365. <https://doi.org/10.1038/425365a>

Chabot, D., & Claireaux, G. (2008). Environmental hypoxia as a metabolic constraint on fish: The case of Atlantic cod, *Gadus morhua*. *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, 57(6–12), 287–294. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2008.04.001>

Chabot, D., Steffensen, J. F., & Farrell, A. P. (2016). The determination of standard metabolic rate in fishes. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 88(1), 81–121.

- Claireaux, G., & Chabot, D. (2016). Responses by fishes to environmental hypoxia: integration through Fry's concept of aerobic metabolic scope. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 88(1), 232–251. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.12833>
- Claireaux, G., & Lagardère, J. P. (1999). Influence of temperature, oxygen and salinity on the metabolism of the European sea bass. *Journal of Sea Research*, 42(2), 157–168. [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1385-1101\(99\)00019-2](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1385-1101(99)00019-2)
- Claireaux, G., Webber, D. M., Lagardère, J. P., & Kerr, S. R. (2000). Influence of water temperature and oxygenation on the aerobic metabolic scope of Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*). *Journal of Sea Research*, 44(3–4), 257–265. [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1385-1101\(00\)00053-8](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1385-1101(00)00053-8)
- Clark, T. D., Sandblom, E., & Jutfelt, F. (2013). Aerobic scope measurements of fishes in an era of climate change: respirometry, relevance and recommendations. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 216(15), 2771.
- Côté, I. M., Darling, E. S., & Brown, C. J. (2016). Interactions among ecosystem stressors and their importance in conservation. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 283(1824). <https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2015.2592>
- Crain, C. M., Kroeker, K., & Halpern, B. S. (2008). Interactive and cumulative effects of multiple human stressors in marine systems. *Ecology Letters*, 11(12), 1304–1315. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2008.01253.x>
- Crespel, A., Anttila, K., Lelièvre, P., Quazuguel, P., Le Bayon, N., Zambonino-Infante, J.-L., Chabot, D., & Claireaux, G. (2019). Long-term effects of ocean acidification upon energetics and oxygen transport in the European sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*, Linnaeus). *Marine Biology*, 166(9), 116. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-019-3562-9>
- Cucco, A., Sinerchia, M., Lefrançois, C., Magni, P., Ghezzi, M., Umgiesser, G., Perilli, A., & Domenici, P. (2012). A metabolic scope based model of fish response to environmental changes. *Ecological Modelling*, 237–238, 132–141. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2012.04.019>

- 759 Del Raye, G., & Weng, K. C. (2015). An aerobic scope-based habitat suitability index
760 for predicting the effects of multi-dimensional climate change stressors on
761 marine teleosts. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*,
762 113, 280–290. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2015.01.014>
- 763 Deutsch, C., Ferrel, A., Seibel, B., Poertner, H.-O., & Huey, R. B. (2015). Climate
764 change tightens a metabolic constraint on marine habitats. *Science*, 348(6239),
765 1132–1135. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aaa1605>
- 766 Diaz, R. J., & Rosenberg, R. (2008). Spreading Dead Zones and Consequences for
767 Marine Ecosystems. *Science*, 321(5891), 926.
- 768 Dickson, A G, & Millero, F. J. (1987). A comparison of the equilibrium constants for
769 the dissociation of carbonic acid in seawater media. *Deep Sea Research Part A.*
770 *Oceanographic Research Papers*, 34(10), 1733–1743.
771 [https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/0198-0149\(87\)90021-5](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/0198-0149(87)90021-5)
- 772 Dickson, Andrew G. (1990). Standard potential of the reaction: $\text{AgCl(s)} + 12\text{H}_2\text{(g)} =$
773 $\text{Ag(s)} + \text{HCl(aq)}$, and the standard acidity constant of the ion HSO_4^- in
774 synthetic sea water from 273.15 to 318.15 K. *The Journal of Chemical*
775 *Thermodynamics*, 22(2), 113–127. [https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/0021-](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/0021-9614(90)90074-Z)
776 9614(90)90074-Z
- 777 Duncan, M. I., James, N. C., Potts, W. M., & Bates, A. E. (2020). Different drivers,
778 common mechanism; the distribution of a reef fish is restricted by local-scale
779 oxygen and temperature constraints on aerobic metabolism. *Conservation*
780 *Physiology*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.1093/conphys/coaa090>
- 781 Ern, R. (2019). A mechanistic oxygen- and temperature-limited metabolic niche
782 framework. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological*
783 *Sciences*, 374(1778), 20180540. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2018.0540>
- 784 Farrell, A P. (2016). Pragmatic perspective on aerobic scope: peaking, plummeting,
785 pejus and apportioning. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 88(1), 322–343.
786 <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.12789>
- 787 Farrell, Anthony P, & Richards, J. G. (2009). Chapter 11 Defining Hypoxia: An
788 Integrative Synthesis of the Responses of Fish to Hypoxia. In A. P. F. and C. J.

- 789 B. Jeffrey G. Richards (Ed.), *Fish Physiology: Vol. Volume 27* (pp. 487–503).
790 Academic Press. [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1546-5098\(08\)00011-](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1546-5098(08)00011-3)
791 3
- 792 Fry, F. E. J. (1971). 1 - The Effect of Environmental Factors on the Physiology of
793 Fish. In W. S. H. and D. J. Randall (Ed.), *Fish Physiology: Vol. Volume 6* (pp. 1–
794 98). Academic Press. [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1546-](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1546-5098(08)60146-6)
795 5098(08)60146-6
- 796 Gomez Isaza, D. F., Cramp, R. L., & Franklin, C. E. (2021). Thermal plasticity of the
797 cardiorespiratory system provides cross-tolerance protection to fish exposed to
798 elevated nitrate. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part C: Toxicology &*
799 *Pharmacology*, 240, 108920.
800 <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpc.2020.108920>
- 801 Grans, A., Jutfelt, F., Sandblom, E., Jonsson, E., Wiklander, K., Seth, H., Olsson, C.,
802 Dupont, S., Ortega-Martinez, O., Einarsdottir, I., Bjornsson, B. T., Sundell, K., &
803 Axelsson, M. (2014). Aerobic scope fails to explain the detrimental effects on
804 growth resulting from warming and elevated CO₂ in Atlantic halibut. *J Exp Biol*,
805 217(Pt 5), 711–717. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.096743>
- 806 Hartig, F. (2020). *DHARMA: Residual Diagnostics for Hierarchical (Multi-*
807 *Level/Mixed) Regression Models*. R Package version 0.3.0.
- 808 Heuer, R. M., & Grosell, M. (2016). Elevated CO₂ increases energetic cost and ion
809 movement in the marine fish intestine. *Scientific Reports*, 6, 34480.
810 <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep34480>
811 <https://www.nature.com/articles/srep34480#supplementary-information>
- 812 Hollowed, A. B., Barange, M., Beamish, R. J., Brander, K., Cochrane, K., Drinkwater,
813 K., Foreman, M. G. G., Hare, J. A., Holt, J., Ito, S., Kim, S., King, J. R., Loeng,
814 H., MacKenzie, B. R., Mueter, F. J., Okey, T. A., Peck, M. A., Radchenko, V. I.,
815 Rice, J. C., ... Yamanaka, Y. (2013). Projected impacts of climate change on
816 marine fish and fisheries. *ICES Journal of Marine Science: Journal Du Conseil*,
817 70(5), 1023–1037. <https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fst081>
- 818 Howald, S., Cominassi, L., LeBayon, N., Claireaux, G., & Mark, F. C. (2019). Future
819 ocean warming may prove beneficial for the northern population of European

seabass, but ocean acidification will not. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 222(21), jeb213017. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.213017>

Hurvich, C. M., & Tsai, C.-L. (1989). Regression and time series model selection in small samples. *Biometrika*, 76(2), 297–307. <https://doi.org/10.1093/biomet/76.2.297>

IPCC. (2014). *Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*.

Jerde, C. L., Kraskura, K., Eliason, E. J., Csik, S. R., Stier, A. C., & Taper, M. L. (2019). Strong Evidence for an Intraspecific Metabolic Scaling Coefficient Near 0.89 in Fish . In *Frontiers in Physiology* (Vol. 10, p. 1166).

Jutfelt, F., Norin, T., Ern, R., Overgaard, J., Wang, T., McKenzie, D. J., Lefevre, S., Nilsson, G. E., Metcalfe, N. B., Hickey, A. J. R., Brijs, J., Speers-Roesch, B., Roche, D. G., Gamperl, A. K., Raby, G. D., Morgan, R., Esbaugh, A. J., Gräns, A., Axelsson, M., ... Clark, T. D. (2018). Oxygen- and capacity-limited thermal tolerance: blurring ecology and physiology. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 221(1). <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.169615>

Krogh, A. (1916). *The respiratory exchange of animals and man* (Vol. 13). Longmans, Green.

Lagardère, J.-P., Begout-Anras, M. L., & Claireaux, G. (1998). Advances in invertebrate and fish telemetry. *Hydrobiologia*, 371, 372.

Lefevre, S. (2016). Are global warming and ocean acidification conspiring against marine ectotherms? A meta-analysis of the respiratory effects of elevated temperature, high CO₂ and their interaction. *Conservation Physiology*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.1093/conphys/cow009>

Lefevre, S. (2019). 6 - Effects of high CO₂ on oxygen consumption rates, aerobic scope and swimming performance. In M. Grosell, P. L. Munday, A. P. Farrell, & C. J. B. T.-F. P. Brauner (Eds.), *Carbon Dioxide* (Vol. 37, pp. 195–244). Academic Press. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/bs.fp.2019.08.001>

- 849 Lefrancois, C., & Claireaux, G. (2003). Influence of ambient oxygenation and
850 temperature on metabolic scope and scope for heart rate in the common sole
851 *Solea solea*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 259, 273–284.
- 852 Lenth, R. (2020). *emmeans: Estimated Marginal Means, aka Least-Squares Means*.
853 R Package Version 1.4.6.
- 854 Leo, E., Kunz, K. L., Schmidt, M., Storch, D., Portner, H. O., & Mark, F. C. (2017).
855 Mitochondrial acclimation potential to ocean acidification and warming of Polar
856 cod (*Boreogadus saida*) and Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*). *Frontiers in Zoology*,
857 14, 12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12983-017-0205-1>
- 858 Lewis, C., Clemow, K., & Holt, W. V. (2013). Metal contamination increases the
859 sensitivity of larvae but not gametes to ocean acidification in the polychaete
860 *Pomatoceros lamarckii* (Quatrefages). *Marine Biology*, 160(8), 2089–2101.
861 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-012-2081-8>
- 862 Mallekh, R., & Lagardère, J. P. (2002). Effect of temperature and dissolved oxygen
863 concentration on the metabolic rate of the turbot and the relationship between
864 metabolic scope and feeding demand. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 60(5), 1105–
865 1115. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8649.2002.tb01707.x>
- 866 McBryan, T. L., Anttila, K., Healy, T. M., & Schulte, P. M. (2013). Responses to
867 Temperature and Hypoxia as Interacting Stressors in Fish: Implications for
868 Adaptation to Environmental Change. *Integrative and Comparative Biology*,
869 53(4), 648–659. <https://doi.org/10.1093/icb/ict066>
- 870 McBryan, T. L., Healy, T. M., Haakons, K. L., & Schulte, P. M. (2016). Warm
871 acclimation improves hypoxia tolerance in *Fundulus heteroclitus*.
872 *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 219(4), 474–484.
873 <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.133413>
- 874 Melzner, F., Thomsen, J., Koeve, W., Oschlies, A., Gutowska, M. A., Bange, H. W.,
875 Hansen, H. P., & Körtzinger, A. (2013). Future ocean acidification will be
876 amplified by hypoxia in coastal habitats. *Marine Biology*, 160(8), 1875–1888.
877 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-012-1954-1>

- Michaelidis, B., Spring, A., & Pörtner, H. O. (2007). Effects of long-term acclimation to environmental hypercapnia on extracellular acid–base status and metabolic capacity in Mediterranean fish *Sparus aurata*. *Marine Biology*, 150(6), 1417–1429.
- Montgomery, D. W., Simpson, S. D., Engelhard, G. H., Birchenough, S. N. R., & Wilson, R. W. (2019). Rising CO₂ enhances hypoxia tolerance in a marine fish. *Scientific Reports*, 9(1), 15152. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-51572-4>
- Norin, T., & Clark, T. D. (2016). Measurement and relevance of maximum metabolic rate in fishes. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 88(1), 122–151. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.12796>
- Oellermann, M., Pörtner, H. O., & Mark, F. C. (2014). Simultaneous high-resolution pH and spectrophotometric recordings of oxygen binding in blood microvolumes. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 217(9), 1430 LP – 1436. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.092726>
- Pawson, M. G., Pickett, G. D., Leballeur, J., Brown, M., & Fritsch, M. (2007). Migrations, fishery interactions, and management units of sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) in Northwest Europe. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*, 64(2), 332–345. <https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsl035>
- Perry, S. F., & Abdallah, S. (2012). Mechanisms and consequences of carbon dioxide sensing in fish. *Respiratory Physiology & Neurobiology*, 184(3), 309–315. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resp.2012.06.013>
- Person-Le Ruyet, J., Mahé, K., Le Bayon, N., & Le Delliou, H. (2004). Effects of temperature on growth and metabolism in a Mediterranean population of European sea bass, *Dicentrarchus labrax*. *Aquaculture*, 237(1), 269–280. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2004.04.021>
- Pierrot, D., Lewis, E., & Wallace, D. W. R. (2006). CO₂SYS DOS Program developed for CO₂ system calculations. In *ORNL/CDIAC-105*. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, US Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, TN.

- Pilakouta, N., Killen, S. S., Kristjánsson, B. K., Skúlason, S., Lindström, J., Metcalfe, N. B., & Parsons, K. J. (2020). Multigenerational exposure to elevated temperatures leads to a reduction in standard metabolic rate in the wild. *Functional Ecology*, 34(6), 1205–1214. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2435.13538>
- Pinheiro, J., Bates, D., DebRoy, S., Sarkar, D., & Team, R. C. (2018). *nlme: Linear and Nonlinear Mixed Effects Models* (3.1-137).
- Pörtner, H. O. (2012). Integrating climate-related stressor effects on marine organisms: unifying principles linking molecule to ecosystem-level changes. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 470, 273–290.
- Pörtner, H. O., Bock, C., & Mark, F. C. (2017). Oxygen- and capacity-limited thermal tolerance: bridging ecology and physiology. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, 220(15), 2685–2696. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.134585>
- Pörtner, H. O., & Farrell, A. P. (2008). Physiology and Climate Change. *Science*, 322(5902), 690.
- Pörtner, H. O., & Peck, M. A. (2010). Climate change effects on fishes and fisheries: towards a cause-and-effect understanding. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 77(8), 1745–1779. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8649.2010.02783.x>
- R Core Team. (2020). *R: A language and environment for statistical computing*. R Foundation for Statistical Computing.
- Rummer, J. L., Stecyk, J. A. W., Couturier, C. S., Watson, S.-A., Nilsson, G. E., & Munday, P. L. (2013). Elevated CO₂ enhances aerobic scope of a coral reef fish. *Conservation Physiology*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.1093/conphys/cot023>
- Sandblom, E., & Axelsson, M. (2005). Effects of hypoxia on the venous circulation in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology*, 140(2), 233–239. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpb.2005.01.005>
- Sandblom, Erik, Clark, T. D., Gräns, A., Ekström, A., Brijs, J., Sundström, L. F., Odelström, A., Adill, A., Aho, T., & Jutfelt, F. (2016). Physiological constraints to climate warming in fish follow principles of plastic floors and concrete ceilings. *Nature Communications*, 7(1), 11447. <https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms11447>

- 937 Sandblom, Erik, Gräns, A., Axelsson, M., & Seth, H. (2014). Temperature
938 acclimation rate of aerobic scope and feeding metabolism in fishes: implications
939 in a thermally extreme future. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological*
940 *Sciences*, 281(1794), 20141490. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2014.1490>
- 941 Schulte, P. M., Healy, T. M., & Fangue, N. A. (2011). Thermal Performance Curves,
942 Phenotypic Plasticity, and the Time Scales of Temperature Exposure.
943 *Integrative and Comparative Biology*, 51(5), 691–702.
944 <https://doi.org/10.1093/icb/ucr097>
- 945 Seibel, B. A., & Deutsch, C. (2020). Oxygen supply capacity in animals evolves to
946 meet maximum demand at the current oxygen partial pressure regardless of
947 size or temperature. *The Journal of Experimental Biology*, jeb.210492.
948 <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.210492>
- 949 Slesinger, E., Andres, A., Young, R., Seibel, B., Saba, V., Phelan, B., Rosendale, J.,
950 Wieczorek, D., & Saba, G. (2019). The effect of ocean warming on black sea
951 bass (*Centropomus striatus*) aerobic scope and hypoxia tolerance. *PLOS ONE*,
952 14(6), e0218390.
- 953 Souche, E. L., Hellemans, B., Babbucci, M., MacAoidh, E., Guinand, B., Bargelloni,
954 L., Chistiakov, D. A., Patarnello, T., Bonhomme, F., Martinsohn, J. T., &
955 Volckaert, F. A. M. (2015). Range-wide population structure of European sea
956 bass *Dicentrarchus labrax*. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 116(1),
957 86–105. <https://doi.org/10.1111/bij.12572>
- 958 Strobel, A., Bennecke, S., Leo, E., Mintenbeck, K., Pörtner, H. O., & Mark, F. C.
959 (2012). Metabolic shifts in the Antarctic fish *Notothenia rossii* in response to
960 rising temperature and P CO₂. *Frontiers in Zoology*, 9.
961 <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/1742-9994-9-28>
- 962 Strobel, A., Leo, E., Pörtner, H. O., & Mark, F. C. (2013). Elevated temperature and
963 PCO₂ shift metabolic pathways in differentially oxidative tissues of *Notothenia*
964 *rossii*. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part B: Biochemistry and*
965 *Molecular Biology*, 166(1), 48–57.
966 <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpb.2013.06.006>

- 967 Svendsen, M. B. S., Bushnell, P. G., & Steffensen, J. F. (2016a). Design and setup
968 of intermittent-flow respirometry system for aquatic organisms. *Journal of Fish*
969 *Biology*, 88(1), 26–50. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.12797>
- 970 Svendsen, M. B. S., Bushnell, P. G., & Steffensen, J. F. (2016b). Design and setup
971 of intermittent-flow respirometry system for aquatic organisms. *Journal of Fish*
972 *Biology*, 88(1), 26–50. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.12797>
- 973 Tinker, J. P., Howes, E. L., Wakelin, S., Menary, M., Kent, E., Berry, D., Hindson, J.,
974 Ribeiro, J., Dye, S., Andres, O., Lyons, K., & Smyth, T. (2020). The impacts of
975 climate change on temperature (air and sea) relevant to the coastal and marine
976 environment around the UK. *MCCIP Science Review 2020*, 1–30.
977 <https://doi.org/10.14465/2020.arc01.tem>
- 978 Todgham, A. E., & Stillman, J. H. (2013). Physiological Responses to Shifts in
979 Multiple Environmental Stressors: Relevance in a Changing World. *Integrative*
980 *and Comparative Biology*, 53(4), 539–544.
- 981 Wernberg, T., Smale, D. A., & Thomsen, M. S. (2012). A decade of climate change
982 experiments on marine organisms: procedures, patterns and problems. *Global*
983 *Change Biology*, 18(5), 1491–1498. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02656.x)
984 [2486.2012.02656.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02656.x)
- 985 Wood, C. M., Turner, J. D., & Graham, M. S. (1983). Why do fish die after severe
986 exercise? *Journal of Fish Biology*, 22(2), 189–201.
987 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8649.1983.tb04739.x>
- 988 Zeidler, R., & Kim, H. D. (1977). Preferential hemolysis of postnatal calf red cells
989 induced by internal alkalization. *The Journal of General Physiology*, 70(3),
990 385–401. <https://doi.org/10.1085/jgp.70.3.385>

995 **Supplementary materials**

996 **Table S1:** Measurements of $p\text{CO}_2$ (μatm , top row) and pH (NBS scale, bottom row)
 997 as O_2 declined during $\text{O}_{2\text{crit}}$ trials for each treatment. All values are mean $\pm$ S.D. apart
 998 from for Treatment 3 at $\sim 30\%$ dissolved O_2 where only one measurement of $p\text{CO}_2$
 999 and pH was made and calculations of mean and S.D. were not possible

~Dissolved O_2 (% air saturation)	Treatment					
	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C
	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2
100	377 $\pm$ 23	483 $\pm$ 20	455 $\pm$ 35	1019 $\pm$ 50	1070 $\pm$ 10	1172 $\pm$ 89
	8.14 $\pm$ 0.02	8.09 $\pm$ 0.02	8.10 $\pm$ 0.04	7.79 $\pm$ 0.01	7.78 $\pm$ 0.00	7.80 $\pm$ 0.03
80	418 $\pm$ 9	508 $\pm$ 10	486 $\pm$ 47	1149 $\pm$ 2	1156 $\pm$ 86	1209 $\pm$ 18
	8.10 $\pm$ 0.01	8.07 $\pm$ 0.01	8.07 $\pm$ 0.04	7.74 $\pm$ 0.01	7.75 $\pm$ 0.02	7.79 $\pm$ 0.02
60	477 $\pm$ 25	613 $\pm$ 90	497 $\pm$ 23	1383 $\pm$ 125	1315 $\pm$ 73	1335 $\pm$ 92
	8.05 $\pm$ 0.02	7.99 $\pm$ 0.01	8.07 $\pm$ 0.02	7.67 $\pm$ 0.02	7.69 $\pm$ 0.02	7.75 $\pm$ 0.03
40	625 $\pm$ 44	746 $\pm$ 40	577 $\pm$ 46	1637 $\pm$ 83	1488 $\pm$ 24	1658 $\pm$ 237
	7.94 $\pm$ 0.03	7.92 $\pm$ 0.02	8.01 $\pm$ 0.04	7.59 $\pm$ 0.01	7.64 $\pm$ 0.00	7.66 $\pm$ 0.05
30	822	1104 $\pm$ 155	647 $\pm$ 18	1973 $\pm$ 159	1964 $\pm$ 134	2179 $\pm$ 63
	7.83	7.76 $\pm$ 0.06	7.96 $\pm$ 0.01	7.51 $\pm$ 0.04	7.53 $\pm$ 0.02	7.55 $\pm$ 0.01
20	1162 $\pm$ 2	2103 $\pm$ 79	808 $\pm$ 35	2491 $\pm$ 238	2416 $\pm$ 265	2547 $\pm$ 266
	7.69 $\pm$ 0.00	7.50 $\pm$ 0.02	7.88 $\pm$ 0.02	7.42 $\pm$ 0.05	7.45 $\pm$ 0.03	7.48 $\pm$ 0.06
15	1734 $\pm$ 92	2431 $\pm$ 663	1318 $\pm$ 108	3099 $\pm$ 448	2579 $\pm$ 4	3380 $\pm$ 354
	7.53 $\pm$ 0.02	7.45 $\pm$ 0.11	7.68 $\pm$ 0.04	7.32 $\pm$ 0.07	7.41 $\pm$ 0.00	7.36 $\pm$ 0.06

1000 **Table S2:** Temperature (°C), pCO₂ (µatm), and O₂ (kPa) conditions sea bass were exposed to pre-chase, during chase, and when recovering from exercise during measurements of MMR. All
1001 values are presented as mean ± S.E. - indicates measurements for which data was not collected. For the 14 °C present day CO₂ treatment missing pre-chase values would be expected to be
1002 extremely similar to values recorded during chase as shown by values for all other treatments.

	Treatment																	
	14 °C Present CO ₂			18 °C Present CO ₂			22 °C Present CO ₂			14 °C Future CO ₂			18 °C Future CO ₂			22 °C Future CO ₂		
	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery	Pre-chase	During chase	Recovery
~100 % air saturation	Temp (°C) 13.9 ± 0.1	13.9 ± 0.1	13.9 ± 0.1	-	18.3 ± 0.5	18.3 ± 0.5	22.0 ± 0.0	21.8 ± 0.1	22.0 ± 0.0	13.9 ± 0.0	14.2 ± 0.5	13.9 ± 0.1	18.0 ± 0.1	18.5 ± 0.0	18.0 ± 0.2	21.6 ± 0.1	22.3 ± 1.1	21.9 ± 0.1
	pCO ₂ (µatm) -	-	364 ± 12	-	522 ± 105	522 ± 105	-	-	404 ± 0	1056 ± 27	1148 ± 171	1040 ± 4	1085 ± 57	1129 ± 44	1195 ± 44	1092 ± 27	1168 ± 177	1100 ± 52
	O ₂ (kPa) -	-	19.6 ± 0.1	20.8	20.7	19.3 ± 0.2	-	-	18.8 ± 0.2	20.0 ± 0.3	20.7 ± 0.2	19.2 ± 0.6	20.8 ± 0.4	20.4 ± 0.6	19.1 ± 0.3	20.5 ± 0.2	20.3 ± 0.1	19.2 ± 0.9
~60 % air saturation	Temp (°C) 13.3 ± 0.1	13.6 ± 0.1	13.9 ± 0.1	-	17.7 ± 0.1	18.7 ± 0.1	20.5 ± 0.1	21.4 ± 0.2	22.0 ± 0.0	13.7 ± 0.2	13.8 ± 0.4	14.0 ± 0.2	17.5 ± 0.2	17.7 ± 0.2	18.0 ± 0.1	21.2 ± 0.4	21.2 ± 0.3	21.9 ± 0.1
	pCO ₂ (µatm) 542 ± 67	-	501 ± 69	-	619 ± 98	674 ± 37	554 ± 25	-	579 ± 93	1533 ± 62	1577 ± 67	1528 ± 44	1457 ± 137	1486 ± 168	1540 ± 38	1468 ± 67	1436 ± 58	1468 ± 60
	O ₂ (kPa) 13.9 ± 0.3	14.5 ± 0.2	12.0 ± 0.1	14.3 ± 0.3	14.3 ± 0.6	11.8 ± 1.0	14.3 ± 0.2	14.8 ± 0.0	11.6 ± 0.2	14.5 ± 0.2	14.4 ± 0.0	12.0 ± 0.1	14.4 ± 0.3	14.4 ± 0.2	11.9 ± 0.2	14.5 ± 0.2	14.5 ± 0.1	11.5 ± 0.1
~30 % air saturation	Temp (°C) 13.1 ± 0.2	13.4 ± 0.0	13.8 ± 0.1	-	17.6 ± 0.5	18.7 ± 0.1	20.5 ± 0.1	21.4 ± 0.1	22.0 ± 0.0	12.9 ± 0.2	13.1 ± 0.6	13.9 ± 0.1	17.6 ± 0.0	17.6 ± 0.1	18.3 ± 0.2	20.9 ± 0.1	20.9 ± 0.1	21.9 ± 0.1
	pCO ₂ (µatm) 1173 ± 95	-	839 ± 53	-	854 ± 40	793 ± 118	929 ± 85	-	898 ± 101	2575 ± 243	2467 ± 110	2219 ± 216	2213 ± 135	2278 ± 179	2123 ± 272	2400 ± 126	2399 ± 34	2027 ± 100
	O ₂ (kPa) 8.3 ± 0.3	8.8 ± 0.0	6.1 ± 0.1	8.4 ± 0.5	8.6 ± 0.3	6.8 ± 0.8	8.5 ± 0.3	8.8 ± 0.2	6.6 ± 0.2	9.1 ± 0.3	8.9 ± 0.0	6.7 ± 0.1	8.8 ± 0.4	9.1 ± 0.1	6.4 ± 0.3	8.7 ± 0.5	8.7 ± 0.3	6.4 ± 0.5

Table S3: Temperature and $p\text{CO}_2$ levels fish were exposed to when they were anaesthetised immediately prior to blood sampling. All measures are given as mean $\pm$ S.D.

Parameter	Treatment					
	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C
	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2
Temperature (°C)	13.1 $\pm$ 0.1	17.4 $\pm$ 0.1	21.2 $\pm$ 0.3	13.3 $\pm$ 0.3	17.8 $\pm$ 0.1	21.3 $\pm$ 0.2
$p\text{CO}_2$ (μatm)	350 $\pm$ 13	445 $\pm$ 52	398 $\pm$ 28	1130 $\pm$ 33	1103 $\pm$ 47	1221 $\pm$ 35

Table S4: Samples sizes for each measurement in all treatments. We were unable to make measurements of P_{50} or Hills number for the 14 °C future CO_2 scenario due to an equipment failure.

Measurement	Treatment					
	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C	14 °C	18 °C	22 °C
	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Present CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2	Future CO_2
SMR	10	10	10	10	10	10
$\text{O}_{2\text{crit}}$	10	10	10	10	10	10
MMR at ~21 kPa O_2	9	10	10	12	10	10
MMR at ~12 kPa O_2	10	7	10	10	10	10
MMR at ~6 kPa O_2	10	7	10	10	10	10
Blood pH_e	10	6	9	10	9	7
Plasma $p\text{CO}_2$	10	6	9	10	9	7
Plasma HCO_3^-	10	6	9	10	9	7
RBC pH_i	10	6	8	9	9	7
P_{50}	10	6	9	NA	8	7
Hills number	10	6	9	NA	8	7
Haematocrit	10	6	9	10	9	7
Haemoglobin	7	6	9	10	9	7
Plasma lactate	9	6	9	7	8	7
Plasma glucose	9	6	10	7	8	7

Table S5: Structure of models and model comparison results explaining variation in SMR, O_{2crit} , and MMR of sea bass exposed to differing combinations of temperature, O_2 , and CO_2 . The best supported model for each response variable is highlighted in bold.

Response Variable	Explanatory Variables Structure	AICc	$\Delta AICc$	d.f.
SMR	Temperature + CO_2	546.3	0	5
	Temperature	548.2	1.9	4
	Temperature* CO_2	548.7	2.4	6
	CO_2	578.4	32.1	4
O_{2crit}	Temperature + CO_2 + SMR	72.7	0	6
	Temperature * SMR + CO_2	75.2	2.5	7
	Temperature * CO_2 + SMR	75.2	2.5	7
	Temperature + CO_2 * SMR	75.3	2.6	7
	Temperature + SMR	76.2	3.5	5
	Temperature*SMR	78.6	5.9	6
	Temperature * CO_2 * SMR	83.0	10.3	10
	SMR	84.0	11.3	4
	SMR + CO_2	84.8	12.1	5
	SMR* CO_2	87.2	14.5	6
	Temperature	134.2	61.5	4
	Temperature + CO_2	136.4	63.7	5
	Temperature* CO_2	138.8	66.1	6
	CO_2	144.0	71.3	4
MMR	CO_2 + Temperature*O_2 + Temperature*(O_2)²	2240.8	0	12
	CO_2 *Temperature* O_2 + Temperature*(O_2) ²	2243.0	2.2	15
	CO_2 + Temperature* O_2 + (O_2) ²	2247.5	6.7	11
	CO_2 *Temperature* O_2 + (O_2) ²	2248.8	8.0	14
	Temperature + CO_2 * O_2 + CO_2 *(O_2) ²	2280.1	39.3	12
	CO_2 *Temperature* O_2	2349.8	109.0	13
	Temperature + CO_2 * O_2	2360.7	119.9	10
	CO_2 + Temperature* O_2	2362.8	122.0	10
	CO_2 * O_2	2365.1	124.3	9
	Temperature* CO_2 + O_2	2371.4	130.6	10
	Temperature + CO_2 + O_2	2379.7	138.9	9
	Temperature + CO_2	2464.3	223.5	8
	Temperature + O_2	2464.7	223.9	8
	Temperature * CO_2	2465.4	224.6	9
	Temperature* O_2	2467.0	226.2	9

CO ₂	2478.3	237.5	7
O ₂	2488.8	248.0	7
Temperature	2638.1	397.3	7

Table S6: General linear mixed-effects model outputs for analysis of standard metabolic rate. The best supported model was fitted using a Gaussian distribution and included the parameters temperature and CO₂ as explanatory variables and group ID as a random intercept term. Parameter effects are compared against a reference level where temperature and CO₂ are 0. Marginal $R^2 = 0.70$, Condition $R^2 = 0.70$. Confidence intervals for each parameter were determined from function confint in package lme4. Marginal and conditional R^2 of the model were determined using function r.squaredGLMM from package MuMIn.

Parameter	Estimate	Standard Error	Confidence Interval (95%)	t-value	Variance	Standard Deviation
Best supported model <- lmer(SMR ~Temperature + CO ₂ + (1 Group))						
Intercept	-14.77	11.62	-37.35 – 7.81	-1.27		
Temperature	6.66	0.57	5.55 – 7.78	11.61		
CO ₂	-0.012	0.006	-0.024 – -0.001	-2.04		
Group					0.0	0.0

Table S7: General linear mixed-effects model outputs for analysis of O_{2crit}. The best supported model was fitted using a Gaussian distribution and included the parameters temperature, CO₂, and SMR as explanatory variables and group ID as a random intercept term. Parameter effects are compared against a reference level where temperature, CO₂, and SMR are 0. Marginal $R^2 = 0.72$, Condition $R^2 = 0.77$. Confidence intervals for each parameter were determined from function confint in package lme4. Marginal and conditional R^2 of the model were determined using function r.squaredGLMM from package MuMIn.

Parameter	Estimate	Standard Error	Confidence Interval (95%)	t-value	Variance	Standard Deviation
Best supported model <- lmer(O2crit~ Temperature+CO ₂ +SMR) + (1 Group)						
Intercept	2.174	0.421	1.401 – 2.945	5.16		
Temperature	-0.126	0.031	-0.185 – -0.068	-4.00		

CO ₂	0.0005	0.0002	0.0001 – 0.0009	10.75		
SMR	0.036	0.003	0.030 – 0.043	2.37		
Group					0.03	0.18

Table S8: General linear mixed model outputs for analysis of maximum metabolic rate. The best supported model was fitted using a Gaussian distribution and included the parameters temperature and CO₂ as explanatory variables and group ID as a random intercept term. Parameter effects are compared against a reference level where temperature and CO₂ are 0. Marginal $R^2 = 0.91$, Condition $R^2 = 0.96$. Confidence intervals for each parameter were determined from function confint in package lme4. Marginal and conditional R^2 of the model were determined using function r.squaredGLMM from package MuMIn.

Parameter	Estimate	Standard Error	Confidence Interval (95%)	t-value	Variance	Standard Deviation
Best supported model < - lmer(MMR ~ scale(Temperature)*scale(O ₂) + scale(Temperature)*scale(O ₂ ²) + scale(CO ₂) + (O ₂ Fish ID) + (1 Group)						
Intercept	231.99	2.58	227.01 – 236.98	89.96		
scale(Temperature)	32.53	2.55	27.60 – 37.46	12.76		
scale(O ₂)	240.35	9.50	221.92 – 258.74	25.31		
scale(Temperature*O ₂)	41.95	8.60	25.26 – 58.62	4.88		
scale(O ₂ ²)	-157.69	8.68	-174.50 – -140.85	-18.17		
scale(Temperature*O ₂ ²)	-25.10	8.36	-41.31 – -8.86	-3.00		
scale(CO ₂)	-7.52	2.58	-12.08 – -2.97	-3.20		
Fish ID (Intercept)					90.02	9.49
Fish ID (O ₂)					6.53	2.56
Group					4.78 x 10 ⁻⁶	0.00

Figure S1: No impacts of temperature and CO₂ were observed for measurements of haemoglobin-O₂ binding affinity (measured using P₅₀) and Hill's' number. Due to an equipment failure no measurements were possible during the original experimental period for fish at 14 °C exposed to ~1000 μatm CO₂.

Figure S2: Impact of temperature and CO₂ on haematological parameters of sea bass. No significant difference in haematocrit were observed between any treatments. Significant difference in haemoglobin content were noted between fish sampled at different temperature and CO₂ treatments and are represented by different lower case letters.